Routledge Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Literature

YUAN ZHEN'S NEW MUSIC BUREAU POETRY

MUSIC AND RITUAL AS MEANS OF GOVERNANCE

Mei Ah Tan

ROUTLEDGE

Yuan Zhen's New Music Bureau Poetry

This book is the first comprehensive study of the twelve New Music Bureau poems by the influential poet-official Yuan Zhen 元稹 (779–831) in comparison with the response poems of Bai Juyi 白居易 (772–846). Its new perspective on music and ritual reveals connections between Yuan's poems that otherwise appear to have no logical relation. While Bai's poems are celebrated for their simple and direct style, those by Yuan are criticized for being abstruse and overloaded with historical and literary allusions. This study uncovers the inner mechanism of Yuan's poems, his role in both the revival of Confucianism and the so-called "New Music Bureau Movement" in the Mid-Tang, his vision of the significance of music and ritual in securing lasting order after decades of military conflict and political upheaval, and his innovative use of New Music Bureau poetry as memorial.

Mei Ah Tan, Ph.D. (2008), University of Wisconsin, Madison, is Professor of Chinese, Programme Director of the Master of Arts in Chinese, and Associate Director of The Tin Ka Ping Institute for Chinese Language and Culture at The Hang Seng University of Hong Kong. Her research is multidisciplinary, exploring the intersection of linguistics, literature, and history. She has published on classical Chinese language and literature. Her work includes articles on Yuan Zhen and Han Yu and *A Dictionary of High Frequency Function Words in Literary Chinese* (Routledge, 2023).

Routledge Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Literature

177 Tolstoy's Search for the Kingdom of God
Gender and Queer Anarchism
Javier Sethness Castro

178 Teaching Text Technologies and Critical Bibliography Among the Disciplines
Objects of Study
Edited by Barbara Heritage and Donna A. C. Sy

179 Nature and Narrative
Rhetoric and Design in Contemporary Fiction
Markku Lehtimäki

180 Mental Libraries
The Reception of the Arts of Memory in Literature and Culture
Edited by Julia Domínguez

181 Narratives of Hope and Despair
Ruin and Regeneration in Literature and Culture
Edited by Johanna M. Wagner, Melanie Duckworth and Deanna Benjamin

182 Yuan Zhen's New Music Bureau Poetry
Music and Ritual as Means of Governance
Mei Ah Tan

For more information about this series, please visit: www.routledge.com/Routledge-Interdisciplinary-Perspectives-on-Literature/book-series/RIPL

Yuan Zhen's New Music Bureau Poetry

Music and Ritual as Means of Governance

Mei Ah Tan

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group
NEW YORK AND LONDON

First published 2026
by Routledge
605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10158

and by Routledge
4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Names: Tan, Mei Ah author
Title: Yuan Zhen's new music bureau poetry : music and ritual as means of governance / Mei Ah Tan.
Description: New York, NY : Routledge, 2026. | Series: Routledge interdisciplinary perspectives on literature | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2025027742 (print) | LCCN 2025027743 (ebook) | ISBN 9781032738789 hardback | ISBN 9781032738802 paperback | ISBN 9781003466482 ebook
Subjects: LCSH: Yuan, Zhen, 779-831--Criticism and interpretation | Bai, Juyi, 772-846--Criticism and interpretation | Music in literature | Ritual in literature | Yue fu (Chinese poetry)--History and criticism | LCGFT: Literary criticism
Classification: LCC PL2677.Y8 Z86 2026 (print) | LCC PL2677.Y8 (ebook) | DDC 895.11/3--dc23/eng/20250626
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2025027742
LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2025027743

ISBN: 9781032738789 (hbk)
ISBN: 9781032738802 (pbk)
ISBN: 9781003466482 (ebk)

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482

Typeset in Sabon LT Pro
by KnowledgeWorks Global Ltd.

For my parents

Taylor & Francis
Taylor & Francis Group
http://taylorandfrancis.com

Contents

Acknowledgments

My deepest gratitude goes to my parents, my husband, and my siblings for their support in my academic endeavors. My interest in this topic took root when I was still a graduate student at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. At that time, my advisor, Professor William H. Nienhauser, Jr., kindly provided me with training and guidance, to which I am deeply indebted. This manuscript builds on parts of my dissertation, "A Study of Yuan Zhen's Life and Verse 809–810: Two Years that Shaped His Politics and Prosody," with significant revisions and new findings. I am grateful for the research funding provided by the Faculty Development Scheme under the University Grants Committee of the HKSAR government (UGC/FDS14/H06/19). This support has allowed me to further my research on this topic and made possible the publication of this manuscript as open access. I am also grateful for the research support provided by The Hang Seng University of Hong Kong. My strong appreciation goes to Ms. Ellen McGill for her professional editing, indexing, and insightful comments, and to Ms. Cynthia Col for her timely assistance in providing a fresh pair of eyes at the final stage and in bringing the manuscript to the next level. Ms. Li Xiaoni 李小妮 assisted in locating various resources and in compiling bibliographies, for which I am thankful. I have benefited from advice for the refinement of the manuscript offered by anonymous reviewers—especially those who strongly supported my grant proposal. I hope that the final version is deserving of their approval of the project. Any remaining errors are of course my own. Last but not least, I owe my thanks to Ms. Anita Bhatt, whose kind support and understanding have smoothened out the publication process, making it less daunting and more manageable.

Permissions

The primary analysis of "Shangyang baifaren" in Chapter 6 has previously been published as "New Music Bureau Poetry as Memorial: The True Significance of Yuan Zhen's 'Shangyang Baifa Ren,'" *Tang Studies* 35 (2017): 87–108, whereas the primary analysis of "Yinshan dao" in Chapter 7 has been published as "Exonerating the Horse Trade for the Shortage of Silk: Yuan Zhen's 'Yin Mountain Route'" (絲綢短缺與絹馬貿易關係: 元稹〈陰山道〉發微), *Journal of Chinese Studies* 57 (Jul. 2013): 49–96, ©2013. I am grateful to the T'ang Studies Society and the *Journal of Chinese Studies*, respectively, for granting me permissions to reprint these articles in this book.

List of Abbreviations

BJYJJJ	*Bai Juyi ji jianjiao*
HJAS	*Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*
JAOS	*Journal of the American Oriental Society*
JRAS	*Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*
JTS	*Jiu Tang shu*
QTWXB	*Quan Tang wen xinbian*
SKQS	*Siku quanshu*
SSJZS	*Shisanjing zhushu*
THY	*Tang hui yao*
XTS	*Xin Tang shu*
YZJJZ	*Yuan Zhen ji jiaozhu*
ZZTJ	*Zizhi tongjian*

1 Introduction

Chinese literature is widely recognized as having two distinct sources: the *Songs*, a collection of "airs" (i.e., folk songs), odes, and hymns for ceremonies; and the *Elegies of Chu*. The *Songs* includes 305 poems. Dated between c. 1000 and c. 600 BCE, they were said to have been selected by Confucius from three thousand items, or collected by officials to observe the lives and feelings of commoners.[1] The *Elegies of Chu* comprises the poetical works of Qu Yuan 屈原 (c. 300 BCE), a nobleman of the Chu state during King Huai's 懷 rule (r. last quarter of the fourth century BCE), together with a smaller number of works ascribed to his followers and imitators. The representative work "Li sao" 離騷 (Sublimating sorrow) comprises an "allegorized autobiography and moralizing reflections on court politics."[2]

Music Bureau poetry (*Yuefu shi* 樂府詩) is often introduced by modern anthologies of Chinese literature after these two crucial sources.[3] The Music Bureau refers to the music office of the Han dynasty (206 BCE–220 CE); it was responsible for providing music and songs for state rituals and imperial entertainment. The Bureau also collected folk songs. In this sense, these songs are often compared to the "airs"—both are considered expressions of the life of commoners and thus could serve as a reflection of rule. Owen also points out that some of the Western Han Music Bureau poems recall earlier ritual songs of Chu from the *Elegies of Chu*.[4] For centuries, the significance of this poetic genre has made it a specialized area of study known as *Yuefuxue* 樂府學.[5]

Poetry in Service of the State

The emphasis on using poetry as a means for social criticism had already been established in pre-Qin China (before 221 BCE), and the Music Bureau poems of the Han dynasty have been highly celebrated in Chinese literary history for this practical function.[6] Literati of the Wei (220–265) and

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-1

Jin (265–420) dynasties took note of their value for governance, and they composed *nizuo* 擬作 (imitation poetry) by using the same titles. These poems demonstrate thematic imitation of and intratextuality with their source poems; musicality was no longer a defining feature.[7] Due to the constraints imposed by thematic imitation and intratextuality, these imitation poems over time increasingly failed to address contemporary issues. Rather, they simply became literary exercises during the Six Dynasties (c. 222–589), to the point that Yang Lun 楊倫 (1747–1803) criticized them as "plagiarism."[8]

By the Tang dynasty (618–907), there was a call for reviving the perceived Han function of Music Bureau poetry as a means for social criticism. By the mid-Tang (roughly 791–825), there were poets who began to compose Music Bureau poems that took after those of the Han. However, they differed from the imitation poems because they no longer adopted the traditional titles.[9] Around 809, two pivotal figures, Yuan Zhen 元稹 (779–831) and Bai Juyi 白居易 (772–846), composed New Music Bureau poetry (*Xin Yuefu* 新樂府) in response to their mutual friend Li Shen's 李紳 (772–846) compositions. Since Li's poems are no longer extant,[10] there is no means to investigate his literary creation. What we can be sure of is that poems of the three did not just use new titles. They also included new content in response to contemporary affairs and a new style in response to the literary developments of the time. As a result, even thematic imitation and intratextuality may not be used to identify such poems. It is for this reason that Joseph R. Allen comments, "In its literary context a nonintratextual, nonfictional *yuefu* poem was certainly new, if it was *yuefu* at all."[11]

Although Yuan and Bai's New Music Bureau poetry had abandoned the defining features of this poetic genre, they still declared their compositions to be "Music Bureau poems." To highlight their differences from the traditional ones, they added the modifier "New." Their poems took after the Han Music Bureau poetry in the sense that they adhered to the spirit of social criticism. While Bai deliberately employs a simple style with straightforward language, Yuan opts for a more erudite style with high-register language embedded with historical and literary allusions. In terms of prosody, Yuan's poems resembled heptasyllabic poems but without the required tonal and rhyming patterns; in contrast, Bai's poems display more irregularity typical of folk songs. The comparison between the two that this study undertakes demonstrates that Yuan's erudite style had to do with his target reader(s) and his central thread of the Western Zhou governing principles that connect the poems.

Re-centering Yuan's New Music Bureau Poems

During the Tang dynasty, Yuan Zhen was a pivotal poet-official who enjoyed a similar degree of literary fame with Bai Juyi. Indeed, the two men were close friends, and their friendship was highly celebrated in Tang

cultural history. But later history saw a rise in Bai's literary reputation—not only within China but also beyond. There were various reasons for this. One reason is the number of works by Bai that are still extant. Despite being seven years older, Bai outlived Yuan by fifteen years. He composed over three thousand poems and left behind a large corpus of work. In comparison, Yuan's works suffered considerable loss in transmission. His comprehensive collection, *Yuanshi Changqingji* 元氏長慶集 (Collected works of Yuan during the Changqing era), should have contained a total of one hundred *juan*,[12] but the extant version only has sixty. Another reason is likely Bai's writing style. Because his poems have a simpler and more direct style, they are easier to appreciate—particularly over time and in different cultures.

Of the two poets, however, Yuan displayed a stronger spirit for change. He was ambitious in linking his literary creation to his political endeavor. His composition of New Music Bureau poetry to present advice to the emperor exemplifies this reach. He was consciously trying to change the world, and this motivated him to innovate in various genres. Apart from the New Music Bureau poems, his Yuanhe-style poetry and imperial documents were notable achievements in this vein. Both show him challenging inherited aesthetic conventions and practices.

This book presents the first comprehensive study of Yuan Zhen's New Music Bureau poetry. By focusing on Yuan's innovative use of music and ritual as a central thread that connects the twelve seemingly unrelated poems, the book teases out his poetry's uniqueness in comparison to the work of Bai Juyi. In doing so, it challenges the standard comment on his New Music Bureau poetry as disconnected and abstruse. This book also takes issue with the idea that there is a "New Music Bureau Movement" with unified principles of composition.

Chen Yinke's 陳寅恪 pioneering 1950 study of this set of poems remains highly influential even today.[13] He disparaged Yuan's poems for their lack of a centripetal theme, arguing that there is no structure linking Yuan's twelve poems; in contrast, Bai's fifty poems have a clear chronological structure, commenting on events that appeared in the reigns of the emperors in a progressive order.[14] Wu Weibin 吳偉斌, who has devoted over thirty years to the study of Yuan,[15] agrees to some extent with Chen Yinke's criticism. Wu finds some (but not all) of Yuan's New Music Bureau poems suffer from having a jumble of ideas. He argues that this phenomenon is, however, uncommon in the context of Yuan's broader poetic corpus; it is by no means representative of Yuan's literary style.[16]

This work takes issue with Chen's characterization. It proposes that an internal mechanism can be seen within each poem. Specifically, Yuan uses various rhetorical methods to connect the phenomena on which he comments to his advice on governance. I also argue that, in addition to

their underlying principle of benevolence, there is a connective mechanism between these poems that concerns music and ritual—the two key methods of rule that Yuan advocates. Music and ritual are the exterior demonstration of the humanistic spirit of benevolence. The entire set of Yuan's poems concerns state governance; indeed, it is the model of the Western Zhou that Yuan is promoting. Through analyzing the connections among this set of poems and comparing Yuan's works to those of Bai, the book concludes that their New Music Bureau experiment was not governed by a single, unified principle and style. Moreover, the target reader of Yuan's works was primarily the emperor. This explains why he often went beyond the ostensible subject of the poem and offered his views on administration in the first person. At first glance, his poems may appear to suffer from a lack of focus, but deeper examination shows that all the ideas are linked.

This study further discusses how the political situation and Yuan's personal endeavors contributed to the formulation of these poems. Yuan's use of poems as memorials not only challenges the traditional function of poetry but also exemplifies the mid-Tang experimentation with genre. The issues these poems address move away from the stock phrases and topoi of traditional Music Bureau poems and directly address state policies. In so doing, Yuan abandoned intratextuality and created a new genre that was only remotely related to the traditional Music Bureau poetry. In this sense, this book supplements Allen's study, demonstrating that intratextuality—the vital feature that marks Music Bureau poetry not set to music—ceased to exist for New Music Bureau poetry.[17]

Through analyzing the role of music and ritual in structuring this set of poems, this book shows that Yuan's poems are not simply poems of social criticism.[18] Rather, they are poems of political advice. These New Music Bureau poems are also different from his Ancient-style Music Bureau poems. In spite of their striking differences, however, they are often lumped together as a whole when they are discussed.

Angela J. Palandri states that Yuan and Bai revived the spirit of the early Music Bureau poems by consciously adopting a popular folk idiom and the popular meters of folk lyrics, thereby bridging the gap between folk songs and the high poetry of the literary class.[19] Her comments apply to Yuan's Music Bureau poems with ancient titles, which are her focus, but not to the New Music Bureau poems. The only two examples of Yuan's New Music Bureau poems that she covers are "Shangyang baifa ren" 上陽白髮人 (The white-haired consorts of Shangyang Palace) and "Xunxi" 馴犀 (A tamed rhinoceros). She classifies these under "poems of social and political concern" and "allegories and animal fables," respectively, and only gives translations rather than analysis.[20]

Lily Hwa disregards the differences between Yuan's New Music Bureau poems and his Music Bureau poems with ancient titles. She refers

to them collectively as "satirical *yuefu* poems," mentioning that they are concerned with current social and political problems. The only two examples she gives are "Tianjia ci" 田家詞 (The farmer) and "Zhifu ci" 織婦詞 (Song of the weaving women); both are Music Bureau poems with ancient titles, not New Music Bureau poems.[21] A relatively recent thesis by Yu Liangqin 禹良琴 studies the New Music Bureau poems of Yuan in a broader sense and also includes those Music Bureau poems with ancient titles. Yu's discussion of literary techniques and its classification of topics, however, are largely based on the work of Liao Meiyun 廖美雲.[22] Liao follows the conventional view of Music Bureau poetry, proposing that Yuan and Bai drew on what they had heard and seen to reflect the actual lives of commoners and to voice the opinions of ordinary people for the emperor to observe his rule. Thus, she classifies Yuan's poems into four types: (1) to admonish the emperor to refine his governance; (2) to condemn wicked officials for undermining the state; (3) to criticize border officials for warfare; and (4) to lament the decline of ritual music.[23] While Fan Shufen 范淑芬 studies all of Yuan's Music Bureau poems, the analyses Fan provides for the New Music Bureau poems are rudimentary. The section that compares Yuan's New Music Bureau poems with Bai's is based on Chen Yinke's seminal study, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao* 元白詩箋證稿 (Draft of commentaries and verification of Yuan and Bai's poetry).[24]

So far, none of the literature has devoted attention to the connections between and within Yuan's New Music Bureau poems. Yuan did not randomly select poems from Li Shen's compositions to respond to. He was using this set of poems to present his governing principles. It is the goal of this study to tease out the central thread that holds together the series.

Mid-Tang Transitions

This account of Yuan's New Music Bureau poetry fits into the larger picture of change associated with the mid-Tang period, which was arguably a turning point in Chinese history. Eventually, the great political, literary, and economic changes that unfolded at this time would usher in a significantly different society in the Song 宋 (960–1279) dynasty. The Japanese scholar Naitō Konan 內藤湖南 (also known as Naitō Torajiro 內藤虎次郎, 1866–1934) famously perceived this transition as one from a medieval China in the Tang to a modern China in the Song; it was signified by the decline of the aristocracy, the rise of commerce, the emergence of civil control of the military, a critical spirit, and a conscious rethinking of tradition.[25] The "Naitō hypothesis" posited the crucial transitional period as the end of the Tang to the Five Dynasties 五代 (902–979). Whether the Song dynasty should be considered as the advent of the modern period of China remains a subject of debate.[26]

Nonetheless, important changes—even transformations—may be observed as early as the mid-Tang. As Edwin G. Pulleyblank has pointed out, the greatest and most significant Tang intellectual activity could be seen in the Zhenyuan 貞元 era (785–805), a focal period in Chinese intellectual history. There was a new critical spirit among literati that led them to search the classics for interpretations that were consonant with reason rather than merely consistent with the orthodox commentaries; this spirit reached its culmination in the Song dynasty.[27]

David McMullen has argued that this commitment among literati to examine tradition and to concern themselves with social and political problems emerged gradually. Over time, it led to the flowering of intellectual life that occurred during the late eighth and early ninth centuries. In particular, he examines the concept of *wen* in relation to historical and literary theory and looks at how literati explored it more fully during this period. Literati considered *renwen* 人文 (human pattern), "in the sense of ritual, music, or the written word, as an indication of the condition of the state in any period, which offered them a measure for analyzing the historical process itself."[28]

Peter Bol has investigated the broader cultural transformation from about 600 CE to 1200 CE that shaped the intellectual history of the late imperial era. He highlights the overwhelming importance of the concept of *wen* after the An Lushan Rebellion (755–763); *wen* came to be seen as all-encompassing. The effects of this development were likewise felt all the way to the Song dynasty.[29]

Anthony DeBlasi noted more specifically the salient elements of the mainstream position of mid-Tang literati. These include the elevated status of literary practice and culture to the creation of social and political order; moreover, great value was placed on balance and accommodation in complying with a tradition that encompassed disparate values. He emphasizes that *wen*, understood as encompassing the civil values central to governance, was the major focus of scholars in the late eighth and early ninth centuries. The glory of the pre-rebellion dynastic order was to be restored by defending the value of literary culture and asserting that literary practice was crucial to that restoration.[30]

To sum up, the mid-Tang is recognized in both literary and historical scholarship as an important moment of transformation. Stephen Owen characterizes this period as the final decades of the "Middle Ages" of China, a unique time in Chinese literary culture that saw a lasting change in how literati perceived their role: "The pride in singular interpretation, as opposed to the restatement of received knowledge, remained a constant in intellectual culture thereafter." [31] Jo-shui Chen analyzes the intellectual transformation of the time by examining Liu Zongyuan 柳宗元 (773–819) as a representative figure. He argues that Liu's Confucian revival was

concerned with Confucian political ideals rather than with the metaphysical and moral philosophy that categorized Neo-Confucianism.[32] Charles Hartman's study of Han Yu 韓愈 (768–824) proposes that he sought unity in the political, philosophical, and literary spheres.[33] Madeline K. Spring examines in detail the stylistics of Han Yu and Liu Zongyuan to determine what was meant by the designation "ancient-style prose." She identifies many features that demonstrate the fundamental transformation of prose form wrought by these two writers.[34] Anna Shields examines the nature of friendship in relation to the changes in literature and culture during the mid-Tang; one pair of friends on whom she focuses is Bai Juyi and Yuan Zhen.[35] Focusing on different aspects, all these works examine the intellectual and literary changes at the time.

Yuan's focus on music and ritual in his New Music Bureau poetry resonates with this transitional period. Grounding himself in the classics that dealt with music and ritual, he applies these ideas to address the social and political problems of the time, showcasing his elevation of the concept of *wen* and his effort in corresponding with his friends for literary creation. This book not only reconstructs Yuan's search for a cultural unity bound by music and ritual but also shows how he contributed to the political and literary spheres with the assistance of his circle of friends, particularly Li Shen and Bai Juyi.

Structure of This Book

The book focuses on the evaluation of New Music Bureau poetry in the context of the literary, social, and political history of the Tang. To highlight Yuan's innovations, this book compares Yuan's works in this genre to poems of the same titles composed by Bai. The different forms and techniques used by Yuan and Bai will be examined and compared, the aesthetic elements analyzed, and an evaluation of their literary contribution given.

Politics, however, cannot be neglected. Because politics played an essential role in New Music Bureau poetry, it is a focus of this book. Yuan and Bai themselves proclaimed that their New Music Bureau poems were not composed simply for the sake of literary aesthetics. They aimed to use literature to make an impact on politics and society. Although the political and cultural value of these poems has frequently been stressed in previous scholarship, I argue, it has not fully appreciated their linkage. For Yuan in particular, political motivation had an impact on both the content and style of his New Music Bureau poems.

Politics and art were bound especially closely in Yuan's work. One of my central arguments is that some of Yuan's aesthetic choices were rooted in his political hopes. These choices make sense only if we realize that his intended audience was the emperor. For this reason, he chose a more

erudite style and filled his poems with political and literary allusions and resonances to showcase his political and literary knowledge. This erudite style is distinctive because it moved away from the widely held belief that Music Bureau poems should be of a simpler and more direct style in accord with their presumed origin as a form of folk songs.

This book begins by explicating the literary and political background that led to Yuan's composition. At the same time, it also investigates why Yuan chose poetry to present his political advice as in a memorial. It explains the nature of the earlier Music Bureau poems and how they relate to the New Music Bureau poems. It then moves on to discuss the use of music and ritual as a means of governance. This political ideology was established in the Western Zhou. Here, the focus will be on its application to the mid-Tang.

The book primarily comprises a detailed analysis of Yuan's twelve New Music Bureau poems. These are classified into three major types: those on music, on ritual, and on benevolence. In examining the details of these poems, I adopt a comparative approach to analyze how Yuan's poems differ from those of Bai. The aim of the comparison is to uncover the main features of Yuan's works and their inner mechanism. The analysis of the poetry is based on modern collated versions of Yuan and Bai's poetry. Variants of different editions are noted and discussed only when what they provide is significant enough to alter interpretations. Unless otherwise noted, all translations are my own. The book concludes with an analysis of Yuan's contributions to New Music Bureau poetry and rethinks the nature of the so-called "New Music Bureau Movement."

Notes

1 For an overview of this classic, see Michael Loewe, "Shih Ching" 詩經, in Michael Loewe, ed., *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide* (Berkeley: The Society for the Study of Early China and The Institute of East Asian Studies, 1993), 415–23.

2 For an overview of this classic, see David Hawkes, "Ch'u tz'u" 楚辭, in Loewe, *Early Chinese Texts*, 48–55. For a recent translation, see Nicholas M. Williams, *Elegies of Chu: An Anthology of Early Chinese Poetry* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022).

3 See for example Stephen Owen, ed. and trans., *An Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911* (New York and London: W. W. Norton & Company, 1996), 227–48. Page 227 provides a succinct definition of Music Bureau poetry, which is referenced in what follows in this paragraph. Robert Joe Cutter, in writing about poetry from 200 BCE to 600 CE, brings up Music Bureau poetry after introducing poems written in the form of Chu songs in the Han dynasty. See his "Poetry from 200 B.C.E to 600 C.E.," in *The Columbia History of Chinese Literature*, ed. Victor Mair (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), 249–73. Tai Jingnong 臺靜農 devotes chapter four of his literary history to this genre as part of his discussion of Han-dynasty poetry. See Tai

Jingnong, *Zhongguo wenxueshi* 中國文學史 (Zhengzhou: Haiyan chubanshe, 2015), 136–44.

4 Owen compared the Western Han Music Bureau poem "Zhan chengnan" 戰城南 (South of the walls we fought) to the Chu ritual song, "Guo shang" 國殤 (Those who died in battle for their state), noting that both allow "those dead in distant battle to speak," and that they serve "the same function of allowing the community to acknowledge the bravery and loyalty of the dead." Owen, *An Anthology of Chinese Literature*, 228.

5 See Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲, *Yuefuxue gailun* 樂府學概論 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2015).

6 For the tradition of using poetry as a means of social criticism, see Chu Wo-Hsin 朱我芯, *Zhongguo shige fengyu chuantong: Jianlun Tangdai Xin Yuefu* 中國詩歌諷諭傳統：兼論唐代新樂府 (Taipei: Taiwan shifan daxue chuban zhongxin, 2015).

7 Joseph Allen argues that using musicality to define Music Bureau poetry is no longer viable. This is because it does not provide us with any method to test, to appreciate, or to read the genre. Instead, he proposes thematic imitation or, preferably, intratextuality, as better defining criteria. Thematic imitation and intratextuality also account for many of the core poems in textual ways. Joseph R. Allen, *In the Voice of Others: Chinese Music Bureau Poetry* (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1992), 64–65.

8 Yang Lun, *Du shi jingquan* 杜詩鏡銓, 2 vols. (1981; Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2007), vol. 1: 5.225.

9 Stephen Owen, *The End of the Chinese "Middle Ages": Essays in Mid-Tang Literary Culture* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 1–11.

10 See "He Li Jiaoshu xinti Yuefu shi'ershou bingxu" 和李校書新題樂府十二首並序, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 24.717–18.

11 Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 232.

12 "Yuan Zhen zhuan," in *JTS*, 166.4336.

13 A relatively recent article on the differences between Yuan's and Bai's New Music Bureau poetry still relies solely on Chen's argument as the basis for further explication. See Chen Yan 陳燕, "Yuan Zhen, Bai Juyi Xin Yuefu shi zhi chayi fenxi—Cong Chen Yinke *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao* shuoqi" 元稹、白居易新樂府詩之差異分析——從陳寅恪《元白詩箋證稿》說起, *Henan jidian gaodeng zhuanke xuexiao xuebao* 河南機電高等專科學校學報 26, no. 4 (July 2018): 57–61.

14 See Chen Yinke, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao* 元白詩箋證稿 (Beijing: Sanlian shudian, 2001), 121–308.

15 His *Xinbian Yuan Zhen ji* 新編元稹集 (Xi'an: San Qin chubanshe, 2015) presents detailed annotations of the words used throughout Yuan's entire corpus. However, quite a few took their sources from *Hanyu da cidian* 漢語大詞典 (Comprehensive dictionary of Chinese) without explaining how the words actually function in particular contexts. The major focus of his research is on the life and political experiences of Yuan Zhen, his poetic style, and his famous prose work "The Tale of Yingying." He disputes common criticisms of Yuan, including censure of Yuan's moral standards, political integrity, and literary style. See Wu Weibin, *Yuan Zhen pingzhuan* 元稹評傳 (Zhengzhou: Henan renmin chubanshe, 2008); Wu Weibin, *Yuan Zhen kaolun* 元稹考論 (Zhengzhou: Henan renmin chubanshe, 2008). His most recent publication is *Xinbian Yuan Zhen nianpu* 新編元稹年譜 (Xi'an: San Qin chubanshe, 2022).

16 See Wu Weibin, "Yuan Zhen shige yishu tese qianxi" 元稹詩歌藝術特色淺析, *Yangzhou shiyuan xuebao* 揚州師院學報, no. 3 (1985): 54–59.
17 Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 230–32.
18 See Hans H. Frankel, "Yueh-fu Poetry," in *Studies in Chinese Literary Genres*, ed. Cyril Birch (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974), 69–107. His view has been quoted by Angela J. Palandri, *Yuan Chen* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1977), 56.
19 See "The New *Yuefu*," in Palandri, *Yuan Chen*, 56 and 58.
20 See Palandri, *Yuan Chen*, 80 and 90.
21 See Lily Hwa, "Yuan Chen (A.D. 779–831): The Poet-Statesman, His Political and Literary Career" (PhD diss., University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1984), 115–26.
22 See Yu Liangqin 禹良琴, "Yuan Zhen Xin Yuefu yanjiu" 元稹新樂府研究 (MA thesis, Yangzhou daxue, 2010), 35–49.
23 See the preface and "Yuan Zhen Xin Yuefu zuopin tanjiu" 元稹新樂府作品探究 section in chapter five of Liao Meiyun, *Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu yanjiu* 元白新樂府研究 (Taipei: Taiwan xuesheng shuju, 1989), i–ii and 89–99.
24 See Fan Shufen 范淑芬, *Yuan Zhen ji qi Yuefushi yanjiu* 元稹及其樂府詩研究 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1984), 185–221.
25 Naitō proposed this first in his *Shina ron* 支那論 (Tokyo: Bunkaidō shoten, 1914), 7–9. For the article that established the Naitō hypothesis, see Naitō Konan, "Tō Sō jidai no kenkyū: Gaikatsu teki Tō Sō jidaikan" 唐宋時代の研究: 概括的唐宋時代觀, *Rekishi go chiri* 歷史ご地理9, no. 5 (1922): 1–12. For a discussion of his arguments and their effects on the Japanese scholarly world, see Hisayuki Miyakawa 宮川尚志, "An Outline of the Naitō Hypothesis and Its Effects on Japanese Studies of China," *The Far Eastern Quarterly* 14, no. 4, Special Number on Chinese History and Society (August 1955): 533–52. For their impact on scholarship as a whole, see Zhang Guangda 張廣達, *Neiteng Hunan de Tang Song biange shuo ji qi yingxiang* 内藤湖南的唐宋變革說及其影響, *Tang yanjiu* 唐研究 11 (2005): 5–71.
26 For a survey of the debate, see Peter K. Bol, *"This Culture of Ours": Intellectual Transitions in T'ang and Sung China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1992).
27 Edwin G. Pulleyblank, "Neo-Confucianism and Neo-legalism in T'ang Intellectual Life, 755–805," in *The Confucian Persuasion*, ed. Arthur F. Wright (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1960), 77–114; for the direct quotation, see page 77.
28 David L. McMullen, "Historical and Literary Theory in the Mid-Eighth Century," in *Perspectives on the T'ang*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1973), 307–42; for the direct quotation, see page 322.
29 Bol, *This Culture of Ours*, 1–31; 108–47.
30 See Anthony DeBlasi, "Prelude" and "The Literary Response to the Mid-Tang Crisis," Chapter 1 in *Reform in the Balance: The Defense of Literary Culture in Mid-Tang China* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002), 1–17.
31 For the span of years and the expression "Middle Ages," see Owen, *The End of the Chinese "Middle Ages,"* 1–11; for the direct quotation, see page 7.
32 Jo-shui Chen, *Liu Tsung-yüan and Intellectual Change in T'ang China, 773–819* (1992; rpt. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

33 Charles Hartman, *Han Yü and the T'ang Search for Unity* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986).
34 Madeline K. Spring, "A Stylistic Study of Tang 'Guwen': The Rhetoric of Han Yu and Liu Zongyuan" (PhD diss., University of Washington, 1983).
35 Anna M. Shields, *One Who Knows Me: Friendship and Literary Culture in Mid-Tang China* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2015).

2 Literary and Political Background

Yuan Zhen's lifespan covered the reigns of six emperors, but his major political activities took place during the rule of Xianzong 憲宗 (778–820, r. 805–820) and Muzong 穆宗 (795–824, r. 821–824). His twelve New Music Bureau poems have long been tied to 809, but they were likely written in late 808, as Shizunaga Takeshi 静永健 argues. Shizunaga proposes that Yuan composed the poems to seek the patronage of Chief Minister Pei Ji 裴垍 (750–811), who advocated direct criticism of state affairs. Shizunaga explains that this is likely the reason that, in the guise of celebrating intelligent men, Yuan often leapt from the affairs he was ostensibly discussing to self-recommendation. Moreover, his deliberate use of systematic rhyming patterns and his plentiful historical and literary allusions are meant to display his literary talents. Therefore, Shizunaga argues, this set of poems was composed when Yuan had no official position, sometime between the twelfth month of the third year of Yuanhe (808) and the first month of 809. Soon after Yuan finished the poems, he was appointed as Supervising Censor 監察御史. This set of poems can be seen as a form of *wenjuan* 溫卷 (warming of scrolls), a practice employed to impress the examiners and to establish one's personal reputation prior to the imperial examination.[1]

Li Shen had written a total of twenty poems commenting on contemporary affairs, but as previously mentioned, none of them are extant. Among them, Yuan chose only those titles that addressed pressing concerns to compose his response poems.[2] This shows that Yuan carefully selected titles that were beneficial for him to present his views on governance. Doing so paved the way for his return to court after completing the three-year mourning period he observed for his mother.

While self-promotion is one reason for Yuan's composition of these poems, the literary, political, and intellectual developments of the time all stimulated their formation. In the Tang dynasty, Music Bureau poetry (*yuefu*) was already a mature poetic genre. The aftermath of the An Lushan Rebellion caused literati to re-examine the function of literature and the value of Confucian philosophy in relation to rule. As a result, there

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-2

had been efforts to use poetry—especially Music Bureau poetry, with its hallmark of social criticism—to address contemporary issues and to revive the Confucian principles of governance. The literati were in search of different means that would allow them to assume a more significant role in the recovery of the state.

Below, I first discuss the origin of the Music Bureau (Yuefu) and the eventual use of the term *yuefu* as a poetic genre. I then discuss the political and social situations that led Yuan and his literary comrades to write New Music Bureau poetry and look at the reasons why they termed these poems as "new." By highlighting Yuan's particular achievements and motivations in pushing the boundaries of well-established genres, this chapter concludes by placing Yuan's work in the broader context of mid-Tang literary innovation.

Genre Development

The idea that poetry is a means to observe the quality and effectiveness of rule sprang from the tradition of the *Songs*. The "airs" of the different states in that classic compendium are folk songs that feature the lives and emotions of commoners and show that governance must be the most important thing shaping ordinary lives. The other major source of Chinese literature, the *Elegies of Chu*, was seen as demonstrating the capacity of literature for expressing political distress, concern over state politics, and love for the state. Since the majority of its works were composed by Qu Yuan, a loyal official who was cast aside by the King of Chu, his works represent compositions by literati concerned with the state.

These two traditions of literature were continued by a set of Han poems that reflect the life of commoners, anachronistically referred to as Music Bureau poetry. *Wenxin diaolong* 文心雕龍 (The literary mind and the carving of dragons), the first systematic work of literary criticism extant that dates from the late fifth or early sixth century, ranks Music Bureau poetry after the "Li sao" 離騷 (Sublimating sorrow) of the *Elegies of Chu* and the *Songs* in recapitulating the development of literature.[3]

Music Bureau poems were believed to have derived from the music office of the Han dynasty. However, as Birrell points out, no extant songs are known to have originated in the Bureau during the Han.[4] As a music office, the Music Bureau was reoriented and reformed by Emperor Wu of Han 漢武帝 (r. 140 BCE–87 BCE) around 111 BCE.[5] The existence of such an office, however, could be traced as far back as the Warring States period (c. fifth century BCE–221 BCE). This is proven by a knob bell inscribed with the characters *yuefu* 樂府 excavated in 1976 from the tomb of the First Emperor of Qin. Moreover, twenty-two pieces of sealing clay related to a Music Bureau were found at a Qin historical site in 2000, and various

chime stones inscribed with "Beigong Yuefu" 北宮樂府 (Music Bureau of the Northern Palace) were dug up in 2016 in Xianyang. These archaeological finds suggest that there was already a music office titled Yuefu under the Qin.[6] Chen Ruiquan 陳瑞泉 argues that there were two music institutions in the Qin dynasty: the Taiyue 太樂 (Grand Music Office) and the Yuefu (Music Bureau). The former oversaw ceremonial music, the latter popular music.[7] During the Qin dynasty, popular songs had already gained popularity among the ruling class and the literati.[8]

In the Han dynasty, the Grand Music Office was primarily in charge of the ceremonial music passed down from the pre-Qin period, while the Music Bureau was primarily in charge of the new music at the time, affiliated with the Shaofu 少府 (Privy Treasurer).[9] Birrell points out that the alleged tasks of the Music Bureau were

> to collect popular songs from regions of the Han empire (especially Chao, Tai, Ch'in, and Ch'u) and from foreign countries; to adapt and orchestrate popular songs; to compose new hymns and put them to music; to put existing texts to new, modern tunes; to set to music compositions commissioned from famous poets, such as Ssu-ma Hsiang-ju; to participate in, and perform at, religious and secular functions.[10]

Collecting folk songs for performance at sacrificial ceremonies, which was what the historian Ban Gu 班固 (32–92) proposed, was in fact only one of its functions.[11] Furthermore, in the early Han, there was no system of gathering poetry that contained social criticism for the goal of judging governance.[12] Rather, the collection of folk songs was to provide the court with songs to enjoy.[13] In doing so, Emperor Wu indulged his personal preference for popular secular music.[14]

Ban Gu highlighted the political function of folk songs, believing that their composition was spurred by contemporary affairs, through which the ruling class could observe the customs and the well-being of people from all walks of life who were subject to the influence of imperial policies.[15] The folk songs that Ban eulogized, however, might have mainly referred to those songs composed in the Eastern Han (25–220 CE), when the court collected ballads to observe the ruling performance in the regions. In doing so, they were encouraging commoners to use songs to express their comments on rule.[16] Music Bureau poems were thus perceived as indicators of the performance of the ruling house,[17] similar to the *Songs* in this aspect. Since then, these poems have been highly celebrated by historians and literary critics. The political reading of these poems follows the tradition of the Mao commentary of the *Songs* and has been frequently quoted in literary history, shaping the imitation poetry of literati.

As early as the Eastern Han, there were already literati who composed poems that took after the songs of the Music Bureau by picturing the lives of commoners and by using simple language. Examples include Xin Yannian's 辛延年 (born c. 220 BCE) "Yulin lang" 羽林郎 (Gentleman of the Palace Guard) and some of the texts in the *Nineteen Old Poems* (*Gushi shijiu shou* 古詩十九首).[18] By the Jian'an 建安 period (196–220), literati began to write new songs for the old titles and music; the content began to differ so much from the themes indicated by the old titles that only the tunes remained.[19] The Cao family of the Wei and their literati officials wrote imitation poems to express their personal feelings and to depict social phenomena: for example, Cao Cao's 曹操 (155–220) "Xielu ge" 薤露歌 (Songs of dew on the shallots) and Chen Lin's 陳琳 (d. 217) "Yinma Changcheng ku xing" 飲馬長城窟行 (Ballad on letting the horse drink in the grotto of the great wall). The driving force for these compositions finds its precedent in the spirit of Qu Yuan, who expressed in "Li sao" his sorrow over ineffective governance.

Such imitation poetry continued to be written and to exercise literary influence after the fall of Han. Music Bureau poetry as a defined genre "began to emerge between the fourth and sixth centuries, fully four hundred years after the end of the Music Bureau in the Han."[20] Indeed, the term Music Bureau "was only applied for the first time to a group of song-texts in the period between 520–545"[21] in the Six Dynasties. Stephen Owen notes that during the seventh and early eighth centuries, *yuefu* was not yet a stable generic term either to distinguish a body of texts from *shi* 詩 (poetry) or to describe texts associated with music.[22] He also points out that *yuefu*'s association with music welcomed the possibility of performance.[23] As such, the term Music Bureau poetry was an anachronistic term to refer to poems collected by the Music Bureau office in the Han; it was also applied to imitation poetry that used identical or similar titles, that demonstrated similar content, or that employed similar language of presentation.

Adhering to the content and style of Han Music Bureau poetry imposed grave constraints on the development of the genre, to the point that its role as a means for social criticism could not be exercised fully. As Yuan Zhen commented, although some poems of Cao, Liu Zhen 劉楨 (d. 217), Shen Yue 沈約 (441–513), and Bao Zhao 鮑照 (ca. 414–466) could realize the social function of this type of poetry, such examples were few.

It was in this context that Chen Zi'ang 陳子昂 (661–702) of the early Tang came into the picture. Chen was the pivotal figure in transforming the frivolous literary style passed down from the Six Dynasties into what he considered a proper style that matched the *Songs*.[24] Yuan was deeply impressed by Chen's "Ganyu" 感遇 (Inspiration and encounters),[25] which was written in ancient-style pentasyllabic verse.[26] Although this set of poems has diverse themes that may not have been connected to any topical

events,[27] Yuan was drawn to the evocative and metaphorical meanings expressed therein.

The said meanings are explained by Ge Xiaoyin's 葛曉音 study. She notes that Chen was affected by the Daoist School of Maoshan 茅山. Keen on observing the changes in the way of Heaven to explore the relations between timing, talent, and destiny, Chen frequently expresses his ambition to have the right timing and opportunities to realize his ambition to manage state affairs. His "Ganyu" series propelled Li Bai 李白 (701–762) to compose the fifty-nine poems of "Gufeng" 古風 (The ancient airs) with the same idea.[28]

Yuan notes that reading the series spurred him to compose twenty poems under the title "Ji Sixuanzi shi" 寄思玄子詩 (Poems for Sixuanzi) on the same day. Yuan did not explain the connection between the two. The modern annotator Zhou Xianglu 周相錄 believes that Sixuanzi refers to Zhang Heng 張衡 (78–139), who composed "Sixuan fu" 思玄賦 (*Fu* on contemplating the mystery)[29] to subtly express his personal feelings over the decline of the state.[30] David R. Knechtges unravels the political meaning and its relation to the *Chu ci* of this *fu*. He points out that it is the most eloquent refutation of the melancholy pessimism of the *Sao* tradition of frustration with state politics, and that Zhang chose to believe in a moral order to release himself from grief caused by the corrupt world of slander and malice, rather than embarking further on an imaginary journey.[31] Similarly, Yuan might have aspired to establish himself in a corrupt world with the power of virtue.

Although Li Bai had a significant role to play in the emergence of New Music Bureau poems,[32] Yuan's direct source of inspiration, however, was Du Fu 杜甫 (712–770). Yuan was the first to present a comprehensive evaluation of Du's poetry and to place Du higher than Li Bai.[33] He praised Du for the practical content (i.e., social consciousness) of his poetry and his perfection in style. In Yuan's opinion, Du had surpassed his predecessors: Shen Quanqi 沈佺期 (d. c. 713) and Song Zhiwen 宋之問 (d. 712) failed to be his match from the perspective of content; Chen Zi'ang fell short from the perspective of literary technique.[34]

More specifically, Yuan praised Du for his creation of something new: ballads with "indirect social criticism" (*feng* 諷) in mind. For this he gave the examples of "Bei Chentao" 悲陳陶 (Grieving over the casualties at Chentao slope),[35] "Ai jiangtou" 哀江頭 (Mourning at the riverbank),[36] "Bingju xing" 兵車行 (Ballad on soldiers and chariots),[37] and "Liren xing" 麗人行 (Ballad on beautiful women)[38] that commented on the An Lushan Rebellion and the suffering of commoners. They were named after events he himself had encountered.

Two sets of Du's poems known as "three officials and three partings" 三吏三別 have often been treated as newly titled Music Bureau poems

preceding those of Yuan and Bai. The first set includes "Xin'an li" 新安吏 (Officials of Xin'an), "Tongguan li" 潼關吏 (Officials of Dongguan), and "Shihao li" 石壕吏 (Officials of Shihao). The second set includes "Xinhun bie" 新婚別 (Parting of the newlyweds), "Chuilao bie" 垂老別 (Parting of old men), and "Wujia bie" 無家別 (Parting of the homeless). They were written in the second year of the Qianyuan 乾元 era (759) during Suzong's 肅宗 (711–762, r. 756–762) reign when Du Fu witnessed the forcible recruitment of men of all ages along his route of return from the eastern capital of Luoyang to Huazhou 華州 (in modern Shaanxi).[39] These poems, however, were pentasyllabic ancient-style poems rather than Music Bureau poems. The misclassification is mainly subject to the *shihua* 詩話 (notes on poetry talks) of Kangxi's 康熙 reign (1661–1722) during the Qing dynasty (1644–1911), as Wang Huibin 王輝斌 argues.[40] Du Xiaoqin 杜曉勤 traced the misclassification all the way to the Song dynasty, when Cai Juhou 蔡居厚 (d. 1125) mistook "Wujia bie" as a Music Bureau poem and paired it with "Bingju xing." Nonetheless, he agrees that the element of social criticism inspired Bai Juyi.[41]

Another crucial figure at this time was Yuan Jie 元結 (719–772), who composed "Xi Yuefu shi'er shou" 系樂府十二首 (Twelve poems propagating the Music Bureau ballad) in 751. As William H. Nienhauser points out, each piece of this series is a social statement, and this work was considered a significant model for many of those who wrote New Music Bureau poetry during the ninth century.[42] Later, Zhang Ji 張籍 (c. 767–c. 830) and Wang Jian 王建 (c. 767–c. 831) composed ancient-style poems that contain social criticism; their works served as a catalyst for the genre development that appeared in the mid-Tang.[43] The works of Li Shen, Yuan Zhen, and Bai Juyi represent the zenith of this genre's development in Tang times, and they are worth a detailed study.

Debates on Genre Characteristics

Although "Music Bureau poetry" is an anachronistic term, its association with the music office has caused the genre to be largely defined by the type of music that accompanies it. In Guo Maoqian's 郭茂倩 (fl. 1084) *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集 (Collections of Music Bureau poetry), the most influential collection of this genre from ancient times through the Tang dynasty, Music Bureau poems were classified into four major categories based on their relation to music. There were those written for existing musical pieces; those that were originally sung a cappella, but some of which were eventually set to music; those composed with music; and imitation poems not necessarily intended to be set to music.[44] He further categorized these poems into twelve categories based on their origin, function, and musical element.[45]

While the imitation poems that were not used in ritual ceremonies might not be tied to music, they were still classified as Music Bureau poetry so long as they were written using the same title, content, or style of the genre. However, at different times literati made changes to the format and theme of those texts that had come to be known as Han dynasty Music Bureau poetry when they wrote imitation pieces. These adaptations caused the poetic genre to change diachronically.

One major scholarly concern surrounding this genre is the folk/literati distinction. Hans Frankel highlighted the oral-formulaic characteristics of Han folk songs.[46] Charles Egan, on the other hand, argues that anonymous Music Bureau poems were not composed in performance by unlettered folk using formulaic language, on the grounds that they do not meet the relevant criteria, and that some poems contain literary and historical allusions or classical linguistic structures that are unlikely to be employed by folk authors. It is much more likely that members of the elite created both the corpora of anonymous Music Bureau poems presumably composed by commoners and those presumably composed by literati. Their involvement is evidenced by the fact that they could easily incorporate colloquial elements. Egan points out that the stylistic difference between the two corpora "should not be seen as due to a difference in the social and educational levels of composers, but rather as the result of differing functions for poetry, one performative and the other written."[47]

The other concern is the influential traditional definition of Music Bureau poetry—it is not clear-cut, especially once the works had ceased to be associated with music. The compositions or the collections of compositions for the Han Music Bureau office had been tied to music. The pre-Tang imitative works were not necessarily set to music, and early- to mid-Tang writings were generally not put to music. Finally, there is the whole body of work that is lumped under the heading "Music Bureau poetry" simply because it was tied to music, resulting in lyrics (*ci* 詞) that appeared in the late Tang and flourished in the Song also being called *yuefu*.

Xiao Difei 蕭滌非 proposes that for modern scholars, the two major defining criteria must be literary and historical values rather than music. This is because any music that might originally have accompanied the poems can no longer be reconstructed; thus, it is meaningless to emphasize the musical aspect of Music Bureau poems. Importantly, the outstanding feature of this genre is social criticism.[48] Joseph Allen also argues that using musicality to define Music Bureau poetry is no longer viable. This is because it does not provide us with any method to test, to appreciate, or to read the genre. He thus proposes that thematic imitation, or, preferably, intratextuality, would serve as better defining criteria. These principles also account for many of the core poems in textual ways.[49] The intratext in this case would consist of a set of Music Bureau poems that are identified

with each other by shared or derived titles,[50] and a Music Bureau poem should either draw basic materials (such as language or images) from the previous corpus of Music Bureau poetry or eventually become one of them as literati of later generations resonate with it in their imitation works.[51]

This resonance with the previous corpus of Music Bureau poems was precisely what confined the genre, but this adherence to the original Music Bureau poems was criticized by Yuan for failing to keep the content abreast with time. He pointed out that Music Bureau poetry was like the airs and odes of the *Songs* that contain social criticism and express one's feelings regarding contemporary affairs. The best imitation poems should keep this key feature in mind. This meant that, even though poets might write on the ancient titles, these new creations would have embedded meanings that either criticize or eulogize contemporary affairs and thus would provide a reference for the emperor. In this way, the poems could still demonstrate the principle of using ancient events to indirectly criticize the present.

Reimagining Poetry in the Wake of Rebellion

Yuan notes that he and his friends Li Shen and Bai Juyi approved of Du Fu's practice.[52] Therefore, in his early years, Yuan refused to write Music Bureau poems with ancient titles. Instead, he composed Music Bureau poetry with new titles, deliberately treating it as a new poetic genre that eventually was known as New Music Bureau poetry. Although these poems still carry the name "Music Bureau poems," their resemblance to the former Music Bureau poems is merely the intention that these poems serve as a thermometer of rule. Similar to Du Fu, who wrote Music Bureau poems with new titles when he witnessed the disasters caused by the An Lushan Rebellion, politics likewise had a crucial role to play in Yuan's composition.

During Yuan's times, the empire was no longer in full control of many regions beyond the capital area, and the pressing question for supporters of the court was how to strengthen the central government. As the empire sought to regain strength economically and militarily, it was common for literati to stress the role of the emperor in facilitating a core reform that would transform the guiding principles of the empire. Only when the proper principles are established, they believed, can proper policies be devised and implemented. The emperor would need the support of his officials, and he would need to be open to their ideas. It was against this background that Yuan stressed the political usefulness of New Music Bureau poems. It is also why he chose to respond to twelve of Li Shen's poems that criticized current affairs most severely.[53]

The strong political criticisms of these poems might have been the reason Yuan redefined New Music Bureau poetry in a totally different

manner in 812, two years after he was demoted to Jiangling 江陵 (in modern Hubei) due to his investigation of corruption by powerful officials. This time he notes, "Those whose words follow the tradition of Music Bureau poetry, yet are restricted to depicting and describing objects and scenery, are called Music Bureau poetry with new titles" 詞實樂流, 而止於模象物色者, 為新題樂府.[54] This definition does not apply to his twelve New Music Bureau poems as we know them today. Either he was undermining his poems, or there was another set of poems that has been lost.[55] Nonetheless, his silence on his New Music Bureau poems that carry political connotations suggests that he was exercising caution after his exile from the capital, a period that ultimately lasted almost ten years.

Li Shen and Yuan Zhen's New Music Bureau poetry inspired Bai Juyi to write response poems; in the process, Bai created more new titles. Both Yuan and Bai claimed that they commented on contemporary matters in hopes that the emperor and the ministers would heed them and make changes to their policies accordingly. While Yuan pointed out that New Music Bureau poetry contained similar political value to the *Songs,* Bai went a step further to format his New Music Bureau poetry according to the received edition of the said text. The way that he titled his New Music Bureau poems with the beginning words of his poem is an imitation of the *Songs*.[56]

This manuscript argues that Yuan went beyond the social criticism found in the *Songs*, and embarked directly for state governance. The entire set of his New Music Bureau poetry proposes to reconstruct a civilized society by elevating music and ritual and actualizing the principle of benevolence.

Yuan Zhen's Role in Literary Innovation

Yuan's pursuit of literary innovation was galvanized by the wish to rebuild the Tang empire, which, after the An Lushan Rebellion, was beleaguered by insubordinate military governors, powerful eunuchs, cliques, and foreign powers. Given its importance to Yuan and many literati of the late eighth and early ninth centuries and its impact on Tang state and society, a brief review of the rebellion is in order.

In 755, An Lushan 安祿山 (d. 757), the most powerful military governor of the Tang emperor Xuanzong 玄宗 (685–762, r. 712–756), rebelled. The rebellion lasted for eight years and caused the central government to lose its control over many regions, especially the northeast. Although the revolt was ultimately put down, the central government was seriously weakened, and the mid- to late Tang saw the rise of semi-independent military governors.

One of the immediate effects of the rebellion on the literary arena was that literati aimed to revive the civilizing power of *wen* 文 (culture/literature/pattern),[57] as they believed that the lack of virtue in military governors was partially responsible for the rebellion. Literati thus contemplated the function of literature and its relation to governance. Their aspiration for change was coupled with a desire to supersede the literary accomplishments of the High Tang in terms of the perfection of regulated verse and the uplifting spirit or broad vision displayed in literature.

Various literary genres flourished; some experienced transformation. One such example was Tang tales, which saw remarkable development. Tales have been considered by literary histories a popular genre for the "warming of scrolls," when in fact poetry was a more common form for such practice at the time.[58] Other forms of prose writing also reached new heights, especially in the hands of Han Yu, who created an extraordinary style to show the marvels of ancient-style prose. Even imperial documents were a site of innovation by Yuan and Bai. In their hands, such documents ceased to be standard formulas; they focused now on the effective use of content and style for establishing state authority.

Yuan was the initiator of many literary innovations, to the point that Bai, who later overshadowed him, was often his supporter and sometimes even his follower.

In the realm of prose, Yuan was renowned for his "Yingying zhuan" 鶯鶯傳 ("The Tale of Yingying") and for his imperial documents. "Yingying zhuan," the only Tang tale under his name, was originally titled "Chuanqi" 傳奇 (Transmission of the extraordinary), later considered the name of the genre.[59] The tale was extraordinary enough to cement his name in the genre, and has had numerous adaptations in later generations.[60] He also renovated the function of imperial documents as a means of governance[61] and used ancient-style prose in place of the popular parallel prose; some of his works fully demonstrate the solemn style of the Confucian classic, *Documents*. His rescript writing was especially appreciated by Muzong, and this revision in the writing style of imperial mandates won him praise among the supporters of ancient-style prose. Yuan was made chief minister for these literary and political skills.[62]

Poetic style also underwent great changes. Yuan was a seminal figure in Yuanhe-style poetry. In this context, Yuanhe style refers specifically to the response poems written between Yuan and Bai.[63] When Yuan presented his collection of poetry to Chief Minister Linghu Chu 令狐楚 (766–837) in 819, he pointed out clearly that he and Bai were both leaders in composing Yuanhe-style poetry. Although some tried to imitate their writing style, Yuan considered many such attempts to be failures that were inadequate in both content and literary technique; therefore, they were not worthy of the name. Yuan and Bai experimented with the use of language and all but

exhausted the possibilities of prosody and rhymes using the form of regulated poetry. Bai would compose poems of up to five hundred or a thousand words and send them to Yuan. Yuan would playfully follow Bai's original rhymes and create new lines different from the original poem, challenging him to write more.[64] Yuan was also known for his elegiac poetry, especially the poems he wrote for his wife, Wei Cong 韋叢 (783–809), who died young at the age of twenty-six.

Finally, Yuan was a pivotal figure in the writing of New Music Bureau poetry, the center of this research. Yuan, Bai, and also Li Shen were its leading figures. They made a conscious attempt to reconsider the function of literature and to formulate writing principles of their own. By reworking the form and titles of Music Bureau poetry and tying the genre to governance, they moved away from thematic imitation and intratextuality. In doing so, they created a new form of Music Bureau poetry. Their creations not only present firsthand observations of mid-Tang politics but also demonstrate their literary experimentation. With his use of highly erudite language to present his advice on governance, Yuan, in particular, had completely moved away from the folk elements of Music Bureau poetry.

This advice concerns the reconstruction of the Confucian standard of rule. Music and ritual were believed to be not only the essential means to cultivate virtue but also the signifiers of *wen*. As such, they were considered key methods of rule. In the Confucian textual tradition, the Western Zhou 西周 (eleventh century–770 BCE) was greatly celebrated for its implementation of these two methods: Music acted as a means to transform the human temperament, and ritual acted as a means to regulate behavior. They were understood to constitute the highest form of civil governance established by the sages. Although during the Qin 秦 dynasty (221–206 BCE), appreciation of rule by music and ritual gave way to a Legalist framework of reward and punishment,[65] music and ritual remained core values of Confucian philosophy.

These core values were promoted by Yuan Zhen as beneficial for state governance at a time when they were seen as having been marginalized through contact with other cultural traditions and the fallout from the An Lushan Rebellion. The Tang dynasty had been established by the Li clan, who were descended from an offshoot of a minor Han lineage and non-Chinese tribal aristocrats.[66] Many military governors of the time, including An Lushan, were also of mixed ethnic background.[67] Mutual influence between Han and non-Chinese culture was common in the post-Han period, particularly during the early Tang.

After the rebellion, however, the decline of ritual became a concern for the imperial court, to the point that Xianzong openly commented on it, calling for a response in the imperial examination in 806.[68] It was the goal of Yuan, the literatus whose work is examined here, to examine not

only the reasons for the decline of ritual but also to consider the value of ritual and to reflect on means to promote it. His advocacy of the governing principle of benevolence, realized by music and ritual, could be seen as a response to this concern of Xianzong, whom he memorialized by means of these New Music Bureau poems, in hopes of encouraging the reconstruction of a sagacious era.

Notes

1 See Shizunaga Takeshi, *Haku Kyo'i "fūyushi" no kenkyū* 白居易「諷諭詩」の研究 (Tokyo: Bensei shuppan, 2000), 115–45. For studies on the warming of scrolls, see Cheng Qianfan 程千帆, *Tangdai jinshi xingjuan yu wenxue* 唐代進士行卷與文學 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1980) and Cheng Guofu 程國賦, "Tangdai xiaoshuo yu jinshike kaoshi" 唐代小說與進士科考試, in *Tangdai xiaoshuo yu zhonggu wenhua* 唐代小說與中古文化 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 2000), 95–155.
2 Preface of "He Li Jiaoshu xinti Yuefu shi'er shou," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 24.717–18.
3 Liu Xie 劉勰 (ca. 466–538/ca. 465–532), *Wenxin diaolong zhu* 文心雕龍註, annot. Fan Wenlan 范文瀾 (1893–1969), 2 vols. (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1962).
4 Anne Birrell, "Mythmaking and Yüeh-Fu: Popular Songs and Ballads of Early Imperial China," *JAOS* 109, no. 2 (1989): 223–35: 233.
5 Birrell supports Jean-Pierre Dieny's argument that the Music Bureau referred to an early Han office that Emperor Wu renamed as a new institution around 111 BCE. See Anne Birrell, *Popular Songs and Ballads of Han China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1993), xviii–xx. Wang Yunxi 王運熙 proposes that this musical institution was established in 117 BCE. See Wang Yunxi, "Han Wu shili *Yuefu* shuo" 漢武始立樂府說, in Wang Yunxi, *Yuefushi shulun* 樂府詩述論 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2006), 192–94.
6 The knob bell was identified by the archeologist Yuan Zhongyi 袁仲一. The earliest possible date for the sealing clay to have been made was the late Warring States period. For a survey of the excavation of this bell and sealing clay and their significance, see Chen Sihai 陳四海, "Cong Qin Yuefuzhong Qin fengni de chutu tan Qinshihuang jianli Yuefu de yinyue sixiang" 從秦樂府鐘秦封泥的出土談秦始皇建立樂府的音樂思想, *Zhongguo yinyuexue* 中國音樂學, no. 1 (2004): 52–57. See also Kou Xiaoxin 寇效信, "Qin Han Yuefu kaolue—You Qin Shihuangling chutu de Qin Yuefu bianzhong tanqi" 秦漢樂府考略——由秦始皇陵出土的秦樂府編鐘談起, *Shaanxi shifan daxue xuebao* 陝西師範大學學報, no. 1 (1978): 35–37. The excavation of the chime stones inscribed with "Beigong Yuefu" 北宮樂府 (Yuefu of the northern palace) provided evidence for the existence of the Yuefu during the late Warring States period. See Xin Xuefeng 辛雪峰, "Cong 'Beigong Yuefu' shiqing ji qi xiangguan wenwu kan Qin Yuefu yinyue" 從「北宮樂府」石磬及其相關文物看秦樂府音樂, *Yinyue yanjiu* 音樂研究, no. 1 (2021): 39–46.
7 Chen Ruiquan 陳瑞泉, "Qin 'Yuefu' xiaokao" 秦「樂府」小考, *Tianjin yinyue xueyuan xuebao* 天津音樂學院學報, no. 4 (2005): 26–32.
8 See Zhang Yongxin 張永鑫, "Qindai Yuefu" 秦代樂府, in chapter three, *Han Yuefu yanjiu* 漢樂府研究 (1992; Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 2000), 37–44.
9 Sun Shangyong 孫尚勇, *Yuefu wenxue wenxian yanjiu* 樂府文學文獻研究 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2007), 73.

10 Birrell, *Popular Songs and Ballads of Han China*, xx.
11 "Liyue zhi" 禮樂志, in Ban Gu, *Han shu*, 12 vols. (1962; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002), 22.1045. See also Wang, "Han Wu shi li Yuefu shuo," in Wang, *Yuefushi shulun*, 192–94.
12 See Zhang, *Han Yuefu yanjiu*, 57–63.
13 Wang Rubi 王汝弼, *Yuefu sanlun* 樂府散論 (Xi'an: Shanxi renmin chubanshe, 1984), 4.
14 See Anne Birrell, "Balladry and Popular Song," in *The Columbia History of Chinese Literature*, 953–63; page 953.
15 "Yiwen zhi" 藝文志, in Ban, *Han shu*, 30.1756.
16 See Zhang, *Han Yuefu yanjiu*, 66–69; 83–86.
17 "Yiwen zhi," in Ban, *Han shu*, 30.1756.
18 For the impact of folk songs on the composition of literati, see Wang Yunxi, "Yuefu minge he zuojia zuopin de guanxi" 樂府民歌和作家作品的關係, in Wang, *Yuefushi shulun*, 379–85.
19 See Chen Yicheng 陳義成, *Han Wei Liuchao Yuefu yanjiu* 漢魏六朝樂府研究 (Taipei: Jiaxin shuini gongsi wenhua jijinhui, 1976), 112.
20 For the genre designation of Music Bureau poetry, see Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 47–52.
21 Birrell, "Mythmaking and Yüeh-Fu," 235.
22 See Stephen Owen, "*Yuefu* as a Generic Term," Appendix A in *The Making of Early Chinese Classical Poetry* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2006), 301–7.
23 See Owen, "The Musical Traditions," Appendix B in *The Making of Early Chinese Classical Poetry*, 308–12.
24 "Chen Zi'ang zhuan," in *XTS*, 107.4078.
25 For the translation of this title as "Inspiration and Encounters," see Tim W. Chan, "The 'Ganyu' of Chen Zi'ang: Questions on the Formation of a Poetic Genre," *T'oung Pao*, 2nd series, 87, fasc. 1/3 (2001), 14–42; page 42.
26 The exact number of poems in the series varies in different sources. In Xu Peng's 徐鵬 compilation for Chen Zi'ang, there are thirty-eight poems. See *Chen Zi'ang ji* 陳子昂集, coll. and punc. Xu Peng, rev. ed. (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2013), 3–14.
27 For the study of the meaning of "Ganyu" and the broad scope of themes covered in the series, including that of alchemy, see Chan, "The 'Ganyu' of Chen Zi'ang," 14–42. Tim W. Chan has provided a critical review of Chen's role as a "reformer" of poetry and the real nature of his "Ganyu" poems. He points out the influence of self-promotion on literary compositions and explains the actual contributions of Chen to the so-called "reform," while elaborating on the diverse themes to be found in the "Ganyu" poems. See Part III, "Chen Zi'ang: The 'Reformer' of Poetry," in Tim W. Chan, "In Search of Jade: Studies of Early Tang Poetry" (PhD diss., University of Colorado, 1999), 148–225.
28 See Ge Xiaoyin, "Lun Li Bai Yuefu de fu yu bian" 論李白樂府的復與變, in *Shiguo gaochao yu sheng Tang wenhua* 詩國高潮與盛唐文化 (Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 1998), 162–77.
29 For the translation of this *fu* and detailed annotations in English, see David R. Knechtges, *Wen xuan, Volume Three: Rhapsodies on Natural Phenomena, Birds and Animals, Aspirations and Feelings, Sorrowful Laments, Literature, Music, and Passions* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996), 105–39. "Rhapsody" he now prefers to have directly named as *fu* without translation to show the unique features of this genre.

30 See Yuan, "Xushi ji Letian shu," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 30.853–60. For studies on the embedded meanings of the "Ganyu" poems, see Liu Yuanzhi 劉遠智, *Chen Zi'ang ji qi "Ganyu" shi yanjiu* 陳子昂及其感遇詩研究 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1987), 57–134 and He Wenhui 何文滙, *Chen Zi'ang "Ganyu" shi jian* 陳子昂感遇詩箋 (Hong Kong: Xuejin chubanshe, 1978), 21–138. Also see Wu Mingxian 吳明賢, "Shilun Chen Zi'ang 'Ganyu' shi de sixiang neirong" 試論陳子昂感遇詩的思想內容, in *Chen Zi'ang yanjiu lunji* 陳子昂研究論集, comp. Sichuansheng Shehongxian Chen Zi'ang yanjiu lianluozu 四川省射洪縣陳子昂研究聯絡組 (Beijing: Zhongguo wenlian chuban gongsi, 1989), 187–99 and Yang Yuxiang 羊玉祥, "Chen Zi'ang 'Ganyu' shi shenmei qingqu chutan" 陳子昂感遇詩審美情趣初探, in *Chen Zi'ang yanjiu lunji*, 200–213.

31 David R. Knechtges, "A Journey to Morality: Chang Heng's 'The Rhapsody on Pondering the Mystery'," in *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library (1932–1982)*, ed. Chan Ping-leung et al. (Hong Kong: Fung Ping Shan Library, Hong Kong University, 1982), 162–82.

32 Chu Wo-Hsin 朱我芯, "Tangdai Xin Yuefu zhi fazhan guanjian—Li Bai kaichuang zhi gong yu Du Fu, Yuan Jie zhi shuangxian kaizhan" 唐代新樂府之發展關鍵——李白開創之功與杜甫、元結之雙線開展, *Zhengda zhongwen xuebao* 政大中文學報, no. 7 (June 2007): 25–52.

33 See "Tang gu Gongbu Yuanwailang Du jun muximing bingxu" 唐故工部員外郎杜君墓係銘並序, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 3: 56.1360–62.

34 Yuan, "Xu shi ji Letian shu," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 30.854.

35 "Bei Chentao" lamented the defeat of government troops by rebels in 756 and the commoners' wish for rescue. See Qiu Zhao'ao 仇兆鰲 (1638–c. 1713), *Dushi xiangzhu* 杜詩詳注, 5 vols. (1979; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2004), vol. 1: 4.314.

36 "Ai jiangtou" was composed in 757 to criticize Xuanzong 玄宗 for showering excessive favor on Consort Yang Yuhuan 楊玉環 (719–756), which many considered to have led to a neglect of governance and the resulting rebellion. See Qiu, *Dushi xiangzhu*, vol. 1: 4.329–33.

37 "Bingju xing" criticizes the forced recruitment during the Tianbao era (742–756). See Qiu, *Dushi xiangzhu*, vol. 1: 2.113.

38 "Liren xing" was written in 753 to criticize Yang Guozhong 楊國忠 (d. 756) for getting physically too close to his cousin, Guoguo furen 虢國夫人, who was the elder sister of Consort Yang. See Qiu, *Dushi xiangzhu*, vol. 1: 2.156.

39 Qiu, *Dushi xiangzhu*, vol. 2: 7.523.

40 Wang Huibin 王輝斌, provides various evidence to show that these poems are pentasyllabic ancient-style poems rather than New Music Bureau poems. See Wang Huibin, "Lun Du Fu 'sanli' 'sanbie' de shiti shuxing—Jianji Tangdai Xin Yuefu de youguan wenti" 論杜甫「三吏」「三別」的詩體屬性——兼及唐代新樂府的有關問題, *Du Fu yanjiu xuekan* 杜甫研究學刊, no. 3 (2005): 40–46, 77.

41 See Du Xiaoqin 杜曉勤, "'Qinzhongyin' fei Xin Yuefu kaolun—Jianlun Bai Juyi Xin Yuefushi de tishi tezheng ji houren zhi wujie" 〈秦中吟〉非「新樂府」考論——兼論白居易新樂府詩的體式特徵及後人之誤解, *Wenxue yichan* 文學遺產, no. 1 (2015): 55–69. Ge Xiaoyin defined the two sets as New Music Bureau poems, and she studied their literary features to illustrate the literary significance of Du Fu in expressing his concern with social issues, and in mastering the narrative skills of third-person narration and the objectification of the scene. See Ge, "Lun Du Fu de xinti Yuefu" 論杜甫的新題樂府, in *Shiguo gaochao yu sheng Tang wenhua*, 197–210. See also Yang Shengkuan 楊勝寬,

"Yuan, Bai dui Du Fu xinti Yuefu de renshi yu pingjia—Jianlun erren changdao Xin Yuefu yundong de zuoyong yu gongxian" 元、白對杜甫新題樂府的認識與評價——兼論二人倡導新樂府運動的作用與貢獻, *Jiangsu keji daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 江蘇科技大學學報（社會科學版）, no. 4 (2013): 12–18.

42 Nienhauser quoted Matsuda Kiyohide 增田清秀 to support this argument. For the background to Yuan Jie's composition and translations of this set of poems, see William H. Nienhauser, Jr., "'Twelve Poems Propagating the Music Bureau Ballad': A Series of Yüeh-fu by Yüan Chieh," in William H. Nienhauser, Jr., ed., *Critical Essays on Chinese Literature* (Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1976), 135–46.

43 Zhang Yu 張煜 argues that it was the ancient-style Music Bureau poems of Zhang Ji and Wang Jian that had an impact on Yuan and Bai's composition, not the New Music Bureau poems that were actually composed after Yuan and Bai. See Zhang Yu, "Zhang Wang Yuefu yu Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu chuangzuo guanxi zai kaocha" 張王樂府與元白新樂府創作關係再考察, *Wenxue pinglun* 文學評論, no. 4 (2007): 89–92. Lü Chia Hui 呂家慧 argues that Zhang and Wang continued on from Li Bai in using nonregulated verse to write Music Bureau poetry, and they strengthened Du Fu's practice of using ballads to comment on contemporary affairs. Their response poems in the form of Music Bureau poems might also have inspired the creation of new titles that was one of the hallmarks of Yuan and Bai's poetry of the sort. See Lü Chia Hui, "Zhang Wang Yuefu: Cong guti Yuefu dao xinti Yuefu de guodu" 張王樂府：從古體樂府到新題樂府的過渡, in chapter three of "Cong xing liyue dao guan shengmin: Lun Zhong Tang Yuefu de fuxing yu xinbian" 從興禮樂到觀生民：論中唐樂府的復興與新變 (PhD diss., Chinese University of Hong Kong, 2014), 119–52.

44 Guo made this broad categorization when he introduced the New Music Bureau poetry. See Guo Maoqian, *Yuefu shiji*, 4 vols. (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1998), vol. 4: 90.1262–63.

45 These twelve categories are: 1. hymns for suburban and ancestral temple rituals 郊廟歌辭; 2. state banquet songs 燕射歌辭; 3. songs accompanied by drums and wind instruments 鼓吹曲辭; 4. songs accompanied by horizontal flutes 橫吹曲辭; 5. matching songs 相和歌辭; 6. songs in the tunes *qing* and *shang* 清商曲辭; 7. dance songs 舞曲歌辭; 8. songs for the zither 琴曲歌辭; 9. miscellaneous songs 雜曲歌辭; 10. songs of recent times 近代曲辭; 11. miscellaneous songs and airs 雜歌謠辭; 12. New Music Bureau poems 新樂府辭. See the table of contents in Guo, *Yuefu shiji*, 1–97. Translation slightly revised from Frankel, "Yüeh-fu Poetry," 71.

46 Hans Frankel, "The Formulaic Language of the Chinese Ballad 'Southeast Fly the Peacocks'," *The Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology* 39, no. 2 (1969): 219–41.

47 Charles H. Egan, "Were Yüeh-fu Ever Folk Songs? Reconsidering the Relevance of Oral Theory and Balladry Analogies," *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews* 22 (December 2000): 31–66.

48 See Xiao Difei, *Han Wei Liuchao Yuefu wenxueshi* 漢魏六朝樂府文學史 (1984; rpt. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1998), 9–10.

49 Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 64–65.

50 Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 11.

51 Allen, *In the Voice of Others*, 37–68.

52 Yuan, "Yuefu you xu" 樂府有序, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 23.674.

53 See the preface of "He Li Jiaoshu xinti Yuefu shi'er shou," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 24.717–18.

54 See Yuan, "Xu shi ji Letian shu" 敘詩寄樂天書, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 30.855.
55 Lü Chia Hui suggests that there was a type of New Music Bureau poetry that had nothing to do with social criticism, and that those poems that criticize contemporary issues fall under the narrow definition of this genre. See note #56 in Lü, "Cong xing liyue dao guan shengmin," 21.
56 See Bai, "Xin Yuefu bingxu," in *BJYJJJ*, 3.136; Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 124.
57 *Wen* could mean external appearances, forms, normative patterns, and models whose authority derived from their Zhou-dynasty (eleventh century–770 BCE) origins. In the Tang it could be interpreted as textual traditions that originated in antiquity. See Bol, *This Culture of Ours*, 1.
58 Victor H. Mair, "Scroll Presentation in the T'ang Dynasty," *HJAS* 38, no. 1 (1978): 35–60.
59 Bian Xiaoxuan 卞孝萱 argues that *Taiping guangji* 太平廣記 retitled "Chuanqi" 傳奇 (Transmission of the extraordinary) using the protagonist's name. See Bian Xiaoxuan, "'Yingying zhuan' de yuanbiaoti ji xiezuo niandai" 鶯鶯傳的原標題及寫作年代, in Bian Xiaoxuan, *Tangdai wenshi luncong* 唐代文史論叢 (Taiyuan: Renmin chubanshe, 1986), 89–94. Li Zongwei 李宗為 and Zhou Shaoliang 周紹良 both supported this argument. See Li Zongwei, *Tangren chuanqi* 唐人傳奇 (1985; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003), 58; Zhou Shaoliang, *Tang chuanqi jianzheng* 唐傳奇箋証 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2000), 5–8.
60 The more representative ones are Zhao Lingzhi's 趙令畤 (1061–1134) "Shang diao 'Die lian hua'" 商調蝶戀花, Dong Jieyuan's 董解元 (1189–1208) *Xixiang ji zhugong diao* 西廂記諸宮調, and Wang Shifu's 王實甫 (1295–1307) *Xixiang ji* 西廂記. For detailed discussions on the story's effect on literary works, see Lorraine Dong, "The Creation and Life of Cui Yingying (c. 803–1969)" (Ph.D. diss., University of Washington, 1978).
61 See "Zhigao youxu" 制誥有序, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 40.1007.
62 See *BJYJJJ*, vol. 6: 70.3736; see also "Yuan Zhen zhuan" 元稹傳, in *JTS*, 166.4333.
63 When used as a general term, Yuanhe style refers to the leading literary style that covered different genres during the Yuanhe 元和 (806–820) era. See Li Zhao 李肇 (*fl.* 818), *Tang guoshi bu* 唐國史補 (1957; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979), 57.
64 For Yuan's comment on Yuanhe-style poetry, see "Shang Linghu Xianggong shi qi" 上令狐相公詩啟, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 3: appendix, 2.1450–51.
65 For a collection of research articles on Han Fei, the key figure of Legalism, and the philosophies presented in the *Han Feizi*, of which Han wrote a significant share, see Paul R. Goldin, ed., *Dao Companion to the Philosophy of Han Fei* (New York and London: Springer, 2013).
66 See "Tongzhi jieji zhi shizu ji qi shengjiang" 統治階級之氏族及其升降, in Chen Yinke, *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao* 唐代政治史述論稿 (1997; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2001), 1–48; and also Howard J. Wechsler, "The Founding of the T'ang Dynasty: Kao-tsu (618–26)," in *The Cambridge History of China*, vol. 3: *Sui and T'ang China, 589–906*, Part 1, ed. Denis Twitchett (1979; rpt. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 150–87.
67 For the ethnic origins of An Lushan, see Edwin G. Pulleyblank, *The Background of the Rebellion of An Lu-shan* (London: Oxford University Press, 1955), 7–23.
68 See "Caishi jianmao mingyu tiyongce yidao" 才識兼茂明於體用策一道, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2: 28.818–26.

3 Music and Ritual as Means of Governance

Throughout traditional Chinese history, music and ritual were highly celebrated as two major means of governance. In particular, the Western Zhou dynasty was pictured as a sagacious period that saw the value of their use. This chapter analyzes the institutionalization of music and ritual as means of governance. This entails looking at the following topics: the significance of the five types of rites and the six types of dances; the ritual ceremonies and musical performances observed during the Tang; the functions of music and ritual in terms of rule; and the social and political background that brought Xianzong's attention to music and ritual. It also reviews literati perceptions of the use of music and ritual as a means of governance.

Music and ritual complement each other. The *Liji* 禮記 (*Book of Rites*) points out that "music is for people to bond; ritual is for people to differentiate. To bond is to love each other; to differentiate is to respect each other. If music overrides ritual, one would become unrestrained; if ritual overrides music, one would become distant" 樂者為同, 禮者為異。同則相親, 異則相敬。樂勝則流, 禮勝則離.[1] In other words, music speaks to the similarities between people; it echoes the feelings and emotions in everyone's hearts. In contrast, ritual addresses the differences between people. As such, it entails respect for people with different identities.

Ritual here is used roughly to translate *li* 禮. The precise meaning of this encompassing word depends on context; *li* could mean ritual ceremonies (i.e., rites for essential occasions), ritual practices (i.e., shared ritual that people of different statuses perform in different ways), or ritual proprieties (i.e., etiquette that governs everyday interactions). According to Michael David Kaulana Ing, the scope of *li* is so broad that not even the authors of the *Liji* have a singular view of the meaning of *li,* except that it is of utmost importance in creating an ordered world.[2] As Geir Sigurðsson points out, due to its semantic richness, the term *li* defies translation. This is how Sigurðsson explains the meanings of *li*: It was believed to signify ritual actions enacted by royal families of Xia, Shang, and Zhou to please the spirits; subsequently, it was extended to provide guidelines for proper

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-3

behavior. He thus concludes that *li* is "a heuristic model for acquiring the skill of successfully realizing the (moral) values of the cultural tradition, and thus for finding one's place and identity within it." He deduces that "*li* is in this sense an educative notion, one that in all its expansiveness enables socialization and thus, from the Confucian point of view, humanization."[3]

Despite the difficulties in translating *li*, in all contexts it concerns respect for oneself and others to achieve the state of order and harmony. *Li* can thus be understood as what Roger T. Ames defines as "ritual propriety in one's roles and relations, ritual practices, 'social grammar, rites, customs, etiquette, propriety, morals, rules of proper behavior, reverence.'"[4] In the ancient society of the Zhou, this need for respect is often stressed in relations between people of different statuses; that is to say, ritual was used to differentiate status and to make manifest different classes.[5] Confucius gave ritual a moralistic meaning. Subsequently, the scope of ritual came to include social etiquette. Mencius clearly points out that ritual refers to "the heart that knows when to politely decline treatment or benefits that one should not have received or obtained," known as *cirang zhi xin* 辭讓之心, thus showing deference that leads to propriety in behavior. This quality is one of the four buds of goodness humans are born with.[6] How materials should be apportioned according to ritual extends from this idea. This is a concept that Xunzi 荀子 (c. 313–238 BCE) clearly articulated in his "Li lun" 禮論 (Disquisition on ritual).[7] John Knoblock points out that in Xunzi's thought, *li*, which he translates as ritual principles, not only encompasses the highest sense of morality, duty, and social order; it also concerns the most minor rules of good manners, the minutiae of polite forms, and details of costume and dress.[8] As Roger T. Ames and David L. Hall propose, *li* is "a resolutely personal performance revealing one's worth to oneself and to one's community, a personal and a public discourse through which one constitutes and reveals oneself qualitatively as a unique individual, a whole person."[9] All things considered, ritual is a means to achieve order and harmony in a society.

The counterpart of ritual is music. In the transition from the Spring and Autumn period (770 to the fifth century BCE) to the Warring States period, various philosophers examined the value of music in running a state. The Mohists strongly criticized music. To them, music was a waste of energy and resources and a distraction from work.[10] In contrast, Confucius valued music. He appreciated not simply the sounds produced by musical instruments, but rather the capacity of music to transform customs.[11] Erica Brindley has compared texts dating from ca. 450–300 BCE with texts dating from ca. 300–150 BCE. She points out that there is a change in the understanding of harmony and music driven by state interests in cosmic order and control, from "psychology of influence" that emphasizes music's role in self-cultivation and its effects on the human psyche, to "psychology

of cosmic attunement" that links music to the fundamental harmony of the cosmos. She concludes that—in keeping with the claims concerning state access to and control over the cosmos that were prevalent in early imperial times—authentic music would need to help justify state power on a cosmic scale.[12] While authentic music indicates the health of the state and the virtue of the ruler, excessive music indicates its exact opposite.[13] Music practiced by the sage ruler could even transform animals. Indeed, as Roel Sterckx mentions, "late Warring States, Qin and Han writings frequently present sinicizing the outer regions as tantamount to domesticating barbarians as one domesticates animals, or to transforming the beasts into cultured subjects of the central sage-ruler."[14] Associated with the practice of ritual were bell-chimes and other paraphernalia of ritual music that were emblematic of the aristocratic culture of the Chinese Bronze Age.[15] Ceremonial music displayed the qualities of authentic music, and musical instruments helped achieve these qualities.

Music and ritual complement each other in encouraging self-cultivation and in formulating a civilized state. As Scott Cook states, ritual and music achieve opposite but complementary aims; each counteracts the negative effects resulting from an excess of the other. While the differentiation imposed by ritual is needed to allow society to properly function, the harmonizing power of music is needed to ensure that ritual does not lead to estrangement. Ideal music exhibits the characteristics of ritual—a well-balanced society should function like a well-balanced piece of music, in which each member maintains their position in such a way as to allow for the harmonious operation of the whole.[16] For these reasons, Confucius (c. 551–479 BCE) used ritual and music as a moral compass. Kenneth J. DeWoskin points out that Confucius stressed the importance of music for an individual's internal cultivation; moreover, a gentleman should never be far from ritual instruments, even in moments of great duress. He also states that Confucians were very conservative. They studied and prized performance styles of the ancient sage rulers and eschewed anything foreign or innovative.[17]

In order to make music and ritual meaningful and effective, a benevolent heart that recognizes their value is essential. Confucius said, "When we talk about ritual, is it simply about jade and silk? When we talk about music, is it simply about bells and drums?" 禮云禮云, 玉帛云乎哉? 樂云樂云, 鐘鼓云乎哉? [18] Jade and silk are major objects used in ritual ceremonies, signifying civil correspondence. Jade refers specifically to a type of elongated, pointed tablet of jade held in the hands by ancient rulers on ceremonial occasions. Silk likewise refers to a type of bundled silk used as presents between feudal lords during visits. Bells and drums are instruments for performances of music. The ritual ceremonies and the music should be performed with a benevolent heart; if not, they would be

reduced to sheer form, treading the path of hypocrisy. This benevolence is manifested in the ruler's policies. As recorded in the *Analects*, "The Master said, 'What can people do with ritual if they are not benevolent? What can people do with music if they are not benevolent?'" 子曰：「人而不仁, 如禮何？人而不仁, 如樂何？」[19] In other words, "benevolence" is the basis for any practice of music or ritual.

"Benevolence" (*ren* 仁) refers to genuine love toward others. For this reason, it is also translated as "compassion," "empathy," or even "humanity." Simply put, benevolence is "not to impose on others what you do not want to be imposed on yourself" 己所不欲, 勿施於人. It involves manifesting the "way of empathy" (*shu* 恕).[20] This love can be extended to other creatures and nature.[21] Historically, there have been various explanations of how best to accomplish this. The central idea of benevolence, however, is caring for others as you would care for yourself. The two essential means for cultivating this sense of virtue are filial piety and brotherly love. On the level of domestic governance, benevolence concerns implementing policies that meet the needs of commoners; such policies would make it possible for them to care for themselves and their families. Furthermore, consideration for others lays the foundation of a humanistic spirit. This spirit would prevent indulgence in popular music and hypocritical observance of rites.

Marrying ancient ethical theory to contemporary political practice is never easy. Yuan Zhen's writings give us a lens to examine how a Tang literatus struggled to express and apply these ideas to the problems of his time. Yuan was a graduate of the "Erudite in Classics" (*mingjing* 明經) examination; not surprisingly, he frequently alluded to classical texts, and such knowledge shaped his view of benevolence. We can extrapolate his understanding of this concept from close analysis of his poems, in which he criticized contemporary policies that might appear benevolent but were, in his opinion, otherwise.

Institutionalizing Ritual Ceremonies

The use of music and ritual as means of governance was believed to have been established by Duke Dan 旦 of Zhou 周 (also known as the Duke of Zhou), who established social order during the Western Zhou dynasty. Duke Zhou was an iconic figure of filial piety, brotherly love, and loyalty. He was the son of King Wen 文 and the younger brother of King Wu 武, the latter being the founder of the Western Zhou dynasty. Duke Zhou assisted King Wu in his expedition against King Zhou 紂 of Shang 商 and served dutifully as his subject, to the point that he prayed to take King Wu's place in death if the ruler had to die to serve the Higher Lord. When King Wu died, Duke Zhou assumed the governing role until his nephew,

King Cheng 成, was old enough to take over. His loyalty to the Zhou house and his selfless assistance to King Cheng have been highly praised throughout Chinese history.

According to the *Liji*, in the sixth year of his rule, Duke Zhou granted an audience to all the feudal lords at the Hall of Distinction, instituted ritual ceremonies, standardized musical dances, and gave out standard weights and measures; there was broad acceptance of Zhou rule and peace throughout the kingdom. The year after, he resigned his regency and handed over the reins of government to King Cheng.[22] The term *zhili zuoyue* 制禮作樂 was the standard expression referring to his institutionalization of ritual and music.

The *Zhou li* 周禮 (Rites of the Zhou) notes the Grand Minister of Education 大司徒 "used the five types of ritual ceremonies to restrain commoners from swindling and to teach them propriety" 以五禮防萬民之偽, 而教之中.[23] The Eastern Han commentator of the text, Zheng Zhong 鄭眾 (d. 83), explains that the five rites include "sacrificial ceremonies, sorrowful events, guest receptions, military practices, and enjoyable events" 吉凶賓軍嘉. Zheng Xuan's 鄭玄 (127–200) commentary likewise identified these five types of rites.[24] Clearly the rites are regulations for how an event or activity should be carried out. They provide guidance on the implementation of key ceremonies, through which people are prevented from going to extremes.[25]

The systematic treatment of the five rituals by the *Zhou li*, however, has been challenged by Zhao Lan 趙瀾. He proposes that the ritual practices of the Zhou reflected the lives of Zhou nobles and that their institutionalization was done by the First Emperor of the Qin to elevate the status of the emperor. The Han took note of the Qin ritual practices and established its own ritual codes. During the Qin and for much of the Han dynasty, these ritual practices still had not been categorized based on the five types of rites. It was only in the later years of the Eastern Han that these imperial rituals were called the five rites.[26]

In the order given by the two Zhengs, the rites for sacrificial ceremonies ranked first because they concerned offerings to Heaven and Earth. Those for sorrowful events came second because they concerned the spirits of the deceased. Guest receptions came third so as to encourage others to submit and pledge allegiance. The rites for military practices came next, showing that only when kindness fails to transform others is military action to be taken. The preceding three were seen as involving the feudal states. Finally, enjoyable events concern the commoners.[27]

The five rites continued to evolve in different eras and under various states. Ending a long period of division during the Six Dynasties, the Sui dynasty 隋 (581–619) unified the central plain. Emperor Wen 文 (541–604, r. 581–604), the founder of the dynasty, commanded Niu Hong

牛弘 (546–611), Chamberlain for Ceremonials 太常卿, to consolidate the elaborations of rites of the Six Dynasties into a text titled *Wuli* 五禮 (The five rites) that contained 130 essays.[28] Rites remained central to the idea of successful imperial governance.

Similar efforts were made in various reign eras of the Tang dynasty. When the Tang empire was founded, *Wude yixu* 武德儀序 (Ceremonial orders of the Wude era) was compiled during Gaozu's 高祖 reign (618–626). In the eleventh year of the Zhenguan era (637), scholars including Zhangsun Wuji 長孫無忌 (d. 659), Fang Xuanling 房玄齡 (579–648), Wei Zheng 魏徵 (580–643),[29] Li Baiyao 李百藥 (565–648), Yan Shigu 顏師古 (581–645), Linghu Defen 令狐德棻 (583–666), Kong Yingda 孔穎達 (574–648), and Yu Zhining 于志寧 (588–665) presented the *Da Tang yili* 大唐儀禮 (Rites and ceremonies of the Great Tang) to Taizong 太宗 (599–649, r. 627–649). There were sixty-one articles for the rites of sacrificial ceremonies, four for guest receptions, twenty for military practices, forty-two for enjoyable events, six for sorrowful events, and five for state funerals (i.e., for the emperor or empress), with a total of 138.[30]

This compilation has been referred to as the *Zhenguan li* 貞觀禮 (Rites of the Zhenguan era). This text followed the *Wude yixu*. It is significant as it revealed that during Gaozu's reign the rites for sorrowful events had already been moved to the end of the order of rites; the living were now prioritized.[31] This new order was also used in subsequent ritual texts, including *Xianqing li* 顯慶禮 (Rites of the Xianqing era), compiled by Zhangsun Wuji during Gaozong's 高宗 reign (650–684), and *Da Tang Kaiyuan li* 大唐開元禮 (Rites of the Kaiyuan era of the Great Tang), compiled by Xu Jian 徐堅 (659–729) during Xuanzong's reign.

Da Tang Kaiyuan li, often abbreviated as *Kaiyuan li*, was a summative, comprehensive, and systematic treatment of the Tang rites. It provided a standard reference at the time by summarizing the various ritual practices up till Taizong's time and by incorporating contemporary practices. It continued to be a text for examination during the Five Dynasties and the early Song dynasty. The *Kaibao tongli* 開寶通禮 (The comprehensive rites of the Kaibao era) compiled for the founding of the Song dynasty was based on it.[32] *Kaiyuan li* was also frequently consulted in later dynasties such as the Jin and the Yuan.[33] Its style and classification of the rites also set the standard for compilations of ritual texts in later dynasties, such as *Zhenghe wuli xinyi* 政和五禮新儀 (The new ceremonies of the five rites during the Zhenghe era [of the Song]), *Da Jin jili* 大金集禮 (The collected ceremonies of the Great Jin), *Ming jili* 明集禮 (The collected ceremonies of the Ming), and *Qinding Da Qing tongli* 欽定大清通禮 (The comprehensive rites of the Great Qing made by imperial order).

After the An Lushan Rebellion, the role of rituals was again stressed. In the fifth year of the Zhenyuan era (789), a special examination discipline

was created for the *Kaiyuan li* and the three ritual classics (i.e., *Zhou li*, *Yili*, and *Liji*). This provides evidence of the court's plan to promote ritual practices and the elevation of the *Kaiyuan li* to the three classics.[34] When Du You 杜佑 (735–812) compiled the *Tongdian* 通典 (Comprehensive canons), he incorporated details of the *Kaiyuan li* into the text.[35] Lü Wen 呂溫 (772–811) identified ritual and music as the two means to educate and transform people. Moreover, he proposed refining the *Kaiyuan li* and having it presented to officials and commoners; by doing so, the ritual practices therein would be observed dutifully.[36]

Institutionalizing Music

The Duke of Zhou was also said to have made dances to music a standard practice of the Zhou house. The *Zhou li* notes the Grand Minister of Education "uses six types of music to guard against the extreme emotions of commoners and to teach them harmony" 以六樂防萬民之情, 而教之和. Zheng Xuan quoted Zheng Zhong to identify these six types of dances with their musical accompaniments. These included "Yunmen" 雲門 ([The Yellow Emperor's virtue is similar to] the coverage of clouds), "Xianchi" 咸池 ([Yao's] virtue covers all), "Da shao" 大韶 ([Shun's] great inheritance [of Yao's virtue]), "Da Xia" 大夏 ([Yu's] augmentation of Xia), "Da hu" 大濩 ([Tang's] great salvation of the people), and "Da wu" 大武 (Great military force [of King Wu]).[37] They were composed to celebrate the founding rulers for their achievements in unifying the central plain. While "Yunmen," "Xianchi," "Da shao," and "Da Xia" symbolize literary/civil virtue, "Da hu" and "Da wu" symbolize military virtue. Both forms of virtue were seen as necessary for the establishment and strengthening of the state. These dances were thus highly regarded by rulers and were used in ritual ceremonies.

Both the *Liji zhengyi* 禮記正義 (The orthodox interpretation of the *Book of Rites*) and the *Shangshu tongkao* 尚書通考 (A thorough examination of the *Book of Documents*) hold that Shun 舜 composed "Da shao," Yu 禹 composed "Da Xia," and King Wu composed "Da wu"; each did this to celebrate his own merit. The *Shangshu tongkao* has no comment on "Yunmen," and it proposed that the Yellow Emperor composed "Xianchi."[38] Zheng Xuan comments that although the Yellow Emperor was the original composer of "Xianchi," it was commonly known as Yao's music due to his modification of the piece.[39]

This practice of creating new music to celebrate one's imperial achievements continued in the Han and the Tang dynasties. Taizong was known for his creation of "Shi'er he" 十二和 (The twelve harmonies) and "Qide wu" 七德舞 (Dances of seven virtues) to educate his people through cultural means. During the Zhenguan 貞觀 (627–649) era, Taizong examined

the music of the north and south passed down from the Sui dynasty. He concluded that the music was either tainted by the tones of the Wu 吳 (south of modern Jiangsu and north of modern Zhejiang) and Chu 楚 areas (in modern Hubei and Hunan) or imported from less civilized tribes. He therefore commanded Zu Xiaosun 祖孝孫 (d. c. 624), Zhang Wenshou 張文收 (fl. 627–670), and Lü Cai 呂才 (c. 600–665) to guide ritual music back to the proper way and to name it "Shi'er he."[40] The key feature that signifies it as the greatest music is its capability to harmonize with Heaven and Earth.[41] They were played when offering sacrifices to Heaven and Earth or to ancestors and also performed at the court; they were thus called the ceremonial music of the Great Tang.

After Zu passed away, Zhang Wenshou summoned the Authority of the Performance of Imperial Ceremonies 有司 to refine the compositions. Zhang personally examined and rectified the bamboo pitch-pipes, while Lü Cai, Secretary in Charge of Noting the Deeds and Gestures of the Emperor 起居郎, coordinated the music's sound. From Gaozong's reign, the titles included in "Shi'er he" were changed slightly, but the original titles were resumed during the Kaiyuan era.[42]

"Qide wu" was the most influential and significant dance during Tang times and was considered the music of the state. The development of this dance embodied the governing principle, which was to combine military and literary/civic virtues; this principle was considered characteristic of Taizong's reign. Its original title was "Pozhen yue" 破陣樂 (Music for breaking the enemy ranks), and it used to be the army music of the Sui dynasty. When Taizong was still Prince of Qin and had just defeated Liu Wuzhou 劉武周 (d. 622), who had declared himself emperor,[43] lyrics were put to the music to eulogize Taizong's merits; eventually, a dance accompanied with song and music appeared. This dance was first retitled "Qide wu" during Taizong's reign; during Gaozong's reign, it was renamed "Shengong pozhen yue" 神功破陣樂 (Music of the sagely achievement in defeating the enemy ranks).[44]

Taizong himself contributed to the fashioning of "Qide wu." He personally composed the dancing chart, which showed the dancers aligned in a circle on the left and a square on the right, with twenty-five dancers dressed as chariots in front and five dancers dressed as foot soldiers in the back, crisscrossing, bending, and stretching to symbolize the military ranks Yuli 魚麗 ("fish" battle formation) and Eguan 鵝鸛 ("goose and stork" battle formation). He also enlarged the scale of this dance to 120 dancers, asking Lü Cai to train them. The dancers wore armor and held two-pronged halberds, mimicking the battle array. There were three sections, and each section had four arrays to mimic striking and stabbing. The singers would also sing in harmony "The Defeat of the Enemy Ranks by the Prince of Qin."

Later, Taizong ordered the lyrics to be rewritten. To this task he assigned Wei Zheng, Assistant on the Right of the Department of Affairs of State 尚書右丞; Chu Liang 褚亮 (558–645), the Auxiliary Secretary of the Grand Counselor of the Emperor 員外散騎常侍; Yu Shinan 虞世南 (558–638), the Auxiliary Secretary of the Grand Counselor of the Emperor; and Li Baiyao, the Right President of the Grand Secretariat of the Heir Apparent 太子右庶子. He also renamed the piece "Qide wu."[45]

Taizong's choreography and renaming of the dance constituted an ideological statement at a foundational moment of the Tang dynasty. He first composed "Qingshan yue" 慶善樂 (Music on celebrating goodness) as the literary counterpart of "Pozhen yue." Later, he retitled "Pozhen yue" as "Qide wu" and "Qingshan yue" as "Jiugong wu" 九功舞 (Dance of nine merits). These actions demonstrated his intention to rule with both *wude* 武德 (military virtue) and *wende* 文德 (literary virtue), creating a state of harmony.[46] The original title "Pozhen yue" only speaks to the military strength of the ruler in defeating his enemies. But to stabilize the central plain and to unify the people, military power needs to be combined with civil power. Because *qide* 七德 (seven virtues) focuses on the seven civic effects to be achieved through military action, it is thus more appropriate in this sense.

The *locus classicus* of *qide* appears in the *Zuozhuan* 左傳 (*The Zuo Tradition*), which includes "the repression of cruelty, the calling in of the weapons of war, the preservation of the great appointment, the firm establishment of one's merits, the giving of repose to the people, the harmonizing of the multitude, and the enlargement of the general wealth" 禁暴、戢兵、保大、定功、安民、和眾、豐財. By including these seven virtues in the stanzas of "Da wu," King Wu laid them out for posterity.[47] Changing "Pozhen yue" to "Qide wu" eulogizes Taizong's ability to realize the seven virtues as stated in the *Zuozhuan*. Thereby, it compares Taizong to the sage ruler King Wu. It suggests that Taizong's military success was in service of a greater ambition, and his goal was nothing less than bringing about peace and prosperity.

The choreography of "Qide wu" further elaborates on the combination of military and literary virtues. Although it begins with dancers charging against imaginary enemies, its climax, known as *luan* 亂 (envoi), signifies ruling by literary virtue. This is when dancers kneel with their bodies straight and lift their left knees off the ground. This gesture originated from the "Da wu." In a conversation between Binmou Gu 賓牟賈 (fl. sixth century/fifth century BCE) and Confucius regarding the various gestures of the "Da wu" musical dance and their implications, Confucius points out the following:

> Music is a representation of accomplishments. The dancers hold their shields, standing as firm as a mountain, thus representing the attitude of King Wu. The violent movements of arms and fierce stamping

> with feet represent the enthusiasm of Jiang Taigong. The kneeling of all at the envoi represents the government at peace, instituted by the Dukes of Zhou and Shao.
>
> 夫樂者, 象成者也。總干而山立, 武王之事也; 發揚蹈厲, 大公之志也; 〈武〉亂皆坐, 周、召之治也。[48]

This passage suggests that King Wu launched an expedition only to rescue the people from King Zhou of Yin's tyrannical rule. The delay at the beginning of "Da wu" shows his reluctance to use military force. The vigorous swinging of arms and stamping of feet reflect the ambition of Jiang Taigong 姜太公 (also known as Jiang Ziya 姜子牙) in advising King Wu on conquering King Zhou. When the military expedition was over, lasting stability depended on the civil governance of Duke Zhou and Duke Shao. Taizong references the kneeling gesture of the "Da wu" to show his principle of governance. As the *Zuozhuan* suggested, the greatest military merit is to put an end to arms.

The Transforming Power of Music and Ritual

Both ritual ceremonies and dances to music have a clear set of performance instructions to establish a standard for people to follow. Their ethical meanings, however, are only made clear by Confucius. Ritual can restrain people from misbehaving, whereas music can regulate extreme emotions and bring people back to a state of neutrality. Ritual and music complement each other in the creation of a harmonious society.[49] For this reason, both the *Liji* and the *Yueshu* 樂書 (Book of music) were considered essential texts to study and were included in the six classics.[50] The *Yueshu* was probably the text that contained the most detailed information on musical concepts in pre-Han China, but it was likely destroyed in the book burning ordered by the First Emperor of Qin 秦始皇 (r. 246–210 BCE) in 213 BCE.[51] Although the *Yueshu* was lost, music continued to play an important role in ritual ceremonies. Moreover, its close connection to politics remained a focus of attention.

The earliest materials still extant concerning the nature and function of music include Xunzi's "Yue lun" 樂論 (Treatise on music), *Shiji*'s 史記 (*Grand Scribe's Records*) "Yueshu" 樂書 (Book on music),[52] and *Han shu*'s "Liyue zhi" 禮樂志 (Monograph on rites and music). The ideas expressed in these texts correspond with the "Yueji" 樂記 (Record of music) of the *Liji*, a classic that is generally believed to have been composed over an extended period of time by different authors.[53] The view of music stated in these works was influential, particularly on traditional scholars such as Yuan, who intensively studied ancient classics.

The *Liji* notes not only that music can produce pleasure but also that it is in the nature of people to seek pleasure.[54] That music brings pleasure is suggested by the character 樂, which means "pleasure" when pronounced as *le*, and "music" when pronounced as *yue*.[55] Music is persuasive since it strikes the chords of human emotions, and people are responsive to it. Sages took pleasure in it, for it can move people deeply and can transform manners and customs; the ancient kings promoted its instruction in regulating the expression of emotions.[56]

Since music is created of sound and tones, respectively known as *sheng* 聲 and *yin* 音, its differences from these two components are elaborated in the classics. The *Liji* points out that tones originate from the human heart, and music connects with ethics; thus, only the noble can comprehend music and have the capability to interpret its significance in governance and be close to ritual.[57] While beasts can only comprehend sounds, commoners can only comprehend musical tones, which constitute arrangements of sound pleasing to the ears. These musical tones are popular songs often filled with expressive lyrics and melodies that divert the listeners' minds from the state of harmony. It is the role of sages to promote ceremonial music instead to encourage calmness and peace, thereby maintaining the order of society.

A leader who is ignorant of the transforming power of ritual and music would lead his people astray and eventually induce the fall of his own state. The decline in their practice, known as *libeng yuehuai* 禮崩樂壞 (the decline of ritual and ceremonial music), was considered to be one of the factors in the decline of the Zhou dynasty. The Zhou practiced the enfeoffment system, which was essentially a division of power based on trust and kinship between the Son of Heaven and his feudal lords. Their hierarchical relation was to be maintained largely through the rites.

According to the *Liji*, all sage rulers established their own music and rites once they had stabilized society. This was done to celebrate the achievements through which their authority was created: Those whose merit was great enough would have perfect music to celebrate their merits, while those who governed well would have accomplished rites. The *Liji* moves on to comment that music that only comprises dances with shields and axes is not perfect music, and rites that only involve sacrifices with cooked flesh are not accomplished rites. The eras of the five lords were different, and they did not adopt the music of their predecessor. The three kings belonged to different ages, and none followed the rites of his predecessor. It then concludes that music carried to an extreme degree would cause obsession, whereas rites implemented coarsely would diverge from propriety. To value music and complete rites without risking obsession or threatening propriety was possible only for a great sage.[58]

The establishment and proper implementation of music and rites are thus indicative of the level of sagacity. They carry not just a governing value but also political and cultural value.

Popular Songs versus Ceremonial Music

The major factor that made ceremonial music more difficult to appreciate than popular songs was its relative simplicity. Popular songs were often full of evocative lyrics and melodies that aimed at moving listeners to sorrow or happiness. Their musical notes were thus more versatile and complex. This type of music is what Zixia 子夏 (507–c. 400 BCE) refers to as *niyin* 溺音 (vile tones), which contrast with *deyin* 德音 (virtuous tones). In a conversation between Zixia and Marquis Wen 文 of Wei 魏 (d. 396 BCE), Marquis Wen inquired of Zixia why he became sleepy while listening to virtuous tones, but never got tired of what Confucians considered vile. In response, Zixia explained the making of the respective songs and their nature.

According to Zixia, music equates to virtuous tones that are made by sagacious rulers, who infuse in them the order of nature and society. He says that "the great propriety" refers to the great order of ancient times, when Heaven and Earth acted according to their various natures, the four seasons were what they ought to be, people were virtuous, the five cereals were produced abundantly, and there were no calamities or evil omens. In response, the sages set forth the roles of father-and-son and ruler-and-subject as guiding principles for the society. When these roles were rectified, there was great pacification of all under Heaven. Then they rectified the six pitch-pipes associated with the *yang* principle and made resonant the five notes of the five-tone scale, singing to the zithers that played odes and praise-songs. These produced virtuous tones, and thus qualified as music.

Zixia then presents the vile tones of the Zheng, Song, Wei, and Qi states of the Spring and Autumn period as a contrast, that they all stimulate libidinous desire and cause injury to virtue, and thus they are not used in sacrificial ceremonies.[59] The term "Zheng Wei zhi yin" 鄭衛之音 (tones of the Zheng and Wei states) has come to signify music of a state in decline and was perceived negatively in Chinese history and literature.

In contrast to these new songs, the sages designed ceremonial music to calm the mind and spirit through simple and primitive notes: "The greatest music must be primitive; the greatest rites must be simple" 大樂必易, 大禮必簡.[60] Scott Cook notes that music was a form of multimedia which included music, sung poetry, and dance as a self-conscious form of musical

expression created by sages. He summarizes the differences between popular tunes and ceremonial music well:

> While *yin* (i.e., 音, musical tones) may **reflect** order (or lack thereof) in society, *yue* (i.e., 樂, music) seeks to **promote** it; while *yin* is in effect passively created through some outside influence, *yue* itself strives actively to create such an influence. To speak of it in another way: while *yin* may be applied [among other things] to the music of the common folk, *yue* can only refer to the music of the ruling class.[61]

In sum, commoners composed tunes for expression and entertainment, while the ruling class designed ceremonial music for its civilizing effect. Musical tones arise from the emotions of commoners and thus can be used as a mirror of governance; music arises from the design of the sages and can be used for governance. It is these musical tunes promoted by the sages that can be referred to as *yue* 樂 (music).

Tones as a Mirror of Governance

Since tones are expressive in nature and are often created and appreciated by commoners, they have distinctive features at times of great peace or disorder. As such, they can serve as thermometers of society.[62] When tones are filled with sorrow and distress, the state is not far from its fall. In the Tang dynasty, this connection deepened. There were literati who believed that musical tones could *directly* cause the decline of a state—not simply reflect it. In this context, tones and music were often equated; they were treated as one. This undifferentiated treatment of tones and music and the diverging understanding concerning the cause-and-effect relationship are evident in a conversation between Taizong and Du Yan 杜淹 (d. 628), President of the Tribunal of Censors 御史大夫, that is followed by the concluding remark of the renowned adviser Wei Zheng.

In Taizong's opinion, the making of music and ritual exists for the sage to educate commoners, using them as guidance for his people. Music by itself did not determine the success or failure of a government. Du Yan, however, disagreed. He argued that the rise and fall of the former dynasties should be attributed to their music, but the musical pieces he criticized could only be considered as musical tones. To support his argument, however, he noted that when the Chen 陳 dynasty (557–589) was about to fall, the emperor composed "Yushu houting hua" 玉樹後庭花 (Jade trees and blossoms of the rear garden). When the Qi 齊 (479–502) dynasty was about to fall, the emperor composed "Banlüqu" 伴侶曲 (Song of partners). When passersby heard these songs, they all wept sorrowfully. Du thus identified them as "musical tones of a perishing state" 亡國之音.

Taizong also did not differentiate between tones and music, but argued that music could not possibly be the cause of a state's decline. He believed that listeners are moved by what they have heard because of their own personal emotions and experience; whatever a joyful person hears would sound joyful to them, and vice versa. He commented that the emotions of sorrow and joy dwell within a person's heart, and do not originate from music. Using the same musical scores as examples, he notes that even if they were sorrowful and plaintive, they would be unable to make a joyful person sorrowful. He further proposed that Du would not be sorrowful listening to these musical tunes now, as he was present at a time of great peace.[63]

Du's argument was ineffective because he failed to present his idea with a clear differentiation between tones and music. What he should have clarified was the role of the emperor in promoting music rather than tones. As mentioned earlier, the tones by themselves cannot cause the downfall of the empire—they are simply a reflection of social order. The popularity of such tones often indicates the mindset of the emperor—he might have indulged himself in entertainment and neglected governing.

A closer look at the lyrics of "Yushu houting hua" reveals that they praised the consorts' fair countenances, and the tones were made for entertainment.[64] They were set to new music, which was likely to be versatile in notes and tones. Passersby wept upon hearing the songs not because the songs were sad but because of their implication: The emperor did not concern himself with rule but with personal entertainment. It is for this reason that Taizong dismissed Du Yan's supposition that the destruction of the Qi and Chen dynasties could be attributed to their songs, to which Du referred as sorrowful melodies.[65] Rather, Taizong treated the tears of listeners as a response to the political and social situations of the time.

Neither Taizong nor Du Yan addressed the differences between tones and music. Their focus was musical tones rather than ceremonial music. Early Tang historians criticized songs that were overly expressive, holding them responsible for the decline of a state and advising emperors against listening to them. In fact, the importance of ceremonial music had often been stressed, especially in the face of the spread of popular music. In the first year of the Wude 武德 era (618), when Gaozu 高祖 (r. 618–626) established the Tang dynasty, Sun Fujia 孫伏伽 (d. 658), Administrator of the Law Section of Wannian District 萬年縣, criticized the elevated status of popular music. He proposed that ceremonial music, such as that of "Da shao," should be promoted instead.[66]

In support of Taizong's comments, Wei Zheng cleverly quoted Confucius' discussion on the meaning of ritual and music as going beyond ritual offerings and musical instruments to show that the most essential factor was the emperor's rule. He notes that the nature of music is determined by

the harmonious relations of people, not by the tones, and that it is just as Confucius comments: Rites are not simply about jade and silk, and music is not simply about bells and drums.[67]

By the mid-Tang, the importation of foreign music and the declining role of ceremonial music became a concern. Xianzong openly asked for methods to promote music and ritual in the imperial examination in 806. In his response, Yuan pointed out that the success of such a policy depends on enriching the commoners, which in turn depends on terminating military activities. He then emphasized that this was not only about abolishing warfare, but also about converting the enemies' hearts and obtaining their allegiance through the means of virtue rather than arms.[68]

While the standard histories did not document the deterioration of ceremonial music in detail, Yuan's New Music Bureau poetry illustrates the process in terms of the "barbarization" (*huhua* 胡化, literally, to become like the Hu) of the central plain's music. *Hu* 胡 broadly referred to the northern and western tribes, and also the peoples of Central Asia during the Sui and Tang dynasties. Yuan considered the civilization of the central plain to be superior to those of foreign peoples. This barbarization, according to Yuan, eventually culminated in the An Lushan Rebellion; it marked, to him, the beginning of a cultural, political, and eventually military invasion. A close reading of the related poems reveals that he was using the motif of music as a vehicle to criticize contemporary politics and to present political advice.

Notes

1 See "Yueji" 樂記, in *Liji zhushu* 禮記注疏, 37.11b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:667.
2 Michael David Kaulana Ing, "Ritual in the *Liji*," chapter one in *The Dysfunction of Ritual in Early Confucianism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 18–37.
3 See Geir Sigurðsson, *Confucian Propriety and Ritual Learning: A Philosophical Interpretation* (2015; rpt. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2016), 11–13.
4 Roger T. Ames, *A Conceptual Lexicon for Classical Confucian Philosophy* (Albany: State University of New York, 2022), 85.
5 For the traditional commentaries, see "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.11b–12b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:667.
6 See "Gongsun Chou shang" 公孫丑上, in *Mengzi zhushu* 孟子注疏, 3b.7a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:66.
7 Wang Xianqian 王先謙 (1842–1918), Shen Xiaohuan 沈嘯寰, and Wang Xingxian 王星賢, punc. and coll., *Xunzi jijie* 荀子集解, 2 vols. (1988; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1997), 13.346–78.
8 John Knoblock, *Xunzi: A Translation and Study of the Complete Works*, 3 vols. (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994), vol. 3:50–55. Xunzi's explanation for the invention of ritual to alter the evils in human nature is what causes Lao Sze-Kwang 勞思光 to disqualify him from being a true

Confucian. This is because a true Confucian would believe in the goodness in human nature, from which ritual springs. See chapter six, "Xunzi yu Ruxue zhi qitu" 荀子與儒學之歧途, in Lao Sze-Kwang, *Zhongguo zhexueshi* 中國哲學史, 4 vols. (Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 2005), 249–66.

9 Roger T. Ames and David L. Hall, *Focusing the Familiar: A Translation and Philosophical Interpretation of the Zhongyong* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001), 42.

10 See "Feiyue shang" 非樂上, in Sun Yirang 孫詒讓 (1848–1908), *Mozi jiangu* 墨子閒詁, punc. and coll. Sun Qizhi 孫啟治, ed. Xu Jialu 許嘉璐, 2 vols. (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2009), vol. 1:251–63. "Feiyue zhong" 非樂中 and "Feiyue xia" 非樂下 are no longer extant. Mohism was an important school of philosophy that was prominent in the Warring States period, but it had faded by the Han dynasty. It emphasized the principle of universal love and austerity in government spending. It was also notable for its development of logic and interest in physical sciences.

11 See Kong Yingda's commentary, in *Lunyu zhushu*, 17.6a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:156.

12 See Erica F. Brindley, "Music, Cosmos, and the Development of Psychology in Early China," *T'oung Pao*, Second Series, vol. 92, fasc. 1/3 (2006): 1–49.

13 See Erica F. Brindley, "Music in State Order and Cosmic Rulership," chapter one in *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012), 25–42.

14 See Roel Sterckx, "Transforming the Beasts: Animals and Music in Early China," *T'oung Pao*, Second Series, vol. 86, fasc. 1/3 (2000): 1–46; pages 44–45.

15 For a comprehensive study, see Lothar von Falkenhausen, *Suspended Music: Chime-Bells in the Culture of Bronze Age China* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press, 1993). A full set of bells were excavated from the tomb of the Marquis Yi of Zeng in 1977. See Jenny F. So, *Music in the Age of Confucius* (Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 2000).

16 Scott Cook, "'Yue Ji' 樂記—Record of Music: Introduction, Translation, Notes, and Commentary," *Asian Music* 26, no. 2, *Musical Narrative Traditions of Asia* (Spring–Summer 1995): 1–96; page 14.

17 Kenneth J. DeWoskin, "Philosophers on Music in Early China," *The World of Music* 27, no. 1, China (1985), 33–47; page 39.

18 See "Yang Huo" 陽貨, in *Lunyu zhushu* 論語注疏, 17.6a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:156.

19 See "Bayi" 八佾, in *Lunyu zhushu*, 3.3a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:26.

20 See "Wei Linggong" 衞靈公, in *Lunyu zhushu*, 15.7, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:140.

21 Guo Qiyong, Cui Tao, Liu Junping, and Xiong Ying, "The Values of Confucian Benevolence and the Universality of the Confucian Way of Extending Love," *Frontiers of Philosophy in China* 7, no. 1 (March 2012): 20–54.

22 See "Mingtang wei" 明堂位, in *Liji zhushu*, 31.4b, in *SSJZS*, 576. Translation slightly revised from James Legge (1815–1897), trans., *Li Chi: Book of Rites*, 2 vols. (New York: University Books, 1967), vol. 2:31.

23 See "Da Situ" 大司徒, in *Zhouli zhushu* 周禮注疏, 10.26b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:161.

24 See "Da Situ," in *Zhouli zhushu*, 10.26b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:161.

25 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.11, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:667.

26 Zhao Lan 趙瀾, "*Da Tang kaiyuanli* chutan—Lun Tangdai lizhi de yanhua licheng" 《大唐開元禮》初探——論唐代禮制的演化歷程, *Fudan xuebao* 復旦學報, no. 5 (1994): 87–92.

27 This explanations follow Chen Yanmei's 陳燕梅 study. See Chen Yanmei, "Chutan 'Wuli' de paixu ji qi yihan" 初探「五禮」的排序及其意涵, *Zhongguo wenxue yanjiu* 中國文學研究, no. 29 (January 2010): 39–70; page 53.
28 See "Liyi zhi" 禮儀志, in *JTS*, 21.816.
29 Wei Zheng served at Taizong's side for seventeen years, significantly contributing to the success of Taizong's rule during the Zhenguan 貞觀 (627–649) era. Wei was also one of the compilers of the *Zhou shu* 周書 (Official history of the Zhou) and the *Sui shu* 隋書 (Official history of the Sui). For a detailed study, see Howard J. Wechsler, *Mirror to the Son of Heaven: Wei Cheng at the Court of T'ang T'ai-tsung* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1974).
30 See "Liyi zhi," in *JTS*, 21.817. *XTS* notes that there are only sixty articles for sacrificial ceremonies and a total of 130 articles for the entire work. See "Yiwen zhi" 藝文志, in *XTS*, 58.1491.
31 This explanation follows Chen Yanmei's study. See Chen, "Chutan 'Wuli' de paixu ji qi yihan," 54.
32 For the significance of the *Kaiyuan li*, see Zhao, "*Da Tang kaiyuanli* chutan," 87–92.
33 See "Li zhi" 禮志, in Tuo Tuo 脫脫 (1314–1355), *Jin shi* 金史 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1975), 29.722; 31.765; 35.816 and 819; "Yue zhi" 樂志, in *Jin shi*, 39.885; "Yufu zhi" 輿服志, in *Jin shi*, 43.981; "Jisi zhi" 祭祀志, in Song Lian 宋濂 (1310–1381) et al., *Yuan shi* 元史 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1976), 72.1787–91; "Shang Wen zhuan" 尚文傳, in *Yuan shi*, 170.3985.
34 See "Zhiguan zhi" 職官志, in *JTS*, 44.1892.
35 See "Du You zhuan" 杜佑傳, in *JTS*, 147.3982.
36 See "Dai Zheng Xianggong qing shanding shixing Liudian Kaiyuan li zhuang" 代鄭相公請刪定施行六典開元禮狀, in *QTWXB*, vol. 11:627.7085.
37 See "Da Situ," in *Zhouli zhushu*, 10.26b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:161.
38 See Huang Zhencheng 黃鎮成 (1288–1362), *Shangshu tongkao* 尚書通考, 4.29, in *Yingyin Wenyuange Siku quanshu* 影印文淵閣四庫全書 (Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1983), vol. 62:92.
39 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 38.2a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:677.
40 See "Yinyue zhi" 音樂志, in *JTS*, 28.1041 and Du, *Tongdian*, vol. 4:142.3621.
41 The first is called the "Harmony of Pleasure" 豫和, the second "Harmony of Compliance" 順和, the third "Harmony of Eternity" 永和, the fourth "Harmony of Solemnity" 肅和, the fifth "Harmony of Grace" 雍和, the sixth "Harmony of Longevity" 壽和, the seventh "Harmony of Grandeur" 太和, the eighth "Harmony of Comfort" 舒和, the ninth "Harmony of Brilliance" 昭和, the tenth "Harmony of Rest" 休和, the eleventh "Harmony of Propriety" 正和, and the twelfth "Harmony of Heritance" 承和.
42 See "Liyue zhi," in *XTS*, 21.464.
43 Liu Wuzhou was a native of Jingcheng 景城 of Hejian 河間 (in modern Hebei) during the Sui dynasty. He joined an expedition in Liaodong 遼東 and was made Commandant 校尉 of the Administration of Yingyang 鷹揚府 of Mayi 馬邑 (in modern Shanxi), the area to which his family had moved. In 617 during Emperor Yang's 煬 reign (605–618), he plotted against the Governor 太守, Wang Rengong 王仁恭 (d. 617), and persuaded his comrade Zhang Wansui 張萬歲 (fl. 617) to murder Wang. Liu then gathered over ten thousand soldiers, declaring himself Governor and establishing an alliance with the Turks. With their help, he occupied Yanmen 雁門, Loufan 樓煩, and Dingxiang 定襄 (all in modern Shanxi), and was made the Khan Who Pacified Yang's Empire

定楊可汗 by the Turks. Liu announced himself emperor and subsequently created his own reign year, Tianxing 天興. In the second year (619) of the Wude 武德 (618–626) era during Gaozu's reign, he aligned again with the Turks and defeated the Tang army, occupying Taiyuan 太原, Jinzhou 晉州, and Huizhou 澮州 (all in modern Shanxi). The following year, he was defeated by Li Shimin 李世民 (599–649). He planned to flee to Mayi, but his plot was exposed, and he was killed by the Turks. For details, see "Liu Wuzhou zhuan," in *JTS*, 55.2252–56.

44 See "Gaozong ji" 高宗紀, in *JTS*, 4.75.

45 For Taizong's role in the making of "Qinwang pozhen yue," see "Liyue zhi," in *XTS*, 21.467–68.

46 For Taizong's intention to combine military and literary virtues, as demonstrated by these two dances, see Yang Ming 楊名, "Lun chu Tang diwang yuewuguan de bianqian ji qi wenhua yiyi" 論初唐帝王樂舞觀的變遷及其文化意義. *Jiaoxiang—Xi'an yinyue xueyuan xuebao* 交響——西安音樂學院學報 32, no. 2 (June 2013): 21–26; page 22.

47 See Duke Xuan 宣 12, in *Zuozhuan zhushu* 左傳注疏, 23.21b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 6:398. Translation slightly revised from James Legge, *The Chinese Classics: The Ch'un Ts'ew with the Tso Chuen* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960), vol. 5:320.

48 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 39.9b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:695. Translation revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:121–22.

49 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.11b–12a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:667. For a study on the relation between music and ritual and the importance of music in comparison to poetry as an expressive art, see Haun Saussy, "'Ritual Separates, Music Unites': Why Musical Hermeneutics Matters," in *Recarving the Dragon: Understanding Chinese Poetics*, ed. Olga Lomová (Prague: Karolinum Press, 2003), 9–25.

50 *Liji*, *Yueshu*, *Shijing* and *Shangshu* 尚書 (*Book of Documents*) together constituted the four essential texts the son of a noble family had to study. The six classics include also *Yi* 易 (*Book of Changes*) and *Chunqiu* 春秋 (*The Spring and Autumn [Annals]*). The Guodian 郭店 manuscripts note that six types of virtues can all be seen in these six classics. See "Liu de" 六德 (Six virtues), in Jingmenshi bowuguan 荊門市博物館, ed., *Guodian Chumu zhujian* 郭店楚墓竹簡 (Hebei: Wenwu chubanshe, 1998), 188.

51 See "Yuezhi" 樂志, in Shen Yue 沈約 (441–513), comp., *Song shu* 宋書 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1974), 19.533 and "Yinyue zhi" 音樂志, in Wei Zheng and Linghu Defen, comp., *Sui shu* 隋書 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1973), 13.288 and "Yuezhi," in Zhao Erxun 趙爾巽 (1844–1927), comp., *Qingshi gao* 清史稿 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1976–1977), 94.2731.

52 Some scholars believe that "Yueshu" in the *Shiji* is not authentic, "but a significantly later and in parts badly flawed text." See Martin Kern, "A Note on the Authenticity and Ideology of *Shih-chi* 24, 'The Book on Music'," *JAOS* 119, no. 4 (October–December 1999): 673–77; page 673.

53 For a comprehensive study of the music theory of ancient China and related texts, see Cook, "'Yue Ji'—Record of Music," 1–96. For a brief discussion of the *Liji* and its scholarship, see Loewe, ed., *Early Chinese Texts*, 293–97.

54 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 39.19a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:700.

55 For the meaning of the graph *yue* and the development of its concept, see Fritz A. Kuttner, "The Development of the Concept of Music in China's Early History," *Asian Music* 1, no. 2 (Autumn 1969): 12–21.

56 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 38.4a–5a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5, 678–79; translation slightly revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, 2:107.
57 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.7b–8a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5, 665; translation slightly revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:95.
58 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.17, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:670; translation revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:101–2.
59 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 39.3, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:692; translation revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:118–19.
60 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.13a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:668; translation revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:98.
61 Emphasis in original. See Scott Cook, "Unity and Diversity in the Musical Thought of Warring States China" (PhD diss., University of Michigan, 1995), 53–55.
62 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.4, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:663; translation slightly revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:93.
63 "Yinyue zhi," in *JTS*, 28.1041.
64 See "Huanghou zhuan" 皇后傳, in Yao Silian 姚思廉 (557–637), comp., *Chen shu* 陳書 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1972), 7.132.
65 This taste for sorrowful melodies could be traced to the Han. Ronald Egan discussed the moving quality of music associated with a five or seven-stringed zither by quoting Lu Wenchao's 盧文弨 (1717–1796) supposition that sadness was considered the primary value of music during the Han, Wei, and Jin periods. See Egan, "The Controversy over Music and 'Sadness' and Changing Conceptions of the *Qin* in Middle Period China," *HJAS* 57, no. 1 (June 1997): 5–66; page 5.
66 "Sun Fujia zhuan" 孫伏伽傳, in *JTS*, 75.2635.
67 Revised from D. C. Lau, trans., *The Analects*, 2nd ed. (1992; rpt. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 2002), 175.
68 See "Caishi jianmao mingyu tiyongce yidao" 才識兼茂明於體用策一道, in *YZJJZ*, 28.818–26.

4 On Musical Instruments

Yuan Zhen's profound knowledge of the classics and his dedication to carrying out his political ideas manifest themselves in his twelve New Music Bureau poems. These poems show his greatest effort in using poetry to critique contemporary affairs and to present political advice. Most spectacular is his focus on the motif of music. These six poems, which constitute half of the series, deal with music in relation to politics. In them, Yuan frequently lamented the decline of ceremonial music. Although this was a phenomenon that had begun as early as the late Zhou dynasty and might not seem relevant to current affairs, he was able to associate music with cultural identity and successful rule to present his view of the importance of depending on virtue to govern. His arguments regarding the correlation between music, virtue, and politics are closely related to the traditional values attached to music and ritual discussed in the previous chapter.

This chapter offers a comprehensive, in-depth analysis of three poems that concern musical instruments: "Huayuan qing" 華原磬 (Chime stones of Huayuan), "Wuxian tan" 五弦彈 (Playing the five-stringed lute), and "Piaoguo yue" 驃國樂 (Music of the Piao state). It compares them to Bai's response poems and links them to the broader discussion during the Tang concerning the value of music as a form of cultural identity.

"Huayuan qing" focuses on the use of Huayuan stones to replace chime stones, an ancient musical instrument. Chime stones are shaped like a carpenter's square and hung on a rack for musicians to strike. Huayuan stones are soft stones originally covered by water. They are easily carved into different shapes—the exact opposite of ancient chime stones, which are hard and difficult to carve.[1] "Wuxian tan" comments on the imported five-stringed lute and its popularity. Although it bore similarities to an ancient Chinese twenty-five-stringed musical instrument, it was a foreign instrument that produced sorrowful tunes. The music performed by the skillful hands of Zhao Bi 趙璧 (fl. 785)[2] only served to stir up emotions; like the Huayuan floating stones, it had no positive value in terms of governance. In this poem, Yuan uses "five-stringed"

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-4

as a pun for five virtuous men, linking music to people. "Piaoguo yue" brings up the foreign musical instrument of the Piao state. It had no resemblance to the instruments of China; the music created with it violated the general principles of Han music. Yuan criticizes Dezong's improper patronage of its performance and the excessive favor bestowed on it, which made it overshadow traditional Chinese music. In Yuan's opinion, Dezong should have taken this opportunity to demonstrate to the people of the Piao state the ritual music that represented the grandeur of the Tang.

PART I "HUAYUAN QING": CHIME STONES AS ORTHODOX INSTRUMENTS

"Huayuan qing" criticizes the use of stones from Huayuan in place of the ancient chime stones from the Si 泗 riverside for palace music since the Tianbao era 天寶 (742–756). Yuan points out the symbolic meaning of ancient chime stones and the governing value associated with this instrument. Their distinctive sound symbolizes the clear distinction between right and wrong, and this was considered capable of reminding the ruler of his border officials, who guarded the dynasty's territory at the risk of their lives. By elaborating on the chime stones, Yuan criticizes Xuanzong, the emperor at the time of their abandonment, for neglecting his border officials and commoners, and for appointing improper men as military governors. Since the ancient chime stones were used by the emperor, and the political implications behind this type of instrument all concern rule, the target reader is clearly the present emperor, Xianzong. Yuan urges him to reform the practice.

Yuan's "Huayuan qing"[3]

	The floating stones from the Si riverside are carved into chime stones.	泗濱浮石裁為磬
2	The sparse sounds of ancient music have few admirers.	古樂疏音少人聽
	Musicians are lowly; rare are Ya and Kuang.	工師小賤牙曠稀
4	Unable to discern unorthodox sounds, they dislike ceremonial music for its propriety.	不辨邪聲嫌雅正
	Proper sounds do not bend; ancient musical scores are superb.	正聲不屈古調高
6	But now the tones of bells are irregular, and the pipes and strings suffer.	鍾律參差管弦病
	Sounds of hitting metal and tapping on the zithern mingle in vain.	鏗金戛瑟徒相雜
8	Like throwing jade and knocking ice, they vibrate sporadically.	投玉敲冰杳然零
	The soft stones of Huayuan are easy to carve;	華原軟石易追琢

10	High and low as you please, regardless of ceremonial or Zheng music.	高下隨人無雅鄭
	To discard the old in favor of the new is up to the musicians.	棄舊美新由樂胥
12	Since this [practice] began, the classical bells cannot compete.	自此黃鍾不能競
	Xuanzong's love for music was love for the new.	玄宗愛樂愛新樂
14	Disciples of the Pear Garden rode on his favor at will.	梨園弟子承恩橫
	The Central Asian cavalry came just when "Rainbows" sounded through.	霓裳纔徹胡騎來
16	"Yunmen" could not be personally set by him.	雲門未得蒙親定
	I preserve the ancient chime stone by preserving it in my heart.	我藏古磬藏在心
18	Sometimes I strike it to make a "Southern wind" song.	有時激作南風詠
	The venerable Kui once tamed wild animals;	伯夔曾撫野獸馴
20	Confucius made zither playing thrive when he chimed for a time.[4]	仲尼暫和春雷盛
	When do I get to hang the chime stones on the music stand?	何時得向筍簴懸
22	I shall strike them loud for my lord to awaken his heart.	為君一吼君心醒
	I hope my lord will keep the border in mind each time he listens to them.	願君每聽念封疆
24	Not sending out jackals and wolves that exhaust the lives of men.	不遣豺狼剿人命

Symbolic Meaning of Ancient Chime Stones

The poem plays with the symbolism of the ancient chime stones. The best of them came from the banks of the Si River. They were referred to as "floating stones," not because they could float. Rather, because the stones formed the margin of land between the high and low tides of the river, it looked as if they were floating in the water.[5] The stones were subject to the sun and wind when they came out of the water. The sound they created is clear and distinct,[6] reaching far.

These stones made simple but distinctive sounds, which were typical of ceremonial music.

Because of the clarity of their sound and its immediate recognizability, the chime stones symbolize purity in judgment. This purity in judgment is associated with integrity and righteousness, qualities that one should hold to the point that one would die for duty. When a noble person hears this tinkling sound, he thinks of subjects who die while defending the frontiers. Its meaning goes beyond its musical value; thus, when a noble person listens to tones, he does not simply hear their sonority.[7]

The Ruler's Appreciation of Tones

Yuan attributes the decline of ceremonial music to Xuanzong, who appreciated tones based on aural pleasure. In pursuit of this, Xuanzong forsook chime stones and opted for the stones from Huayuan. Since the

latter were soft, they could be carved in many different ways to produce various sounds. They were therefore perfect tools for playing new music that contained complex melodies. Different from the chime stones that have a character of their own, the Huayuan stones simply comply with whatever the musicians prefer. This lack of character makes it even more important for the musicians and the ruler to determine how the stones should be used, and it is here that Yuan brings their roles into the discussion.

Yuan notes that fine musicians such as Bo Ya 伯牙 and Shi Kuang 師曠 of the Spring and Autumn Period are rare. Without experts who truly understand music, the ruler's preference becomes the determining factor in musical development. As Xuanzong espoused new tunes, musicians skilled in these quickly rose to prominence. This phenomenon recalls the statements of Confucius that "the ruler must be prudent in what he likes and dislikes, as they are examples for people to follow" 上之所好惡, 不可不慎也, 是民之表也.[8] His disciple Zixia elaborated, "A ruler must be careful of what he likes and dislikes. What the ruler likes, his subjects will practice, and what superiors do, their inferiors will follow" 為人君者, 謹其所好惡而已矣。君好之, 則臣為之。上行之, 則民從之.[9]

By Confucian standards, Xuanzong had failed to set a good example. He disregarded the symbolic meaning and political value of music and only concerned himself with sensual pleasure. Not only did he prefer new music, but he also personally composed "Weichang yuyi qu" 霓裳羽衣曲 (The song of raiment of rainbows and feathers) and taught three hundred young musicians to play musical instruments at the Pear Garden. This active involvement had created a new group of musicians known as "Disciples of the Emperor" 皇帝弟子, or "Disciples of the Pear Garden" 梨園弟子, who received great favor at the time.[10]

Xuanzong promoted new tunes, but what he should have done was to elevate state music. To suggest this idea, Yuan refers to "Yunmen" and *huangzhong* 黃鍾 (loosely translated as "classical bells"). "Yunmen" was the first of the six dances to music that the Musician-in-chief taught the heir during the Zhou dynasty, whereas *huangzhong* was the first note of twelve in Chinese music that lays the standard point of reference for higher and lower pitch. *Huangzhong* was considered the central note, for it was in the *yang* 陽 (the masculine or positive principle in nature) tone, and its sound was deep and solemn, comforting and fair; its use was proper for initiating sacrificial ceremonies.[11] When Yuan noted that *huangzhong* could not compete with popular music, and that "Yunmen" could not be personally approved by the emperor, he was insinuating that Xuanzong was not a sage ruler.

In Yuan's opinion, Xuanzong's neglect of border affairs, symbolized by his discarding of the ancient chime stones, led to the outbreak of the An

Lushan Rebellion. *Huji* 胡騎 (Central Asian cavalry) refers to An Lushan and his army; An came from Yingzhou 營州 (in modern Hunan) and was of mixed ethnicity. Pulleyblank notes,

> In the T'ang period *hu* almost always refers to the Western, Indo-European speaking peoples of Central Asia and more often than not specifically to the Sogdians who were the most prominent and widely distributed of them. Occurring together with the surname An, it can hardly be taken to mean anything but Sogdian.[12]

According to Li Shen, "It was not until the middle of the Tianbao era that the chime stones from the Si riverside were abandoned and the stones from Huayuan were used instead" 天寶中, 始廢泗濱磬, 用華原石.[13] The decline of this ceremonial musical instrument was thus tied to the decline of the empire.

The Transforming Power of Music

Yuan stresses the power of music to effect change. He states how dear the ancient chime stones were to him, and that he occasionally chanted the ancient song "Nanfeng" 南風 (Southern wind). The "Nanfeng" shows sage ruler Shun's caring for commoners. The *Liji* notes that Shun created the five-stringed zither to sing the song; it was then that Kui set it to music to bestow it on feudal lords.[14] Shun admired the southern wind for its regenerating power, which reminded him of the nurturing power of parents who not only shape their children's characters but also provide for their needs. Kui, the Grand Musician during Shun's reign, expressed his wish that Shun would reward the feudal lords with the "Nanfeng" to encourage them to be filial.[15]

Both Zheng Xuan of Han and Kong Yingda of Tang noted that the "Nanfeng" was no longer extant at their time. The version found in *Kongzi jiayu* 孔子家語 (The school sayings of Confucius) is believed to be a pseudograph, but it is unclear whether Yuan might have had access to it. Nonetheless, it reads:

> The warmth of the southern wind
> Can be used to untie the mental knot of my people.
> The right timing of the southern wind
> Can be used to augment the property of my people.
> 南風之薰兮, 可以解吾民之慍兮;
> 南風之時兮, 可以阜吾民之財兮。[16]

At the literal level, this song eulogizes the regenerating power of the southern wind and praises its calming effect and its timely arrival to bring

wealth through providing a desirable environment for cultivation. At a more abstract level, this song symbolizes Shun's virtue in nourishing his people both materialistically and mentally, just as the southern wind does. Since rulers are also regarded as the parents of their people, this song additionally signifies Shun's care for commoners, as he shared the same intent as Heaven to nurture them.[17] Yuan stresses his own embrace of the "Nanfeng," as it reflects the ideal governance he had in mind. In so doing, he might have been comparing himself with Kui.

To highlight the magical power of music in governing, Yuan alludes to the legends of Kui and Confucius. The allusion to the latter is no longer traceable, likely due to the loss of the relevant text. As for the former, it is said that Kui was able to tame animals and spur them to dance when he struck stones to make rhythms, revealing that the world had achieved a peaceful state under Shun's rule. The modern scholars Wu Zhao 吳釗 and Liu Dongsheng 劉東升 suggest that the various animals refer to men who dressed up as animals in ritual ceremonies to celebrate hunting.[18] Yet even if the animals were men in costumes, they still signify that the most desirable music was the type that could tame even animals. Shun highly praised the value of music for character development and its harmonizing effect between spirits and people; thus, he commanded Kui to be the Grand Musician, teaching the heir to be straightforward but mild, gentle but dignified, strong but not tyrannical, and impetuous but not arrogant.[19]

Appointing Men of Virtue

Yuan recommends appointing virtuous men who would defend the border with their lives, rather than those whose behavior resembles jackals and wolves (line 24). These two types of predators are metaphors for those who abuse their power for personal gain. Chen Yinke suggests that the borderland to which Yuan referred might have been Fengxiang 鳳翔 (in modern Shaanxi); Yuan was brought up there after his father passed away, and he likely witnessed the chaotic events caused by the Tibetans' intrusion from the west.[20]

Chen Yinke and Su Zhongxiang 蘇仲翔 propose that the theme of this poem is "to elevate ancient music and belittle contemporary music" 崇古樂賤今樂.[21] This is a literal reading. Yuan's ultimate goal is to remonstrate with the emperor, to recommend that he be careful in selecting military governors in defense of the border, and to remind him that music had a more critical function as a means and a thermometer of rule. He successfully made the transition from music to the border crisis by identifying the chime stone as a reminder of those who guard the borderland. His concern with frontier policies also manifests itself in three of his other New Music Bureau poems, namely "Xiliang ji" 西涼伎 (Entertainers of Xiliang),

"Manzi chao" 蠻子朝 (The southern barbarians came to pay tribute), and "Fu Rongren" 縛戎人 (The Tibetan captives).

Targeting Musicians: Bai's "Huayuan qing"

Bai's response poem echoes Yuan's poem in many aspects. Indeed, it is almost like a work of annotation that spells out the historical and literary allusions that Yuan uses. However, Bai switches the target of criticism from the emperor Xuanzong to the musicians. He states that he wrote the poem "to ridicule the musicians that are not qualified for their positions" 刺樂工非其人也. In the preface, he attributes the responsibility for the use of Huayuan stones to the musicians, who chose them for their flexibility to be tuned to sounds of a lower key.[22]

	Bai's "Huayuan qing"[23]	
	Huayuan chime stones;	華原磬
	Huayuan chime stones:	華原磬
3	The ancient people did not listen to them, but the current people do.	古人不聽今人聽
	Stones from the Si riverside;	泗濱石
	Stones from the Si riverside:	泗濱石
6	People now do not strike them, but the ancients did.	今人不擊古人擊
	What are the differences between the two?	今人古人何不同
8	The use or the forsaking of it all depends on musicians.	用之捨之由樂工
	Even if musicians are present, their ears are like walls:	樂工雖在耳如壁
10	They are as good as deaf, when they cannot tell the good from the bad.	不分清濁即為聾
	Disciples of the Pear Garden tuned the pitch pipes.	梨園弟子調律呂
12	How would they know that the new tunes did not match the ancient?	知有新聲不如古
	It was said of old that the floating chime stones came from the Si riverside;	古稱浮磬出泗濱
14	So touching was their distinctive sound, reminiscent of those who died for duty.	立辯致死聲感人
	Once he listened to the Huayuan stones hung in the palace,	宮懸一聽華原石
16	The emperor forgot in his heart his frontier officers.	君心遂忘封疆臣
	As expected, the Sogdian bandits rose from Yan.	果然胡寇從燕起
18	Few military officials were willing to die guarding the frontiers.	武臣少肯封疆死
	Since then, it has been known that music is associated with politics:	始知樂與時政通
20	How would it be just for the rhythmic and sonorous tones?	豈聽鏗鏘而已矣
	The chime stone master Xiang traveled to the sea and never returned.	磬襄入海去不歸
22	Laymen of Chang'an market became musicians.	長安市人為樂師
	As for the Huayuan stones and the stones from the Si riverside,	華原磬與泗濱石
24	Who could distinguish the clear or muddled sounds of each?	清濁兩聲誰得知

Bai begins by pointing out the popularity of the Huayuan stones over the chime stones from the Si riverside. He then attributes the change to incompetent musicians, who have misled the emperor. Once the Huayuan stones were hung in the palace (*gongxuan* 宮懸), the emperor turned to sensual pleasure. *Gongxuan* refers to the ritual practice of having musical instruments hung on the four sides of the palace; this distinguished the emperor from feudal lords, grand masters, and officials, who could only have their instruments hung on three, two, or one wall, respectively.[24]

As the emperor forgot about his border officials, his bond with them was weakened; eventually, this caused the borderlands to fall into the rebels' hands. The An Lushan Rebellion began in the northeastern area, historically known as Yan 燕. By associating the use of Huayuan stones with the rebellion, Bai points out why the emperor needs competent musicians, for music goes beyond entertainment; like Yuan, he feels it has a deeper cultural value related to proper rule.

PART II "WUXIAN TAN": THE FIVE-STRINGED LUTE AS FOREIGN IMPORT

While "Huayuan qing" comments on the abandonment of the ancient chime stones, "Wuxian tan" speaks about the musician Zhao Bi and his musical skills in playing the five-stringed lute, a northern musical instrument. Yuan urges Xianzong to appreciate talented literati who could assist in governance, rather than musicians who could not even promote ceremonial music. To bring out this idea, he utilizes the same pronunciation of the word *xian* 弦 for strings and *xian* 賢 for virtuous men to make a pun on the phrase *wuxian* (five-stringed) for *wuxian* (five virtuous men).

"Wuxian tan" criticizes Dezong's obsession with Zhao's performance. This five-stringed instrument is not the five-stringed zither played by Shun. Rather, it is a lute-like stringed instrument with a fretted fingerboard known as *pipa* 琵琶; it is relatively small and originated from the northern states. Its name came from its method of play, which was to stroke the strings up and down with a piece of wood. It was not until the Zhenguan era of Taizong's reign that another method of playing it simply using one's fingers emerged.[25] Once the instrument could be directly plucked or strummed, it allowed quick movements; thus, the tunes produced could be more fluid and complex.

Zhao Bi was highly skilled in playing this northern instrument, to the point that he considered himself to have merged with it,[26] forming one being and reaching a status similar to Cook Ting mentioned in the *Zhuangzi*. But the music he played was considered unorthodox music that had a detrimental effect on the state, and Chen Yang 陳暘 (fl. 1094) praised Yuan for pointing this out.[27]

Yuan's "Wuxian tan"[28]

	When Zhao Bi played the *zhi*-tune on the five-stringed lute,	趙璧五弦彈徵調
2	How high-pitched and piercing the *zhi*-note was!	徵聲嶠絕何清峭
	Lyrics were sharp as if a white crane cried and startled the dew,	辭雄皓鶴警露啼
4	Or a grieving ape that had lost its child howled about in the woods.	失子哀猿繞林嘯
	Wind blew into the spring pines; rustled were their leaves.	風入春松正凌亂
6	Orioles chirped in the morning; cherished were their marvels.	鶯含曉舌憐嬌妙
	Hooting, undercurrents were muffled by the icy spring.	嗚嗚暗溜咽冰泉
8	Frighteningly, the frosty sword lay jagged in a chilly sheath.	殺殺霜刀澀寒鞘
	Striking with increasing speed, he hastened the beats.	促節頻催漸繁撥
10	A flag adorned with beads snapped, and its golden bell fell.	珠幢斗絕金鈴掉
	Whistling arrowheads shot from thousands of Tartar bows,	千靺鳴鏑發胡弓
12	When ten thousand pieces of jade stones chimed in the Yu temple.	萬片清球擊虞廟
	Although all music belonged to the same first section,	眾樂雖同第一部
14	Emperor Dezong often summoned him in particular.	德宗皇帝常偏召
	Returning briefly every ten days and from holidays,	旬休節假暫歸來
16	With just one note he defeated the youth of Chang'an.	一聲狂殺長安少
	It was most difficult to see him in the house of nobles.	主第侯家最難見
18	He answered to imperial edicts to sing and play.	挼歌按曲皆承詔
	He taught the noble concubines from outside the crystal curtain;	水精簾外教貴嬪
20	He accompanied eunuchs in the heart of the hawksbill banquet.	璹瑁筵心伴中要
	"Your subject has five 'virtuous' men different from these 'strings.'"	臣有五賢非此弦
22	Some are imprisoned; some are butchering and fishing.	或在拘囚或屠釣
	Even just one virtuous man appointed surpasses many hundreds;	一賢得進勝累百
24	Two virtuous men appointed would be similar to Zhou and Shao.	兩賢得進同周邵
	Three virtuous men could serve the Han to put down tyrants and bullies;	三賢事漢滅暴強
26	Four virtuous men could steady mountains and pacify borders.	四賢鎮岳寧邊徼
	Five virtuous men, all appointed, could harmonize the five norms.	五賢並用調五常
28	If the five norms are properly arranged, the three lights will shine.	五常既序三光曜
	The five strings of Zhao Bi are not virtuous men of this type.	趙璧五弦非此賢
30	Why bother to light the imperial torches for one with trivial skills like 'multiplication'?"	九九何勞設庭燎

Musical Tunes Mirror Governance

The first ten couplets elaborate on Zhao Bi's musical skills and his elevated status at court; in doing so, Yuan criticizes Dezong for failing to appreciate true talents. He links this to improper governance, suggesting that it is responsible for causing frequent military problems.

Much ink has been spilled over Zhao's performance of the *zhi*-tune, one out of the five ancient musical tunes of *gong* 宮, *shang* 商, *jue* 角, *zhi* 徵, and *yu* 羽. The *zhi*-tune represents military affairs. It is believed that "when the *zhi*-tune sounds irregular, the songs will express sorrow, indicating frequent military issues" 徵亂則哀, 其事勤.[29] By specifically elaborating on the *zhi*-tune, Yuan insinuates that there were frequent military actions during Dezong's reign. The use of martial images such as frosty swords and whistling arrowheads to describe the *zhi*-tune strengthens this reading.

The images used to describe Zhao's performance also point to military affairs. The flag adorned with beads refers to the type carried by the honor guard when the emperor went on an outing. Snapping this flag, accompanied by the fall of the golden bell, signifies the defeat of the emperor, in this case by foreign tribes. The image of thousands of arrowheads shooting from their bows (*hugong* 胡弓) represents the Tartar invasion.

The specific term used, *mingdi* 鳴鏑 (whistling arrowheads), suggests that there were subjects who plotted against the lord. The whistling arrowheads were devised by Modu 冒頓 (d. 174 BCE), a prince of the Xiongnu, who used it as a signal to order his soldiers to shoot his father Touman, the Xiongnu leader. Because Touman had intended to kill Modu and invest Modu's younger brother as heir, Modu designed the whistling arrowheads as part of his plot to usurp the throne.[30] Yuan used the whistling arrowheads as a metaphor for Zhao's plucking of the lute, insinuating that the invasion of the Tang court by Tartar music was a signal of their subsequent military invasion. Yuan was likely referring to the military governors from the northeast area who had become semi-independent after the An Lushan Rebellion.[31]

The phrase "when ten thousand pieces of jade stones chimed in the Yu temple" suggests that Zhao's music challenges the principles set down by the sage ruler. As the five-stringed lute was imported from the north, it signifies cultural invasion. Zhao's performance stirred people into extreme emotions. The high-pitched, piercing sounds brought forth disturbing images such as the crying cranes and the grieving apes, evoking unpleasant and unsettled feelings. His evocative music was the precise opposite of ceremonial music; thus, it was unfit for Dezong's appreciation.

Five Types of Officials Worthy of Praise

Yuan's major concern was, of course, the recruitment of virtuous and talented officials, not Zhao's skills per se. He made this transition with the pun noted earlier, using *xian* 弦 (strings) for *xian* 賢 (to be virtuous). He

compared talented men who were either confined in prison or engaged in a lowly profession to Zhao, a musician who was merely skilled at a Tartar musical instrument yet who was treated favorably by the emperor, nobles, and powerful eunuchs. Yuan thus declared that he had five virtuous people worthy of recommendation. They would benefit the state—not like Zhao, whose talent might entertain but would bring about an adverse effect.

The precise identities of these five people are unclear. They may indicate five types of virtuous men.[32] They may also be specific references to five virtuous subjects who assisted Duke Wen of Jin 晉文公 (697 BCE–628 BCE) in becoming a hegemon during the Spring and Autumn period: Hu Yan 狐偃 (fl. 680 BCE–fl. 633 BCE), Zhao Cui 趙衰 (d. 622 BCE), Dian Jie 顚頡 (d. 632 BCE), Wei Wuzi 魏武子 (fl. 656 BCE–fl. 636 BCE), and Sikong Jizi 司空季子.[33]

Yuan likely referenced specific virtuous people in the past as a means of comparison to those in the present that he wanted to recommend. The one person who would surpass many hundreds of men is reminiscent of Mao #131 "Huangniao" 黃鳥 (Oriole) of the *Songs*. The poem mourned the three virtuous officials, Yanxi 奄息, Zhonghang 仲行, and Qianhu 鍼虎 of the Ziju 子車 clan, who willingly went to their graves with Duke Mu 穆 of Qin. At the end of each stanza, the poet repeatedly lamented that were it possible to resurrect any one of these men, people would give a hundred lives in exchange because of their virtue and competence.[34]

In line twenty-four, Yuan introduces Duke Dan of Zhou and Duke Shi of Shao 召公奭, the two most virtuous subjects assisting King Cheng's rule. Line twenty-five comments on Zhang Liang 張良 (d. 186 BCE), Han Xin 韓信 (d. 196 BCE), and Xiao He 蕭何 (d. 193 BCE), who served the Han and helped wipe out the Qin armies. Line twenty-six refers to the four sons of Xihe 羲和 who guarded the four mountains (Si Yue 四岳) that stood for feudal lords.[35] These ancient figures were employed as metaphors for virtuous people who were present during the Tang dynasty but were not recognized and employed by the emperor.

The final couplet ties up this central theme of seeking virtuous people for governance. Yuan alludes to the historical event concerning Duke Huan of Qi's 齊桓公 reception of talented men, but did not adhere to the received understanding of that event. In the original story, Duke Huan of Qi set up torches in his courtyard to await knowledgeable men to come for an audience with him. After a year had gone by without anyone answering his call, he was even persuaded into welcoming a villager who was only skilled in multiplication (*jiujiu* 九九). The villager points out that if Duke Huan was able to treat him with courtesy, those with worthier talents would certainly come. The strategy proved to be successful.[36] Duke Huan showed the villager respect for the purpose of attracting more talented men. Yuan used this allusin to suggest that Dezong's partiality to Zhao could only be justified if he aimed thus to attract others who were more

virtuous and talented. Since Dezong's intention was not as such, the ending line carries a note of sarcasm, as his behavior opposed what the allusion might have suggested.

Lamenting the Power of Skillful Musicians: Bai's "Wuxian tan"

Unlike Yuan, who points his finger at Dezong, Bai, in his response poem, again shifts the responsibility to the musician, attributing the decline of ceremonial music to Zhao Bi's bewitching musical skills.

	Bai's "Wuxian tan"[37]	
	The playing of the five-stringed lute;	五絃彈
	The playing of the five-stringed lute:	五絃彈
3	Listeners pricked up their ears with lonesome hearts.	聽者傾耳心寥寥
	Zhao Bi knew that you loved it deep in your bones.	趙璧知君入骨愛
5	He tuned every single string of the five for you.	五絃一一為君調
	The first and the second strings made rustling sounds,	第一第二絃索索
7	As if the autumn wind brushed off the pines with a sparse melody.	秋風拂松疏韻落
	The third and the fourth strings made shrill sounds,	第三第四絃泠泠
9	As if a caged crane cried at night, longing for its child.	夜鶴憶子籠中鳴
	The sound of the fifth string was the most depressing,	第五絃聲最掩抑
11	As if River Long was frozen, its flow blocked.	隴水凍咽流不得
	May you listen to him playing all five strings?	五絃並奏君試聽
13	The sound was mournful and clanking.	淒淒切切復錚錚
	Iron struck coral, creating one or two musical pieces;	鐵擊珊瑚一兩曲
15	Ice rushed down on a jade tray, creating ten thousand sounds.	冰寫玉盤千萬聲
	The sound of iron was frightening;	鐵聲殺
17	The sound of ice chilling.	冰聲寒
	Once the frightening sound entered the ears, skin and blood suffered.	殺聲入耳膚血慘
19	Once the chilling air reached people, muscles and bones ached.	寒氣中人肌骨酸
	After the melody was over, the sound lingered almost half a day.	曲終聲盡欲半日
21	The audience faced each other, remaining sad and speechless.	四座相對愁無言
	Among them was an audience from afar,	座中有一遠方士
23	Who sighed in admiration without end.	唧唧咨咨聲不已
	He regretted not having heard this earlier but only now.	自歎今朝初得聞
25	It was then that he knew he had not done justice to his ears.	始知孤負平生耳
	All he worried about was that Zhao Bi would age.	唯憂趙璧白髮生

27	Once he was dead, never again would such a wonderful sound be made.	老死人間無此聲
	"Scholars from afar:	遠方士
	You listened to the five-stringed lute and believed it was perfect.	爾聽五絃信為美
30	I have heard that orthodox music was not like this.	吾聞正始之音不如是
	What was orthodox music like?	正始之音其若何
32	Gentle were the songs of Pure Temple from strings of boiled-off silk.	朱絃疏越清廟歌
	One plucked, one sang, and three chanted:	一彈一唱再三歎
34	Its music was peaceful, stanzas were sparse, and sounds were not many.	曲淡節稀聲不多
	Harmonious and gentle, it gathered the essence of spirit.	融融曳曳召元氣
36	The heart unconsciously became at ease upon hearing it.	聽之不覺心平和
	It is human nature to value the present and belittle the ancient.	人情重今多賤古
38	The ancient zithern still has its strings, but no one plays it.	古琴有絃人不撫
	Even more so after Zhao Bi came with his mature skills,	更從趙璧藝成來
40	The twenty-five-stringed zithern cannot match the five-stringed lute."	二十五絃不如五

Bai holds Zhao responsible for the decline of ceremonial music. He begins the poem by commenting on Zhao, who tuned the five-stringed lute to cater to the taste of the emperor. The metaphors Bai uses to describe the sound made by each string are dark, and the sounds are unpleasant: rustling, shrill, and depressing. The first two strings create rustling sounds that suggest the autumn, when plants are sparse. The third and the fourth strings conjure the visceral sounds of a parent deprived of its child. The fifth string calls to mind ice and immobility. All these strings played together make for a mournful and clashing performance, in which iron and ice are used as metaphors to capture the sharpness of the tones. Bai describes these tones as *shasheng* 殺聲 (frightening sound) and *hanqi* 寒氣 (chilling air) for the feelings of distress they induced in listeners. The power of his performance was obvious, as following it the audience did not stir but sat in sorrow and silence.

Bai then brought up the twenty-five-stringed zithern, the ancient musical instrument known as *se* 瑟 in Chinese, as a contrast. Used in ritual ceremonies, it is a zither-like instrument with movable bridges. It differs from the zither that only had seven strings and was without bridges. Its flat, rectangular box was often elaborately decorated on both sides. This instrument was believed to have virtually disappeared by the beginning of the first millennium CE and is known primarily through archaeological finds. The tomb of Marquis Yi, which was found in 1977, included the most sumptuous examples (totaling twelve) of this musical instrument.[38]

Zitherns created sparse and simple sounds, fitting for ceremonial music. Its calming effect was stressed by Bai, who uses the songs sung for ancestral ceremonies (known as Pure Temple) as an example, drawing on "Lilun" of the *Xunzi*. It reads, "At the singing of the 'Pure Temple' song, only one man sings and three harmonize with him, only one bell is played with the leather rattles above it, and the zitherns have strings of boiled-off silk and holes in the bottom" 清廟之歌, 一倡而三歎也, 縣一鍾, 尚拊之膈, 朱絃而通越也. [39] He concludes by attributing the belittlement of this instrument to the skills of Zhao, thus referring to his intent "to express his dislike for the sounds of Zheng that override ceremonial music" 惡鄭之奪雅也.[40]

In another poem titled "Wuxian" 五絃 (Five-stringed), Bai again held Zhao responsible for the decline of ceremonial music. The loud sounds that Zhao created were like wind and rain, and his soft sounds were like the whispering of ghosts and spirits. Occasionally he produced cheerful sounds, but they too soon turned into sad tones. There appeared to be no patterns, and because of its unpredictable, frequent changes, the audience's emotions were stirred into great confusion. Bai lamented that commoners were unable to recognize the damaging effect of Zhao's performance, and were simply enchanted by it.[41]

PART III "PIAOGUO YUE": MUSIC OF THE PIAO STATE AS TRIBUTE

While Yuan criticized Xuanzong for facilitating the blending of foreign tones and the music of the central plain, he also condemned Dezong for the excessive favor he bestowed on foreign tones and their performers. "Piaoguo yue" comments on the importing of Piao's musical instruments and its music during the Zhenyuan era.

The Piao state was situated in modern Myanmar, and it was adjacent to the kingdom of Nanzhao to the north, another foreign state on which we will comment. The *Jiu Tang shu* records that Piao lay over two thousand *li* south of the former county of Yongchang 永昌 (west of modern Yunnan and north of modern Myanmar) and was fourteen thousand *li* away from Chang'an. The boundary of the state was three thousand *li* in breadth and thirty-five hundred *li* in length. Zhenla 真臘 state (in modern Cambodia) was to its east, Tianzhu 天竺 (i.e., India) state to its west, the Ocean Ming 溟海 to its south, and the border of Xieyue City 些樂城 of Nanzhao to its north. Its northeast lay sixty-eight hundred *li* from Yangjumie City 陽苴咩城.[42] Due to its distance from the Tang and earlier courts and the language barrier, the Piao state had never corresponded with China in the past. In the late eighth century, its king, Yong Qiang 雍羌, heard that Yimouxun 異牟尋 (754–808) of Nanzhao had relented and

accepted Tang suzerainty. Subsequently, he commanded his younger brother Shwenandaw to seek an audience with the Tang court through a Nanzhao interpreter in 802. His brother brought along thirty-five musicians and presented a total of ten or twelve musical pieces that elaborated on the teachings of Sakyamuni.[43]

Since the Piao state came to present its musical instruments and music as a form of tribute to seek Tang protection, Yuan believed that Dezong should have taken this opportunity to show them ceremonial music that represents the grandeur of the dynasty. On the contrary, Dezong did not have ceremonial music played; rather, he simply let the Piao musicians perform their pieces in court. Yuan argues that this was the wrong method to bring in foreign tribes and proposes that the unity and strength of the state should be obtained through cultural influence.

Yuan's "Piaoguo yue"[44]

	The musical instruments of Piao have elephant- or camel-shaped heads.	驃之樂器頭象駝
2	Its tones and sound do not agree with "The Twelve Harmonies."	音聲不合十二和
	They danced hurriedly and jumped with stiff muscles and joints;	促舞跳趫筋節硬
4	Fancy words jumbled together, and names all messed up.	繁詞變亂名字訛
	A thousand plucking and ten thousand songs were all chokingly low.	千彈萬唱皆咽咽
6	Swirling to the left and wheeling to the right, they danced as if drunk.	左旋右轉空傞傞
	They did not know how to bow to the ground and call to the sky.	俯地呼天終不會
8	When the song was over and the tone changed, what could be done?	曲成調變當如何
	Dezong's profound wish was to pacify the state from afar.	德宗深意在柔遠
10	Not playing the reed-pipe wind instruments and large bells, he had consorts and palace maids cast aside.	笙鏞不御停嬪娥
	The History Office recorded it as an account of imperial tribute.	史館書為朝貢傳
12	The Court of Imperial Sacrifice included it in the Section of Tributaries.	太常編入鞮鞻科
	In ancient times when Tao Yao was Son of Heaven,	古時陶堯作天子
14	He disguised himself to listen to the songs of the broad road.	遜遁親聽康衢歌
	Again he sent announcers to hold a wooden bell	又遣遒人持木鐸
16	To collect folk songs and ballads all over the place.	遍採謳謠天下過
	The desires of ten thousand people could all be delivered.	萬人有意皆洞達
18	The guardians of the four quarters dared not implement harsh policies.	四嶽不敢施煩苛
	He let everyone break up clods of earth.	盡令區中擊壤塊

(Continued)

20	His beneficence reached remote areas, and his favor spread abroad.	燕及海外覃恩波
	The ancient system crumbled as Qin dominated and Zhou declined.	秦霸周衰古官廢
22	The kingly way tilted as the upper was blocked from the lower.	下堙上塞王道頗
	All esteemed the foreign culture as if it held transforming power,	共矜異俗同聲教
24	Disregarding the commoners who suffer from frequent disasters.	不念齊民方薦瘥
	It is said that even fish and turtles could be civilized by the emperor.	傳稱魚鼈亦咸若
26	If only Dezong would follow this model [Yao], he would be worthy of praise.	苟能效此誠足多
	It is as if cows and horses are not subject to the emperor's favor,	借如牛馬未蒙澤
28	How could one hold on to an earthen basin to nurture soft-shelled turtles and Yangtze alligators?	豈在抱甕滋黿鼉
	The way of civilization has its origin and end.	教化從來有源委
30	One must swim in the river before swimming in the ocean.	必將泳海先泳河
	Inverting right and wrong has occurred since mid-antiquity.	非是倒置自中古
32	Alas, Piao! Alas, Piao! Who can hold you responsible?	驃兮驃兮誰爾訶

"Piaoguo yue" begins by criticizing the musical instruments of the Piao state; they cannot possibly be used to produce sounds that comply with those in "Shi'er he," the music that could harmonize human beings and godly spirits. As such, they were unworthy of Dezong's attention. According to Hayashi Kenzo's 林謙三 (1899–1976) study, the Piao envoys brought to the Tang court twenty-two instruments and performed twelve pieces of music. Due to their proximity to India, the Piao people were subject to the influence of Indian culture—including their music. The twelve pieces they performed featured only the *shang*-tune 商調, which was the foundation of Indian music. Over half of the musical instruments also came from India.[45]

The *shang*-tune is based on the pentatonic scale; symbolically, this tune is associated with autumn and indicative of sadness, because autumn is when plants wither and die. The Chinese music before the Six Dynasties all used the *gong*-tune 宮調 as the beginning tune. It was only after the arrival of foreign music that the Chinese began to use other tunes as the beginning tune for popular music, although the use of the *gong*-tune was still considered a defining feature of ceremonial music.[46]

Yuan further pointed out songs that were reflections of governance, including "Kangqu ge" 康衢歌 (Song of the broad road) and "Jirang ge" 擊壤歌 (Song of breaking up clods), were the ones worth attending to. The former alludes to an anecdote about Yao's disguising himself as a

commoner to examine the effectiveness of his rule for the past fifty years. It was then that he heard a child on a broad road singing a song praising his governance; the commoners did not know him but naturally followed his commands.[47] The latter celebrates Yao's rule, sung by a fifty-year-old peasant who was playing a game called "breaking up clods." The game involves throwing a wooden piece at a tilted wooden board from thirty or forty steps away. Clods could also be used. The song reads:

I work when the sun comes up, rest when the sun goes down.
I bore a well for water to drink and plow a field for food to eat.
What does the power of the emperor have to do with me?
日出而作, 日入而息;
鑿井而飲, 耕田而食。
帝力於我何有哉? [48]

The game then became a symbol for a peaceful and orderly world in which the commoners had the leisure to entertain themselves and were undisturbed by imperial orders.

Both songs impart the idea that the most desirable ruler would let his people live according to nature to the point that they might not even feel the existence of a ruler. From couplets seven through ten, Yuan highlights Yao's genuine care for the commoners and his efforts to ascertain the effectiveness of his rule, through which he subtly brought up the idea that Dezong—had he been a sage-ruler equivalent to Yao—would have reached out to all his subjects, including the commoners.

Yuan then criticizes Dezong for neglecting the misfortunes of commoners. The *locus classicus* of the phrase *jiancuo* 薦瘥 (redoubling afflictions) is "Jie Nanshan" 節南山 (Lofty is the southern hill) of the *Songs*, and its import would have been easily recognizable to the emperor and literati. The song criticizes Grandmaster Yin 尹 for his incompetence and for his reluctance to recruit worthy people to assist the state.[49] The ancient Chinese believed that harsh policies were at odds with Heaven's will and would induce calamities. With this belief in mind, the poet lamented the unrelenting Grandmaster, who refused to rectify his mistakes even in the face of the multiplying afflictions sent down by Heaven.

Yuan might have intended to compare Grandmaster Yin with Dezong, who made use of power struggles to eliminate those he did not favor. Obvious examples are the elimination of Liu Yan 劉晏 (715–780) at the hands of Yang Yan 楊炎 (727–821) and Dezong's later use of Lu Qi 盧杞 (d. c. 785) to seize power from Yang.[50] In spite of the contributions of Liu and Yang to economic reform, both were demoted and commanded to commit suicide en route to where they had been exiled.[51] Lu Zhi 陸贄 (754–805), a chief minister who had once earned Dezong's trust and favor, was also

demoted and almost executed en route to his new appointment.[52] In Dezong's last decade (795–805), he relied more heavily on eunuchs, installing them in the direct line of command of the palace army in 796 and also appointing them as army supervisors of the provincial governors.[53]

Dezong therefore failed to rule with virtue, a quality that Yuan emphasizes for its civilizing power. The references to fish, cows, horses, turtles, and Yangtze alligators all play a part in an extended metaphor arguing that virtue is the essential element for a ruling house. The *locus classicus* of the term *xianruo* 咸若 (to enjoy their existence according to their nature) comes from the *Shangshu*. There is a record relating to Yi Yin's 伊尹 discussion of Yu's virtue, which was so great that the spirits of the hills and rivers were all tranquil, and the birds and beasts, the fish and tortoises, all enjoyed their lives in their natural habitats, so no calamities were sent down from Heaven. He then attributed the destruction of the Xia dynasty to the tyrannical rule of Yu's descendant Jie, which caused Heaven to have King Tang 湯 put him down.[54] By alluding to this record, Yuan proposes that the true indicator of imperial authority was its transforming power, under the influence of which all creatures were cultivated naturally. Yuan further uses turtles and alligators to elaborate on the futility of caring for lesser ones when the larger ones, such as cows and horses, have not been cared for.

In the concluding part, Yuan alludes to the *Liji* to strengthen his argument. The term *yuanwei* 源委 (origin and confluence) concerns the cultivation of the basics. The *Liji* notes that "when the three sovereigns offered sacrifices to the waters, they did so first to the rivers, then to the seas, first to the source, then to its confluence—this is called 'paying attention to the basics'" 三王之祭川也，皆先河而後海；或源也，或委也。此之謂務本.[55] Yuan stressed that civilization and governance should begin from those who were the closest to the emperor. In the last couplet, Yuan criticized Dezong's preposterous policy, for he failed to cultivate the central plain and instead practiced a conciliatory policy trying to impress the Piao people. It was an attempt that Yuan considered futile.

The Well-being of Commoners as a True Indicator of Peace: Bai's "Piaoguo yue"

Bai notes that his poem "expresses his wish to have the imperial transforming power be exercised on the closest ones rather than on the far" 欲王化之先邇後遠也. Different from Yuan, he did not criticize the music of the Piao state directly. His criticism was conveyed by highlighting the foreignness of their customs, including their musical instruments, their hairstyles, their tattoos, their hair accessories, and their bodily movements.

Bai's "Piaoguo yue" [56]

	Music of Piao state,	驃國樂
	Music of Piao state:	驃國樂
3	It came from the southwestern corner of the large ocean.	出自大海西南角
	Shwenandaw, the son of Yong Qiang,	雍羌之子舒難陀
5	Came to present the southern sound to declare their allegiance.	來獻南音奉正朔
	Dezong had the insignia set up at the imperial palace,	德宗立仗御紫庭
7	Not plugging up his ears with the yellow cotton balls of his royal crown so that he could listen.	黈纊不塞為爾聽
	Once the conch shell was blown, the [Piao dancers with] hammer topknots rose.	玉螺一吹椎髻聳
9	Accompanied by the thousand striking of the bronze drums, they danced in their tattooed bodies.	銅鼓千擊文身踊
	Their pearl tassels were swung dazzlingly like twinkling stars.	珠纓炫轉星宿搖
11	Their flower garlands were enlivened like roving dragons and snakes.	花鬘斗擻龍蛇動
	When the song ended, the prince reported to the sage ruler,	曲終王子啟聖人
13	"My father implores to serve the Tang as a subject."	臣父願為唐外臣
	How swiftly everyone around cheered!	左右歡呼何翕習
15	All praised the highest for his broad virtue that reached afar.	至尊德廣之所及
	In no time various officials came to the palace gate,	須臾百辟詣閤門
17	Kneeling to present memorials congratulating the highest:	俯伏拜表賀至尊
	"I humbly saw the Piao people presenting new music,	伏見驃人獻新樂
19	And I plead to record it in the official histories to pass it on."	請書國史傳子孫
	At the time there was an elderly peasant who broke up clods.	時有擊壤老農父
21	He conjectured the heart of the ruler and mumbled on his own:	暗測君心閑獨語
	"I heard that our Majesty is sagacious and wise in his transforming policies,	聞君政化甚聖明
23	That he would like to move people to obtain great peace.	欲感人心致太平
	Moving people shall begin from nearby rather than from afar.	感人在近不在遠
25	Great peace comes from merit, not from sound.	太平由實非由聲
	Reflect on oneself and govern the state, and the state would benefit.	觀身理國國可濟
27	The ruler is like the heart, and the people are like the body.	君如心兮民如體
	When the body suffers from illness, the heart is sorrowful.	體生疾苦心慘悽
29	When the commoners have peace, the ruler is cheerful.	民得和平君愷悌
	If the people of Zhenyuan were not at ease,	貞元之民若未安
31	The ruler would not be happy hearing the Piao music.	驃樂雖聞君不歡
	If the people of Zhenyuan were not suffering from illness,	貞元之民苟無病
33	The ruler would be sagacious even if the Piao music did not come.	驃樂不來君亦聖
	The Piao music sounded in futility.	驃樂驃樂徒喧喧
35	It would be better to listen to these shallow remarks of mine."	不如聞此芻蕘言

The poem begins by introducing the musical performance presented by the Piao state, followed by the reaction of the court officials when the Piao prince declared allegiance to the emperor. While the officials used this as evidence of the imperial power reaching far beyond the border and considered it an event worthy to be included in the official histories, an elderly farmer proposed a strikingly different view. The term *jirang* 擊壤 (to break up clods) clearly references the sagacious rule of Yao, under which a truly peaceful world comes from the actual well-being of commoners; without this, the ruler would not be happy. Whether the Piao state declared allegiance or not, the farmer argues, was not of grave importance, and it certainly was not an indicator of the sagacity of the emperor. Piao's music was simply a chorus of noise, less worthy of attention than his own words.

Bai stresses the importance of implementing benevolent policies over music, whereas Yuan presents his criticism by noting that Dezong let go of the ancient musical instruments in favor of the Piao instruments, details that Bai left out. By doing so, Bai again shifts attention to the officials, who jumped at the opportunity to flatter the emperor, to the point that they urged the emperor to have the event recorded in official histories. In contrast to Yuan, who simply states that the performance was recorded in the official histories, Bai highlights the responsibility of the various officials for misleading the emperor about its importance.

PART IV VOICE AND PROSODY ACROSS THE POEMS

Yuan's "Huayuan qing" has twenty-four lines (twelve stanzas); Bai's response poem has the same number of lines but with one stanza less. Yuan begins with third-person narration, but then assumes first-person narration by introducing *wo* 我 (I) in line 18. From here on he expresses his wishes directly, clearly indicated by the use of *yuan* 願 (to wish) and *jun* 君 (my lord). Bai's response poem, in contrast, uses third-person narration throughout.

The tone patterns for both poems are irregular, in the sense that there is no clear rule for the alternation of level and oblique tones. Yuan's poem is entirely heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem mixes in three-character lines in the first two stanzas to highlight the subject matter: the contrast between Huayuan stone and stones from the Si riverside. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses rhyme words from the rhyme categories *jing* 徑, *jing* 勁, and *ying* 映. While using words from *jing* 徑 to rhyme with the other two does not comply with the practice of the *Guangyun* 廣韻 (Enlarged [*Qieyun*] rhymes, 1011), it complies with the ancient rhyme patterns.[57] Bai's poem shows a frequent change of rhyme categories, including both level tones and oblique tones. There are stanzas that rhyme every line and stanzas that

rhyme every other line. He also uses near-rhymes within a stanza. For the tone pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.1.

Yuan's "Wuxian tan" has thirty lines (fifteen stanzas), whereas Bai's response poem is longer, with forty lines (nineteen stanzas). Both poets begin with third-person narration and switch to first-person narration in the latter half. Yuan speaks directly to the emperor using *chen* 臣 (your subject), a humble self-reference in the third person, whereas Bai speaks directly to the scholar using the first-person *wu* 吾 (I).

The tone patterns of both poems are again irregular. Yuan's poem is once more consistently heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem employs lines of different lengths. Bai's poem begins with two three-character lines that highlight the subject: the plucking of the five-stringed lute. In stanza eight in the middle, he again uses two three-character lines to stress the piercing sound of Zhao's performance and its effect on listeners. When he presents himself in the first person in the poem, he incorporates both a three-character and a nine-character line in stanza fourteen. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses rhyme words from the two near-rhyme categories *xiao* 笑 and *xiao* 嘯 that comply with the practice of *Guangyun*.[58] Bai's poem shows the same types of frequent changes described above for "Huayuan qing." For the tone pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.2.

Turning to the third set of poems, Yuan's "Piaoguo yue" has thirty-two lines (sixteen stanzas), whereas Bai's response poem is longer; it has a further three lines and one more stanza. Yuan uses third-person narration throughout. Bai uses the third person at the beginning but has the various officials and the peasant speak directly in the latter half. By contrasting the voices of two different groups of subjects—one that can influence policies and one that can only be subject to such policies—Bai criticizes officials for lacking the insights of a commoner.

Again, the tone patterns for both poems are irregular. Yuan's poem is entirely heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem includes two three-character lines at the beginning to highlight the subject. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses rhyme words from the two near-rhyme categories *ge* 歌 and *ge* 戈. Bai again deploys the same types of frequent changes described above for the previous two poems. For the tone pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.3.

Notes

1 Wu Weibin has pointed out an error in the *Hanyu dacidian* where this poem by Yuan is used as textual support to define soft stones as a type of stone that has a hard texture, produces delightful sounds, and can be used as chime stones or for axes. See Wu, *Xinbian Yuan Zhen ji*, vol. 3:1110. See also Luo Zhufeng 羅竹風, ed., *Hanyu dacidian* 漢語大詞典, 12 vols. (Shanghai: Hanyu dacidian chubanshe, 1994), vol. 9:1228.

2 There is a biography of an individual named Zhao Bi from the Kaiyuan era, but he was not the performer in question. See "Xiaoyou zhuan" 孝友傳, in *JTS*, 188.4932 and "Xiaoyou zhuan," in *XTS*, 195.5584.
3 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:720–21.
4 Wu Weibin treats *chunlei* 春雷 as spring thunder. See Wu, *Xinbian Yuan Zhen ji*, vol. 3:1112. Based on the context, however, it likely refers to a type of ancient musical instrument. See "Guqin ming" 古琴名, in Tao Zongyi 陶宗儀 (b. 1316), *Nancun chuogeng lu* 南村輟耕錄 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1959), 29.365. It may have been the original five-stringed zither or the later seven-stringed version.
5 See "Yu gong" 禹貢, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 6.11, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:82.
6 "Lun qingshi suochan chu" 論磬石所產處, in Zhu Zaiyu 朱載堉 (1536–1611), *Yuelü quanshu* 樂律全書, 9.37a–39b, in *SKQS*, vol. 213–14:336.
7 "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 39.5b–6b, in *SSJZS*, 693. Translation revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:120–21.
8 "Ziyi" 緇衣, in *Liji zhushu*, 55.3b, in *SSJZS*, 928. Translation slightly revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:353.
9 "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 39.4a, in *SSJZS*, 692. Translation slightly revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, 2:119.
10 "Yinyue zhi," in *JTS*, 28.1058.
11 See *Zhouli zhushu*, 22.12b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:339.
12 See Edwin G. Pulleyblank, *The Background of the Rebellion of An Lu-shan* (London: Oxford University Press, 1955), 10.
13 See Yuan, "Huayuan qing," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.720.
14 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 38.1a, in *SSJZS*, 677.
15 See *Liji jishuo* 禮記集說, 94. 32a, in *SKQS*, vol. 119:83.
16 See "Bianyue jie" 辨樂解 of *Kongzi jiayu* 孔子家語, in Qianlong 乾隆 (1711–1799, r. 1736–1795), comp., *Yupi lidai tongjian jilan* 御批歷代通鑑輯覽 (Taipei: Xinxing shuju, 1959), 1.9a.
17 See Luo Bi 羅泌 (13th cent.), *Lu shi* 路史, 45.17a–b, in *SKQS*, vol. 383:635.
18 Wu Zhao 吳釗 and Liu Dongsheng 劉東升, *Zhongguo yinyue shilue* 中國音樂史略 (1993; Beijing: Renmin yinyue chubanshe, 2005), 3.
19 See "Shun dian" 舜典, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 3.26a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:46. Translation slightly revised from James Legge, *The Chinese Classics: The Shoo King or the Book of Historical Documents* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960), vol. 3:47–48.
20 Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 166.
21 See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 166 and Su Zhongxiang, annot., *Yuan Bai shixuan* 元白詩選 (Shanghai: Gudian wenxue chubanshe, 1957), 72.
22 *BJYJJJ*, vol.1:3.153.
23 *BJYJJJ*, vol.1:3.153–54.
24 See *Zhouli zhushu*, 23.8b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:353.
25 "Yinyue zhi" 音樂志, in *JTS*, 29.1076.
26 See Li, *Tang guoshi bu*, 58–59; see also Chen, *Yueshu*, 129.2b, in *SKQS*, vol. 211:568.
27 See Chen, *Yueshu*, 129.2b.
28 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.722.
29 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.5a, in *SSJZS*, 664.
30 See "Xiongnu zhuan" 匈奴傳, in *Shiji*, 110.2888. See also *Han shu*, 94.3749.
31 C. A. Peterson, "Court and Province in Mid- and Late T'ang," in *The Cambridge History of China: Sui and T'ang China, 589–906, Part I*, ed. Denis Twitchett (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), vol. 3:464–97.

32 Su, *Yuan Bai shixuan*, 74.
33 For these references, see Yang, *Yuan Zhen ji biannian jianzhu*, 114.
34 See *Mao* 131. See also the translation by James Legge in his *The Chinese Classics: The She King or the Book of Poetry* (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960), vol. 4:199.
35 See Kong Anguo's commentary on "Yaodian" 堯典, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 2.19b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:26.
36 Han Ying 韓嬰 (fl. 156 BCE), *Hanshi waizhuan jishi* 韓詩外傳集釋, ed. Xu Weiyu 許維遹 (1980; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2005), 3.100–101; James R. Hightower, *Han shih waichuan: Han Ying's Illustrations of the Didactic Application of the Classic of Songs* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1952), 95–96.
37 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.188–89.
38 See the study on stringed zithers by Bo Lawergren in So, *Music in the Age of Confucius*, 65–85. The twenty-five-stringed zithern kept in the Hunan Museum is the most well-preserved ancient zithern.
39 Translation based on Burton Watson, *Hsün Tzu: Basic Writings* (1963; rpt. New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), 93–94. Chinese original from Wang, *Xunzi jijie*, vol. 2:13.354.
40 See "Wuxian tan," in *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.188.
41 "Wuxian," in *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:2.94.
42 See "Nanman Xinanman zhuan" 南蠻西南蠻傳, in *JTS*, 197.5285.
43 See "Nanman Xinanman zhuan," in *JTS*, 197.5286; "Yinyue zhi," in *JTS*, 29.1070.
44 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.734–35.
45 See Hayashi Kenzo 林謙三, *Sui-Tang yanyuediao yanjiu* 隋唐燕樂調研究, trans. Guo Moruo 郭沫若 (Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1936), 82–84. The original Japanese text of this book is lost, making Guo's Chinese translation the only available version until Hasebe Tsuyoshi 長谷部剛 and Yamadera Michi 山寺三知 translated the Chinese back to Japanese. This Japanese version also included other related works of Hayashi and Guo as well as a translation of Chen Yingshi's 陳應時 comments on Hayashi's research. See Hasebe Tsuyoshi and Yamadera Michi, comp. and trans., *Hayashi Kenzo "Zui Tō engakuchō kenkyu" to sono shūhen* 林謙三『隋唐燕楽調研究』とその周辺 (Osaka: Kansai daigaku shuppanbu, 2017), 108–11.
46 See Hayashi, *Sui-Tang yanyuediao yanjiu*, 120; see also Hasebe and Yamadera, *Hayashi Kenzo "Zui Tō engakuchō kenkyu" to sono shūhen*, 145.
47 See Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, ed., *Liezi jishi* 列子集釋 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1979), 4.143–44.
48 See Qianlong, *Yupi lidai tongjian jilan*, 1.6b.
49 See *Mao* 191/2. See also the translation by Legge in his *The Chinese Classics*, vol. 4:310–11.
50 See "Yang Yan zhuan" 楊炎傳, in *JTS*, 68.3423–25. Also see Michael T. Dalby, "Court Politics in Late T'ang Times," in *The Cambridge History of China*, ed. Denis Twitchett, vol. 3:561–681, 580–82.
51 According to the *JTS*, Yang Yan spread rumors about Liu Yan's advice for Daizong (Dezong's father) to enthrone Consort Dugu 獨孤后 as the Empress and make Li Jiong 李迥 the heir instead, and Liu's secret alliance with the rebel Zhu Ci 朱泚 (742–784). Statesmen of the time generally considered Liu innocent, and Li Zhengji 李正己 (c.734–c.783) thus presented a memorial to clear his name. Facing the criticism of many statesmen, Yang sent his close associates to various circuits under the pretense of expressing condolences; in fact, they

blamed Liu's death on Dezong's personal grudge against him. See "Yang Yan zhuan" 楊炎傳, in *JTS*, 118.3423.

52 For a comprehensive study of Lu Zhi's aristocratic lineage, career life, personality, and reform policies as well as his later conflict with Dezong, see Josephine Chiu-Duke, *To Rebuild the Empire: Lu Chih's Confucian Pragmatist Approach to the Mid-T'ang Predicament* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2000). For a study of Lu Zhi's fall due to his changing relationship with Dezong after he and his rival Pei Yanling were both appointed as Chief Ministers, see Denis C. Twitchett, "Lu Chih (754–805): Imperial Advisor and Court Official," in *Confucian Personalities*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1962), 84–122.

53 See Dalby, "Court Politics in Late T'ang Times," 598–601.

54 "Tang shi" 湯誓, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 8.13b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:114.

55 See "Xueji" 學記, in *Liji zhushu*, 36.18a, in *SSJZS*, 656. Revised from Legge, *Li Chi*, vol. 2:91.

56 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.194.

57 Hanabusa Hideki 花房英樹 and Maegawa Yukio 前川幸雄, *Gen Shin kenkyū* 元稹研究 (Kyoto: Ibundō shoten, 1977), 277.

58 Hideki and Yukio, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 276–77.

5 On Dances with Accompaniment

Besides the three New Music Bureau poems by Yuan Zhen that comment on music, three others focus on dances with accompaniment: "Faqu" 法曲 (Buddhist music), "Libu ji" 立部伎 (Entertainers of the Standing Section), and "Huxuan nü" 胡旋女 (Girls of the "Sogdian Whirl"). Dances with accompaniment had a significant role to play in governance. The early Tang emperors used them not only to establish their authority and to display their achievements but sometimes also to display filial piety.[1] On the one hand, Yuan appreciates the ancient musical instruments, songs, and dances; on the other hand, he criticizes the excessive favor bestowed on musicians and performers of contemporary and foreign songs and dances. By doing so, he emphasizes music as a form of cultural identity, one that has a transforming effect by uniting people of the same nation and as a result, reinforcing rule. It is based on this idea that Yuan comments on the imperial composition of dances with accompaniment by wise rulers in "Faqu" and "Libu ji," and criticizes the celebration of foreign dances in "Huxuan nü."

"Faqu" and "Libu ji" both concern the decline of ritual songs, symbolizing the decline of governance. "Faqu" points out that dances with accompaniment serve as a reminder of proper rule, and a good ruler would be mindful of their nature and quality. "Libu ji" brings out the symbolic meanings of Taizong's "Qide wu." "Huxuan nü" focuses on the popularity of Tartar dances and compares them metaphorically to crafty and bewitching officials.

PART I "FAQU": DANCE WITH ACCOMPANIMENT AS A REMINDER OF GOOD RULE

"Faqu" uses the motif of dance with accompaniment as a symbol of political achievement. In this way, Yuan criticizes Xuanzong and the succeeding emperors for failing to strengthen their rule through promoting state music.

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-5

	Yuan's "Faqu"[2]	
	I heard that when the Yellow Emperor beat the *qingjue*-note,	吾聞黃帝鼓清角
2	He tamed bears and enticed auspicious cranes to dance.	弭伏熊羆舞玄鶴
	When Shun held shields and feathers, the Miao changed their hearts;	舜持干羽苗革心
4	When Yao played "Xianchi," phoenixes came to nest on the pavilion.	堯用咸池鳳巢閣
	"Da Xia," "Hu," and "Wu" all symbolize sagacious achievements:	大夏濩武皆象功
6	So plentiful are the merits that the natural force appears slight.	功多已訝玄功薄
	Gaozu of Han made a song when he passed by Pei.	漢祖過沛亦有歌
8	The Prince of Qin did not let his defeat of the enemy ranks go without a composition to celebrate it.	秦王破陣非無作
	To compose for the ancestral temple is difficult;	作之宗廟見艱難
10	To compose for the army passes on only dregs.	作之軍旅傳糟粕
	The Bright Emperor designed music with many new forms.[3]	明皇度曲多新態
12	A subtle and slow-paced style replaced the solemn.	宛轉浸淫易沉著
	"Red Peach and White Plum Blossoms" took its name from flowers;	赤白桃李取花名
14	"Raiment of Rainbows and Feathers" was considered music from Heaven.	霓裳羽衣號天落
	Although ceremonial music was already in disarray,	雅弄雖云已變亂
16	Foreign music had not yet been mixed in.	夷音未得相參錯
	Since the Tartar cavalries raised smoke and dust,	自從胡騎起烟塵
18	The fur-wearing enemies have occupied Xian and Luo.[4]	毛毳腥羶滿咸洛
	Girls became Tartar women wearing Tartar make-up;	女為胡婦學胡妝
20	Entertainers presented Tartar songs and studied Tartar music.	伎進胡音務胡樂
	The sound of "Flaming Phoenix" dwindled and was almost extinguished.	火鳳聲沉多咽絕
22	"The Warble of Spring Orioles" ended and was long silenced.[5]	春鶯囀罷長蕭索
	Tartar cavalries, Tartar music, and Tartar make-up	胡音胡騎與胡妝
24	For fifty years have spread everywhere.	五十年來競紛泊

Dances to Music as Symbols of Political Success

Faqu was a type of dance to popular music originally performed in Buddhist religious assemblies. It first appeared in China during the Eastern Jin 東晉 (317–420) and the Six Dynasties. It was also called *fayue* 法樂 (music for Buddhist assemblies) when it was composed for promoting Buddhist doctrines.[6] The music was imported from the Western Regions, in particular Qiuci 龜茲 (in modern Xinjiang) and India.

By the time of the Qi 齊 (479–502) and Liang 梁 (502–557) dynasties of the Southern Dynasties 南朝 (420–c. 589), a form of palace music known as "Qingshang" 清商 was also used for Buddhist assemblies.

"Qingshang music" was considered Han music because it was a combination of a *yuefu* sub-genre called "songs of resonance" 相和歌 and folk songs from the Jiangsu, Shanxi, and Shaanxi areas.[7] The incorporation of "Qingshang" music into *faqu* encouraged the blending of the music of the Western Regions and Han music. During the early Tang, there were already lay servants of monasteries known as *jingren* 淨人 who were trained for performing these dances to music. These performances tried to promote Buddhist doctrines in the form of entertainment. The renowned monk Shaokang 少康 compares it to the music of the Zheng and Wei states; it is like honey used to ease the bitter taste of the fine medicine of Buddhist doctrines.[8]

Yuan's poem begins by showing how music is significant in representing a ruler's political achievements. Yuan alludes to the music of various successful ancient leaders—including legendary heroes and sagacious rulers as well as the founders of the Han and Tang dynasties. The allusions, however, appear to have been drawn from a mixture of different sources.

The first couplet seems to be a fusion of various records concerning the Yellow Emperor, who was also named Xuanyuan 軒轅. There is no precise record of the Yellow Emperor playing the musical instrument *qingjue* 清角 to tame black and brown bears or to inspire auspicious cranes to dance.[9] Either Yuan had access to sources that are no longer available to us, or he deliberately changed the allusions to emphasize the magical power of music and the transforming power of imperial virtue.

There are, however, several anecdotes regarding the Yellow Emperor's playing the musical note *qingjue*, commanding demons and monsters to fight for him at the field of Zhuolu 涿鹿 (in modern Hebei) to resist Chiyou 蚩尤. The note was so clear and piercing that it could be compared to the resonance of phoenixes and the chanting of dragons.[10] Both creatures were considered divine and auspicious; they only emerged with sages and responded to an orderly world. Another record has it that the Yellow Emperor recruited ferocious wild animals and trained them to fight against the tyrannical Flaming Emperor 炎帝 in the wilds of Banquan 阪泉 (in modern Shanxi).[11] Although these animals may be metaphors for powerful military units,[12] Yuan treats them as real animals.

Instead of the Yellow Emperor, various sources have the famous musician Shi Kuang who induced auspicious cranes to dance. In the *Yueshu*, Chen Yang listed one by one the effects of music on animals, saying, "Hou Kui played 'Xiaoshao,' and phoenixes came and danced elegantly for him; Shi Kuang played the *qingjue* (i.e., the note), and auspicious cranes led each other on to dance to it" 后夔奏簫韶, 鳳凰為之來儀; 師曠奏清角, 玄鶴為之率舞.[13]

Yuan merged all the legends concerning the magical power of music to suggest that the Yellow Emperor's successful rule had harmonized

nature and men. Yuan used the Yellow Emperor as a representative of culture heroes because he was celebrated for both his literary and military achievements.

The second couplet calls up the sage rulers Yao and Shun as examples of how statecraft surpasses military exploits. The normal order for these two rulers would be Yao and Shun, but in the poem the order has been switched to cater to the rhyming scheme. According to the *Shangshu*, Shun commanded Yu to lead an expedition against the state of San Miao 三苗 (in modern Jiangzhou, Ezhou, and Yuezhou), but it yielded no result. It was not until Shun terminated military action and instead ruled by virtue that San Miao declared its allegiance to him.[14]

Shields and feathers were tools used in military and civil dances respectively, used as symbols for the end of military actions. Because of Shun's virtue in serving his ruthless father Gusou 瞽瞍, who favored the younger son borne to him by his second wife and tried to kill Shun many times, it was possible for him to convert the Miao through civil means. It is as Kong Anguo 孔安國 (c. 156–74 BCE) comments on Shun, that the ruler must possess the virtuous way to convert the enemies' hearts.[15] The Way refers to the Confucian way of governance, which values benevolence and considers filial piety as its root.

Although there is no record concerning the phoenix that rested on the pavilion upon hearing Yao's "Xianchi," Chen Yang suggests that the playing of Shun's piece "Xiaoshao" effectively summoned phoenixes to dance elegantly. Yuan might have combined this legend concerning Shun's "Xiaoshao" and the ancient musical composition "Xianchi," which concerns Yao's virtue,[16] to underscore the magical power of music and the charisma of a virtue that draws even divine creatures.

In the third couplet, Yuan illustrates the different types of dances to music and their implications. These include "Da Xia," which eulogizes Yu's ability to channel the Yellow River to prevent flooding;[17] "Da hu," which reveals Tang's provisions for commoners; and "Da wu," which refers to King Wu's conquest of the tyrannical King Zhou of Yin.[18] For Yuan, all these dances are proof of the former sages' emphasis on the active function of music in governance.

Composing Dances with Accompaniment

Yuan argues that every emperor should take after the former sage rulers and make compositions to express their political endeavor. As examples, he chose two great leaders: Han dynasty founder Gaozu 高祖 (c. 256–195 BCE, r. 206–196 BCE) and Taizong, the greatest emperor of Tang, as representatives.

Gaozu composed "Dafeng ge" 大風歌 (Song of the great wind) when he stopped by Pei 沛 (in modern Jiangsu) after defeating the rebel Qing Bu 黥布 (d. 195 BCE) at Kuaizhui 會甀. This song is considered a Music Bureau poem, and it contains three lines only:

> A great wind arose; clouds flew up.
> My prestige increasing within the seas, I return to my hometown.
> But where will I find valiant warriors to hold the four directions?
> 大風起兮雲飛揚。威加海內兮歸故鄉。安得猛士兮守四方？

In the song, he expressed his wish to have valiant warriors guard the borders.[19] Yuan points to it to argue that all successful emperors were eager to find valuable subjects.

This conscious effort to strengthen one's rule is again manifest in Taizong's composition "Pozhen yue," later revised as "Qide wu." It was said that the dance was so full of spirit that the audience all clutched their wrists and felt elated even after it ended. Various generals came forth to wish Taizong longevity, and numerous officials called out, "Long live the emperor!" The non-Han people in court pleaded to lead each other on to dance.[20] This dance was so influential that it spread to Turfan, the Western Regions, and Japan.[21] In Japan, it was included in the category of ceremonial music, holding the most esteemed position.[22] Taizong had this dance performed at every banquet. Although the vigorous swinging of arms and stamping of feet are not civil expressions, these moves reminded Taizong and his court of his rise to power through military means. To stabilize his rule, however, he would resort to literary and civil virtues to pacify all.[23]

Yuan uses Xuanzong as a contrast to Gaozu of Han and Taizong of Tang. He criticizes Xuanzong for creating evocative music to replace the solemn; further, he suggests that the loss of two capitals, Chang'an and Luoyang, to the northern rebels had led to the infiltration of Tartar culture, which had influenced Tang society for some fifty years when Yuan composed his New Music Bureau poems.[24] Through juxtaposing Xuanzong with former sage kings and great leaders, he stresses the impact of music in general and the ability of particular types of music to influence governance for good or bad.

Holding the Musicians Responsible: Bai's "Faqu ge"

Bai's response poem shifts the responsibility for the decline of the music of the central plain from the emperor to the musicians. He notes that he wrote the poem "to praise the various sages in their rectification of the sounds of the central plain" 美列聖, 正華聲也.[25]

Bai's "Faqu ge"[26]

	Music for Buddhist assemblies, music for Buddhist assemblies: Come sing "The Great Pacification."	法曲法曲歌大定
	The fine policies added to sagacity and bequeathed felicity,	積德重熙有餘慶
3	that the people of Yonghui danced and sang.	永徽之人舞而詠
	Music for Buddhist assemblies, music for Buddhist assemblies: Come dance "Raiment of Rainbows and Feathers."	法曲法曲舞霓裳
	The sounds are soothing in an orderly world with harmonious rule,	政和世理音洋洋
6	that the people of Kaiyuan were joyous and affluent.	開元之人樂且康
	Music for Buddhist assemblies, music for Buddhist assemblies: Come sing "The Magnificence."	法曲法曲歌堂堂
8	The magnificent felicity will last without limit.	堂堂之慶垂無疆
	Zhongzong and Suzong restored their grand legacies.	中宗肅宗復鴻業
10	The Tang rule was rejuvenated for tens of thousands of generations.	唐祚中興萬萬葉
	Music for Buddhist assemblies, music for Buddhist assemblies: Combined with it are songs of the aliens.	法曲法曲合夷歌
12	Alien sounds are erratic as opposed to the harmonious sounds of China.	夷聲邪亂華聲和
	Chaos impinging on harmony marked the end of Tianbao.	以亂干和天寶末
14	The dust of Tartars invaded the palace in the following year.	明年胡塵犯宮闕
	Music for Buddhist assemblies was thus known to have originated from the airs of China.	乃知法曲本華風
16	If one could examine its notes, one could see its relation to rule.	苟能審音與政通
	Once we follow the Tartar tune to mix in their sounds,	一從胡曲相參錯
18	We fail to distinguish prosperity from decline, sorrow from joy.	不辨興衰與哀樂
	I wish to seek Ya and Kuang to rectify the notes of China,	願求牙曠正華音
20	Not to let the aliens and the Chinese intrude upon each other.	不令夷夏相交侵

Whereas Yuan praised Taizong for his making of dances to music, Bai chose to celebrate Taizong in another poem titled "Qide wu." In "Qide wu," he argues that Taizong created this dance not so much to display his achievements, but rather to lay out the difficulties of establishing an empire. Success depends on bringing people together, not on military force alone.

In "Faqu ge," Bai traces the development of music for Buddhist assemblies to the change initiated by Gaozong, who created "Yirong dading yue" 一戎大定樂 (Great pacification of a foreign tribe), a new military dance designed in preparation for the expedition against Koryo.[27] Gaozong also had "The Magnificence" sung at the palace. While Yuan subtly criticizes Xuanzong, Bai sang praises of his rule during the Kaiyuan era, noting that it was only when music for Buddhist assemblies was mixed

with Tartar music toward the end of the Tianbao era that the Tang empire was subject to the intrusion of Tartars. Just like Yuan, he makes a final remark that by examining music, one could perceive governance. Instead of accusing the emperor, however, he expresses his wish to seek out a fine musician like Bo Ya or Shi Kuang to rectify Chinese music and restore its original nature.

PART II "LIBU JI": COMBINING MILITARY AND LITERARY VIRTUES

While Yuan's "Faqu" comments on Xuanzong's negligence in creating his own state music for reinforcing rule, his "Libu ji" criticizes the ruler's elevation of Tartar music to the "Sitting Section" and the belittlement of the "Section of Ceremonial Music" 雅樂部. The "Sitting Section" was performed seated in the hall and was the most prestigious. In comparison, the "Standing Section" was performed while standing under the terrace.[28] In the mid-Tang, those who were sent to the "Section of Ceremonial Music" were those unwanted even for the "Standing Section."[29] This phenomenon reveals how insignificant ceremonial music had become and suggests that resources provided for it were also limited.

Yuan's "Libu ji"[30]

	The "Tartar Section" of new music sat on brocaded mats;	胡部新聲錦筵坐
2	While the Han music sounded through from the courtyard.	中庭漢振高音播
	Taizong's temple music was passed on to his offspring.	太宗廟樂傳子孫
4	It took its source from the initial defeat of the baleful ranks.	取類群凶陣初破
	Clink, clink, the stabbing spears shine like frost and snow;	戛戛攢鎗霜雪耀
6	Thump, thump, the rumbling drums sound like wind and thunder.	騰騰擊鼓風雷磨
	The beginning resembles soldiers charging against the enemies;	初疑遇敵身啟行
8	The end follows the ritual by men kneeling with their left knees lifted.	終象由文士憲左
	In days past, Gaozong always stood listening to it.	昔日高宗常立聽
10	Only when the song ended would he approach his imperial seat.	曲終然後臨玉座
	Yet now the military governors have returned from battlefield,	如今節將一掉頭
12	The court's music is battered as lightning ceases and the wind stops.	電捲風收盡摧挫
	Girls of Song, Jin, and Zheng sing their songs;	宋晉鄭女歌聲發
14	A full house of guests choruses loudly.	滿堂會客齊喧哦
	Tinkle, tinkle, jade ornaments move by their waists.	珊瑚佩玉動腰身
16	One by one, "a stream of pearls" is spit from their mouths.	一一貫珠隨咳唾
	The girls have performed in sacrificial ceremonies on Circle Hillock,	頃向圜丘見郊祀

(Continued)

18	and have joined court celebrations on the New Year.	亦曾正旦親朝賀
	Instruments of Imperial Sacrifices are hung on four sides of the palace,	太常雅樂備宮懸
20	But before the nine sets are over, the hundred officials are drowsy.	九奏未終百寮惰
	Disarrayed, it is difficult for even Ji Zha to distinguish the tones;	遠遻難令季札辨
22	Dragging on, it puts even Marquis Wen to sleep, I fear.	遲迴但恐文侯臥
	Musicians are all chosen from the ranks of the deaf and the blind.	工師盡取聾昧人
24	How could this be the fault of former emperors who made the songs?	豈是先王作之過
	Song Yan once recorded that at the end of the Tianbao era,	宋沇嘗傳天寶季
26	Music for Buddhist assemblies and Tartar music were suddenly mixed.	法曲胡音忽相和
	In the tenth month of the following year, bandits from Yan arrived.	明年十月燕寇來
28	The nine temples and thousand palaces were tainted by barbarians.	九廟千門虜塵涴
	I lament and weep whenever I hear these words.	我聞此語歎復泣
30	What could be done to the strayed and the proper since ancient times?	古來邪正將誰奈
	Treacherous sound enters ears, and flattery enters the heart.	姦聲入耳佞入心
32	Dwarfs are stuffed when Yi and Qi starve.	侏儒飽飯夷齊餓

Popular Music Overrides Ceremonial Music

Yuan begins by introducing the "Qide wu" to present his political ideal of rule through combining literary and military virtues. In his opinion, Taizong's choreography for "Pozhen yue wutu" 破陣樂舞圖 (Dancing chart for the music of defeating the enemy ranks) in 633 reflects Taizong's sagacity in making clear his governing principles. While military force was needed to suppress the rebels, its virtue lies in its termination of military affairs, restoring order and bringing peace. The final pose of *zhi you* 致右 (kneeling down on the right knee) and *xian zuo* 憲左 (lifting up the left knee) symbolizes ruling the state with literary virtue, one that was formerly demonstrated by Duke Dan of Zhou and Duke Shi of Shao, the two virtuous officials who assisted King Cheng in stabilizing the Zhou empire.

Yuan alludes to Confucius' analysis of the "Da wu" dance to suggest that "Qide wu" shared similar features with it and that Taizong espoused the same ideology of rule. Taizong was on par with the former sages in the sense that he saw the value of state music for guiding rule. In contrast—without realizing that new music was detrimental to rule—the emperors of

Yuan's time entertained themselves with new music comparable to those of the Jin, Song, and Zheng states, the representatives of perishing states in the Spring and Autumn period.

He then contrasts the popularity of these songs to the fading out of ceremonial music. While the instruments for ceremonial music were hung in the palace, there were no competent musicians to play them, for all the talented ones were sent to practice new music. Here Yuan states the responses of three different types of people to the performance of ceremonial music, including the various officials, the music appraiser, and the ruling class. The various officials grew drowsy before the nine sets of ceremonial music were over. The *Shangshu* notes the significance of the nine sets of Shun's composition, "Xiaoshao," that "when the nine sets of music were over, phoenixes came dancing elegantly" 簫韶九成, 鳳凰來儀.[31] Ceremonial music properly performed can move even divine creatures, but its performance in Yuan's time could not even sustain the interest of common officials; it was so disarrayed that even Ji Zha 季札 (fl. 544 BCE),[32] the appraiser known for his ability to recognize subtle differences in musical tones and interpret the oracular messages behind them, had difficulty differentiating the tones.[33] Even members of the ruling class, who should be able to appreciate ceremonial music, are also driven to sleep. Here Yuan uses Marquis Wen of Wei as a metonymy. Marquis Wen of Wei was a feudal lord during the Warring States period known for his admiration of ritual; however, he too found ceremonial music dull and the songs of the Zheng and Wei states interesting.[34] Yuan alludes to Zixia's comments in regard to the fatigue the marquis experienced while listening to ceremonial music here, but he diverts the emphasis to the musicians' incompetence to better fit his argument. In doing so, he ignores the fact that the marquis was only interested in what Zixia classified as airs.

The term *zhanzhi* 遮懥 (disharmonious) is used to describe the distortion of the five musical tunes and has symbolic meanings as specified by the *Liji*. The five components of a state correspond to the five musical tunes and their symbolic meanings, respectively, covering the ruler, his ministers, the commoners, military affairs, and state resources. The harmonious interplay of the five tunes reflects the peace of society,[35] whereas the cacophony of them indicates the decline of the empire.

Such cacophony is partially attributed to the blending of Han music with Tartar music. Song Yan 宋沇, the Assistant of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices, states that Xuanzong never let Tartar and Han musicians play together until 754. At that time, Xuanzong issued an edict to arrange for the performers of the "Daodiao" 道調 and music for Buddhist assemblies to cooperate with the "Tartar Section of New Music." An Lushan rebelled the following year. [36] Yuan clearly connects the rebellion to the blending of these distinct types of music.

Yuan laments in the concluding couplet that once unorthodox music had become the norm, "dwarfs"—a metaphor for unworthy musicians—were given their fill of food while Bo Yi 伯夷 and Shu Qi 叔齊—metaphors for virtuous men—starved. Bo Yi and Shu Qi were the two sons of the lord of Guzhu 孤竹. The junior Shu Qi yielded the throne to Bo Yi to show respect to the latter for being the eldest son, but Bo Yi refused because it was their father's will to enthrone Shu Qi. They disapproved of King Wu's expedition against King Zhou, considering that it was improper for a subject to overthrow his leader—even more so by military force; they thus refused to serve the Zhou dynasty. They became two of the most celebrated examples of people who upheld their principles even if they had to starve to death.[37] Han Yu in particular wrote "Bo Yi song" 伯夷頌 (The eulogy of Bo Yi) to praise Bo Yi's courage in living up to his principles regardless of public trends and social opinion.[38]

In ancient China, some nobles employed dwarfs as entertainers. The comment on the dwarfs alludes to a dialogue between Dongfang Shuo 東方朔 (154 BCE–93 BCE) and Emperor Wu of Han recorded in the *Han shu*. Dongfang deliberately frightened the dwarfs, claiming that the emperor considered them useless and intended to eradicate their type. Then he advised them to plead for mercy, causing the emperor to inquire of Dongfang his reasons for scaring the dwarfs. Making use of this opportunity, Dongfang voiced out the mismatch of his salary and his talent, and he successfully obtained a raise to distinguish his merit as greater than that of the dwarfs.[39] By alluding to Dongfang's remark, Yuan successfully rounds out his criticism that the emperor failed to deploy those in his service to proper places.

Holding the Court of Imperial Sacrifices Responsible: Bai's "Libu ji"

Unlike Yuan, who holds the emperor responsible for failing to appoint talented musicians to play the state music, Bai again turns his criticism toward the officials, this time the three ministers of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices.

Bai's "Libu ji"[40]

	Entertainers of the Standing Section:	立部伎
2	Their drums and flutes are loud—	鼓笛喧
	Wielding double swords,	舞雙劍
4	Juggling seven balls,	跳七丸
	Brandishing large ropes,	嫋巨索
6	Swinging long poles.	掉長竿
	Entertainers of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices have different ranks.	太常部伎有等級

8	Those in the hall are seated, and those below stand.	堂上者坐堂下立
	In the hall, the singing to reed-organs of the Sitting Section is distinct;	堂上坐部笙歌清
10	Below the hall, drums and flutes of the Standing Section ring.	堂下立部鼓笛鳴
	Just one note sung with reed-organs attracts the multitude;	笙歌一聲眾側耳
12	Ten thousand tunes played with drums and flutes have no audience.	鼓笛萬曲無人聽
	The Standing Section is lowly;	立部賤
14	The Sitting Section is prestigious.	坐部貴
	The originals from the Sitting Section have regressed to the Standing Section,	坐部退為立部伎
16	Striking the drums and blowing the pipes to go along with acrobatics.	擊鼓吹笙和雜戲
	What roles do those who have regressed from the Standing Section assume?	立部又退何所任
18	They perform the ceremonial music with hung instruments.	始就樂懸操雅音
	Ceremonial music has deteriorated to this,	雅音替壞一至此
20	that it has been up to this class of people to tune the five tunes.	長令爾輩調宮徵
	When offering sacrifices to Heaven and Earth,	圓丘后土郊祀時
22	One claims to move the gods and spirits with this music.	言將此樂感神祇
	Wishing that phoenixes would come and myriad animals would dance:	欲望鳳來百獸舞
24	How different is it from driving a carriage north to go to Chu [in the south]?	何異北轅將適楚
	What needs to be said about the ignorant and lowly musicians?	工師愚賤安足云
26	Who are you three ministers of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices?	太常三卿爾何人

Bai details the different rankings of the Sitting and the Standing Sections. He stresses that the most talented musicians should have been trained for playing ceremonial music, but the three ministers of the Court of Imperial Sacrifice had sent the most untalented ones for that task. To highlight their responsibility for this mismanagement, he concludes by posing a rhetorical question. In doing so, he ridicules them for their lack of vision and insight, suggests this poor handling of resources should be rectified, and calls for ceremonial music to be elevated. He therefore composed the poem to "criticize the decline of ceremonial music" 刺雅樂之替也. [41]

PART III "HUXUAN NÜ": BEWITCHING FOREIGN DANCES

While virtuous and talented literati were left unrecognized, crafty and fawning men worked their way up through cajolery. Yuan uses the popular "Huxuan wu" 胡旋舞 (Sogdian whirl) that was imported from the west

during the Tianbao era to elaborate on this theme.[42] "Huxuan nü" begins by commenting on the features of this dance. Using whirling dancers as a metaphor for flattering and deceptive officials, he singles out both groups of people, calling for their condemnation.

	Yuan's "Huxuan nü"[43]	
	Tianbao was about to end as Tartars were about to rebel.	天寶欲末胡欲亂
2	Tartars presented girls capable of whirling.	胡人獻女能胡旋
	They whirled so much that the Bright Emperor was naturally enchanted.	旋得明王不覺迷
4	Wicked Tartars sneakily swept into the Palace of Longevity.[44]	妖胡奄到長生殿
	The meaning of "whirling" the world is impossible to know;	胡旋之義世莫知
6	The features of "whirling" I can convey.	胡旋之容我能傳
	Fleabane snaps with its white roots spinning like a sheep-horn tornado;	蓬斷霜根羊角疾
8	A pole holding up a cinnamon plate whirls like a fire wheel of dazzling light.	竿戴朱盤火輪炫
	Precious pearls and split earrings race after the Dragon Star.	驪珠迸珥逐龍星
10	The iridescent halo of light cloth moves as swift as lightning.	虹暈輕巾掣流電
	A hidden whale secretly sucks in water, creating waves on the sea.	潛鯨暗嗡筧海波
12	A whirling wind dances chaotically, just as sleet fills the air.	迴風亂舞當空霰
	Who can figure out its beginning or end as they whirl ten thousand times?	萬過其誰辨終始
14	How can the audience possibly tell if it is the dancers' front or back?	四座安能分背面
	Consorts and observers tell each other:	才人觀者相為言
16	"To secure the Lord's favor lies in tactfulness and caprice:	承奉君恩在圓變
	Follow the Lord's words, be they right or wrong, may you like or dislike.	是非好惡隨君口
18	Be it south, north, east, or west, follow wherever the Lord glances at.	南北東西逐君盼
	Be like an adorned belt that is soft and clings to the torso;[45]	柔軟依身看佩帶
20	Be the same as a bracelet that enlaces around fingers."	徘徊繞指同環釧
	Crafty officials hear this, and their scheming revolves.	佞臣聞此心計迴
22	They confuse the Lord's heart by baffling the Lord's eyes.	惑亂君心君眼眩
	The Lord says it seems crooked; they bend it like a hook.	君言似曲屈如鉤
24	The Lord says he prefers it straight; they stretch it into like an arrow.	君言好直舒為箭
	Craftily following his clear shadow everywhere,	巧隨清影觸處行
26	They cleverly learn from spring orioles to sing in a hundred ways.	好學春鶯百般囀
	They use the power of the Lord to topple heaven and tilt earth,	傾天側地用君力
28	Concealing and covering it up in fear that the Lord may see.	抑塞周遮恐君見
	The emerald-feathered chariot went south to Bridge of Ten-Thousand *li*,	翠華南幸萬里橋

30	Only then did Xuanzong realize the central plain was overturned.	玄宗始悟坤維轉
	Do send my words to those who whirl others' eyes and hearts:	寄言旋目與旋心
32	Those with fiefs and appanages shall all condemn you!	有國有家當共譴

Yuan criticized the "Sogdian Whirl," for its swift movements only served to perplex the eyes of the audience. He then held it responsible for giving wicked officials the idea of seeking the emperor's favor by sycophancy. The connection between dancing and governance has a historical background: Both An Lushan and Consort Yang could perform such dances. This information is provided by Bai's response poem. Consort Yang was held responsible for distracting Xuanzong from governance and for exploiting the imperial favor, whereas An Lushan betrayed the emperor's trust and rebelled.

The transition from the descriptions of Tartar dancers to the discussion of compliant Tang subjects is made in the eighth stanza, in which Yuan highlighted their common features: *yuanbian* 圓變 (tactfulness and caprice). The crafty officials let go of all principles (if they had any to begin with) to please the emperor; they either betrayed the emperor themselves or failed to offer their honest opinions. This idea complies with Yuan's belief in the importance of having upright officials to admonish the emperor, just as the sage emperor Taizong had Wang Gui 王珪 (571–639) and Wei Zheng as his remonstrators to ensure that both his speech and his policies were appropriate.[46] Without upright officials, the emperor would be unable to notice the looming danger. One good example is Xuanzong's flight to Shu when An Lushan rebelled.

Condemning Wicked Officials: Bai's "Huxuan nü"

Unlike Yuan, who condemned both the dancers and the wicked officials, Bai focuses on criticizing the latter. Instead of reproaching the dancers for dazzling the emperor, he advises them to sing his response poem to the throne. Doing so will enlighten the ruler about the danger of bewitchment.

Bai's "Huxuan nü"[47]

	Whirling girls,	胡旋女
2	Whirling girls:	胡旋女
	Their hearts answer to the strings;	心應絃
4	Their hands to the drums.	手應鼓
	Their sleeves are up when the strings and drums are struck,	絃鼓一聲雙袖舉
6	Just like snowflakes circling and stray leaves dancing.	迴雪飄颻轉蓬舞
	They whirl left and revolve right without getting tired,	左旋右轉不知疲

(Continued)

8	For a thousand circles and ten thousand rounds without end.	千匝萬周無已時
	Nothing in the human world can be their match;	人間物類無可比
10	Even running wheels seem slow, and whirling winds seem tardy.	奔車輪緩旋風遲
	When the song ends, they express their thanks to the Son of Heaven,	曲終再拜謝天子
12	Who opens his mouth for them:	天子為之微啓齒
	"You, the whirling girls	胡旋女
	Who passed through Kangju,	出康居
15	had come east from over ten-thousand *li* away for nothing.	徒勞東來萬里餘
	There are already whirling ones in the central plain—	中原自有胡旋者
17	You cannot possibly compete with them in craftiness.	鬪妙爭能爾不如
	Towards the end of Tianbao when the era was about to change,	天寶季年時欲變
19	Subjects and concubines all learned to swirl.	臣妾人人學圓轉
	There was Taizhen within and Lushan without.	中有太真外祿山
21	They were the two who whirled the best.	二人最道能胡旋
	One was invested as a consort in Pear Blossom Garden;	梨花園中冊作妃
23	The other was kept as a son under the windbreak of a golden cock.	金雞障下養為兒
	Lushan whirled and dazzled the eyes of the emperor;	祿山胡旋迷君眼
25	Even when his armies crossed the Yellow River, he was not convicted of rebellion.	兵過黃河疑未反
	Consort Yang whirled and obsessed the heart of the emperor;	貴妃胡旋惑君心
27	After being put to death in Mawei, she was missed even more.	死棄馬嵬念更深
	Since then the earth's axis and the heaven's cords turn,	從茲地軸天維轉
29	For fifty years it cannot be stopped.	五十年來制不禁
	Whirling girls,	胡旋女
	Do not dance in vain.	莫空舞
32	Do sing this song often to enlighten the sage ruler!"	數唱此歌悟明主

Bai points out that he wrote this poem to "warn the emperor against those to whom he entrusted himself" 戒近習也. Bai's poem echoes closely that of Yuan; both describe in detail the "Sogdian Whirl." He differs from Yuan in the sense that he is very specific concerning his criticism: It was Consort Yang and An Lushan who bewitched Xuanzong with this dance and with their crafty behaviors. He ends the poem by urging the dancers to sing his composition, warning the emperor against crafty officials.

PART IV VOICE AND PROSODY ACROSS THE POEMS

In this set of poems, Yuan frequently presents himself as the first-person narrator. "Faqu" begins with *wu* 吾 (I) to recount what he has heard about the magical power of music. In "Libu ji," using *wo* 我 (I), he concludes

the poem with his lamentation over the decline of ceremonial music. In "Huxuan nü," he does not present himself by means of the first-person pronoun. However, his presence as narrator is obvious in line 31, where the subject is omitted in an imperative sentence.

Bai's poem does not directly employ the first-person pronoun, but sometimes he also uses the same technique as Yuan to express his wishes with the subject omitted but understood. This is the case for "Faqu ge." Toward the end of the poem, he expresses his desire to seek Bo Ya and Shi Kuang to rectify the notes of the central plain. More often, he uses direct speech and the second-person pronoun to voice his comments. In "Libu ji," he uses *er* 爾 (you) at the end to criticize the three ministers of the Court of Imperial Sacrifices. In "Huxuan nü," he created a direct speech presumably given by the emperor, where he again uses *er* (line 17) to stress his point that the deceiving officials could "whirl" more craftily than the dancers; "whirling" is used as a metaphor for "befuddling." Toward the end, he creates an imperative sentence. This time, he commands the whirling girls to sing his song for the wise emperor and thus bring practical value to their dance.

In terms of prosody, neither Yuan nor Bai cater to the alternate use of level and oblique tones required of regulated verse. Yuan's poems are heptasyllabic, and he mainly uses words from the same rhyme category or near-rhyme categories in every other line. "Faqu" mainly uses words from the rhyme category *duo* 鐸, with some from the rhyme category *yao* 藥. "Libu ji" uses rhyme words from *guo* 過 and *ge* 箇. The near-rhymes used in both poems comply with the practice of *Guangyun*.[48] "Huxuan nü" uses rhyme words from *xian* 線 and *xian* 霰, which does not comply with the practice of the *Guangyun*, but complies with the ancient rhyme patterns.[49]

Bai's works show more irregularities. His poems are often not entirely heptasyllabic, and a stanza may not be composed of two lines. While "Faqu ge" is heptasyllabic, he has three lines for the first and second stanzas. This special arrangement is indicated by his change of rhymes and the contents. In the first stanza, he eulogizes the "Great Pacification" and uses words from near-rhyme categories *jing* 徑 and *ying* 映. In the second stanza, he sings praises of the "Raiment of Rainbows and Feathers" and uses words from near-rhyme categories *yang* 陽 and *tang* 唐.

In "Libu ji," Bai uses three-character words for the first three stanzas and the seventh stanza. The change of rhyming categories is frequent. In "Huxuan nü," Bai frequently uses the short length of the phrase *huxuan nü* to highlight the focus of the poem: its first use being the skillfulness of these performers, the second being the foreign nature of these performances, and the third being the uselessness of their dances if the entertainment lacks value for governance.

Notes

1 For the significance of dances to music, see Yang, "Lun chu Tang diwang yuewuguan de bianqian ji qi wenhua yiyi," 21–26.
2 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.727.
3 Xuanzong was often referred to as Minghuang 明皇 (Bright Emperor) in literature, for his posthumous title was "The Filial Emperor of the Ultimate Way, the Greatest Sage and the Greatest Brightness" 至道大聖大明孝皇帝.
4 Xianyang 咸陽 (in modern Shaanxi) was the capital of the Qin dynasty and was also known as Xianjing 咸京. It is often used to refer to Chang'an, which was the Western Capital of the Tang, as opposed to the Eastern Capital, Luoyang.
5 "Huofeng" 火鳳 and "Chunying zhuan" 春鶯囀 were both musical pieces of the early Tang. See Guo, *Yuefu shiji*, 80.856–57.
6 See chapter three, "Sui-Tang yinyue" 隋唐音樂, in Wu and Liu, *Zhongguo yinyue shilue*, 100.
7 See chapter two, "Qin Han Wei Jin Nanbeichao yinyue" 秦漢魏晉南北朝音樂, in Wu and Liu, *Zhongguo yinyue shilue*, 37.
8 See chapter three, "Sui-Tang yinyue," 100.
9 *Qingjue* could also be an ancient zither that the Yellow Emperor played. Quoting from *Liangyuan zuanyao* 梁元纂要, Chen Yang notes that *qingjue* was a musical instrument. Chen, *Yueshu*, 141.9 and 130.10b, in *SKQS*, vol. 211:651 and vol. 211:577.
10 Ma Duanlin 馬端臨 (1254–1323), *Wenxian tongkao* 文獻通考, 138.22b–23a, in *SKQS*, vol. 613:189.
11 The Flaming Emperor's position as clan leader was considerably weakened by this time, and it is unclear how he could have attempted to oppress the feudal lords. See William H. Nienhauser, Jr., ed., *The Grand Scribe's Records* (Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994), vol. 1:2.
12 *Shiji*, 1.3; Although Sima Zhen 司馬貞 interprets this list as actual animals (bears, foxes, and tigers), they should be names of military units as Zhang Shoujie 張守節 proposes. See Nienhauser, *The Grand Scribe's Records*, vol. 1:2.
13 See Chen, *Yueshu*, 41.4–5, in *SKQS*, vol. 211:207.
14 See "Da Yu mo" 大禹謨, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 4.13–14, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:58.
15 See "Da Yu mo," in *Shangshu zhushu*, 4.14b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:58.
16 See Du You 杜佑 (735–812), *Tongdian* 通典, 5 vols. (1988; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003), vol. 4:141.3589.
17 See Wu and Liu, *Zhongguo yinyue shilue*, 5.
18 See Du, *Tongdian*, vol. 4:141.3590.
19 See *Shiji*, 8.389; slightly revised from William H. Nienhauser, Jr., ed., *The Grand Scribe's Records* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002), vol. 2:81–83. The *Grand Scribe's Records* notes that the final line of the song indicates that Gaozu was becoming suspicious of his subordinates. See note 561 in Nienhauser, *The Grand Scribe's Records*, vol. 2:82.
20 For the effects of the dance on its audience, see *XTS*, 21.467–68.
21 For its spread, see Liu Yuanyuan 劉媛媛, "Lun Tang 'Pozhen yue'" 論唐破陣樂, *Huangzhong (Zhongguo Wuhan yinyue xueyuan xuebao)* 黃鍾（中國·武漢音樂學院學報）, no. S1 (2006):45–49; especially pages 48–49.
22 Su Ya 蘇婭, "Tang yuewu zai Riben de yinjin yu gaizao" 唐樂舞在日本的引進與改造, *Yunnan yishu xueyuan xuebao* 雲南藝術學院學報, no. 1 (2015): 77–80. A recreation of this dance can still be seen as a tourist event in Xi'an today.
23 *XTS*, 21.467. The origin of this song was not explained in the *JTS*.

24 It had been roughly fifty-two years since the An Lushan Rebellion broke out when Yuan composed the other poem "Libu ji."
25 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.145.
26 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.145.
27 "Yinyue zhi," in *JTS*, 28.1047; "Liyue zhi," in *XTS*, 21.472.
28 A similar record can be seen in the *XTS*, which specifies where these musicians perform. *XTS*, 22.475.
29 See Li Shen's remark in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.731.
30 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.731–32.
31 See "Yi Ji" 益稷, in *Shangshu zhushu*, 5.14b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 1:72.
32 Ji Zha was born in the Spring and Autumn period and was the fourth son of Shoumeng 壽夢 (r. 585–561 BCE), the King of Wu 吳. He was enfeoffed in Yanling 延陵 (in modern Changzhou 常州); thus he was also known as Yanling Jizi 延陵季子. Later, he was enfeoffed in Zhoulai 州來 (in modern Anhui), and thus he was also known as Yan Zhoulai Jizi 延州來季子. He declined the offer of enthronement made by his father and elder brother. For this reason, he was regarded as a virtuous man. See "Wu Taibo shijia" 吳太伯世家, in *Shiji*, 31.1449–63. Also see William H. Nienhauser, Jr., ed., *The Grand Scribe's Records: The Hereditary Houses of Pre-Han China, Part I* (Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006), vol. 5:1, 1–25.
33 See "Wu Taibo shijia," in *Shiji*, 31.1452–53.
34 See "Liyue zhi," in *Han shu*, 22.1042.
35 See "Yueji," in *Liji zhushu*, 37.5a–7a, in *SSJZS*, 664–65; also see *Shiji*, 24.1181–82.
36 See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.732.
37 "Boyi zhuan" 伯夷傳, in *Shiji*, 61.2123.
38 Ma Qichang 馬其昶 (1855–1930) and Ma Maoyuan 馬茂元 (1918–1989), eds., *Han Changli wenji jiaozhu* 韓昌黎文集校注 (1986; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1998), 1.64–66.
39 See "Dongfang Shuo zhuan" 東方朔傳, in *Han shu*, 65.2843.
40 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.150–51.
41 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.150.
42 Li Shen notes, "During the Tianbao era, the Western States came to present [dancers capable of Tartar dance] as tribute" 天寶中, 西國來獻. See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.737.
43 See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.737.
44 *Yaohu* resonates with the following passage in the *Xunzi*: "Speaking good but acting evil, those are wicked people of the state" 口言善, 身行惡, 國妖也. See "Dalue" 大略, in Wang, *Xunzi jijie*, vol. 2:498.
45 *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集 has *zhuo peidai* 着珮帶 instead of *kan peidai* 看珮帶. Ji Qin changed it to *zhuo* accordingly and Yang Jun changed it back to *kan*. See Yang, *Yuan Zhen ji biannian jianzhu*, 127. Zhou Xianglu's edition also has *kan*.
46 See Yuan, "Lun jianzhi biao" 論諫職表, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:33.902–3.
47 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.161–62.
48 Hideki and Yukio, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 276–77.
49 Hideki and Yukio, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 277.

6 On the Imperial Transgression of Ritual

Yuan's "Shangyang baifaren" 上陽白髮人 (The white-haired women of Shangyang Palace)[1] is held together by the idea of "seclusion," underlying which is the imperial transgression of ritual. Yuan extends his argument from unwanted but still cloistered women to the seclusion of princes and princesses. At every step, Yuan is criticizing the emperor's failure to observe accepted rites and standards of propriety.[2]

PART I "SHANGYANG BAIFAREN": THE EMPEROR'S FAILURE TO OBSERVE RITUAL PROPRIETIES

The core concern of "Shangyang baifaren" is imperial household policy, as it not only directly relates to ritual but also violates it. To reach this point, Yuan parallels the similar fate of "seclusion" of the palace women with the imperial agnates and princesses. Yuan recommends the release of palace women and princesses to get married and allowing princes to assume duties at their enfeoffed areas.

The heated debate over the enfeoffment system versus the prefecture and county system during Taizong's 太宗 reign (626–649) was revived during and after the An Lushan Rebellion.[3] At that time, the loyalty of military governors remained questionable, and the need to seek reliable support became pressing. "Shangyang baifaren" starts off as advice to release palace women, and it extends its argument to the contemporary debate over the enfeoffment of princes. Yuan's major purpose was not to sympathize with palace women, as has been argued in previous scholarship.[4] Rather, it criticized the imperial house's failure to observe ritual—a failure that was manifest in imperial household politics.

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-6

Yuan's "Shangyang baifaren"

	"Bird and Flower Commissioners of the Tianbao era	天寶年中花鳥使
2	Toyed with flowers and birds in spring sentiment.[5]	撩花狎鳥含春思
	Robes stuffed with inky edicts, in search of palace women,	滿懷墨詔求嬪御
4	They drank themselves tipsy in tiered pavilions.	走上高樓半酣醉
	Tipsy, they marched straight up to the houses of dignitaries.	醉酣直入卿士家
6	Girls in the boudoirs and harems could not escape or conceal themselves.	閨闈不得偷迴避
	Hearts shattered; men turned to gaze at their concubines;	良人顧妾心死別
8	Tears of blood streamed down; little girls cried for their daddies.	小女呼爺血垂淚
	Only one out of ten was chosen to serve the emperor.[6]	十中有一得更衣
10	Others were sent deep into the palace as palace maids.	永配深宮作宮婢
	Imperial horses hurried south as Tartar horses approached.	御馬南奔胡馬蹙
12	Cast away in the palace were three thousand palace women.	宮女三千合宮棄
	Once shut, the palace gate never opens again.	宮門一閉不復開
14	Only flowers, grass, and green moss of Shangyang are in view.	上陽花草青苔地
	On moonlit nights, I idly listen to the sound of River Luo.	月夜閑聞洛水聲
16	By autumnal ponds, the wind wafts a faint scent of lotus.	秋池暗度風荷氣
	Day after day, I look at Tixiang Gate for the longest hours.[7]	日日長看提象門
18	Nevermore in my life will I see beyond the gate.	終身不見門前事
	Several others were sent here in recent years,	近年又送數人來
20	Saying that they came from the southern palace, Xingqing."	自言興慶南宮至
	This song pierces my bones with sorrow.	我悲此曲將徹骨
22	I want to weep when I contemplate their deep misfortune.	更想深冤復酸鼻
	What can be said, since they are lowly imperial concubines?	此輩賤嬪何足言
24	Of old, children of emperors and grandchildren of heaven were reputed noble.	帝子天孫古稱貴
	For forty years princes have been confined to their palace quarters;	諸王在閤四十年
26	The gates of the ten residences and six palaces have been shut.[8]	十宅六宮門戶閟
	The descendants of Emperor Yang of Sui have inherited fiefs.	隋煬枝條襲封邑
28	But Suzong's scions assume no political posts.	肅宗血胤無官位
	Princes receive no escorts for their brides; princesses have no matches.	王無妃媵主無壻
30	Overwhelming *yang* and excessive *yin* lead to disasters.	陽亢陰搖結災累
	How about clearing up the blockages by following the wish of all?	何如決壅順眾流
32	Marry off the ladies and appoint the gentlemen as officials.	女遣從夫男作吏

The imperial violation of ritual is multi-level. Yuan begins by criticizing Xuanzong for his obsession with beautiful women. He describes the outrageous behavior of the Bird and Flower Commissioners and brings up Shangyang Palace, a place that symbolizes the power of Empress Wu 武 (r. 684–705) and Consort Yang 楊貴妃 (719–756); both were taken from another imperial family member and were held responsible for riding on the emperor's favor to abuse power.

Yuan subtly reveals the fragile relations between members of the royal family, demonstrated by Xuanzong's appropriation of his own daughter-in-law Consort Yang, his immediate forsaking of his own blood at a time of crisis, his lack of trust in his siblings and sons, and his eventual isolation by his heir Li Heng 李亨, who reigned as Suzong. He attributes the seclusion of the royal members to the failure of Xuanzong and his successors in observing the rites of the Western Zhou.

The Bird and Flower Commissioners destroyed trust between the emperor and his subjects. These commissioners were eunuchs personally appointed by the emperor to seek out beautiful women for his inner palace. Their power was such that they could recruit young maidens and concubines of high officials. The intrusion into the boudoir was already a transgression of propriety—not to mention the forcible induction of the ladies therein. This went against Confucius's teaching: "Feudal lords must not seek beauties among their subordinates" 諸侯不下漁色. A noble man will distance himself from beauties to set an example for commoners.[9] The Son of Heaven, who was the leader of all feudal lords, should observe this principle to set a good example.

Even worse, such an induction was unnecessary—many of these ladies simply became unwanted palace maids. This phenomenon of the Tianbao era was a sharp contrast to the Kaiyuan 開元 era (713–741). Early in 714, Xuanzong dismissed palace women, following the precedent of Taizong.[10] In 722, he approved Lü Xiang's 呂向 (fl. 716–722) memorial against the quest for palace women and promoted him to Left Remonstrator.[11] In the later years of his reign, however, he did not restrain himself from such quests, and forcible seizure became rampant. Such acts later prompted Li Shen, Yuan, and Bai to comment on his behavior.[12] From the perspective of the literati, such actions signified the decline of rule. Indeed, it was due to such violation of the ritual propriety that Xuanzong failed to unite his subjects.

The reference to the Shangyang Palace hints at the disastrous results of the emperor's obsession with beauties: abuses of power by favored women. These two ladies refer to Empress Wu, the first and only female emperor in Chinese history, and Consort Yang, one of the four recognized beauties in Chinese history. Empress Wu was condemned for scheming her way to power by riding on Gaozong's favor and for usurping the throne.[13] Consort Yang was held responsible for the An Lushan

Rebellion: she distracted Xuanzong from governance, and her cousin, the chief minister Yang Guozhong 楊國忠 (d. 756), did not handle well his relationship with An, giving the latter an excuse to rebel. During Xuanzong's flight to the Shu area, the military officials who escorted him brutally killed the minister and forced him to send the consort to her death in exchange for his own safety.

The Shangyang Palace was known for its luxury, [14] and had been the stronghold of Empress Wu. It was where she held audiences with her subjects after she established the [Wu] Zhou 武周 (690–705) dynasty and made Luoyang her capital. Empress Wu managed to seize power only because Gaozong deposed his empress to install her. She took part in ruling while he was alive; after he fell ill and died, she eventually deposed her own sons and enthroned herself.

Because Empress Wu was originally Taizong's palace lady, she could be considered Gaozong's stepmother. Although it was common for a tribal leader to adopt his deceased father's women, and the practice had also existed in the central plain during the Spring and Autumn period, such an action was unacceptable from the perspective of Confucians.[15] Chen Yinke proposed that the Tang imperial family rose from the mixed group of Tartars and Han in the areas of Guanzhong and eastern Gansu (關隴胡漢集團). Unlike the influential and privileged scholar-officials of Shandong, they did not value ritual regulations as core family principles.[16] Zhu Xi 朱熹 (1130–1200) states, "The Tang house originated from the foreign tribes, and therefore did not consider violations of ritual propriety within the boudoir absurd" 唐源流出於夷狄, 故閨門失禮之事, 不以為異.[17]

Shangyang Palace also demonstrates the consort's power. Since the emperor seldom visited the palace, she had beautiful girls sent there to prevent him from setting eyes on them.[18] Although Xuanzong dismissed her in 746 and 750 for being "jealous and fierce with no respect" 妬悍不遜, each time he summoned her back.[19] The large number of women relegated to the Shangyang Palace reflected the power Consort Yang held over the fate of the other palace women.[20] All of these references thus had to do with the emperor's susceptibility to the charm of the consort.

Xuanzong's arrogation of Consort Yang within the imperial family shows not only his transgression of ritual propriety but also his fragile relationship with his son. Consort Yang was originally his daughter-in-law, who was married to Li Mao 李瑁, Prince of Shou 壽 (d. 775). While this kind of behavior could also be seen in the Spring and Autumn period, it was against Confucian principles and to many observers signified the decline of morality. The Shangyang Palace was thus an ideal symbol for disastrous and unseemly romantic entanglements.

The An Lushan Rebellion caused Xuanzong to flee to the Sichuan region; in couplet six, Yuan criticizes Xuanzong for abandoning the palace

women. The poet deliberately omits the fact that Xuanzong also forsook consorts, princesses, and his own grandchildren. Although it is left unmentioned, the brutal fact that he left his offspring exposed to the atrocities of the rebels was clear to Tang readers. This truth is alluded to in lines 23–24, where the poet claims that the fate of royal family members was no better than that of the palace women—if not worse.

For his own survival, in 756 Xuanzong had handed down a rescript proclaiming his intent to lead the fight against the rebels, but he was already planning to flee the next day. Only those who were closest to him and most in his confidence were in his retinue. Others did not even learn of his flight. Every one of the consorts, princesses, and grandsons who resided outside the palace grounds was abandoned.[21] When An Lushan occupied Chang'an, among the first to be killed were the emperor's sister, the Princess of Huo 霍 (d. 756), and the spouses of princes and princesses.[22] Their hearts were carved out as sacrifices in the name of An Qingzong 安慶宗 (d. 755), the son of An Lushan, who had been executed when the rebellion broke out.[23] Eighty-three officials whom An detested were also put to death; some even had their craniums removed. Soon after, more than twenty of Xuanzong's children and grandchildren were killed.[24] The bloody slaughter took place in Chongren 崇仁 ward, on the perimeter of the East Market. These executions must have left a long-lasting impression on the people of the Tang: Xuanzong had abandoned not only the palace women but also his own flesh and blood.

The emperor's lack of trust in his siblings and sons inevitably made him lose the support of imperial agnates, who could have otherwise served as buttresses of the state. Lines 25–28 point to this aspect by lamenting the fate of imperial agnates since Suzong's reign. In fact, Xuanzong was the first to put the heir and princes under surveillance, and this practice was continued by Suzong, who had experienced power struggles with his father and his siblings.

Xuanzong deprived the heir and the princes of their former role in governance to prevent a *coup d'état*. He forbade royal family members from having any connection with literati or officials, appointed them to meaningless honorary posts, and discouraged them from entering politics.[25] It was only when the rebellion broke out that he considered appointing the heir as regent, but the plan was dropped upon Consort Yang's request.[26] Later, he followed the advice of Fang Guan 房琯 (697–763) to appoint princes to various strategic regions to fight against the rebels,[27] but only Prince Lin of Yong 永王璘 headed off to Jiangling to assume his post.[28] These appointments might even have been made to keep the power of the heir in check.

When Suzong enthroned himself as emperor in remote Lingwu 靈武 (in modern Ningxia) without the consent of Xuanzong, Helan Jinming

賀蘭進明 (fl. 756–759), Grand Protector of Beihai 北海太守, commented that princes stationed at various strategic points were a threat.[29] Prince Lin of Yong's refusal to obey Suzong's order[30] and his later attempt to keep Jiangling for himself confirmed this threat.[31] It is noteworthy that Suzong had earlier showered the Prince of Yong with affection; his rebellion may explain Suzong's sensitivity to palace intrigues.[32] Suzong's fear was manifest in his wrongful execution of his third son, Li Tan 李倓 (d. ca. 756), Prince of Jianning 建寧, for scheming against the heir, Li Yu 李豫 (726–779), who later reigned as Daizong 代宗 (762–779).[33] Throughout Suzong's reign, he did not enfeoff princes at key posts. It was with respect to these sad incidents that Yuan laments, "Suzong's scions assume no political posts."[34]

Yuan criticizes the Tang emperors for enfeoffing descendants of the Sui dynasty but not their own sons. The Tang court had sought to model itself after the Zhou dynasty, enfeoffing descendants of the previous dynasties. This practice was seen to demonstrate the sagacity of the ruler, who considered it disrespectful to treat royal descendants of the previous dynasties as his subjects.[35] It was also a means to stabilize the empire, similar to King Wu of Zhou's investiture of Wugeng 武庚, Prince of Yin 殷, to pacify the people of Yin. By the Tang dynasty, this type of enfeoffment reminded the current ruler that even great dynasties would tumble if subject to improper governance.[36] Although the Tang court made much effort to honor this ancient custom, it departed from Zhou practice. This is because the Tang enfeoffed princes figuratively with entitlement to the tax income, but they were not given actual power over their fiefs. Yet enfeoffment of princes was a key system upheld by rites and believed to be beneficial for maintaining the imperial bloodline and prolonging dynastic rule.

When Suzong eventually recovered Chang'an and got the upper hand, he had Xuanzong secluded, just as he himself had been when he was the heir. The reference to women dismissed from the southern Xingqing Palace, described in lines 19 and 20, alludes to the seclusion of Xuanzong, who was forcibly moved to Taiji 太極 Palace in 760, leaving behind all his former consorts in the Xingqing Palace.[37]

On the literal level, noting that in recent times more women were being sent to the Shangyang Palace, Yuan highlights the suffering of palace maids even now under Xianzong. On a deeper level, Yuan is most likely referring obliquely to the power struggle in the inner court. The Xingqing Palace, also known as the South Inner Palace 南內, was closely associated with Xuanzong's imperial power. It was built in 714 at Xingqing Lane 興慶坊, where Xuanzong's original residence as prince had been located.[38] Before Xuanzong rose to power, it was said that his abode was covered by an auspicious air commonly referred to as "the aura of the emperor." The aura manifested itself with the emergence of a large pond nearby, known

as Longqing Pond 隆慶池.[39] When Xuanzong ascended the throne, he had the palace built; in 728, he made it his principal residence, where he held audiences. The palace remained his abode when he returned to the capital as Supreme Emperor in 757; at the moment, he still maintained a balance of power with Suzong, forming what Ren Shiying 任士英 calls a "dual political house."[40]

It was only after Xuanzong was forcibly relocated to the Taiji Palace in 760 that he lost all power.[41] This was done to prevent Xuanzong from planning a *coup d'état*. By that time, his closest associates had all been dismissed. These included not only Chen Xuanli 陳玄禮 (fl. 756–760) and Gao Lishi 高力士 (684–762), but also his consorts. Although Li Fuguo 李輔國 (705–763) appeared to be the sole instigator of the entire episode, it was done with Suzong's approval.[42] Xuanzong then led a life of isolation and died there in 762, only about two years after the move. The Xingqing Palace had Changqing Tower 長慶樓 that faced south and overlooked a highway. While Xuanzong was housed at Xingqing Palace, from the tower he could see passersby, who often greeted him. After the relocation, this minimal connection with the outside world was severed; even the hundred maids who served him at Taiji Palace were selected by Suzong. Common speculation had it that Xuanzong either died of loneliness or was murdered.[43] The reference to the palace ladies from the Xingqing Palace was thus a subtle nod to the power struggle between members of the royal family.

The last part, lines 21–32, holds together the earlier sections and brings out the central theme. Lines 23–24, "What can be said, since they are lowly imperial concubines?/Of old, children of emperors and grandchildren of heaven were reputed noble," indicate that Yuan's primary concern was state politics. Comparing the confinement of palace women with that of royal descendants, he proposes that princes be granted real governing power and princesses be married. This advice addresses the power struggle within the royal family and the problems it was creating in mid-Tang politics.[44]

Yuan thus proposes enfeoffing princes and letting them assume real political duties. The line, "Princes receive no escorts for their brides; princesses have no matches," clearly indicates this. *Ying* 媵, translated as escorts, were the female relatives who accompanied the bride in marriage and could be treated as concubines. During the Zhou dynasty, when a feudal lord married, he not only took in a bride; among the bridal escorts who were to become his concubines were one younger sister and a niece of the bride and three maidens from two other states. This increased the possibility of the feudal lords having male offspring who could inherit their land.[45] Yuan notes that the princes receive no escorts for their brides, suggesting that they no longer enjoyed the privileges of feudal lords. Juxtaposing the

treatment of royal descendants of old with that of the Tang princes, Yuan recommends appointing princes to hereditary posts.

Yuan further extends his argument to princesses in the inner palace. The fates of princes and princesses were connected. As princes were confined to the capital with no actual power or viable political prospects, their daughters also had difficulties finding desirable matches, and large dowries had to be given. In the reign of Xuanzong, it was said that all marriages of princes and their offspring relied on the matchmaking of Consort Yang's sisters.[46] Moreover, the Tang princesses were seen as not attending to the rules of propriety honored by the literary clans of Shandong, and the five prestigious clans there refused to marry them. Even after Gaozong banned intermarriage among these clans, they risked punishment to hold discreet wedding ceremonies rather than marry princesses.[47] The case of Princess Gaoguo 郜國 (d. 790) is a perfect example of such disregard of propriety and the damage it could cause. She was secluded because of adultery, and in 788, she was banished for performing witchcraft.[48] Since the heir Li Song 李誦 (761–806, who briefly reigned as Shunzong 順宗, 805) was her son-in-law, he was implicated in the event and would have been deposed if not for Li Bi's 李泌 (722–789) support.

When Dezong 德宗 (742–805, r. 779–805) was on the throne, he resorted to granting princesses the title District Princess 縣主 and had men of prestigious backgrounds selected to be their matches. But even these policies could not guarantee success. When Xianzong attempted to select a match from among literati for his eldest daughter, Princess Qiyang 岐陽 (d. 837), they all declined his invitation for an audience; without exception, they pretended to be sick.[49] The princess eventually married Du Cong 杜悰 (794–873), an official who was the grandson of the literatus Du You 杜佑, but he was seen as having a military background because his father, Du Xiwang 杜希望 (fl. 738), made his name by fending off the Tibetans.[50] The poor reputation of Tang princesses, the mixed origins of the imperial house, the fact that their status as princesses overshadowed that of their parents-in-law and husbands (to whom as wives they should be inferior), and the potentially dangerous political implications of a royal match all contributed to the dim marital prospects of princesses.[51]

Towards the end of the poem, Yuan highlights the overwhelming *yin* and *yang* caused by the confinement of princesses/palace women and princes to the palace. *Yin* and *yang* are the two major forces in the formation and balance of the universe; they were manifested at court by the ruler's role in governing the outer palaces and the empress's role in monitoring the inner palace.[52] The confinement of princes to the capital deprived the emperor of support, while the princesses might commit misconduct without a proper match. To keep *yin* and *yang* in balance, Yuan concludes, the emperor ought to release palace women and princesses for suitable marriages and

appoint scholars and noble descendants to proper positions. The last line of the poem presents his advice directly: Men and women, be they noble or humble, should be set in their appropriate places for the benefit of the state.

Although both Yuan and Bai express sympathy with palace women, Yuan points his finger at the royal house, condemning Xuanzong particularly for his failure to observe ritual propriety. On a superficial level, palace women and the royal family share the same fate, being confined to the capital; on a deeper level, the idea that lust has cost the state dearly, whereas trust and loyalty within the royal family could strengthen it, refers to the inner court. Additionally, Yuan believed that a benevolent policy could garner the support of commoners and strengthen the Mandate of Heaven. Taking unwanted palace women as his starting point, he extends his argument to inner court politics. Subtly criticizing the power struggles among imperial agnates, he insinuates that it was this suspicion and tension that led to the rise of provincial power centers and the weakening of the imperial house. As McMullen has noted, by the late seventh century BCE, the enfeoffment exercise had been given a positive moral valence and was seen as embodying a relationship of love and trust among immediate members of the ruling house; it was closely identified with one of the values of the inner family, fraternal love.[53]

Yuan's proposal addressed the problems of overwhelming provincial military power in the mid-Tang. During the An Lushan Rebellion, the court had to rely on loyal military governors to combat the rebels. However, even these sometimes turned against the court. The most prominent cases were the rebellions of Pugu Huai'en 僕固懷恩 (d. 765) and Li Huaiguang 李懷光 (729–785).[54] In Yuan's opinion, royal agnates could become a reliable source of support if they were entrusted with military posts. Marriage with princesses who would then live outside the capital could also form a source of support for the court, in that their husbands/in-laws might be more likely to support the imperial family because of their marriage ties.

Lamenting the Sorrowful Fate of Palace Women: Bai's "Shangyang baifaren"

Bai's "Shangyang baifaren" serves as an instructive foil to Yuan's poem. Bai's preface reads, "Since the fifth year of the Tianbao era (746), Precious Consort Yang had the emperor all to herself. Other women in the inner palace could no longer serve the emperor in his bed. The beautiful ones from the six palaces were always sent to a different palace; Shangyang was one of them. It was still in use during the Zhenyuan era" 天寶五載已後, 楊貴妃專寵, 後宮人無復進幸矣。六宮有美色者輒置別所, 上陽是其一也。貞元中尚存焉. He therefore wrote the poem to

express "sympathy towards unwanted women" 愍怨曠也.[55] Traditional interpretations have primarily followed Bai's characterization. Another interpretation compares the poem's unwanted palace women to abandoned vassals.[56]

Bai's "Shangyang baifaren"[57]

	The women of Shangyang:[58]	上陽人
2	Their rosy cheeks dimmed with age, and their white hair grew.	紅顏暗老白髮新
	Guarded by envoys in green at the palace gate,	綠衣監使守宮門
4	Once locked up in Shangyang, how many springs have come and gone!	一閉上陽多少春
	"Inducted at the end of Xuanzong's reign,	玄宗末歲初選入
6	I was sixteen, and now I am sixty.	入時十六今六十
	A hundred others were picked at the same time.	同時采擇百餘人
8	Desolate and isolated for years, I alone remain alive.	零落年深殘此身
	How I choked on my sorrow and bid farewell to my clansmen!	憶昔吞悲別親族
10	Helped into a cart, I was not allowed to weep.	扶入車中不教哭
	Everyone assured me of good fortune once inducted—	皆云入內便承恩
12	My face is like hibiscus, and my bosom is like jade.	臉似芙蓉胸似玉
	Before the emperor could set eyes on me, however,	未容君王得見面
14	There came Consort Yang's glare from afar.	已被楊妃遙側目
	Jealous, she had me sent to the Shangyang Palace;	妒令潛配上陽宮
16	All of my life I am to dwell in this empty chamber.	一生遂向空房宿
	Autumn nights are long,[59]	秋夜長
18	Sleepless in long nights, the sky refuses to lighten.	夜長無寐天不明
	Flickers of dying lamps cast my shadow on a wall;	耿耿殘燈背壁影
20	Pitter-patter, night rain hits the windowpanes.	瀟瀟暗雨打窗聲
	The spring days linger.	春日遲
22	As I sit alone in the lingering daylight, the sky hardly darkens.	日遲獨坐天難暮
	Sad, I detest hearing the hundred tunes of palace orioles.	宮鶯百囀愁厭聞
24	Old, I no longer envy swallows nesting on rafters in pairs.	梁燕雙栖老休妬
	Orioles return and swallows depart; it has always been quiet.	鶯歸燕去長悄然
26	Spring and autumn come and go; I barely mark the time.	春往秋來不記年
	All I do is gaze at the bright moon above the imperial palace.	唯向深宮望明月
28	From east to west I have seen it wax four or five hundred times.	東西四五百迴圓
	Today I am the oldest in the palace,	今日宮中年最老
30	His Highness from afar bestowed on me the title of matron.	大家遙賜尚書號
	My shoes are pointed, and my clothes are tight;	小頭鞋履窄衣裳
32	Blue kohl dots my eyebrows; my eyebrows are thin and long.	青黛點眉眉細長
	People outside must laugh if they were to see me.	外人不見見應笑

(Continued)

34	My makeup is the fashion of late Tianbao!"[60]	天寶末年時世妝
	The women of Shangyang:	上陽人
36	Their sufferings are most numerous.	苦最多
	The young ones suffer.	少亦苦
	The old suffer too.	老亦苦
39	Both the young and the old suffer, yet what can they do?	少苦老苦兩如何
	Don't you see Lü Xiang's "Rhapsody on Beauties" in days of yore?	君不見昔時呂向美人賦
41	And don't you see today's "Song of the white-haired women of Shangyang Palace"?[61]	又不見今日上陽白髮歌

The first four lines give a summative account of the women at the forbidden Shangyang Palace, who have spent their entire lives in seclusion. From line 5, Bai focuses on the life of a woman who has lived in the palace for forty-four years. As one of the hundred selected during the Tianbao era, her long life allows her to speak up for her kind. To present her point of view, the narrative voice shifts in lines 5–34 from the poet to the palace woman. The shift is suggested by line 8, where *ci shen* 此身, literally "this body," is here used to refer to "I."

She narrates the arc of her life from being a blossoming young girl to an old maid. It can be summarized in two words: idleness and boredom. On sleepless nights, she waits for the dawn but has nothing to look forward to. Even the long days of spring are a torment: the sight of orioles in pairs and the beautiful tunes of swallows bring only annoyance. Her life is wasted. The title of matron appears to be her reward, but it brings her no substantive benefit. Even her makeup is still in the long-gone fashion of the Tianbao era. She has been severed from the outside world for decades and will continue to be so until her death.

Bai then shifts the narrative voice back to himself, concluding that both the old and the young suffer from such seclusion. Using the rhetorical question, "Both the young and the old suffer, yet what can they do?" Bai implies that only the emperor can set them free. At the end, he juxtaposes Lü Xiang's "Meiren fu" 美人賦 (Rhapsody on beauties) with his own poem.[62] Instead of pointing out that palace women should be released, he simply shows his sympathy for them, inviting readers to contemplate the issue on their own.

PART II VOICE AND PROSODY ACROSS THE POEMS

There are two narrative voices in Yuan's poem. The first part is told from the perspective of a palace woman. We know this because the poet uses the directive word *lai* 來 (literally, "come") in line 19, "Several others were

sent here in recent years." It reveals that the narrator also resides in the palace. In line 21, "This song pierces my bones with sorrow," the narrative voice shifts to the poet. He begins to speak from his own perspective. By doing so, he brings out the underlying storyline concerning the imperial family and presents his advice to the emperor.

Bai's poem also has two narrative voices. The beginning and the end are told from the perspective of the poet, whereas most of it is told from that of the palace woman. The monologue of the palace woman on her physical decline and fading of passion for life encourages readers to sympathize with her. Although, like Yuan, he shifts the narrative voice back to the poet at the end, Bai does not present any advice directly. Rather, he lets readers contemplate what should be done.

Yuan's poem is heptasyllabic and tonally unregulated, with a total of thirty-two lines. It uses plenty of near-rhymes, including words from the falling-tone near-rhyme categories *zhi* 至, *zhi* 志, and *zhi* 寘 that could be used together, and *wei* 未 that is normally used alone in the *Guangyun*. He also uses words from the rising-tone near-rhyme category *zhi* 紙 (see Table A.7 in the appendix). Although the use of rhymes does not suit the *Guangyun*, it complies with the ancient rhyme patterns.[63] Bai's poem resembles Yuan's in the sense that he mostly uses heptasyllabic lines, and the tonal pattern is also irregular. It is longer than Yuan's poem, and it does not have two lines per stanza as Yuan's poem does. The irregularity appears in the poet's narration. The most notable is the end, where the irregularity in meter pinpoints the key message of the poem. The penultimate stanza has three lines in the rhythm 3-3-7; the rhyme appears at the end of the seven-character line. The last stanza has two lines, each of which can be sung in the rhythm 3-7. The poem also differs from Yuan's work in its frequent changes of rhymes and the mixing in of lines of different lengths. Bai initiates his poem with a three-character line that highlights the subject of discussion, adds in two three-character lines to introduce the loneliness of the women, and begins the conclusion with three-character lines to comment on the suffering of them. He then ends it with the stock expression *junbujian* 君不見 (don't you see) that is common in Music Bureau poetry.

Notes

1 The Dunhuang manuscript has no "baifa" 白髮 in the title. Chen Yinke argues that these two words should be included since all other editions have them. See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 167–68.

2 A preliminary analysis of this poem can be seen in the author's dissertation, "A Study of Yuan Zhen's Life and Verse 809–810: Two Years That Shaped His Politics and Prosody" (PhD diss., University of Wisconsin–Madison, 2008),

253–60. There is no mention, however, of the role of music and ritual in cementing the entire set of the poems, nor the poem's function as a memorial to the throne, nor the role of ritual and its relation to governance. The major arguments made here were presented in my more detailed analysis of this poem, published as "New Music Bureau Poetry as Memorial: The True Significance of Yuan Zhen's 'Shangyang baifa ren'," *Tang Studies* 35, no. 1 (December 2017): 87–108. In this paper, however, I did not elaborate on Yuan's ideas about ritual and the poem's relation to the others as a whole.

3 See David L. McMullen, "Devolution in Chinese History: The *Fengjian* Debate Revisited," *International Journal of China Studies* 2.2 (2011): 135–54. See also Ignacio Villagran, "In Search of the Ethical Empire: Medieval Chinese Debates on Fengjian and Junxian" (PhD diss., University of Michigan, 2015). McMullen also discusses the promotion of the ideal of "universal interest" and its manifestation in arguments concerning the *fengjian* 封建 (feudal system) issue in Du You 杜佑 (735–812) and Liu Zongyuan's 柳宗元 (773–819) works. See McMullen, "Views of the State in Du You and Liu Zongyuan," in *Foundations and Limits of State Power in China*, ed. Stuart R. Schram (Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1987), 77–85.

4 Most scholars believe that Yuan composed the poem out of sympathy for palace women and to advise Xianzong to release them. See Palandri, *Yuan Chen*, 80; Hwa, "Yuan Chen," 122; Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 126; Fan, *Yuan Zhen ji qi Yuefushi yanjiu*, 126; Liao, *Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu yanjiu*, 194. Zhang Xiurong 張修蓉 proposes that the poem also criticizes Xuanzong for showing excessive favor by doting on Consort Yang, a favoritism that led to the An Lushan Rebellion. See Zhang Xiurong, *Zhong Tang Yuefushi yanjiu* 中唐樂府詩研究 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1985), 223–28; 460.

5 Flowers and birds are metaphors for women; "spring sentiment" symbolizes the stirring of romantic emotions.

6 See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.719.

7 The Shangyang Palace was situated southwest of the Eastern Capital (Luoyang). Tixiang 提象 Gate was the main entrance. See "Dili zhi" 地理志, in *JTS*, 38.1421.

8 The fragmentary Shu edition has *qi* 七 (seven) instead of *shi* 十 (ten); see Yuan Zhen, *Xinkan Yuan Weizhi wenji* 新刊元微之文集 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1994), 136. Chen Yinke mentions that the correct number should be ten, since both the *JTS* (*juan* 107) and the *XTS* (*juan* 82) have "ten residences." See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 126.

9 See "Kongzi xianju" 孔子閒居, in *Li ji zhushu*, 51.26b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:872.

10 Taizong dismissed over three thousand palace women when he ascended the throne. In 628, he again dismissed palace women out of humanistic and economic concerns. See "Taizong ji" 太宗紀, in *JTS*, 2.30 and 2.36. Kroll believes that the same action by Xuanzong was both a political gesture and a way to create more space for himself to choose new women. See Paul W. Kroll, "Four Vignettes from the Court of Tang Xuanzong," *Tang Studies* 25 (2007): 1–27; esp. page 2.

11 See "Lü Xiang zhuan" 呂向傳, in *XTS*, 202.5758.

12 There is an annotation under the first line of the poem: "During the Tianbao era, Xuanzong secretly referred to those who sought beauties for him as 'Bird and Flower Commissioners'." See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.718. The Song edition of Bai's poem has a similar in-text annotation: "At the end of the Tianbao era, those who sought beauties for the emperor were called 'Bird and Flower

Commissioners'. Lü Xiang presented 'Rhapsody on Beauties' to admonish the emperor against the quest." However, Zhu Jincheng 朱金城 notes that this in-text annotation is most likely an interpolation, since the line cannot be seen in Yan Zhen's 嚴震 (fl. 1506–1531) *Bai shi fengjian*, in the Song edition copied by a person surnamed Fei 費 in the Qing dynasty, or in the Dunhuang edition. See *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.156.

13 For how Empress Wu made use of political, religious, and cultural heroines to establish herself as the emperor, see Harry N. Rothschild, *Emperor Wu Zhao and Her Pantheon of Devis, Divinities, and Dynastic Mothers* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2015). For a biography of Empress Wu, see Harry N. Rothschild, *Wu Zhao: China's Only Woman Emperor* (New York: Pearson Education, 2008). For a study of how the perception of gender roles and power shaped the image of Empress Wu, see Rebecca Doran, *Transgressive Typologies: Constructions of Gender and Power in Early Tang China* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2016).

14 Di Renjie 狄仁傑 (630–700) criticized its extravagance when he served as Censor 侍御使. His complaint made Gaozong demote Wei Ji 韋機 (fl. 647–682), Chief Minister of the Court of the National Granaries 司農卿, who was in charge of its construction. See "Di Renjie zhuan," in *JTS*, 89.2886.

15 See Zhang Qiuyang 張秋陽, "Zuozhuan 'zheng' 'bao' hun yanjiu" 左傳「烝」「報｜婚研究, *Jiuzhou wentan* 九州文談 (December 2009), 40–58.

16 Chen, *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao*, 183–235. These clans were the Wang 王 of Taiyuan 太原, the Lu 盧 of Fanyang 范陽, the Zheng 鄭 of Xingyang 滎陽, the Cuis 崔 of Qinghe 清河 and Boling 博陵, and the Lis 李 of Longxi 隴西 and Zhaojun 趙郡. See Liu Su 劉餗 (fl. 742), *Sui-Tang jiahua* 隋唐嘉話, coll. Cheng Yizhong 程毅中 (1979; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1997), 33.

17 "Lidai san" 歷代三, in Zhu Xi, *Zhuzi yulei* 朱子語類 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1986), 136.3244.

18 See Bai's preface to "Shangyang baifaren," in *BJYJJJ*, 3.156.

19 See *ZZTJ*, 215.6873. The official histories simply note that she was sent away for committing "a minor offense" 微譴 and for violating "the emperor's command" 忤旨. See "Yang Guifei zhuan" 楊貴妃傳, in *JTS*, 51.2179–80.

20 The number of women there, as well as in the Danei 大內 Palace, amounted to 40,000 during Xuanzong's reign. See "Huanguan zhuan" 宦官傳, in *JTS*, 184.4754.

21 See *ZZTJ*, 218.6970–71. For a translation of this narrative from *ZZTJ*, see Paul W. Kroll, "The Flight from the Capital and the Death of Precious Consort Yang," *Tang Studies* 3 (1985): 25–53.

22 See "Zhudi gongzhu" 諸帝公主, in *XTS*, 83.3657.

23 See *ZZTJ*, 217.6937.

24 See *ZZTJ*, 218.6984.

25 The other policy he used to stabilize the court was to prevent consorts from forming cliques. See Huang Yongnian's 黃永年 appendix, "Shuo Tang Xuanzong fangwei dujian de liangxiang xin cuoshi" 說唐玄宗防微杜漸的兩項新措施, to "Sheng Tang yingzhu Tang Xuanzong" 盛唐英主唐玄宗, in Huang Yongnian, *Tangshi shi'er jiang* 唐史十二講 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2007), 56–66.

26 See *ZZTJ*, 217.6940–41.

27 See "Ming sanwang zhi" 命三王制, in Song Minqiu 宋敏求 (1019–1079), comp., *Tang da zhaolingji* 唐大詔令集 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2008), 36.154–55. The same edict, with slightly different wording, can be found in *Wenyuan yinghua* 文苑英華 under the title, "Xuanzong xing Pu'an jun zhi"

玄宗幸普安郡制, written by Jia Zhi 賈至 (718–772), in Li Fang 李昉 (925–996) et al., comp., *Wenyuan yinghua* (1966; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), 462.3a–5a. DeBlasi noted that Fang's advocacy of the feudal system was an attempt to literally recreate the institutions of the sages of antiquity. See DeBlasi, *Reform in the Balance*, 65. See also "Fang Guan zhuan" 房琯傳, in *JTS*, 111.3322. For a comprehensive study of Xuanzong's 756 Pu'an decree that enfeoffed princes to strategic areas, see David L. McMullen, "The Emperor, the Princes, and the Prefectures: A Political Analysis of the Pu'an Decree of 756 and the *Fengjian* Issue," *Tang Studies* 32 (2014): 47–97.

28 See *ZZTJ*, 218.6984. The *JTS* notes that the various princes were only symbolically enfeoffed; they did not leave their palace quarters to assume their duties. See "Dezong Shunzong zhuzi zhuan" 德宗順宗諸子傳, in *JTS*, 150.4050.

29 See "Fang Guan zhuan," in *JTS*, 111.3322.

30 For details of the prince's actions in Jiangling, see "Ruizong, Xuanzong ji" 睿宗玄宗紀, in *XTS*, 5.153.

31 See *ZZTJ*, 219.7007. See also "Xuanzong zhuzi zhuan" 玄宗諸子傳, in *JTS*, 107.3264–66. Unaware of the sensitivity of this imperial power struggle, Li Bai joined Prince Lin of Yong, and was exiled to Yelang 夜郎. See "Li Bai zhuan" 李白傳, in *JTS*, 190.5054. For a study of Li Bai's offense, his punishment, and his relation to the rebellion of Prince Lin of Yong from a legal point of view, as well as the historical background of the power struggle between Xuanzong and Suzong, see Chen Junqiang 陳俊強, "Cong Tangdai falü de jiaodu kan Li Bai changliu Yelang" 從唐代法律的角度看李白長流夜郎, *Taiwan shida lishi xuebao* 臺灣師大歷史學報 42 (2009): 21–50.

32 See "Xuanzong zhuzi zhuan," in *JTS*, 107.3264–66.

33 Li Tan escorted Xuanzong and Suzong out of the palace just before the fall of the capital. He was the one who recommended Suzong head toward Hexi 河西 (in modern Gansu) to prepare for combat. Suzong intended to appoint him as Commander-in-Chief 兵馬大元帥, but in the end appointed his heir Li Yu instead, to secure the latter's position. He was slandered by Empress Zhang Liangdi 張良娣 (d. 762) and eunuch Li Fuguo 李輔國 (705–763), who accused him of harboring bitter and treacherous thoughts because he had not been invested as heir, causing Suzong to order him to commit suicide. It was only after Li Bi 李泌 (722–789), a personal advisor of Suzong, revealed Li Tan's close bond with the heir that Suzong admitted that he had wrongfully killed his son. When Li Yu ascended the throne, he gave Li Tan the posthumous title Prince of Qi 齊 and also revered him as "Emperor Who Followed the Way of Heaven" 承天皇帝. See "Suzong Daizong zhuzi zhuan" 肅宗代宗諸子傳, in *JTS*, 116.3384–85; "Shiyizong zhuzi zhuan" 十一宗諸子傳, in *XTS*, 82.3617–19.

34 The annotation under couplet fourteen reads, "Since Suzong's reign, princes do not assume duties in the outer court" 肅宗已後諸王並未出閤. See *YZJJZ*, 24.719.

35 See *Chunqiu Zuozhuan zhu*, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:1105. This practice did not go beyond two dynasties. See *Li ji zhushu*, 39.11b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:696.

36 See Bai's "Erwang hou" 二王後, in *BJYJJJ*, 3.148.

37 See *ZZTJ*, 221.7094–95.

38 See "Xuanzong ji" 玄宗紀, in *JTS*, 8.173.

39 See *ZZTJ*, 209.6640–41.

40 See Ren Shiying 任士英, *Tangdai Xuanzong Suzong zhi ji de zhongshu zhengju* 唐代玄宗肅宗之際的中樞政局 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2003), 259–88.

41 A similar situation occurred with Gaozu 高祖 (r. 618–626), who retired from the throne as Supreme Emperor after Li Shimin 李世民 (who reigned as Taizong) killed the heir. However, Andrew Eisenberg argues that it was Gaozu's plan to have an early imperial retirement, and that he still possessed a share of power before relocating to the suburban Tai'an 大安 Palace. Eisenberg also proposes that Gaozu encouraged the competition between Li Shimin and the heir, and he fully supported the winner. See Andrew Eisenberg, "Kingship, Power and the Hsüan-wu Men Incident of the T'ang," *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., 80 (1994): 223–59.
42 See *ZZTJ*, 220.7045.
43 See *ZZTJ*, 221.7093–95. Huang Yongnian suggests that Xuanzong was probably murdered by Li Fuguo. See Huang Yongnian, "Tang Suzong jiwei qian de zhengzhi diwei he Su Dai liangchao zhongshu zhengju" 唐肅宗即位前的政治地位和肅代兩朝中樞政局, in Huang Yongnian, *Tangdai shishi kaoshi* 唐代史事考釋 (Taipei: Lianjing chuban, 1998), 290–91.
44 For the political status of the heir and princes in relation to imperial accession, see Xie Yuanlu 謝元魯, "Sui-Tang de taizi qinwang yu huangwei jicheng zhidu" 隋唐的太子親王與皇位繼承制度, *Tianfu xinlun* 天府新論, no. 2 (1996): 70–75.
45 Ban Gu, *Baihutong shuzheng* 白虎通疏證, comm. Chen Li 陳立 (1809–1869), punc. & coll. Wu Zeyu 吳則虞, 2 vols. (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1994), 10.469.
46 See "Yang Guifei zhuan," in *JTS*, 51.2180.
47 See Chen, *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao*, 1–48.
48 See "Zhudi gongzhu," in *XTS*, 83.3662.
49 See "Du Cong zhuan," in *JTS*, 147.3984.
50 See Lü Simian 呂思勉 (1884–1957), *Sui-Tang Wudai shi* 隋唐五代史, 2 vols. (2005; Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2009), vol. 2:670.
51 For the reasons that made princesses undesirable matches for literati, see Wang Shounan 王壽南, "Tangdai gongzhu zhi hunyin yu zhengzhi" 唐代公主之婚姻與政治, chap. eight, in *Tangdai renwu yu zhengzhi* 唐代人物與政治 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1999), 236–87; Cheng Guofu 程國賦, "Tangdai shizu zhi jia buyuan qu gongzhu zhi yuanyin kaoshu" 唐代士族之家不願娶公主之原因考述, *Wenxue yichan* 文學遺產, no. 6 (2000):112–14; Lei Qiaoling 雷巧玲, "Tangren weishang gongzhu xisu tanxi" 唐人畏尚公主習俗探析, *Renwen zazhi* 人文雜誌, no. 6 (1992): 92–94.
52 See "Hun yi" 昏義, in *Li ji zhushu*, 61.10, in *SSJZS*, vol. 5:1002.
53 See McMullen, "Devolution in Chinese History," 138.
54 See "Li Huaiguang zhuan," in *JTS*, 121.3493; see also Zhang Qun 章群, "Pugu Huai'en yu Li Huaiguang zhi fanpan" 僕固懷恩與李懷光之反叛, in *Tangdai fanjiang yanjiu* 唐代蕃將研究 (Taipei: Lianjing chuban, 1986), 291–306.
55 See *BJYJJJ*, 3.156.
56 Goldin notes that the interwoven themes of rejected women and rejected ministers go back to the semi-legendary figure of Qu Yuan. See Paul R. Goldin, "Reading Po Chü-I," *Tang Studies* 12 (1994): 57–96.
57 See *BJYJJJ*, 3.156. For a comparison between the Dunhuang edition and the other editions of this poem, see Huang Yongwu 黃永武, *Dunhuang de Tang shi* 敦煌的唐詩 (1987; rpt. Taipei: Hongfan shudian, 1998), 137–42.
58 The Wang Liming 汪立名 edition, the *Bai shi wenji* 白氏文集 collated by Lu Wenchao 盧文弨 (1717–1795) in his *Qunshu shibu* 羣書拾補, and the *Bai shi fengjian* 白氏諷諫 all repeat "the women of Shangyang" 上陽人. See *BJYJJJ*, 3.159.

59 The Wang Liming edition, the *Bai shi wenji* collated by Lu Wenchao, the *Quan Tang shi* 全唐詩, and the *Bai shi fengjian* have "dwelling in an empty chamber" 宿空房 before this line. See *BJYJJJ*, 3.160.
60 Loose clothing was favored over slim-fitting one and short eyebrows over long ones during the Zhenyuan era. See Chen Yinke, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 170–72.
61 This translation has taken reference of Goldin, "Reading Po Chü-i," 57–59.
62 Bai simply treats the rhapsody as one written against excessive induction of palace women. Xu Haoren 許浩然 argues that Lü Xiang composed the piece to address a power struggle within the harem that involved Empress Wang and Consort Wu Huifei 武惠妃. Unlike Wu Huifei, who had borne a son, Empress Wang would not endanger the position of the heir Li Ying 李瑛, whom Lü Xiang was tutoring as an Academician in 722. See Xu Haoren, "Lü Xiang 'Meiren fu' fawei" 呂向〈美人賦〉發微, *Zhongguo yunwen xuekan* 中國韻文學刊 23, no. 3 (2009): 6–8.
63 Hideki and Yukio, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 277.

7 On the Transgressions of Subjects

As discussed in the previous chapter, "Shangyang baifaren" criticizes the transgression of ritual propriety by the imperial house. In "Xiliang ji" and "Yinshan dao" 陰山道 (Mt. Yin Route), Yuan extends his argument to the transgressions of subjects, taking to task the military governors, the myriad officials, and the rich and powerful. In "Shangyang baifaren," Yuan showed how the imperial house's failure to observe ritual propriety made the imperial agnates unable to protect regions beyond the capital area. Following on this discussion, "Xiliang ji" centers on the military governors' negligence, whereas "Yinshan dao" criticizes the entire bureaucracy and the two-tax system (*liangshui fa*). The two poems complete Yuan's argument concerning the overall decline of ritual observance and proper behavior and the grave consequences of such a decline.

PART I "XILIANG JI": TRANSGRESSION OF MILITARY GOVERNORS

As we saw, "Shangyang baifaren" calls to account the Tang emperors for not entrusting their princes with power to guard the regional areas. "Xiliang ji" turns to the military governors and condemns them for exploiting their privileges and not fulfilling their duty to fight off the Tibetans, who had become a threat by the late eighth century.[1]

When the An Lushan Rebellion broke out, the Shuofang army guarding the northwest border was summoned to the capital to resist the rebels, leaving the frontier vulnerable to attack. In 763, the Tibetans invaded the horse pastures in the Circuits of Hexi 河西 and Longyou 隴右 (located roughly in modern Gansu Province). The areas west of Fengxiang and north of Binzhou 邠州 (modern Bin prefecture of Shaanxi) were also lost to the Tibetans. Later that year, they even occupied Chang'an. This forced Daizong to flee to Shanzhou 陝州 (in modern Henan). They again

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-7

attempted to seize the capital during Dezong's reign. By Xianzong's reign, the entire area below the Tengri Tagh (Tian Shan) range had been taken over by the Tibetans;[2] meanwhile, the rest of the Longyou Circuit was in the hands of the Qarluqs and Uighurs. Yet in spite of the extensive damage to Tang territorial claims, the military governors, in Yuan's view, were not interested in recovering lost ground. Rather, they indulged themselves in entertainment.

The poem begins by describing the prosperity of Liangzhou 涼州 (today's Wuwei, Gansu) before its fall. At the time, Geshu Han 哥舒翰 (d. 757) was the Military Governor of Hexi, and Liangzhou was the political, economic, and cultural center. Liangzhou was also known as Xiliang 西涼 (literally Liang in the west) due to its geographical location in the west of China that served as a gateway to the Western Regions. It was densely populated with profuse mulberry and cudrania trees. The night activities for the Lantern Festival could spread to over a dozen *li*; they were almost as magnificent as those of Chang'an. It is for these reasons that Sha Wutian 沙武田 believes that the drawings of the dances with accompaniments found in the Mogao Caves in Dunhuang might have portrayed some of these activities.[3]

This is the text of the poem:

Yuan's "Xiliang ji"[4]

	I heard about the former Xiliang Prefecture:	吾聞昔日西涼州
2	Its population was dense with profuse mulberry and cudrania trees.	人烟撲地桑柘稠
	The rich wine let people seek pleasure at will.	蒲萄酒熟恣行樂
4	Cinnabar tiered pavilions were marked by brilliant burgundy flags.	紅豔青旗朱粉樓
	The women selling wine downstairs were called Lady Zhuo.	樓下當壚稱卓女
6	The women accompanying customers upstairs were named Mochou.	樓頭伴客名莫愁
	Fellow countrymen did not understand the sorrow of parting;	鄉人不識離別苦
8	Most soldiers serving alternate watch sojourned with no expected date of return.	更卒多為沉滯游
	Geshu held a grand banquet at his official residence.	哥舒開府設高宴
10	Eight delicious foods and the ninth-brewed wine were right in front.	八珍九醞當前頭
	Up front, hundreds of acrobatic performers competed to dazzle your eyes;	前頭百戲競撩亂
12	Bells and swords with flickering blades were being juggled.	丸劍跳躑霜雪浮
	Lions shone as their painted manes moved.	師子搖光毛彩豎
14	Tartar singers danced with flexible bones and muscles as if drunk.	胡姬醉舞筋骨柔
	Dayuan came to offer horses that shed red sweat;	大宛來獻赤汗馬

16	Zanpu also presented coats of emerald-green velvet.	贊普亦奉翠茸裘
	Once the rebels of Yan jumbled the central plain,	一朝燕賊亂中國
18	The rich soil at the intersection of Rivers He and Huang only had empty hillocks remain.	河湟忽盡空遺丘
	The watchtower outside Kaiyuan Gate that was once ten thousand *li* away	開遠門前萬里堠
20	Has been pushed in close to Xingyuan Prefecture as of late.[5]	今來蹙到行原州
	How close it is—just five hundred *li* away from the capital!	去京五百而近何其逼
22	Half the land of the Son of Heaven has become barren.	天子縣內半沒為荒陬
	The way to Xiliang has become so distant and far!	西涼之道爾阻修
	Yet border generals of various cities just enjoy their grand gatherings.	連城邊將但高會
25	Wouldn't they be ashamed whenever they listen to this song?	每聽此曲能不羞

The first part of "Xiliang ji" describes Liangzhou's prosperity before the An Lushan Rebellion. More importantly, it portrays the lax attitude of the soldiers at the time and the tributes the border officials received. The second part reveals the loss of territory and its devastating effect not only on the fallen area but also on the Tang court. The ninth couplet serves as a transition from the past to the present by using the term *yizhao* 一朝 (once) to specify the swiftness of change. Such a change was brought by the rebels of Yan (i.e., An Lushan and his troops).

The key that points to the transgression of ritual lies in the mismatch of one's duties and one's privileges. As ritual concerns whether one deserves to have certain material benefits and social status, the border military officials' failure to observe their duties made them ineligible for their titles and positions. By pointing to the excessive entertainment they enjoy, the idea of their transgression of ritual is strengthened. The crucial message of this poem is the last two lines, in which Yuan directly accuses them.

The transgression of ritual can be seen in Geshu Han's banquet. He was a military governor, but he partook of exquisite food and drink that was only fitting for the Son of Heaven. The eight delicious foods refer to the eight types of cooking. The *Rites of the Zhou* notes that "the ways of cooking delicacies involve eight things" (珍用八物). Zheng Xuan notes that they include *chun'ao* 淳熬 (steamed rice with meat sauce), *chunmu* 淳母 (steamed millet with meat sauce), *paotuan* 炮豚 (barbecued pork), *paoyang* 炮牂 (barbecued lamb), *daozhen* 擣珍 (minced loin meat), *ji* 漬 (fresh beef slices marinated with fine wine), *ao* 熬 (seasoned dried meat), and *ganliao* 肝膋 (roasted dog liver).[6] *Pao* 炮 involves stuffing the pork or lamb with jujube and clay-roasting it. One rubs off the dried clay and the membrane afterwards, then spreads rice flour on it to steep it in fat,

and then double boils it for three days straight. *Chun'ao* and *chunmu* were covered by pan-fried meat sauce on top and marinated with its fat.[7] *Ganliao* refers to the roasting of dog liver that was smeared on top with its intestinal fat.[8] These eight ways of cooking delicacies were recorded in the chapter of "Tianguan" 天官 (Ministry of Heaven), under "Shanfu" 膳夫 (The chefs). These chefs cooked for the Son of Heaven, the heir, and the princes.

Jiuyun 九醞 (wine brewed nine times) was wine of the highest quality, as it went through repeated fermentation and was relatively pure; thus, it was often used for significant occasions. The *Liji* notes that in the first month of summer, the Son of Heaven "would drink wine that was brewed many times, and would put into practice ritual and music" 天子飲酎, 用禮樂. Zheng Xuan notes that the Son of Heaven "would drink such wine with his various officials, accompanied by music and ritual, so as to differentiate the superior from the inferior" 與群臣以禮樂飲之於朝, 正尊卑也.[9] Such wine was also used at imperial ancestral ceremonies, as practiced by the Han.[10] The fact that Geshu served this wine at his banquet showed that he had overstepped his bounds as a subject.

The entertainment he enjoyed was another transgression. *Baixi* 百戲 literarily means "a hundred shows." It is roughly translated as acrobatics, as it also involves something like circus performances and magic shows. The term could be traced to the Han dynasty, when tamed animals were imported from India to perform in the palace. These animals could jump and spurt out water, with two dancers dancing on a rope that was tied to pillars on two sides. The magical performances originated from the Western Regions. The performers came to China during the reign of Emperor Wu of Han. During the reign of Emperor An 安 (r. 106–125) of Han, Indian performers again came to demonstrate their magic; they appeared to have limbs severed and intestines cut out but remained unscathed. Such performances became typical until Gaozong of Tang considered them too shocking and thus had such performers barred from entry to China.

This ban did not, however, last long. In Ruizong's 睿宗 reign (684–690; 710–712), Brahmans of India came to present a musical performance as tribute; the dancers walked upside down with their feet dancing between sharp blades. They could also put their faces extremely close to the blades, or let musicians perform while standing on their bellies without getting hurt. They could extend their hands and let dancers whirl a thousand turns on top of them.[11]

It is against this background that Yuan's description of Geshu's banquet entertainment should be read. The juggling of bells and swords high up in the sky and the swift movements of dancers, which yet retained great softness and flexibility, belong to these magical or acrobatic performances. Tamed lions moving around in costumes or decorated with paint were like

circus performances. These eye-catching shows were often presented to the court by foreign rulers as a form of tribute. As such, it was certainly improper for Geshu to have them at his personal banquet.

The next two lines following these descriptions drive the point home. Yuan mentions that Dayuan 大宛, an ancient state of Central Asia, came to offer horses that shed red sweat; he also says that the Zanpu 贊普, or Tibetan leader, presented coats of emerald-green velvet.[12] Horses that shed red sweat were considered divine and called *tianma* 天馬 (heavenly horses) in "Taiyi zhi ge" 太一之歌 (Song of the primal one) of the Han dynasty. This song had been composed to celebrate Emperor Wu's acquisition of these horses from River Wowa 渥洼 (in modern Gansu). Later, when Emperor Wu attacked Dayuan, he obtained three thousand fine steeds known as *pushao* 蒲梢 in return for ceasing hostilities.[13] These horses also shed red sweat. They were so spectacular that the emperor again had a song made to celebrate the acquisition and had it sung at the ancestral temple, likewise referring to them as heavenly horses.[14]

During the Han, Dayuan was only willing to give these horses away when their forces could not defeat the Han armies. In Tang times, however, Dayuan sent envoys to present them as tribute. The recipient should have been the emperor, but it was Geshu who received them. Similar to the heavenly horses, emerald-green velvet was a highly valued cloth that should only have been presented to the emperor.

The reasons that Geshu received such special treatment from Dayuan and the Tibetans likely had to do with his military prowess. According to the official histories, Geshu was good at combat with spears; he could defeat three rows of soldiers with only half a segment of spear. His strength and talent were fully displayed on the battlefield. Not only did he safeguard the border against Tibetan invasion, but he also expanded the western territory of the Tang.

Geshu was the general who resisted the Tibetans at the Sea of Kuba. He also installed the Army of Divine Power 神威軍 on the Qinghai plateau. There, he had a citadel built on the Island of Fine Steeds 龍駒島 to fend off the Tibetans. Legend had it that a white dragon appeared; consequently, the citadel was named "Citadel of a Winged Dragon" 應龍城. He also defeated the Tibetans at the Citadel of Shibao 石堡城 and directed his armies to wipe out five thousand Tibetan cavalry who treated Jishijun 積石軍 as "the wheat village of the Tibetans" 吐蕃麥莊 and looted the place at will.[15]

Geshu's merits were significant in his early career. But when he was forced to fight An Lushan at Tongguan 潼關 (in modern Shaanxi), he lost and fell captive. Rather than remain loyal to the Tang house, he declared allegiance to An and offered to induce other military governors to capitulate. Eventually, he was killed by An's son, An Qingxu, for his failure to do so.

Geshu appropriated actions or items that were proper to the emperor. In doing so, he defied the rites that distinguish the respective status of the ruler and his subjects. Yuan's description of Geshu calls to mind Confucius's comment on Jishi 季氏: Jishi, as a grandee, dared to enjoy the eight-row dance exclusively performed for the Son of Heaven. If he could bring himself to this much transgression of rites, what else would he not do?[16] Yuan uses Geshu as an unflattering comparison to contemporary border generals: They were not as capable as he had been, and yet they imitated him in holding banquets for personal pleasure.

Criticizing Border Officials: Bai's "Xiliang ji"

First, Bai Juyi notes that he wrote "Xiliang ji" to "criticize border officials" 刺封疆之臣.[17]

	Bai's "Xiliang ji"	
	"The Show of Xiliang":	西涼伎
2	Fake are the Tartars and lions.	假面胡人假獅子
	They have carved wood as their heads and threads as their tails;	刻木為頭絲作尾
4	Gold filters their eyes, and silver sticks to their teeth.	金鍍眼睛銀帖齒
	They flap their fur coats and swing their ears,	奮迅毛衣擺雙耳
6	As if they have come from ten thousand *li* away from the western regions.	如從流沙來萬里
	Two Tartar men with purple beards and deep eyes	紫髯深目兩胡兒
8	Dance and jump up front to present their speech.	鼓舞跳梁前致辭
	This must be like the days when Liangzhou had not yet fallen,	應似涼州未陷日
10	And when the Protector-General first came to the area.	安西都護進來時
	Suddenly news comes to their ears,	須臾云得新消息
12	That the way to Anxi is blocked and there is no return.	安西路絕歸不得
	They cry to the lions with tears flowing down.	泣向獅子涕雙垂
14	"Do you know that Liangzhou has fallen?"	涼州陷沒知不知
	The lions turn their heads to look to the west,	獅子迴頭向西望
16	Giving out a sad roar that grieves the audience.	哀吼一聲觀者悲
	The border officials of Zhenyuan love this show.	貞元邊將愛此曲
18	Drunk on mats, they laugh without getting satiated.	醉坐笑看看不足
	Whenever they serve guests, reward soldiers, or feast the three armies,	享賓犒士宴三軍
20	Tartar men and the [fake] lions are always on view.	獅子胡兒長在目
	There is a soldier of age seventy,	有一征夫年七十
22	Who looks down and cries as he sees the show on Liangzhou.	見弄涼州低面泣
	As he stops crying, he cups his hands and addresses the general:	泣罷斂手白將軍
24	"I have heard that the trouble of the master is the shame of his subjects.	主憂臣辱昔所聞
	Since the rise of arms in the Tianbao era,	自從天寶兵戈起

26	The western tribe intrudes into the western border day and night.	犬戎日夜吞西鄙
	Liangzhou has fallen for forty years,	涼州陷來四十年
28	The invasion into Hexi and Longyou pierces close to seven thousand *li*.	河隴侵將七千里
	In peaceful times Anxi's border lay 10,000 *li* away;	平時安西萬里疆
30	Now the frontier defense is in Fengxiang.	今日邊防在鳳翔
	A hundred thousand troops stationed along the border for nothing.	緣邊空屯十萬卒
32	Fed well and kept warm, they entertain themselves days on end.	飽食温衣閑過日
	The survivors in Liangzhou are heartbroken.	遺民腸斷在涼州
34	Generals and soldiers have no intent to recover the land.	將卒相看無意收
	Whenever the Son of Heaven thinks of this, he deplores it.	天子每思長痛惜
36	The generals should be ashamed to speak of this.	將軍欲說合慚羞
	Why should you still watch 'The Show of Xiliang,'	奈何仍看西涼伎
38	Making merry with no shame?	取笑資歡無所愧
	Even if you don't have the wit and strength to recover it,	縱無智力未能收
40	You shouldn't have the heart to make a play of Xiliang!"	忍取西涼弄為戲

This poem begins by describing "The Show of Xiliang," which is a dance with accompaniment. This time Bai discusses the misuse of dances with accompaniment for pure entertainment. Bai uses a third-person narrator to describe the performance, then he changes to the first person to let an observer speak up—this time a seventy-year-old veteran. Seventy is significant—not only because it indicates advanced age, but also because it recalls Confucius, who claimed that at seventy he could follow his heart's desire without transgressing the norm.[18] In the poem, the veteran is an example of Confucian propriety, unlike the general. He voices the sufferings of the people and criticizes the general for their heartless enjoyment of the show and their failure to fulfill their duties as subjects and as leaders of a region.

PART II "YINSHAN DAO": TRANSGRESSION OF THE MYRIAD OFFICIALS[19]

"Yinshan dao" makes use of the shortage of silk to criticize the entire bureaucracy for transgression of ritual. In Tang times, silk tabbies were not simply luxury commodities that signified one's status; they were also quantifiable mediums of exchange for high-value goods that were used for tax payment, tribute, or imperial bestowal.[20] The production of silk helped boost the local economy, facilitate foreign exchange, and establish political relations.[21] A deficiency of this vital commodity thus could cause economic, social, and even political problems.

The general opinion of the time was that the shortage of silk was caused by the horse-silk trade with the Uighurs,[22] the Turkic-speaking tribes who formed a steppe empire in 744.[23] Yuan, however, took a different position and argued that it was the lack of ritual observation that resulted in such a shortage. The poem reads:

	Yuan's "Yinshao dao"[24]	
	Purchasing horses on the Mt. Yin Route year after year,	年年買馬陰山道
2	Horses die at Mt. Yin with silk expended in vain.	馬死陰山帛空耗
	The Yuanhe Son of Heaven cares about weaver women;	元和天子念女工
4	From the imperial treasury, he paid [the Uighurs] with gold and silver.	內出金銀代酬犒
	"Your subject has something to say at the risk of death;	臣有一言昧死進
6	No matter whether it be life or death, I will repay your honor.	死生甘分答恩燾
	We lavish money on horses that don't survive;	費財為馬不獨生
8	There are other thieves who consume silk and exploit weavers.	耗帛傷工有他盜
	Your subject heard that there were 700,000 horses in times of peace,	臣聞平時七十萬匹馬
10	Even then the people of the Guanzhong region were never even aware of their neighs.	關中不省聞嘶譟
	The forty-eight directors of herds selected "dragon intermediaries";[25]	四十八監選龍媒
12	Proffered in tribute to the heavenly court and entrusted to [Wang] Liang and Zao [Fu].[26]	時貢天庭付良造
	Nowadays not one out of ten can be seen in outlying pastures;	如今坰野十無一
14	Confined to the "Stable of Flying Dragons," they trample one another.	盡在飛龍相踐暴
	Myriad bales of hay have been provided day and night;	萬束芻茭供旦暮
16	Thousands of bushels of beans and millet are shipped long distances.[27]	千鍾菽粟長牽漕
	Over a hundred garrisons are military counties and states;	屯軍郡國百餘鎮
18	There are yearly tributes of blond silk and seasonal awards.	縑緗歲奉春冬勞
	Taxpayers flee and tax quotas are levied on the rest;	稅户逋逃例攤配
20	In converting tax payments into goods, officials are avaricious.	官司折納仍貪冒
	The labor doubles when weaving patterns with five silk threads;	挑紋變繭力倍費
22	It's human nature to discard the old and welcome the new.	棄舊從新人所好
	To weave one length of Yue crepe and twill damask,[28]	越縠綾綾織一端
24	Even the effort of weaving ten bolts of plain silk can't match.[29]	十匹素縑功未到
	Powerful families and rich merchants sidestep normal regulations;	豪家富賈踰常制
26	Prestigious clans and cliques of confidants have no integrity.	令族親班無雅操
	Attendants on horseback receive bestowals of silk clothes;	從騎愛奴絲布衫

28	Holding eagles, servants wear arm sheaths of brocade.	臂鷹小兒雲錦韜
	The cabal of officials commits transgressions for personal gain;	羣臣利己要差僭
30	The Son of Heaven's honest concern turns into empty consolation.	天子深衷空閔悼
	Standing on the decorative tiles are phoenixes;	綽立花塼鵷鳳行
32	When can I ever repay Your Majesty's favor?"	雨露恩波幾時報

Transgression of the Uighurs

Yuan begins by bringing up the horse-silk trade with the Uighurs and Xianzong's edict to pay for all the Uighurs' horses with gold and silver in 807. Since the Uighurs had declared allegiance to the Tang, they could be perceived as a vassal state. Various records show that the Uighurs failed to follow proper ritual for vassals but instead abused imperial favor. That is why Yuan uses *you* 有 (there are) to indicate that there are other thieves also responsible for causing the shortage of silk; otherwise, he might have used *nai* 乃 (in fact) if he had wished to suggest the Uighurs were completely innocent.

The Uighurs were permitted to trade horses for silk tabbies every year in recognition of their merit in fighting the Tibetans during the Qianyuan era of Suzong's reign; the exchange rate fluctuated from ten to forty, according to the ratio of the actual power of the two sides.[30] The number of horses they brought could reach tens of thousands, and their many envoys were accommodated at the Court of Diplomatic Relations. They ignored the fact that many of these horses died on the way and that the Tang court was unwilling to trade for more. According to the *Jiu Tang shu*, Daizong once tried to shame the Uighurs by paying them a handsome amount far exceeding the value of their horses, but this gesture only encouraged them to bring more for trade. That month, the Uighurs sent another messenger, Chixin 赤心 (fl. 773), with ten thousand horses, and Daizong was forced to purchase six thousand more.[31] The official records condemned the Uighurs as uncivilized and as knowing material gain but not ritual propriety.

From the Tang point of view, the Uighurs were not loyal vassals. They assisted in the recapture of Tang capitals only for their own benefit. When Luoyang was retaken, they plundered the city for three days and looted the surrounding areas. There were cases in which they made violent attacks on Tang people and their property; sometimes, they even committed murder with impunity. The Uighur khans did not follow ritual niceties. Indeed, Dezong himself had been humiliated when he was still the Prince of Yong 雍王. In 762, after refusing to dance for the khan, four of his entourage were beaten up, and two of them died the very same night.[32]

Yuan did not dwell on the shortcomings of the Uighurs with regard to ritual and proper behavior. General opinion already held them responsible for the shortage of silk; moreover, he might not have expected much of a people from outside the Chinese cultural sphere. Rather, he turned his eyes to the central plain and the factors there that rendered the horse-silk trade a futile business: the transgression of ritual from the imperial court down to all the emperor's officials and rich commoners.

Incompetent Military Governors

Yuan picks up where "Xijiang ji" leaves off. He condemns the military governors for their appetite for silk rather than horses, when the court should have wanted horses for frontier defense and their war against the Tibetans. As H. G. Creel has pointed out, China was always in great need of horses to combat nomadic tribes.[33] Thus, great attention was given to the rearing and keeping of horses; indeed, it was in the Tang code that horse breeders who caused more than a normal number of losses would be punished, as would those who smuggled horses to the outer walls of the state.[34] State power depended on the supply of good horses. This was signaled by the apogee of imperial power when horse pasturage was at its zenith.[35] At times of unrest, the need for horses in battle or for transportation skyrocketed.[36] During the An Lushan Rebellion, Suzong was only able to resist An's forces once he had assembled tens of thousands of horses in Pingliang 平涼 (in modern Gansu). If the Tang were serious about reclaiming lost land, horses should have been in great demand.

Recovering lost land would also relieve the pressure on the pasturage system within the central plain.[37] In the 740s, each army of the Tang had up to tens of thousands of horses, and they were considered essential assets that kept the Tibetans at bay. When the Tibetans invaded the Longyou Circuit, where the major pastureland for Tang horses was located, it caused a significant drop in horse supply, which led to a decline in imperial power.[38] Without proper pastureland, horses were confined to the stables. Eventually, Yuan tells us, they died from a lack of exercise.

To highlight this drastic change, Yuan juxtaposes the High Tang era with his own times. He notes that, in the past, the neighing of horses could not be heard in the Guanzhong 關中 area (mainly referring to the modern Weihe 渭河 Basin). In line 9, Yuan points out that in times of peace there had been 700,000 horses. This refers to some forty years between the Zhenguan (627–649) and Linde 麟德 (664–665) eras. At that time, the imperial horses were raised in the Longyou area and attained a maximum of 706,000 under the supervision of Zhang Wansui 張萬歲, the Vice Minister of the Court of the Imperial Stud 太僕少卿. The Tang court had sufficient

horses at its command, and the large supply lowered their price to one roll of silk per horse.[39]

By contrasting the large number of horses kept during the mid-seventh century with that of the Yuanhe 元和 era (806–820), Yuan underscores the fact that the number of horses apparently needed during the turbulent mid-Tang period was unexpectedly lower than in the halcyon days of the dynasty. It could not be possible. His complaint about military governors becomes manifest as he condemns them for demanding silk rather than horses. Couplet nine juxtaposes the numerous garrison provinces with the great demand for silk, both for yearly tribute and seasonal awards. Presenting these seemingly unrelated lines within one couplet is a deliberate attempt to highlight the preposterous behavior of military governors. Further intertextual evidence of the poet's criticism of military governors can be drawn from "Xiliang ji" and "Fu Rongren." The former has been discussed in this chapter; the latter will be discussed in Chapter 8.

A Corrupt Bureaucracy

Yuan proposes that the primary cause for the shortage of silk was the corruption of officials. These are the thieves at whom he points his finger; many of them held high positions, so he notes that he risked the death penalty to expose them.

Corruption involved manipulating the two-tax system. The two-tax system was a progressive tax system proposed by Chief Minister Yang Yan and promulgated by Dezong in 780. The transition from the *zuyongdiao* 租庸調 (corvée, taxes in kind or service) system to the two-tax form began as early as Suzong's reign. At that time, the principles and methods of taxation and also the manner of dividing tax materials into three portions were all in the process of transformation.[40] The tax reform aimed at taking back some of the regional financial revenue from provincial governments[41] and at increasing overall income.[42] For this reason, the tax amount was predetermined in monetary terms regardless of the actual economic situation; residents and merchants alike were subject to a progressive tax based on property. Different tax quotas were levied on different provinces, and these quotas were set based on "the year that yielded the most produce and taxes," primarily the fourteenth year of Dali 大曆 (779).[43]

Line 19, "Taxpayers flee and tax quotas are levied on the rest," describes the negative impact of this system. While the rich could evade taxes by buying civil titles or assuming false identities as Buddhist monks, the poor had little recourse but to flee their homeland when taxes became too heavy.[44] The situation worsened when the court increased taxes by 20 percent in 782.[45]

Corrupt officials took advantage of the tax payment practice known as *zhena* 折納 (conversion); the term was an abbreviation of *zheqian nawu* 折錢納物 (substituting tax money with goods).[46] Taxes were calculated in bronze coins but often converted to goods, most frequently to silk, especially when coins were in short supply.[47] When coins were dear, the bolts of silk to be submitted per monetary unit increased. In fact, the real increase of tax payments due to continuous deflation proved to be serious even under Dezong.[48] When the two-tax system was promulgated, the conversion rate was around three thousand to four thousand bronze coins for each bolt of silk. By 794, the price had dropped so much that the number of silk bolts to be remitted at the same tax rate had doubled.[49] Deflation continued through Muzong's reign and only came to a halt in the Dazhong 大中 era (847–859) of Xuanzong's 宣宗 reign (847–860); it lasted for approximately seventy years.[50] The falling conversion rate resulted in the continuous rise of real taxes by multiple times, running up to five times greater in some regions.[51]

Corrupt administrators, as well as provincial and prefectural officials, manipulated different conversion rates for the three portions into which the taxes were divided to embezzle public funds. These portions were known as *shanggong* 上供 (presented to the court), *songshi* 送使 (sent to provincial governors), and *liuzhou* 留州 (retained for the prefectures).[52] As a remedy for the collapse in the price of silk, Xianzong set up a bureau rate known as *shenggu* 省估 (department rate) or *xugu* 虛估 (estimated rate) in 806.[53] This rate was higher than the actual market rate known as *shigu* 實估 (actual rate) or *shigu* 時估 (regular rate). However, in carrying out the policy, officials only used the estimated rate for the portion to be sent to the court. For the portions retained for the prefectures and those sent to provincial governors, they kept the actual conversion rate and profited from the discrepancy.[54] Chief Minister Pei Ji advised Xianzong in 808 to use the department rate for all three portions.[55] Official histories note that it was only then that taxpayers along the Yangtze and the Huai rivers were able to lead a better life.[56] However, some governors still did not follow the regulation. The corruption case in Huazhou examined by Yuan when he was Supervising Censor clearly pointed to the manipulation of conversion rates for private profit.[57] Similar cases still occurred in the mid-ninth century under Xuanzong.[58]

Corruption was not limited to the provincial level but also permeated the General Accounts Bureau under the Board of Finance.[59] The bureau held the national finances in its hands and was responsible for collecting the portion sent to the court and distributing the tax materials to various officials as salary payment or provisions. On one hand, the Bureau adopted the department rate when it paid out. On the other hand, it claimed the silk submitted by the provincial and prefectural officials to be of a lower quality; thus, it was able to apply a lower conversion rate when taking

in tax payments.[60] To pay less, some of the Fiscal Commissioners 支度使 directly calculated the expenses for military provisions in silk.[61]

Corruption could also be seen in the imperial house, where it took the form of tribute. This point is not spelled out in the poem. However, history shows that the mid-Tang court was willing to overlook corruption in exchange for tribute from military governors and prefects.[62] In provinces where the emperor could exercise power, tribute was presented in exchange for advancement or simply to preserve one's position. The semi-independent military governors also presented tribute in place of regular tax as a gesture of loyalty.[63] Corrupt officials referred to the silk thus collected as "a surplus of taxation" (*xianyu* 羨餘). The connection is pointed out clearly in Bai Juyi's "Zhongfu" 重賦 (Heavy taxes).[64]

Although the emperors were aware that tribute was often illegally extracted from commoners, they tolerated it for the extra income. Early in 766, Supervising Secretary 中書舍人 Chang Gun 常袞 (729–783) had memorialized Daizong against it,[65] but his admonition fell on deaf ears—as did the advice that Hanlin Academicians Li Bi and Li Jiang 李絳 (764–830) gave to Dezong. In a conversation with Li Bi, Dezong complained about the drop in annual tribute collected, from a worth of 500,000 strings of bronze coins to 300,000. Dezong admitted that it was inappropriate to talk about this, but the money available for court expenses fell far short of what was needed. Dezong confessed to Li Jiang in a separate exchange that he needed the extra income since he was unable to collect taxes from the Henan and Hebei Circuits as well as the frontier areas located in the upper river basin of the Yellow River and the river basin of the Huang River 湟水 that had fallen to the Tibetans.[66] In 811, when Li Jiang served as the Vice Minister of the Board of Finance, Xianzong questioned Li for his failure to follow the earlier practice of generating a surplus. In response, Li pointed out the problems behind the practice. He noted that all the income and expenses of the state should have been properly documented; thus, there should not have been a surplus available for free disposal. Xianzong likewise ignored this principle of state accounting for reasons of expedience.[67]

Yuan's criticism of the corrupt bureaucracy is in line with his memorial "Qianhuo yizhuang" 錢貨議狀 (On bronze coins and goods), composed in 820. In it, he stresses that corrupt officials rather than the tax system were to blame for the suffering of people. He emphasizes that the immediate remedy was to appoint virtuous officials and to enforce the law.

Transgression of the Powerful and the Rich

Transgression by the rich and the powerful is identified as another reason for the suffering of weavers. Yuan focuses on how the love of extravagant, even wasteful, display drove the demand for fine fabrics. It pointed to

widespread corruption and a disregard for ritual strictures and social order—transgressions that could not be blamed on the Uighurs.

As noted above, silk tabby in standardized bolts (*pi* 匹), twelve meters long by fifty-four centimeters wide, was used as the medium of exchange for high-value goods such as horses, land, slaves, and large quantities of grain.[68] Yuan's poem reveals that the type of silk in great demand extended beyond tabby to more exquisite ones that were coveted but not used as a form of currency. This is shown in couplets 11 and 12. Since one length equals only half a bolt, to produce one length of Yue crepe or twill damask took twenty times the effort of weaving plain silk. Crepe silk refers to a kind of thin, plain-woven silk made with warp and weft threads that have been degummed and twisted, thus giving the surface its crepe effect.[69] The crepe produced in the Yue area was the most refined and was often presented as tribute. The most common twill damask was self-patterned, and was woven with wefts and warps in the same color.[70] The fine silk products excavated at Famen Temple 法門寺 in Shaanxi reveal how refined Tang silk could be.[71]

These deluxe silk products were often produced for the imperial house.[72] Bai Juyi's "Liaoling" 繚綾 (Crêpe) criticizes the palace dancers for discarding the silk dresses that they have worn just once.[73] In another poem, "Hongxian tan" 紅線毯 (Red silk carpets), he criticizes the Governor of Xuanzhou 宣州 (in modern Anhui) for presenting silk carpets that were over ten *zhang* in length when commoners did not have enough to wear.[74]

These couplets on high-quality silk reinforce the idea that the horse trade was not the major factor causing hardship to the weavers. This is because the silk the Uighurs obtained was mostly plain silk. Even the silk given as dowries or rewards for the Uighurs' military support was either plain (known as *juan* 絹, *jian* 縑, or *zengbo* 繒帛) or dyed (known as *cai* 綵 or *caiduan* 綵緞). Bai's "Yinshan dao" states that some of the silk the Uighurs received in trade was not even up to standard. The twill damask and Yue crêpe were therefore not intended for the Uighurs. They were made for the emperor, who not only used them himself but also bestowed them on imperial servants. Powerful families, rich merchants, prestigious clans, and favored subjects then likewise demanded fine silk products.

As Yue crêpe and twill damask were often used as tribute, it was a violation of sumptuary regulations for anyone outside the imperial family to wear clothing made of these materials. However, such transgressions by rich merchants were already an issue as early as 689. They also held extravagant funerals, leading the emperor to command their arrest.[75] The situation worsened in the late Tang. During Yizong's 懿宗 reign (860–873), Wang Zong 王宗, Military Governor of Xingyuan 興元 (in modern Shaanxi), was a talented merchant whose wealth matched that of kings. He "wore clothes of dukes, feasted on delicacies, and had a thousand servants."[76]

The extravagance of merchants had to do with their increasing financial and political power. In the early Tang, merchants were strictly forbidden to ride horses or hold political positions. However, this proscription does not seem to have held toward the mid- and late Tang. The court was responsible for this change. When fighting against the rebels, the court resorted to selling honorary titles to anyone who supported the campaign. By Xianzong's time, merchants could even buy their way into the regular bureaucracy and obtain real positions. This was most common at the provincial level, where military governors appointed merchants in return for money.[77] During the various rebellions in the mid-Tang, the court even had to borrow from merchants.[78] As a result, merchants enjoyed exquisite silk products even though this was a transgression of ritual codes.

The mention of *xiao'er* 小兒 (literally, young boys) in line 28 refers to imperial servants. Specifically, it refers to those who worked in the Five Animal Quarters 五坊, including the Quarters of Eagle, Hawk, Kite, Falcon, and Dog, where birds and animals were kept for imperial hunts.[79] They set traps to catch birds on the streets and in the villages. These servants often bullied and exploited commoners by accusing the latter of obstruction and charging them a "fine."[80] Despite these rampant abuses, they still received awards of silk from the emperor. This exposed not only the extravagance of the inner court and the improper management of state resources but also the emperor's failure to appoint the virtuous.

In view of this top-to-bottom corruption, Yuan recommended himself and his comrades to the emperor; this concludes the poem. In the last couplet, using phoenixes as metaphors, the poet praises the Hanlin Academicians. Among them was Bai Juyi, who was serving as Left Remonstrator 左拾遺 and Hanlin Academician at the time.[81] The "decorative tiles" 花塼 allude to the place where Hanlin Academicians stood waiting for an audience with the emperor.[82] Since the status of Hanlin Academician was a promising position for advancement to Chief Minister,[83] the poet might have wanted to join the Hanlin Academy to serve the court and also further his own career. The last couplet subtly reminds Xianzong of the availability of virtuous officials—including Yuan himself—and of the necessity of rule by virtue.

In his pioneering research on New Music Bureau poetry, Chen Yinke uses "Yinshan dao" to illustrate his argument that Yuan's New Music Bureau poems often contain a panoply of themes without focus, and are thus of lesser literary value than those of Bai. He notes specifically that Yuan comments on the impropriety of trading silk for horses, but then jumps from the discussion of silk to the offenses of the rich and the powerful.[84] The detailed analysis of "Yinshan dao" presented above shows that the

various issues discussed are all concerned with the transgression of ritual and that, in Yuan's view, such transgression was the real reason for the shortage of silk.

Condemning the Uighurs: Bai's "Yinshan dao"

Bai notes in his response poem that he wrote it "to show his hatred of the greedy foreign tribes" 疾貪虜也.[85] The poem reads:

	Bai's "Yinshan dao"	
	Mt. Yin Route;	陰山道
	Mt. Yin Route:	陰山道
3	The greenswards are flourishing, and the fountains are fine.	紇邏敦肥水泉好
	But when the barbaric [Uighur] troops bring the horses in,	每至戎人送馬時
5	For one thousand *li* along the road, not one blade of grass remains.	道傍千里無纖草
	Horses sicken as grasses are consumed and fountains drained;	草盡泉枯馬病羸
7	The stamps "flying" and "dragon" are branded on skin and bones.[86]	飛龍但印骨與皮
	Fifty bolts of silk were exchanged for one horse;	五十匹縑易一匹
9	Horses came without end as silk was sent.	縑去馬來無了日
	It was no use to keep them but improper to send them away.	養無所用去非宜
11	Each year six or seven out of ten were either dead or injured.	每歲死傷十六七
	Silk was insufficient, and weavers suffered.	縑絲不足女工苦
13	They wove sparsely and cut short the bolt to meet the number.	疏織短截充匹數
	As for some three staves that resembled lotus fibers and spiderwebs,	藕絲蛛網三丈餘
15	The Uighurs complained and declared them useless.	迴鶻訴稱無用處
	Princess Xian'an carried the title of *khatun*.	咸安公主號可敦
17	She frequently presented memorials for the khan.	遠為可汗頻奏論
	In the second year of Yuanhe, a new edict arrived:	元和二年下新勅
19	The horses were to be paid for with gold and silk from the treasury.	內出金帛酬馬直
	The silk from Jiang and Huai used for horse payments	仍詔江淮馬價縑
21	Was thus forbidden to be woven sparsely and cut short.	從此不令疏短織
	General Heluo called out, "Long live the emperor!"	合羅將軍呼萬歲
23	He gracefully received gold, silver, fine and colored silk.	捧授金銀與縑綵
	Who would have thought that the cunning northern barbarians would let loose their hearts of greed?	誰知黠虜啟貪心
25	The following year the number of horses was doubled.	明年馬多來一倍
	The better the silk,	縑漸好
27	The more the horses:	馬漸多
	The northern barbarians from Mt. Yin,	陰山虜
29	what can be done with you?	奈爾何

Bai begins by narrating the development of the horse-silk trade and the economic and social stress that it created. By stressing the depletion of grass and water en route, he captures the large number of horses brought in for trade. Then, he concludes that the trade was futile due to the poor quality of the horses received.

Thus, the trade did not benefit the court; moreover, it also took its toll on weavers.[87] Bai reveals that low-quality silk tabbies were produced simply because of the huge demand for exchange. Here he introduces Xianzong's edict in response to the complaints of the Uighurs relayed by Princess Xian'an (d. 808), the wife of their khan and the daughter of Dezong. His edict ordered payment in gold and silver from the treasury to compensate the Uighurs; moreover, he commanded that future payments in silk must resume the original fine standard. Although the edict pleased the Uighurs, it ended up increasing the burden of the weavers. This is because it encouraged the former to bring in more horses. Bai drives home his criticism of the Uighurs by highlighting their greed. Unlike Yuan, Bai focuses on the phenomenon itself and its impact on commoners.

PART III VOICE AND PROSODY ACROSS THE POEMS

Yuan's "Xiliang ji" has twenty-five lines, whereas Bai's response poem has forty. Yuan again presents himself as a first-person narrator, indicated by *wu* 吾 (I) in the first line of the poem. Using Geshu Han as an example, he focuses on criticizing the transgressions of ritual by military governors. In the end, he condemns the frontier generals for exploiting their privileges without contributing to the state. In his response poem, Bai introduces the direct criticism of an observer. This allows him to use the first person to admonish the generals who entertain themselves with "The Show of Liangzhou." His focus is on their lack of feeling and neglect of their duties.

The tonal patterns of both poems are irregular. While both poems are primarily heptasyllabic, each mixes in lines of different lengths. Yuan's poem introduces two nine-character lines in the penultimate stanza that call attention to the diminishing state territory. He concludes the poem with three lines, a move that departs from the more regulated form that had two lines per couplet. Bai's poem begins with a three-character line that highlights the subject: "The Show of Xiliang." The rest of his poem is heptasyllabic.

In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem mostly uses words from the rhyme category *you* 尤 or near-rhyme category *hou* 侯 in every other line. Exceptions are the first couplet that rhymes both lines and the last section where rhyming occurs in the first and the last line. This arrangement intensifies the musical effect at the beginning and end. Bai's poem often switches

rhyme categories; it includes both level and oblique tones. His poem is also significantly longer. For the tonal pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.8.

Yuan's "Yinshan dao" has thirty-two lines, whereas Bai's response poem has twenty-nine. Yuan presents himself as a first-person narrator, indicated by *chen* 臣 (your subject) in lines 5 and 9. From lines 1 to 4, he sets down the background for his presentation of advice: Xianzong's edict ordered paying the Uighurs with gold and silver. He then begins his memorial to the throne. This time, he does not accuse the emperor. Rather, he praises the emperor for his benevolence in caring for the weavers. This is indicated by his use of *nian* 念 (to sympathize) and *shenzhong* 深衷 (honest concern)—even as he explains how the policy could not tackle the roots of the problem. To begin his memorial, Yuan boldly claims that he dares to present the truth at the risk of execution. Indeed, because he was intent on repaying the emperor, he would not regret doing so even if he was condemned to death. He restates his desire to repay the emperor at the end. In comparison, Bai's poem uses third-person narration; he uses the second-person pronoun only at the end to directly criticize the Uighurs.

As with the pair of poems discussed in Chapter 6, the tonal patterns are irregular. While both poems are again primarily heptasyllabic, they include lines of different lengths. Yuan's poem introduces one nine-character line in the fifth stanza that highlights the peak era of horse pasturage in Longyou Circuit. The length of the line calls attention to the usefulness of horses and the loss of land. Bai's poem begins with a three-character line that highlights the subject matter: Mt. Yin Route. Toward the end, he uses four three-character lines to create a shorter rhythm to drive home his objection. The more refined the silk tabbies offered, the more horses are presented for trade; in his view, nothing could be done with the Uighurs, whom Bai condemns as driven by greed.

Yuan's "Yinshan dao" mostly uses the falling tone rhyme category *hao* 號 throughout. The only exceptions are the first line, which uses a near-rhyme word from the rising-tone *hao* 皓. Bai's response poem again shows a frequent change of rhyme categories, including both level and oblique tones. Bai also creates variety through incorporating three-character lines at the beginning and end.

The transgressions of ritual that Yuan comments on often refer to the neglect of duties and corruption. In part, this prevented the benevolent policies from coming to fruition. Moreover, the benevolent policies did not tackle the underlying issues that caused the suffering of commoners. In the next chapter, I shall discuss Yuan's perceptions about what would create a truly benevolent policy. Similar to "Yinshan dao," which pinpoints Xianzong's ineffective policy, "Fu Rongren" points out that sending the captives south does not treat the root cause of their suffering. In "Manzi

chao," Yuan raises issues about diverting resources to the foreign state Nanzhao at the expense of the Tang people. This would be similar to the favors bestowed on the Uighurs. Lastly, in "Xunxi," he points out that a truly benevolent policy would let commoners follow their nature and thrive in their natural habitat.

Notes

1 For the history of the Tibetan Empire in Central Asia, see Christopher I. Beckwith, *The Tibetan Empire in Central Asia: A History of the Struggle for Great Power among Tibetans, Turks, Arabs, and Chinese during the Early Middle Ages* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993); see also Michael Walter, *Buddhism and Empire: The Political and Religious Culture of Early Tibet* (Leiden: Brill, 2009).
2 For a comparison of the Tang territories in 669 (Zongzhang 總章 era), 741 (Kaiyuan 開元 era), and 820 (Yuanhe era), see Tan Qixiang 譚其驤, ed., *Zhongguo lishi dituji* 中國歷史地圖集, 8 vols. (1982; rpt. Beijing: Zhongguo ditu chubanshe, 1996), vol. 5:32–37.
3 Sha Wutian 沙武田, "Yifu zhengui de Tang Chang'an yejian yuewutu—Yi Mogaoku di 220 ku Yaoshi jingbian yuewutu zhong deng wei zhongxin de jiedu" 一幅珍貴的唐長安夜間樂舞圖——以莫高窟第220窟藥師經變樂舞圖中燈為中心的解讀, *Dunhuang yanjiu* 敦煌研究, no. 5 (2015): 34–44.
4 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.724–25.
5 Yuan notes, "In peacetime the earthen watchtower was built outside the Kaiyuan gate. It was said to be 9,900 *li* from Anxi to show that the nomads from the west would not take on a trip of ten thousand *li*. In reality it was rounded up to a thousand" 平時開遠門外立堠, 云去安西九千九百里, 以示戎人不為萬里行, 其實就盈數矣. The Chinese text follows Yang Jun's collation. See Yang, *Yuan Zhen ji biannian jianzhu*, 115. *Yuan Zhen ji* has a slightly different version: "It was to round up to a thousand" 其就盈故矣. See *Yuan Zhen ji*, vol. 1: 24.281.
6 See "Shanfu" 膳夫, in *Zhouli zhushu*, 4.1, in *SSJZS*, vol. 3:57.
7 See "Neize" 內則, in *Liji zhushu*, 28.7a, in *SSJZS*, 532.
8 See "Neize," in *Liji zhushu*, 28.9b, in *SSJZS*, 533.
9 See "Yueling" 月令, in *Liji zhushu*, 15.21b–22a, in *SSJZS*, 308.
10 Liu Xin 劉歆 (d. 23), *Xijing zaji jiaozhu* 西京雜記校注, comp. Ge Hong 葛洪 (284–364), coll. and annot. Xiang Xinyang 向新陽 and Liu Keren 劉克任 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1991), 1.5.
11 See "Yinyue zhi," in *JTS*, 29.1073.
12 The Tibetans referred to their leaders as Zanpu (Tib. *btsan po*, literally "a strong man"). See "Tubo zhuan" 吐蕃傳, in *XTS*, 216.6071.
13 See "Xiyu zhuan" 西域傳, in *Han shu*, 96a.3894–95.
14 See "Yueshu," in *Shiji*, 24.1178.
15 "Geshu Han zhuan," in *JTS*, 104.3212–13.
16 See *Lunyu zhushu*, 3.1a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:25.
17 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:4.210.
18 See *Lunyu zhushu*, 2.2a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:16.
19 The major arguments of the analysis of "Yinshan dao" has been published in my article,"Exonerating the Horse Trade for the Shortage of Silk: Yuan Zhen's 'Yin Mountain Route'," *Journal of Chinese Studies* 57 (July 2013): 49–96.

20 See Liu Jiaying 劉佳瑩, "Tangshi zhong de sichou wenhua yu Tangdai shehui shenghuo" 唐詩中的絲綢文化與唐代社會生活, *Wenhua xuekan* 文化學刊, no. 1 (2010): 84–87. For why plain silk was a desirable form of money and the value of more elaborate textiles, see Angela Sheng, "Determining the Value of Textiles in the Tang Dynasty: In Memory of Professor Denis Twitchett (1925–2006)," *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 175–95. See also Helen Wang, "Textiles as Money on the Silk Road?" *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 165–74.

21 See Lu Huayu 盧華語, "Lun sichou zai Tangdai jingji shenghuo zhong de zuoyong" 論絲綢在唐代經濟生活中的作用, *Jiangsu shehui kexue* 江蘇社會科學, no. 6 (1995): 96–99, esp. 95.

22 The Uighurs were known as Huihe 迴紇 in Chinese, changed to Huihu 迴鶻 in 809 upon the request of their khan, who preferred the word *hu* (falcon) to *he* (tassel or knot). See "Huihe zhuan" 迴紇傳, in *JTS*, 195.5210. For the establishment of the Uighur Empire and its fall, see Michael R. Drompp, *Tang China and the Collapse of the Uighur Empire: A Documentary History* (Leiden: Brill, 2005). For the translation of the Uighur accounts in official histories and an introduction to Sino-Uighurs relations, see Colin Mackerras, ed. and trans., *The Uighur Empire According to the T'ang Dynastic Histories: A Study in Sino-Uighur Relations, 744–840,* 2nd ed., Asian publications series, no. 2 (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1973). The Uighurs made a unique contribution to steppe history by their attempt at urbanization in Mongolia. See Judith G. Kolbas, "Khukh Ordung, A Uighur Palace Complex of the Seventh Century," *JRAS,* 3rd ser., 15, no. 3 (November 2005): 303–27.

23 According to James Millward, the Uighurs originated in the Mongolian core lands of the Orkhon river valley and were former components of the Türk khaganate. See James A. Millward, *Eurasian Crossroads: A History of Xinjiang* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), 42–45. They spoke the Turkic dialect of Jagatai (Chagatai) associated with the Eastern Türks in Asia. See M. A. Czaplicka, *The Turks of Central Asia in History and at the Present Day: An Ethnological Inquiry into the Pan-Turanian Problem, and Bibliographical Material Relating to the Early Turks and the Present Turks of Central Asia* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1918), 23–24.

24 See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.744–45.

25 The dragon intermediaries are believed to be able to induce the arrival of dragons. See Ban, *Han shu*, 22.1060. They are used as metaphors for fine horses.

26 Zao Fu 造父 of the Western Zhou and Wang Liang 王良 of the Spring and Autumn period were both well-known horse breeders.

27 *Zhong* 鍾 is a measure word for the capacity of a food container.

28 *Duan* 端 (length) is a measure word for silk cloth. One length equals two *zhang* 丈 or half a bolt.

29 *Pi* 匹 (bolt) is a measure word for silk cloth. One bolt equals four *zhang*.

30 See Sechin Jagchid, "The 'Uighur Horses' of the T'ang Dynasty," in *Gedanke und Wirkung: Festschrift zum 90. Geburtstag von Nikolaus Poppe*, ed. Walther Heissig and Klaus Sagaster (Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1989), 180.

31 See "Huihe zhuan," in *JTS,* 195.5207.

32 See *ZZTJ,* 222.7133; "Huihe zhuan," in *JTS,* 195.5195–218. See also Mackerras, *The Uighur Empire According to the T'ang Dynastic Histories,* 14–51.

33 See H. G. Creel, "The Role of the Horse in Chinese History," *The American Historical Review* 70, no. 3 (April 1965): 647–72.

34 See Liu Junwen 劉俊文, *Tanglü shuyi jianjie* 唐律疏議箋解 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1996), 8.650; 15.1085–92.

35 See Li Shutong 李樹桐, *Tangshi yanjiu* 唐史研究 (Taipei: Taiwan Zhonghua shuju, 1979), 231–334.
36 See "Bing zhi," in *XTS,* 50.1337–40.
37 See Christopher I. Beckwith, "The Impact of the Horse and Silk Trade on the Economies of T'ang China and the Uighur Empire: On the Importance of International Commerce in the Early Middle Ages," *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 34, no. 3 (1991): 183–98.
38 On the importance of the horse pasturage in Longyou, see Xiang Hongwei 向紅偉, "Luelun Tangdai Longyou diqu mazheng dui jinglue Xibei de yingxiang" 略論唐代隴右地區馬政對經略西北的影響, *Hebei keji daxue xuebao* 河北科技大學學報, no. 2 (2007): 68–71.
39 See Zhang Yue 張說 (667–731), "Longyou Jianjiao songde bei" 隴右監校頌德碑, in *Zhang Yuezhi wenji* 張說之文集, *Sibu congkan* 四部叢刊 (Taipei: Taiwan Shangwu yinshuguan, 1967), 12.81.
40 See Li Jinxiu 李錦繡, *Tangdai caizheng shigao* 唐代財政史稿 (Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2001), vol. 2, part 2:614–31. The *zuyongdiao* system consisted of four basic liabilities, including a tax in grain and a tax in cloth, together with two separate types of labor service. See Denis C. Twitchett, *Financial Administration under the T'ang Dynasty,* 2nd ed. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970), 25. The number of household registrations had dropped to one-fourth of the original after the An Lushan Rebellion. See Han Guopan 韓國磐, *Sui-Tang Wudai shigang* 隋唐五代史綱 (1961; rpt. Beijing: Sanlian shudian, 1962), 188–90. For a study of population registration in the eighth century, see E. G. Pulleyblank, "Registration of Population in China in the Sui and T'ang Periods," *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 4, no. 3 (December 1961): 289–301. Incessant military upheavals devastated the state economy. In 762, when Yuan Zai 元載 (d. 777), Taxation Commissioner 租庸使, forcefully collected the eight years of taxes overdue in the various circuits along the Yangtze and the Huai rivers, commoners gathered to resist the government. See *ZZTJ,* 222.7119.
41 See Huang Yongnian, "Lun Jianzhong yuannian shishi liangshuifa de yitu" 論建中元年實施兩稅法的意圖, in Huang, *Tangdai shishi kaoshi*, 297–314. Hino Kaizaburo 日野開三郎 has argued that the central government gradually succeeded in obtaining the financial income of provincial governors by decreasing the amount sent to governors and increasing the amount kept for the court and provinces. See Hino Kaizaburo, "Hanchin-jidai no shūzei sanbunsei ni tsuite" 藩鎮時代の州稅三分制に就いて, *Shigaku zasshi* 史学雜誌 *65*, no. 7 (July 1956): 21–41. He further argued that the two-tax system was implemented to control provincial governors and strengthen court power. See Hino Kaizaburo, *Tōyō shigaku ronshū* 東洋史学論集, vols. 3–4 (Tokyo: San'ichi shobō, 1980–84).
42 Li Jinxiu points out that the actual amount the central government received only recorded an increase between 780 and 782. The amount then suffered a constant decrease, revealing that the government had failed in its attempt to regain state income from provincial governors. See Li, *Tangdai caizheng shigao*, 667.
43 See "Junjie fushui xu baixing liutiao," in *Lu Zhi ji,* 22.721.
44 See *ZZTJ,* 226.7275.
45 The proposal in 782 was made by Chen Shaoyou 陳少遊 (724–85), Military Governor of Huainan 淮南 (in modern Jiangsu). In 792, Wei Gao, Military Governor of Jiannan, made the same proposal and was approved. See "Shihuo zhi," in *JTS,* 48.2093.

46 The practice of conversion also involved conversion between goods. See Chen Mingguang 陳明光, *Tangdai caizhengshi xinbian* 唐代財政史新編 (Beijing: Zhongguo caizheng jingji chubanshe, 1991), 24–28. A Dunhuang manuscript reveals how a local official in the Western Regions received his salary in bolts of silk at the end of a two-step process of conversion: His salary was first specified in grain, then converted into coins, and then into bolts of silk. The same process of dual conversion was followed for all the other business transactions that were carried out by the Doulu 豆盧 Army, especially for the purchase of provisions. The record is dated to less than ten years before the An Lushan Rebellion. See Éric Trombert, "The Demise of Silk on the Silk Road: Textiles as Money at Dunhuang from the Late Eighth Century to the Thirteenth Century," *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 327–47.

47 Xu Chang examines the multicurrency system of the Tang and discusses the court's policy in balancing the use of textiles and bronze coins as currency. See Xu Chang, "Managing a Multicurrency System in Tang China: The View from the Centre," trans. Helen Wang, *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 223–44.

48 See Han, the second section of "Liangshui fa de chengli" 兩稅法的成立 in "Liangshui fa xia de shehui jingji" 兩稅法下的社會經濟, in *Sui-Tang Wudai shigang*, 215–29.

49 Lu Zhi notes that one bolt of silk equaled 3,200 to 3,300 bronze coins when the system was first implemented but only 1,500 to 1,600 coins in 794. See *Lu Zhi ji*, 22.725; *ZZTJ,* 234.7555. Historians likely took reference of Lu's memorial and thus there is a similar record in the "Shihuo zhi," where it specifies the decline of the value of silk from 3,200 to 1,600 bronze coins. See "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1353.

50 For a detailed study of price fluctuation in the Tang, see Quan Hansheng 全漢昇, "Tangdai wujia de biandong" 唐代物價的變動, *Guoli Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Lishi yuyan yanjiusuo jikan* 國立中央研究院歷史語言研究所集刊 11 (1944; rpt. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1947): 101–48.

51 The official history notes that two and a half bolts of silk in 780 equaled eight bolts of silk in 820. The actual tax materials to be remitted were three times more. See "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1360. Li Ao 李翱 (772–841) noted that the price for one roll of silk decreased from four thousand to eight hundred forty years after the implementation of the two-tax system in 780. Thus, the actual tax amount had increased fivefold in 820. See Li Ao, "Shu gai shuifa" 疏改稅法, in *Li Wengong ji* 李文公集 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1993), 9.45–46. Quan Deyu 權德輿 (759–818) also stated that the price of silk had fallen from four thousand to eight or nine hundred, thus causing a fivefold increase in taxes paid in silk. See "Lun zaihan biao" 論災旱表, in Guo Guangwei 郭廣偉, coll., *Quan Deyu shiwen ji* 權德輿詩文集 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2008), 47.750. Han Yu quotes Zhang Pingshu 張平叔 (fl. 821), Vice Minister of the Board of Finance, who said that the price for each roll of silk had decreased from three thousand to eight hundred in 822. See Han Yu, "Lun bian yanfa shiyi zhuang" 論變鹽法事宜狀, in *Han Changli wenji jiaozhu* 韓昌黎文集校注, coll. Ma Qichang 馬其昶, ed. Ma Maoyuan 馬茂元 (1987; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1998), 8.650 (*juan* 40 in the original edition). Xu Dongsheng 徐東升 argues that the discrepancies in prices had to do with regional differences. See Xu Dongsheng, "Lun Tangdai wujia de jige wenti" 論唐代物價的幾個問題, *Wen shi zhe* 文史哲, no. 5 (2002): 134–38.

52 See "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1359–60. Yuan's "Qianhuo yizhuang" 錢貨議狀 (On bronze coins and goods) records the same categories, except that *songshi*

is written as *liushi* 留使 (to be retained for provincial governors). See *YZJJZ,* vol. 2:34.938.

53 Hu Sanxing notes that *shenggu* was "the rate set by the Department of State Affairs" 都省所立價. See *ZZTJ,* 237.7655. Associated with the different conversion rates and assessments are the issue of *xuqian* 虛錢 (virtual currency) and *shiqian* 實錢 (actual currency). Using Yuan Zhen's "Wei Henanfu baixing suju zhuang" 為河南府百姓訴車狀 as evidence, Li Jinxiu argues that virtual and actual currencies actually refer to fiduciary silk that had two different conversion rates to bronze coins. See Li Jinxiu, "Tang houqi de xuqian, shiqian wenti" 唐後期的虛錢、實錢問題, *Beijing daxue xuebao* 北京大學學報, no. 2 (1989): 13–25.

54 See "Pei Ji zhuan," in *JTS,* 148.3991–92.

55 See *ZZTJ,* 237.7655; "Pei Ji zhuan," in *XTS,* 169.5149.

56 See *ZZTJ,* 237.7655. For details of the edict, see "Ting shigu chi" 停實估敕, in *QTWXB,* 61.755.

57 See "Biao zou" 表奏, in *YZJJZ,* vol. 2:32.886.

58 See "Liangshui wai buxu gengzheng zhao" 兩稅外不許更徵詔, in *QTWXB,* 80.974.

59 The Board of Finance oversaw population and land censuses, assessment and collection of taxes, and storage and distribution of government revenues. See Charles O. Hucker, *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985), 258.

60 See "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1353. A Turfan market register preserved in Dunhuang records official prices of various products based on type and quality. The same type of product, including silk, is classified into superior, mediocre, or inferior based on quality. See Éric Trombert and Étienne de La Vaissière, "Le prix des denrées sur le marché de Turfan en 743," in *Études de Dunhuang et Turfan*, ed. Jean-Pierre Drège and Olivier Venture (Paris: Droz, 2007), 1–52.

61 See "Zhiguan zhi" 職官志, in *JTS,* 43.1827.

62 For a study of the corrupt atmosphere of the mid-Tang, see Wang Shounan 王壽南, *Tangdai renwu yu zhengzhi* 唐代人物與政治 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1999), 139–57.

63 These governors drew most of the funds they needed from the abundant resources in the northeast, so they did not have to levy unpopular taxes in their provinces. See Denis C. Twitchett, "Provincial Autonomy and Central Finance in Late T'ang," *Asia Major,* n.s., 11 (1965), 211–32.

64 See *BJYJJJ,* 2.82.

65 See *ZZTJ,* 224.7192.

66 See *ZZTJ,* 233.7501; See also "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1359.

67 See *ZZTJ,* 238.7682–83.

68 See Jonathan K. Skaff, *Sui-Tang China and Its Turko-Mongol Neighbors: Culture, Power, and Connections, 580–800* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 262.

69 Zhao Feng 趙豐 and Wang Le 王樂, "Glossary of Textile Terminology (Based on the Documents from Dunhuang and Turfan)," *JRAS* 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 349–87; page 381.

70 For the definition of twill demask, see Zhao and Wang, "Glossary of Textile Terminology," 354–55.

71 See Yao Peijian 姚培建, "Qiannian sichou jian Tangfeng: Tangdai sichou pingshu" 千年絲綢見唐風——唐代絲綢評述, *Sichou* 絲綢, no. 4 (1997), 40–43.

72 For the hardship of weaver women striving to supply the excessive collection of taxes in silk, see Yuan, "Zhifu ci" 織婦詞, in *YZJJZ,* 23.684.

73 See "Liaoling," in *BJYJJJ,* 4.225.
74 According to Zhu Jincheng, the practice of presenting silk carpets began in the Zhenyuan era. See "Hongxian tan," in *BJYJJJ,* 4.222.
75 See "Gaiyuan Zaichu she" 改元載初赦, in *Tang da zhaoling ji* 唐大詔令集, comp. Song Minqiu 宋敏求 (1019–1079) (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2008), 4.19. For the changes in the social status of merchants and the reasons behind them, see Li Sui 理綏, "Shilun Tangdai shangren shehui diwei de bianhua ji qi xiandu" 試論唐代商人社會地位的變化及其限度, *Zhongguo shehui jingjishi yanjiu* 中國社會經濟史研究, no. 4 (1988), 32–36.
76 See "Wang Chucun zhuan" 王處存傳, in *JTS,* 182.4699.
77 For details of how merchants began to obtain official positions, see Yao Shangyi 姚上怡, "Shilun Tangdai shangren de falü diwei" 試論唐代商人的法律地位 (Master's thesis, Xiangtan University, 2009), 17–18.
78 See "Shihuo zhi," in *JTS,* 48.2087; "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS,* 52.1352.
79 See Hu Sanxing's annotation of the term *xiao'er* in *ZZTJ,* 219.7013.
80 See Bernard S. Solomon, trans., *The Veritable Record of the T'ang Emperor Shun-tsung, February 28, 805–August 31, 805: Han Yu's Shun-tsung shih-lu* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1955), 16–17.
81 See Wang Shiyi 王拾遺, *Bai Juyi shenghuo xinian* 白居易生活繫年 (Yinchuan: Ningxia renmin chubanshe, 1981), 70. The other Hanlin Academicians in 809 were Li Jiang, Cui Qun 崔群 (772–832), Qian Hui 錢徽 (755–829), and Wei Hongjing 韋弘景 (766–831). When Yuan came into open conflict with eunuchs and was demoted in 810, Li Jiang and Cui Qun both presented memorials in his defense. Bian Xiaoxuan notes that they supported Yuan because they had all been recommended by the same person, Pei Ji. See Bian Xiaoxuan 卞孝萱, *Yuan Zhen nianpu* 元稹年譜 (Ji'nan: Qi-Lu shushe, 1980), 155.
82 See Li Zhao 李肇 (*fl.* 818), *Tang guoshi bu* 唐國史補 (1957; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979), 52.
83 Xianzong created the post of Chief Hanlin Academician. Those who assumed the post during his reign were often promoted to Chief Minister. See Mao Lei 毛蕾, *Tangdai Hanlin xueshi* 唐代翰林學士 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2000), 133–34.
84 Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao,* 127. He commends Bai's response poem of the same title, saying that it discloses the Tang government's deceitful behavior in using inferior silk for trade, thus providing valuable information that supplements the standard histories. See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao,* 266–67.
85 See *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:4.231.
86 In the horse pasturage, horses were branded at two years old: The stronger ones were marked with the character *fei* 飛 (flying) on the right side of the neck; the weaker ones had a dragon pattern placed on the left side of their necks. See *THY,* 72.1305. The translation is slightly revised from Jagchid, "The 'Uighur Horses' of the T'ang Dynasty," 181.
87 According to Beckwith, the silk Tibetans received for their horses was money-silk; it was not usable in its received form. He notes that the Tibetans and Sogdians used it to buy goods such as clothing-grade silk from the Chinese, or they sold it to the Arabs for silver or other goods. Although Beckwith's discussion centers on the Tibetans and the Sogdians, the situation was probably the same for the Uighurs. See Beckwith, "The Impact of the Horse and Silk Trade on the Economies of T'ang China and the Uighur Empire," 184.

8 On Benevolence

This chapter examines the meaning of benevolence as revealed in Yuan's "Fu Rongren" 縛戎人 (Tibetan captives), "Manzi chao" 蠻子朝 (Tribal leaders paid court), and "Xunxi" 馴犀 (Tamed rhinoceros). Yuan criticizes policies that the emperor considered benevolent but that Yuan saw otherwise. "Fu Rongren" points out that half of the Tibetan captives were Tang people who had fallen into the hands of Tibetans. True mercy would be shown, not by sparing their lives and sending them to the south, but by recovering Longyou and restoring their homeland. "Manzi chao" argues that mercy should be given to Tang soldiers and people, rather than to faraway foreign tribes who declared allegiance simply for the protection of the Tang court. "Xunxi" argues that true benevolence is to follow nature and to cultivate this virtue to benefit all living forms.

Yuan's poems are connected by the idea of benevolence, whereas Bai's poems do not show such a connection. Bai's "Fu Rongren" focuses on the sorrow of commoners, through which he suggests implementing benevolent policies. "Manzi chao" and "Xunxi" both take issue with the emperor's shortcomings. The former criticizes the emperor's neglect of the value of ministers, the latter the emperor's inability to stick to his benevolent policy throughout his reign.

PART I "FU RONGREN": REAL MERCY FOR "TIBETAN" CAPTIVES

"Fu Rongren" suggests that a truly benevolent emperor would focus on strengthening the frontier so that the border residents would not become captives of the Tibetans and be severed from their cultural origin and native state. Yuan presents his idea by introducing a former Tang frontier soldier who was captured by the Tibetans and later mistaken for a Tibetan by Tang soldiers and exiled to the far south.

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-8

	Yuan's "Fu Rongren"[1]	
	Border generals sent out their robust infantry	邊頭大將差健卒
2	To plunder and capture swifter than falcons.	入抄擒生快於鶻
	They snatched whoever had a face painted red;	但逢頰面即捉來
4	Half were border residents, and half were Rong and Jie barbarians.[2]	半是邊人半戎羯
	The generals' merit relied on the headcount.	大將論功重多級
6	How swiftly were memorials of victory presented to court!	捷書飛奏何超忽
	With utmost benevolence, the sage emperor chose not to kill	聖朝不殺諧至仁
8	But sent the captives to the south as a lenient punishment.[3]	遠送炎方示微罰
	Ten thousand *li* of food expenses went to waste;	萬里虛勞肉食費
10	One by one they caught heatstroke in their felt coats.	連頭盡被氈裘暍
	The putrid and rancid lay on fine mattresses and double mats,	華茵重席卧腥臊
12	Making choking, tearful sounds like sick canines and sad partridges.	病犬愁鴿聲咽嗢
	Among them, one could speak the Han language.	中有一人能漢語
14	He said, "My home was originally in a Chang'an grotto.	自言家本長安窟
	I guarded Anxi with my father when I was young,	小年隨父戍安西
16	And I saw the fall of Gua and Sha between the Yellow and the Wei rivers.	河渭瓜沙眼看没
	Several years before the Tianbao Rebellion,	天寶未亂前數載
18	The Wolf Star shone from four angles with blazing light.	狼星四角光蓬勃
	Disaster arose on the central plain, jeopardizing frontier defense.	中原禍作邊防危
20	As expected, jackals and wolves came to attack on all sides.	果有豺狼四來伐
	Just when the Tibetan horses were strong and stout-muscled,	蕃馬膽成正翹健
22	the well-fed Tibetan soldiers competed to trespass the border.	蕃兵肉飽爭唐突
	Smoke and dust arose with no beacon fire;	煙塵亂起無亭燧
24	Commanders jumped in shock, forsaking flags and battle-axes.	主帥驚跳棄旄鉞
	The city was down by midnight; geese cried.	半夜城摧鵝雁鳴
26	Wives wept and children screamed without end.	妻啼子叫曾不歇
	I dared not take refuge in the eerie and dark temples.	陰森神廟未敢依
28	Yet how could I cross the fragile and thin river ice?	脆薄河冰安可越
	I hid myself among deep brambles,	荊棘深處共潛身
30	Trapped by caltrops in front and chaos at the rear.	前困蒺藜後鞾匕
	At dawn Tibetan horse soldiers galloped all about,	平明蕃騎四面走
32	Turning age-old woods and deep forests into trunks and stumps.	古木深林盡株楑
	The young and the vigorous were made captives and shaved bald;	少壯為俘頭被髡
34	The elders were left behind with their feet cut off.	老翁留居足多刖
	Crows and hawks feasted on corpses across the field;	烏鳶滿野屍狼藉

36	Tiered pavilions burnt to ashes with broken walls remained.	樓榭成灰牆突兀
	Undercurrents splashed into former ponds.	暗水濺濺入舊池
38	A broad field of sand bathed in bright moonlight.	平沙漫漫鋪明月
	The Tibetan king sent generals to pacify us.	戎王遣將來安慰
40	Daring not to utter a word, I lamented in my heart.	口不敢言心咄咄
	I stealthily offered a fine steed to the king,[4]	供進腋腋御叱般
42	Not expecting that the nomads preferred fat livestock.	豈料穹廬揀肥腩
	For fifty or sixty years there was no news.	五六十年消息絕
44	Amid the meeting for alliance, there was again a rampage.	中間盟會又猖獗
	I looked to the east, longing for the clouds of Yao;	眼穿東日望堯雲
46	My insides hurt as I did my hair Han-style on the New Year.	腸斷正朝梳漢髮
	In recent years, of those who had missed the Han like this,	近年如此思漢者
48	Half got old or sick; half turned into buried bones.	半為老病半埋骨
	Yet the living still teach their offspring their local accent.	尚教孫子學鄉音
50	Still they talk about the nice city halls of peaceful times.	猶話平時好城闕
	The elders are almost done for, and the young ones are strong.	老者儻盡少者壯
52	They grow up among Tibetans and are like the Tibetan rebels.	生長蕃中似蕃悖
	Not knowing that their grandfathers and fathers are both men of Han.	不知祖父皆漢民
54	I fear that they may become Tibetans inside and out.	便恐為蕃心矻矻
	With a hundred thousand men well fed by the border,	緣邊飽餧十萬眾
56	Why not dispatch the cavalry at once?	何不齊驅一時發
	Capturing two or three people per year,	年年但捉兩三人
58	It is just like Jingwei trying to fill the ocean with reeds!"[5]	精衛銜蘆塞溟渤

Yuan quotes Li Shen: "A recent regulation says that whenever a Tibetan is captured in the west, he will be sent to the south rather than being executed. Therefore Li composed a song to indirectly criticize this policy" 近制：西邊每擒蕃囚，例皆傳置南方，不加勦戮，故李君作歌以諷焉.[6] Li disapproved of the practice; Yuan felt likewise. Sending the captives to the south, a fine gesture of using exile as a minor punishment, was in fact a lose-lose situation: It did not win the captives over, and the court paid a hefty price to provide them with food and transportation. Worse still, mingled among them were Tang border people, who had been captured by the Tibetans and subjected to their rule. These people were loyal to the Tang court and had always imagined a day of return, only to be met with the fate of captives once again—this time administered by soldiers from their homeland who were supposed to protect them.

Deprivation of their national and cultural identity was the root cause of suffering for these pseudo-Tibetans. This loss was attributed to the fall of the western territories and the inefficacy of imperial policy in recovering

lost ground: Rewards were given simply based on the number of captives without verification of their true identities; instead, generals should be encouraged to recover land.

The idea of benevolence is pinpointed in lines 7–8: "With utmost benevolence, the sage emperor chose not to kill/But sent the captives to the south as a lenient punishment." Yuan thereupon presents his view of this policy through the monologue of the protagonist, who bears witness to the atrocities of the Tibetans and the incompetence of the Tang court and its frontier generals over a period of about fifty or sixty years. He begins by pointing out the astronomical signs right before the An Lushan Rebellion that foreshadowed the many attacks to come: The blaze in color of the Wolf Star in the east signaled the presence of various bandits.[7] The Tang court, however, did not take precautions. Not only was it unprepared for An's Rebellion, but it also did not learn from its mistakes. When the Tibetans attacked in the third year of the Zhenyuan era (787), the generals were startled and fled, forsaking Beiting 北庭 and Anxi 安西 in the Longyou Circuit (in modern Gansu). Their flight turned the ordinary soldiers into refugees. As captives, they were actually or symbolically mutilated through the amputation of feet or hair.

The shame and pain of losing one's feet are obvious; moreover, this was traditionally a form of punishment in China. Having one's hair shaved off was also distressful for the Chinese, as it went against the Confucian idea of filial piety. In pre-modern China, hair was considered a precious part of the body that had been bestowed by one's parents and therefore should be kept intact.[8] Furthermore, shaving the head was the custom of the Tibetans, so it also indicated a loss of cultural and ethnic identity for the captives.

The difficulties of maintaining a connection to Tang culture and identity took other forms as well. Only on the Lunar New Year were the captives allowed to wear clothes and hats of the Tang, and it was when homesickness struck them hard.[9] Their offspring grew to be just like Tibetans despite their parents' efforts to teach them the Han language and heritage. For close to sixty years these captives yearned for the return of the Tang army, but it never happened.

At the end of the poem, Yuan alludes to the story of Jingwei 精衛 (literally, "Sprite Guard") to satirize current frontier policy. Jingwei was the name of a bird in a Chinese legend. In her previous life, she had been Nǚwa 女娃 (literally, "Girl Lovely"), the youngest daughter of the Flaming Emperor; she roamed the East Sea 東海 and drowned. Reincarnated into a bird, she refuses to drink water from the sea that had drowned her, and spends her rebirth trying to fill it with wood and pebbles.[10] The task Jingwei set herself was impossible, but her perseverance became a symbol of courage and persistence in pursuing one's ambitions. Moreover, her vow to never drink from the East Sea symbolizes her high principles.

With these two meanings of the legend in mind, the last line of the poem carries a sarcastic tone. On the superficial level, Jingwei's attempt to fill the sea with reeds is a perfect metaphor for the Tang attempt to capture Tibetans to re-establish Tang sovereignty over this borderland. Both operated on such a small scale that neither would have much impact. On the deeper level, however, she was the exact opposite of the border officials. While Jingwei persisted in fighting her enemy with whatever means she had, no matter how small, the Tang officials had no intention to fight the Tibetans even though they had the power to do so. Yuan concludes that a real benevolent policy would drive away the Tibetans so that the captives could be restored to their former identity as Tang people and to their previous lands.

Expressing the Sorrow of the "Tibetan" Captives: Bai's "Fu Rongren"

Bai's "Fu Rongren" also focuses on the sorrow of the Tang men who were captured by Tibetans, but he does not extend his comments to the military governors.

Bai's "Fu Rongren"[11]

	Tibetan captives,	縛戎人
	Tibetan captives,	縛戎人
3	Driven to Qin with their ears pierced and faces broken.	耳穿面破驅入秦
	The Son of Heaven felt pity and could not bring himself to kill.	天子矜憐不忍殺
5	He ordered them sent to the Wu and Yue areas of the southeast.	詔徙東南吳與越
	Eunuchs recorded their names,	黃衣小使錄姓名
7	Leading them out of Chang'an one by one.	領出長安乘遞行
	Covered in knife wounds, with gaunt faces,	身被金瘡面多瘠
9	They walked barefoot, one post station a day, in sickness.	扶病徒行日一驛
	Eating and drinking day and night, they consumed cups and dishes.	朝飡饑渴費盃盤
11	Laying down in their stink, they dirtied mattresses and mats.	夜臥腥臊污床席
	Chancing on a river and recalling River Jiao,	忽逢江水憶交河
13	They sobbed and sang in unison with hands on their sides.	垂手齊聲嗚咽歌
	One captive spoke to the other captives:	其中一虜語諸虜
15	"Your sorrow cannot match mine."	爾苦非多我苦多
	His companions and passersby all inquired about this.	同伴行人因借問
17	He choked in anger as he tried to speak.	欲說喉中氣憤憤
	Then he said, "My hometown was originally in Liangyuan.	自云鄉管本涼原
19	It fell into Tibetans' hands in the Dali era.	大曆年中沒落蕃
	Since it fell to the Tibetans, forty years have passed.	一落蕃中四十載
21	Driven to wear leather coats and tie belts of fur,	遣著皮裘繫毛帶
	I was only allowed to wear the Han costume on the New Year.	唯許正朝服漢儀

(Continued)

23	I tidied my clothes and headcloth with tears quietly running down.	斂衣整巾潛淚垂
	Swearing to return, I finalized a plan in secret,	誓心密定歸鄉計
25	Not letting my wife and children among the Tibetans know.	不使蕃中妻子知
	Thinking in secret that I was lucky to have some strength still,	暗思幸有殘筋力
27	I feared that once I aged, I could never return.	更恐年衰歸不得
	The Tibetans guarded the border so heavily that even birds could not fly over.	蕃候嚴兵鳥不飛
29	Risking death, I escaped and returned.	脫身冒死奔逃歸
	Crossing the big desert, I lay low in the daytime and walked at night.	晝伏宵行經大漠
31	The clouds shaded the moon, and the sandstorm was severe.	雲陰月黑風沙惡
	Startled, I hid behind tombs where even grass was sparse.	驚藏青塚寒草疏
33	Stealthily, I crossed the Yellow River on thin evening ice.	偷渡黃河夜冰薄
	Suddenly I heard the army drums of the Han troops.	忽聞漢軍鼙鼓聲
35	I rushed out to bow and greet them.	路傍走出再拜迎
	The rangers cared nothing about my ability to speak the Han language.	游騎不聽能漢語
37	The general then had me tied up as a Tibetan.	將軍遂縛作蕃生
	I am exiled to the southeast, where it is low-lying and humid.	配向東南卑濕地
39	No consolation has been given, and I am guarded against."	定無存卹空防備
	When he thought of this, he gulped down his sobs and laid his heart bare to Heaven:	念此吞聲仰訴天
41	"Why should I suffer from this hardship and bitterness for my last years?	若為辛苦度殘年
	I cannot see my homeland in Liangyuan;	涼原鄉井不得見
43	My wife and children are cast away in Tibet for nothing.	胡地妻兒虛棄捐
	Trapped by Tibetans, I longed for the land of Han.	沒蕃被囚思漢土
45	Returning to Han, I was snatched up as a Tibetan captive.	歸漢被劫為蕃虜
	If I had known of this, I would not have come.	早知如此悔歸來
47	How much worse it is, being severed from two rather than one!	兩地寧如一處苦
	The Tibetan captives,	縛戎人
49	Among them, I have it worse.	戎人之中我苦辛
	This injustice must never have occurred in the past—	自古此冤應未有
51	To have a heart of Han and a tongue of Han, but be treated as a Tibetan!"	漢心漢語吐蕃身

Similar to Yuan, Bai also has a Tang captive speak for himself, thus creating a first-person narration. By doing this, he wants "to make known to the emperor the feelings of commoners in dire straits" 達窮民之情也.[12] Bai focuses on the dilemma the man faces: He could not identify with the Tibetans, nor could he return to the Tang community. While Bai, unlike Yuan, did not propose a solution, he too was calling the emperor's attention to the problematic nature of the policy as practiced. In comparison,

Yuan's main purpose—proposing a truly benevolent policy—stands out. He stresses the need to recover lost territories and the Tang ability to do so. In this way, Yuan points his finger not only at the emperor but also at the border generals.

PART II "MANZI CHAO": MERCY FOR TANG PEOPLE

"Manzi chao" criticizes the court for providing support to the kingdom of Nanzhao 南詔 at the expense of Tang soldiers and Tang laborers. Yuan quotes Li Shen: "It was not until the end of the Zhenyuan era that the Shu area made connections with the barbaric state" 李傳云：貞元末, 蜀川始通蠻酋.[13] Yuan, however, holds that their allegiance means nothing, for they "submit" not because of the unifying and transforming power of the court, but because of the material and political benefits they get in exchange. The benevolent policies towards these foreign tribes burden the Tang people and hold the court back from attacking the Tibetans that are located beyond Nanzhao.

Yuan's "Manzi chao"[14]

	There are descendants of the Six Kings in the southwest,	西南六詔有遺種
2	Who live in a desolate area where roads are always blocked.	僻在荒陬路尋壅
	Their tribes are dispersed and leaders lowly,	部落支離君長賤
4	More secluded than the barbarians of the east and north.	比諸夷狄為幽冗
	The strong and robust Tibetans repeatedly attack and intrude on them.[15]	犬戎強盛頻侵削
6	They resent surrender but lack the valor to fight.	降有憤心戰無勇
	At night they guard their deep mountains to prevent robbery;	夜防鈔盜保深山
8	At dawn they go up the high mount to watch out for smoke and dust.	朝望烟塵上高冢
	They pass along bird-like paths and rope-like bridges to submit,	鳥道繩橋來款附
10	Not because they want to be transformed but because they are fearful.	非因慕化因為悚
	Their officials of peace wore golden waist belts;	清平官繫金呿嵯
12	Holding a pair of jades, they pleaded to heaven and kowtowed to earth.	求天叩地持雙珙
	Wei, the Great General of Yizhou and the Grand Imperial Secretariat,	益州大將韋令公
14	Settled areas of River Qian and Long Mountain by chance.	頃實遭時定汧隴
	With no other merit since he was appointed to this troubled garrison,	自居劇鎮無他績
16	He was lucky to have barbarians come to solidify imperial favor.	幸得蠻來固恩寵
	Clearing the way for barbarians and leading them to court,	為蠻開道引蠻朝

(Continued)

18	He received and sent barbarians off one after another.	接蠻送蠻常繼踵
	The Son of Heaven was congratulated by all in the front palace.	天子臨軒四方賀
20	Without military affairs, the court practiced inaction.	朝廷無事唯端拱
	Messengers galloped under the drizzling sky in the chilly rain of spring;	漏天走馬春雨寒
22	There were flying snakes over the Lu River in dense miasmic mist.	瀘水飛蛇瘴烟重
	The clan with mallet-like topknots had their worries cleared away.	椎頭醜類除憂患
24	Laborers getting swollen feet complained of being enslaved.	瘽足役夫勞洶湧
	The Huns did business with us but did not present yearly tribute.	匈奴互市歲不供
26	On good terms with the Yun barbarians, the reins were for long held tight.	雲蠻通好轡長騋
	The Tibetans had been raising horses for many years,	戎王養馬漸多年
28	The southerners were exhausted, and the westerners panicked.	南人耗頽西人恐

Yuan argues against wasting precious resources and labor on protecting the Nanzhao people; he considered it more important to strengthen the central plain and guard against the Tibetans. Rather than praising Wei Gao 韋皐 (745–805), the Military Governor of Jiannan 劍南, for his strong support of the Tang emperors,[16] Yuan criticized him for facilitating the submission of the Nanzhao ruler and encouraging the vanity of the court. To understand Yuan's perspective, which has proved controversial, it is necessary to look briefly at the history of the Nanzhao state and its relation to the Tang, as well as Yuan's critics.

Nanzhao (literally, Kings of the South) was located in modern Yunnan. The state originally consisted of six tribes, with a king for each, which accounts for its earlier name of Liu Zhao 六詔 or "Six Kings." [17] The tribe led by King Mengshe 蒙舍 resided furthest south. He succeeded in combining all the tribes, and thereafter they were collectively known as Nanzhao. When Nanzhao was in the process of establishing its empire, its leaders maintained a good relationship with the Tang court. They even received Tang titles when they were enthroned. In 639, Nanzhao unified and established its capital at Taihe 大和 (i.e., modern Dali 大理 of Yunnan).

Nanzhao's relations with the Tang fell apart in 750, when the leader Geluofeng 閣邏鳳 (712–779)[18] had conflicts with Zhang Qiantuo 張虔陀 (d. 750), Commandery Prefect of Yunnan 雲南太守, and Xianyu Zhongtong 鮮于仲通 (fl. 749), Military Governor of Jiannan. The 766 Dehua bei 德化碑 (Stele of Transforming through Virtue), one of the two extant narratives from Nanzhao, lists six ways in which Zhang attempted to bring down Geluofeng and destroy his kingdom.[19] The Tang official records note that Zhang had sexual relationships with Geluofeng's wife and daughter.[20]

The same account can be seen in *Yunnan zhilue* 雲南志略.[21] When Geluofeng ignored Zhang's commands, Zhang had Geluofeng humiliated, causing the latter to kill the former and rebel.[22] When Geluofeng sought to reconcile with the Tang, Xianyu imprisoned his messenger and attacked his capital. The episode ended when Geluofeng defeated Xianyu and severed Nanzhao's relationship with the Tang to side with the Tibetans in 752.

The alliance presented a serious threat to the Tang court. In the thirteenth year of the Tianbao era (754), Li Mi 李宓 (d. 754), Censor of Jiannan 劍南留後御史, sent an expedition against Nanzhao. Although he recruited only the best soldiers, eighty or ninety percent of them died because of the local environment: They sank into marshes, fell sick from miasma, or suffered from the lack of provisions. Two hundred thousand soldiers were wiped out north of Taihe. It was said that people harbored resentment and hatred towards the court, but none dared speak up.[23]

Nanzhao did not reestablish relations with the Tang until after Yimouxun, the grandson of Geluofeng, submitted to the Tang upon the advice of his former tutor Zheng Hui 鄭回 (fl. 751), who argued that the Tang court valued ritual propriety and would never pressure Nanzhao for financial and military support like the Tibetans. Zheng was a *mingjing* graduate and had been the Xilu 西瀘 District Magistrate of Xizhou 嶲州 (in modern Sichuan) prior to his capture by Geluofeng during the An Lushan Rebellion. Geluofeng valued the Confucian training of Zheng and entrusted him with his heir's education. When Yimouxun was enthroned, he made Zheng one of his six *Qingpingguan* 清平官 (Officials of Peace). These "Officials of Peace," who are mentioned in both Yuan and Bai's poems, were equivalent to chief ministers of the Tang; of them, Zheng was highest in status. In 789 Yimouxun thus accepted the invitation of Wei Gao to declare allegiance to the Tang.[24]

Yuan criticizes Wei for bringing in the Nanzhao people, arguing that sheltering them would bring more harm than good. This view has been challenged by modern historians. Chen Yinke noted that Yuan was uninformed and unjust in his accusations. In Chen's opinion, the Tang's alliance with Nanzhao was a strategy to restrain the power of Tibetans, allowing Tang to besiege them in future battles.[25] This approach had been supported by Li Mi and partially realized by Wei. Moreover, when Wei allied with Nanzhao to fight the Tibetans, Nanzhao frequently won, at a time when the Tang court itself failed to get stronger.[26] In sum, the alliance with Nanzhao not only alienated Tibetans from Nanzhao, but also stabilized the southwestern border.

When Nanzhao turned against the Tang court, however, that border was at great risk. Hou Linbo 侯林伯, another modern historian, summarizes the three periods in which Nanzhao became a threat. The first lasted forty-four years, beginning in the ninth year of Tianbao (750) till

the tenth year of Zhenyuan (794), when Nanzhao sided with the Tibetans. The second lasted only one year, from when Nanzhao took the outer wall of Chengdu in the third year of Taihe 太和 (829) during Wenzong's 文宗 (809–840, r. 827–840) reign. The third lasted twenty years, beginning in the thirteenth year of Dazhong 大中 (859) under Xuanzong 宣宗 (810–859, r. 846–859) until Nanzhao took Jiaozhi 交趾 in the west and attacked Chengdu twice. Hou, however, points out that their rebellions were largely triggered by the improper behavior of border officials. He thus praised Wei Gao and Gao Pian 高駢 (d. 887) for facilitating a successful alliance between Nanzhao and the Tang, which brought the court an ally rather than an enemy.[27] Nanzhao's surrender to Tang rule also encouraged the Piao state to declare allegiance to the Tang empire.

Wei's achievements in pacifying foreign tribes and defeating the Tibetans were significant enough for them to be documented in official histories.[28] However, he was also known for his corruption and his presentation of "daily tribute," known as *rijin* 日進.[29] He levied heavy taxation to do so, and only when he had accumulated enough would he reduce it to pacify the Shu people.[30] Yuan's negative view of Wei might also be due to the latter's extractive excesses and not only to the ignorance of state politics that Chen alleges.

Yuan also argued that Nanzhao was taking advantage of the court's benevolence simply to obtain practical benefits, not because the kingdom had been transformed by Dezong's moral power. Yet Confucian ideas and practices among Nanzhao's elite may have been more complex than Yuan credited. On the Dehua stele, Geluofeng was pictured as an ideal Confucian ruler who drew various tribes to submit to his rule and embrace righteousness and ritual.[31] Zheng Hui's important role has already been discussed. His lasting influence in Nanzhao is suggested by the claim of the Zheng family, who displaced Nanzhao in the tenth century and founded the Changhe 長和 (903–927), to be his descendants.[32] Moreover, notions of Confucian rulership still exercised influence on the Changhe court as they had in the eighth-century Nanzhao.[33]

In fact, Nanzhao was a kingdom characterized by a combination of Sinitic-style bureaucracy with indigenous Southeast Asian allegiance ties. Its rulers themselves invoked Confucian civilizational ideology to morally justify governance of conquered peoples,[34] demonstrating their embrace of at least some Tang principles. Seen from this perspective, the Nanzhao acknowledged the value of ritual, and its submission might not have been entirely profit-seeking.

Yuan argues finally that giving protection to Nanzhao was not a gesture of benevolence, especially when it was done at the cost of Tang soldiers and people. He criticizes the vanity of the emperor in prioritizing the appearance of imperial power over caring for the core Tang state. The fact

that Nanzhao defected in 750 and revolted in 829 and 859 might support Yuan's view that the Nanzhao people, despite their interest in select Confucian principles, were not loyal subjects of the Tang after all, and that their allegiance depended on receiving anticipated material benefits.

Criticizing the Overriding Power of Military Governors: Bai's "Manzi chao"

Bai notes that his response poem "criticizes the phenomenon of military governors being favored while ministers were left without actual power" 刺將驕而相備位也. He subtly condemns Wei for claiming the merit of bringing in Nanzhao; most importantly, he criticizes Dezong for taking Wei's memorial at face value, rejoicing at the coming over of the Nanzhao state, and bestowing excessive favor on the emissaries. Dezong's belittlement of the ministers is stated as a contrast.

	Bai's "Manzi chao" [35]	
	The southern barbarians came to court:	蠻子朝
	Riding on leather boats and crossing rope-like bridges,	汎皮船兮渡繩橋
3	They came from Xizhou, and the paths they traveled were long.	來自嶲州道路遙
	To enter, they must first pass through the Shu area;	入界先經蜀川過
5	To claim merit, the Shu general jumped to offer felicitations in a memorial:	蜀將收功先表賀
	"Your subject heard that there were six barbaric tribes in Yunnan,	臣聞雲南六詔蠻
7	Connected to Zangke in the east and Tibet in the west.	東連牂牁西連蕃
	The six tribes scattered about without much to speak of at first.	六詔星居初瑣碎
9	Once combined, they became increasingly strong.	合為一詔漸強大
	Although the Kaiyuan emperor was sagely and divine,	開元皇帝雖聖神
11	The barbarians were stubborn and did not pay their tribute.	唯蠻倔強不來賓
	The sixty thousand soldiers of Xianyu Zhongtong	鮮于仲通六萬卒
13	Went down in one go on his expedition.	征蠻一陣全軍沒
	Up till now, the river shore of Xi'er	至今西洱河岸邊
15	Is still covered by dry bones, arrow holes, and knife marks.	箭孔刀痕滿枯骨
	Who could have known that they would admire Chinese culture now?	誰知今日慕華風
17	Not bothering a single one, the barbarians have come on their own.	不勞一人蠻自通
	Truly it is attributed to Your Majesty's fine and bright virtue.	誠由陛下休明德
19	It also depends on the persuasion of your petty subject."	亦賴微臣誘諭功
	Dezong learned of this from the memorial.	德宗省表知如此

(Continued)

21	He joyfully commanded eunuchs to receive the barbarians.	笑令中使迎蠻子
	Who were the ones guiding and following among the barbarians?	蠻子導從者誰何
23	The escorts holding feather fans lined up in two rows.[36]	摩挲俗羽雙隈伽
	The official of peace held the staff of crimson cane.	清平官持赤藤杖
25	The grand military officer tied on a golden waist belt.	大軍將繫金呿嗟
	Xungequan, the son of Yimouxun,	異牟尋男尋閣勸
27	Was summoned to Palace Yanying by a special edict.	特勅召對延英殿
	The sovereign valued placating barbarians from afar;	上心貴在懷遠蠻
29	He had them led to the imperial seat close to him.	引臨玉座近天顏
	Not letting down the tassels, he consoled and rewarded them in person,	冕旒不垂親勞俾
31	Bestowing on them clothing and food and meeting them for two hours.	賜衣賜食移時對
	To meet for two hours—	移時對
	This is impossible to achieve.	不可得
34	The grand officials looked on with envy.	大臣相看有羨色
	Pitiful are the ministers wearing purple robes with golden seals:	可憐宰相拖紫佩金章
36	On the day of court, they can only meet the emperor for fifteen minutes!	朝日唯聞對一刻

Bai begins by stating the background of his composition: The Nanzhao state came from afar to pay tribute to the court. He highlights the Shu area through which they had to pass to enter the Tang territory and then brings up Wei, who took credit for their submission and presented a memorial to congratulate the emperor.

Bai presents Wei's memorial in a poetic form. The switch of the narrative tone is indicated by *chen* 臣, literally "your subject," which is a polite way for a subject to refer to himself. Wei begins by highlighting the geographic significance of Nanzhao and its increasing strength. He then stresses the difficulty of bringing them to submit; even Xuanzong was unable to accomplish this. Wei then recalls to Dezong the brutal battle in which 60,000 Tang soldiers died fighting Nanzhao; the remnants of the conflict and the remains of the soldiers are still everywhere to be seen on the battle site. Against this backdrop, he argues that Dezong had transformed Nanzhao with his sagacious rule, which had proved to be more effective than force. He then follows up with his own merit in welcoming them. All of this is brought up to flatter Dezong and gain his favor.

The narrative voice shifts back to the third-person narrator in line 20, when Bai notes that Dezong learned of Nanzhao's submission through Wei's memorial. In Bai's eyes, the emperor had taken Wei's words at face value, shown by the extraordinary favor he bestowed on the prince and the emissaries. Not only did he meet them at the palace for two hours, but

he also let them come forward and showed them his face clearly, without letting down the tassels of his crown.

This indulgence in foreigners serves as a foil to the belittlement of court officials. The emperor's chief advisors could only meet with him briefly even on the day of audience, showing that they were hardly given a chance to assist governance. Although Bai excuses Dezong by saying that it may just be a diplomatic gesture to placate the foreign tribes, he zooms in on the reaction of the various high officials. In the end, he laments the fate of the ministers, specifying the inferior treatment they received.

PART III "XUNXI": REAL MERCY FOR LIVING BEINGS

"Xunxi" employs the death of a tamed rhinoceros to argue for a benevolent policy that would allow commoners to follow their nature and live in peace. Li Shen notes, "The rhinoceros was an object of tribute presented by the southern region in the twelfth year of the Zhenyuan era (796). By the winter of the thirteenth year (797), it suffered from the cold weather and died in the palace garden" 貞元丙子歲, 南海來貢, 至十三年冬, 苦寒, 死於苑中.[37] Li's preface differs from the official record and Bai's preface, which tie this event to the ninth year of Zhenyuan (793). According to Bai, 796 was the year that the rhinoceros died.[38]

	Yuan's "Xunxi"[39]	
	Dezong set free the tamed elephants in the early Jianzhong era,	建中之初放馴象
2	Letting them return to Linyi by the Jiao and Guang prefectures.	遠歸林邑近交廣
	The beasts returned to the deep mountains where birds built their nests.	獸返深山鳥構巢
4	Hawks, condors, snipes, and falcons had no bridles or girth straps.	鷹雕鷸鶻無羈鞅
	During the Zhenyuan era, a tamed rhinoceros was presented as tribute.	貞元之歲貢馴犀
6	An enclosure was set up in Shanglin, where officials fostered it.	上林置圈官司養
	Its jade basins and golden shed were nothing other than precious.	玉盆金棧非不珍
8	But it was like a tiger being catered in a cage or a fish being fed in a net;	虎啖猘牢魚食網
	Like oranges from across the river or raccoons passing over River Min,	渡江之橘踰汶貉
10	How could it grow, defying the seasons and going against nature?	反時易性安能長
	In the twelfth month, the north wind brought deep frost and snow.	臘月北風霜雪深

(Continued)

12	It curled up its scaly body and was gone forever.	踡跼鱗身遂長往
	It could have walked unrestrained but was driven to court.	行地無疆費傳驛
14	The exotic rhinoceros suffered deep injustice.	通天異物罹幽枉
	I then knew that fostering animals is like fostering people;	乃知養獸如養人
16	One does not need to be praised by everyone.	不必人人自敦奬
	Not disturbing achieves order;	不擾則得之於理
18	Not taking away gains more than bestowing.	不奪有以多於賞
	Rather than removing clothes and declining food to clothe and feed the people,	脫衣推食衣食之
20	It would be better to let men farm and women weave.	不若男耕女令紡
	Yao's people did not know about his existence.	堯民不自知有堯
22	Only their leisurely breaking up of clods could be seen.	但見安閑聊擊壤
	Observing the tamed elephants before and the rhinoceros after,	前觀馴象後觀犀
24	The way of ruling a state is as clear as pointing at one's palm.	理國其如指諸掌

Yuan presents the true principle of benevolence as nurturing living beings, be they animals or humans. To do this is to let them follow their natures and to refrain from interference. By contrasting the fate of the elephants in the Jianzhong era with that of the rhinoceros in the Zhenyuan era, Yuan suggests the declining quality of rule. When Dezong had just ascended the throne, he turned down a sumptuous gift from the Governor of Pinglu 平盧; in 780, the Governors of Pinglu and Weibo 魏博 offered tribute, but he gave the money to the state treasury, treating it as regular tax revenue.[40] However, after having to flee the capital in 783, his attitude changed. He began to accept tribute for his private treasury at the expense of the state reserve.[41] This is also reflected in his different treatment of the elephants and the rhinoceros. Dezong had banned the presentation of precious birds and animals and sent the thirty-two dancing elephants presented by the Wendan 文單 state (in modern Laos) to Mt. Jing 荊 during the Jianzhong era,[42] but he kept the rhinoceros at the imperial palace when it was presented to him as tribute during the Zhenyuan era.

In describing the rhinoceros, Yuan uses the term *xingdi wujiang* 行地無疆 (walking on the land unrestrained). The *locus classicus* of the phrase appears in the treatise that elaborates on the *kun*-hexagram 坤 in the *Yijing* 易經 (*Book of Changes*). The *kun*-hexagram has six broken lines to indicate the *yin* 陰 (the feminine or negative principle in nature), the opposite of *yang* 陽 (the masculine or positive principle in nature). *Yin* is a symbol of the regenerating power of earth, indicating what is broad and smooth and is advantageous for the mare divination.[43] The treatise explains the meaning of this hexagram, pointing out that all things owe to it their birth, and it obediently follows the nature of heaven. *Kun*, in its largesse, supports and contains all things, and its

virtue matches the unlimited power of heaven indicated by the *qian*-hexagram 乾. It favorably encompasses a broad range of objects and lets them attain their full development. The mare is a creature of earthly origin that has unlimited power to move on the earth. It is mild and docile; thus, the divination is favorable.[44] Yuan alludes to this hexagram to suggest that only if each being can follow its own nature can everything regenerate boundlessly. This fits into his larger argument about allowing all living creatures to return to where they belong: Ideal governance is to implement a tranquil policy that permits men and women to occupy their appropriate places.

The last line alludes to the political philosophy of Mencius, who was known for his advocation of running a state with benevolent policies, through which "all under heaven can be run within your palm" 天下可運於掌.[45] By lamenting the death of the rhinoceros, Yuan elaborates on the ideal state that implements such policies, in which everybody could make a living without having to depend on bestowals or being subject to the pressure of taxes and turbulent political affairs.

Lamenting the Difficulty of Maintaining Good Rule: Bai's "Xunxi"

Bai Juyi states that he wrote this response poem "to lament the difficulty of maintaining good rule" 感為政之難終也.[46] To achieve this, he likewise contrasts the fate of the elephants and the rhinoceros.

	Bai's "Xunxi"	
	The tamed rhinoceros, the tamed rhinoceros, a "Rhinoceros of Heaven":	馴犀馴犀通天犀
2	Its body and appearance scared people, and its horn scared cocks.	軀貌駭人角駭雞
	Barbarians of the sea heard that there was a wise Son of Heaven;	海蠻聞有明天子
4	They drove the rhinoceros and rode on carriages to come from 10,000 *li* away.	驅犀乘傳來萬里
	Once they had an audience at the Palace of Great Lumen,	一朝得謁大明宮
6	They cheered, bowed, and danced, proclaiming their own merit.	歡呼拜舞自論功
	[Bragging of] spending five years to tame it for presentation as tribute,	五年馴養始堪獻
8	Only with six rounds of translation were they understood.	六譯語言方得通
	The sovereign praised the men and the beast for coming so far;	上嘉人獸俱來遠
10	The barbarians were housed in the Four Quarters, and the rhinoceros in the garden	蠻館四方犀入苑
	Fed with fine fodder and kept in golden chains,	餧以瑤蒭鎖以金

(Continued)

12	Its homeland is far, and the imperial gate is deep.	故鄉迢遞君門深
	Seabirds do not appreciate music of bells and drums;	海鳥不知鍾鼓樂
14	Pond fish have the heart to swim in rivers and lakes, but to no avail.	池魚空結江湖心
	The tamed rhinoceros was born in the hot south.	馴犀生處南方熱
16	There is neither dew in autumn nor snow in winter.	秋無白露冬無雪
	Three or four years had passed ever since it entered Palace Shanglin.	一入上林三四年
18	This year it met with a month bitterly cold.	又逢今歲苦寒月
	Drinking icy water and lying on sleet, it curled up suffering.	飲冰臥霰苦蹐跼
20	Its horns froze, and its scales and shells shrank.	角骨凍傷鱗甲縮
	The tamed rhinoceros died;	馴犀死
	The barbarians cried.	蠻兒啼
23	They bowed repeatedly to the palace and humbled themselves.	向闕再拜顏色低
	"We plead to return to our home state alive,	奏乞生歸本國去
25	As we fear we would freeze to death as the tamed rhinoceros did."	恐身凍死似馴犀
	Don't you see that in early Jianzhong,	君不見建中初
27	The tamed elephants were set free to Linyi?	馴象生還放林邑
	Don't you see that at the end of Zhenyuan,	君不見貞元末
29	The tamed rhinoceros froze to death, and the barbarians wept?	馴犀凍死蠻兒泣
	What I lament is the difference of Zhenyuan from Jianzhong.	所嗟建中異貞元
31	What is worth saying about the elephants that live and the rhinoceros that died?	象生犀死何足言

In this poem, Bai uses the two cases of tribute both to criticize Dezong's change of heart towards accepting tribute and to present a broader argument that the Son of Heaven should always cultivate himself with virtue. The poem begins by recounting the spectacular features of the rhinoceros; its horn was believed to be connected to Heaven.[47] Rather than singing praises of this exotic animal, however, Bai focuses on its frightening nature and the difficulty of taming it. Presented by people from the Huanwang 環王 state (in modern Vietnam), formerly known as Linyi 林邑, it was taken on a long journey to reach the court. Equally exotic were the emissaries, whose language was so rare that it had to be translated through six languages to be understood.

As a reward for the loyalty thus shown, Dezong housed the guests in the Four Quarters, an office for handling affairs of foreign peoples, and put the rhinoceros in the palace garden. While this might be seen as a gesture of ritual, that is, putting others in honored places appropriate to their nature, it did both the guests and the rhinoceros a disfavor. The major portion of the poem speaks from the perspective of the animal that lost its freedom and was subjected to an environment disastrous to its survival. The cold

winter of the north eventually killed this southern animal. Its suffering over the years did not bring Dezong to release it or to let it return with the emissaries.

To drive home his point, Bai contrasts the fate of the thirty-two elephants presented in the Jianzhong era with that of the rhinoceros. Although the elephants could perform dances in accompaniment with music for royal enjoyment, Dezong was still willing to set them free. The rhinoceros could not entertain like this, but Dezong was unwilling to let it go. By articulating the rhinoceros's wish to be set free like the seabird rather than confined like a pond fish and by describing its predictable death, Bai elicits sympathy in his readers.

The ending stanza, however, uses the phrase "*hezu yan*" 何足言 (what is worth saying). This belittles the fates of the tribute beasts in order to convey a satirical tone. It suggests that the situation of commoners was even graver than that of the animals. Dezong's change of policy was not limited to presentations of animals but extended to other forms of tribute; now he welcomed them all. As a result, commoners suffered tremendously under the unlawful levy of extra taxes imposed by the military governors, who then presented them as "a surplus in taxation"; this was in essence a disguised form of bribery. This practice continued even in Xianzong's reign. Through this final ironic remark, Bai highlights the difficulties in maintaining good rule.

PART IV VOICE AND PROSODY ACROSS THE POEMS

Yuan's "Fu Rongren" has fifty-eight lines (twenty-nine stanzas), whereas Bai's response poem is shorter, with fifty-one lines (twenty-five stanzas). In this poem, Yuan does not present himself as a first-person narrator. Instead, he has a former Tang soldier who was driven into exile as a captive speak. This is indicated by the use of *ziyan* 自言 (to speak [of something that relates to oneself]). Bai also uses a similar technique of having a captive speak, indicated by the use of *ziyun* 自云 (to say [something that relates to oneself]).

The tone patterns for both poems are irregular, in the sense that there is no clear rule for the alternation of level and oblique tones. Yuan's poem is entirely heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem mixes in lines of different lengths. Bai's poem begins with two three-character lines that highlight the subject: the Tibetan captives. This line recurs in stanza 24. The rest of the poem is heptasyllabic. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses rhyme words from either the rhyme category *mo* 没 or its near rhyme *yue* 月 in every other line, with the exception of the first stanza that rhymes both lines. Bai's poem shows a frequent change of rhyme categories, including both

level and oblique tones. He also uses near-rhymes that are from different tones within a stanza. For the tonal pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.10.

Yuan's "Manzi chao" has twenty-eight lines (fourteen stanzas), whereas Bai's response poem is longer, with thirty-six lines (seventeen stanzas). Both poets use third-person narration and simply express their comments by using statements. However, Bai also uses the first-person *chen* 臣 (your subject) and the second-person *bixia* 陛下 (a polite way of addressing the emperor) by bringing in Wei Gao's memorial, thus revealing how Dezong was deceived.

As in the first set of poems, the tonal patterns of both poems are irregular. Yuan's poem is again consistently heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem employs lines of different lengths. Bai's poem begins with a three-character line that highlights the subject: the barbarians coming to court. In stanza 16, he uses two three-character lines to underscore his point that the emperor spent little time discussing state policies with his ministers. In the last stanza, he adds *kelian* 可憐 (pitiful) in front of a seven-character line that could have stood alone. The addition of this phrase creates variety, and more importantly, expresses the poet's deep sympathy with ministers over their diminishing role. The rest of the poem is heptasyllabic. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses rhyme words from the rhyme category *zhong* 腫 in every other line and the first line. Bai's poem shows a frequent change of rhyme categories, including both level and oblique tones. He also uses near-rhymes from different tone categories within a stanza. For the tonal pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.11.

Turning to the third set of poems, Yuan's "Xunxi" has twenty-four lines (twelve stanzas) whereas Bai's response poem is longer with thirty-one lines (fifteen stanzas). Both poets use third-person narration. Yuan expresses his comments through an affirmation statement in the end, thus strengthening the rhetorical power, which is beneficial for presenting his advice to the emperor. In comparison, Bai expresses his criticism through a rhetorical question, thus inviting readers to contemplate the sad truth concerning Dezong's failure in maintaining his good rule.

Again, the tonal patterns for both poems are irregular. Yuan's poem is entirely heptasyllabic, whereas Bai's poem includes lines of different lengths. Although this time Bai does not begin his poem with a three-character line that highlights the subject, he uses a 2-2-3 rhythm, repeating the title "Xunxi" twice and ending it with the name of the rhinoceros. In stanza 11, he uses two three-character lines to highlight the death of the animal and the cries of the envoys, laying the foundation for their pleas to return to their homeland. Lines 26 and 28 then use the stock expression *junbujian* to call attention to the contrasting fates of the animals, creating a 3-3 rhythm that stands out, thus driving home the difficulty of

maintaining good rule. The rest of the poem is heptasyllabic. In terms of rhymes, Yuan's poem uses primarily rhyme words from the rhyme category *yang* 養 in every other line and the first line, with the exception of the first stanza that also uses the near rhyme *dang* 蕩. Bai's poem frequently changes rhyme categories, including both level and oblique tones. He also uses near-rhymes that are from different tone categories within a stanza. For the tonal pattern and rhyming pattern, see Appendix, Table A.12.

Notes

1 Rong 戎 and Jie 羯 were ancient tribes of the northwest. The names are used anachronistically to refer to Tibetans. *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.741–42.
2 Zhou Xianglu points out that Qian Qianyi's collation of Yuan's text, *Quan Tang shi*, and *Yuefu* all have *bian* 邊 instead of *fan* 蕃. Although he lists 蕃 in the main text, he suspects that *bian* might be a more reliable version. *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.742. This manuscript has used *bian* since the poem concerns border residents being captured as Tibetans.
3 *Yanfang* 炎方 (literally, "hot quarters") refers to the south.
4 The meaning of *yeye* 腋腋 is unclear. The interpretation here follows Zhou Xianglu, who proposes that 腋 is the same as 掖 (to hide/to conceal). *Chibo* 叱般 is the same as *chibo* 叱撥, which refers to fine horses whose sweat is the color of blood. See the annotation of Zhou Xianglu, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:744.
5 Ming and Bo were names of seas, and used to refer to a large body of water.
6 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.742.
7 "Tianguan shu" 天官書, in *Shiji*, 27.1306.
8 See "Kaizong mingyi zhang" 開宗明義章, in *Xiaojing zhushu* 孝經注疏, 1.3a, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:11.
9 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.742.
10 Yuan Ke 袁珂, ed., *Shanhaijing jiaozhu* 山海經校注 (1980; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1986), 3.92. Translation slightly revised from Anne Birrell, *The Classic of Mountains and Seas* (New York: Penguin Books, 1999), 48.
11 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.197–98.
12 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.197.
13 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.739.
14 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.739–40.
15 Quan Rong 犬戎 was an ancient tribe; the name is here used anachronistically to refer to Tibetans.
16 Peterson notes that despite the complete autonomy Wei enjoyed in running Jiannan West, he was a close ally of the court. See Charles A. Peterson, "The Restoration Completed: Emperor Hsien-tsung and the Provinces," in *Perspectives on the T'ang*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1973): 151–91; 157–58.
17 Nanzhao was originally populated by descendants of the Ailao 哀牢, an alternate kind of Wuman 烏蠻 (literally, Black Man or Black Barbarian). In their language, the word for king was *zhao*. See "Nanman zhuan" 南蠻傳, in *XTS*, 222.6267. For the expansion of the Nanzhao kingdom, see Wilfrid Stott, "The Expansion of the Nan-chao Kingdom: Between the Years A.D. 750–860 and the Causes That Lay behind It as Shewn in the T'ai-ho Inscription and the *Man Shu*," *T'oung Pao*, 2nd series, 50, fasc. 1/3 (1963): 190–220.

18 A variant of his name has *ge* 閣 written as *ge* 閣.
19 See Liao Deguang 廖德廣, *Nanzhao "Dehua bei" tanjiu* 南詔德化碑探究 (Kunming: Yunnan minzu chubanshe, 2006), 122–23.
20 See "Nanman zhuan," in *JTS*, 197.5280; "Nanman zhuan," in *XTS*, 222.6271.
21 See Guo Songnian 郭松年, Wang Shuwu 王叔武, coll. and ed.; Li Jing 李京, Wang Shuwu, coll. and ed., *Dali xingji jiaozhu, Yunnan zhilue jijiao* 大理行記 校注 雲南志略輯校 (Kunming: Yunnan minzu chubanshe, 1986), 74.
22 See "Nanman zhuan," in *JTS*, 197.5280–85.
23 See "Yang Guozhong zhuan" 楊國忠傳, in *JTS*, 106.3243.
24 See "Nanman zhuan," in *JTS*, 197.5280–85.
25 See Chen's analysis of "Manzi chao" in Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 209–10. For his detailed analysis, see Chen, *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao*, 132–48.
26 See Chen, *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao*, 147.
27 See Hou Linbo, "Nanzhao bianhuan" 南詔邊患, chapter six in *Tangdai yidi bianhuan shilue* 唐代夷狄邊患史略 (Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1972), 147–59. This source has 895 for the thirteenth year of Dazhong, which is inaccurate.
28 For Wei Gao's role in recruiting the various states in the southwestern area, see Charles Backus, *The Nan-chao Kingdom and T'ang China's Southwestern Frontier* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 90–100.
29 See "Shihuo zhi," in *JTS*, 48.2087–88 and "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS*, 52.1358.
30 *ZZTJ*, 236.7620.
31 See Megan Bryson, "Tsenpo Chung, Yunnan wang, Mahārāja: Royal Titles in Narratives of Nanzhao Kingship between Tibet and Tang China," *Cahiers d'Extrême-Asie* 24 (2015): 59–76; Bryson notes that the Tang court was a primary audience for the Dehua stele, and its portrayal of Geluofeng in some ways strategic (p. 64).
32 See Li, *Yunnan zhilue jijiao*, 77.
33 See Megan Bryson, "The Great Kingdom of Eternal Peace: Buddhist Kingship in Tenth-Century Dali," *Asia Major* 32, no. 1, Third Series (2019): 87–111.
34 For this argument, see Christian Daniels, "Nanzhao as a Southeast Asian Kingdom, c. 738–902," *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 52, no. 2 (June 2021): 188–213.
35 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.190.
36 For this interpretation, see Duan Tianshu 段天姝, "Bai Juyi 'Manzi chao' 'mosuo suyu shuang weiqie' xinjie" 白居易〈蠻子朝〉「摩挲俗羽雙隈伽」新解, *Chūgoku bungaku ronshū* 中国文学論集 51 (December 2022): 59–75.
37 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.729.
38 See "Dezong ji," in *JTS*, 13.377; *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.185–86.
39 *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.729–30.
40 See Peterson, "Court and Province in Mid- and Late T'ang," 500.
41 Officials from various circuits turned in tribute to help finance the war when Dezong first recovered the capital. This practice of sending in tribute continued and grew after the suppression of major rebels. The prefects competed in sending tribute to solidify their status. As noted above, Wei Gao presented tribute every day. Li Jian 李兼 (d. 791), the Imperial Commissioner and Surveillance Commissioner of Jiangxi 江西觀察使, presented tribute every month. See "Shihuo zhi," in *JTS*, 48.2087–88 and "Shihuo zhi," in *XTS*, 52.1358.
42 See "Dezong ji," in *JTS*, 12.320.
43 See James Legge, trans., *I Ching: Book of Changes* (New York: Gramercy Books, 1996), 59–60.

44 *Zhouyi zhengyi* 周易正義, annot. Wang Bi 王弼 (226–249), comm. Kong Yingda (Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 1999), 25–27. Translation revised from Legge, *I Ching: Book of Changes*, 214.
45 "Liang Huiwang shang" 梁惠王上, in *Mengzi zhushu*, 1b.4b, in *SSJZS*, vol. 8:22.
46 *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.185–86.
47 For the cultural and literary significance of the rhinoceros in Tang Dynasty, and translation and analysis of Yuan and Bai's "Xunxi," see Natasha Heller, "Why Has the Rhinoceros Come from the West?" *JAOS* 131, no. 3 (July–September 2011): 353–70.

9 Conclusion

This book offers the first comprehensive study of the twelve New Music Bureau poems by the influential poet-official Yuan Zhen in comparison with the response poems of his counterpart and good friend Bai Juyi. Its original contributions include teasing out the inner mechanism of Yuan's New Music Bureau poems, pointing out Yuan's use of the New Music Bureau poems as memorial, and explicating the significance of the different authorial intent, contents, and styles of Yuan and Bai's matched poems for the validity of the widely used term "New Music Bureau Movement."

"New Music Bureau Movement" versus Literary Experiment

Since the 1920s, the "New Music Bureau Movement" has been treated as a significant event in literary histories, with Bai Juyi typically identified as its representative. This idea that mid-Tang poets initiated a literary movement to create a new form of literature was first proposed by Hu Shi 胡適 (1891–1962) in his *Baihua wenxueshi* 白話文學史 (History of vernacular literature); the term "New Music Bureau Movement" is therefore often attributed to him. In fact, it was likely formulated by later scholars' tying of Hu's phrase "innovative literary movement" 文學改新運動 to his discussion of Yuan and Bai's Music Bureau poems. Hu praises Bai and Yuan highly for their ambition to use literature for real-world purposes, either to help improve governance or to express personal feelings.[1] Given that Hu's intellectual approach combined John Dewey's Pragmatism with the Confucian emphasis on managing state affairs and rejecting metaphysics, it is only natural that he valued New Music Bureau poems for their clear connection to the politics of the mid-Tang.[2] Hu's own commitment to rethinking Chinese culture and politics may also have influenced his impression of New Music Bureau poetry as part of a movement.

In the 1980s, studies that considered "movement" an inappropriate description began to appear,[3] and debate continues. One important factor is the scope of poems treated as New Music Bureau poems. When

DOI: 10.4324/9781003466482-9

"New Music Bureau poetry" is used as an umbrella term for all Music Bureau poems that comment on contemporary affairs, regardless of whether they have any resemblance to the pre-Tang Music Bureau titles in style, a much larger number of poets and compositions are included. Scholars who adopt this approach are more likely to believe in the existence of a movement. This is the case for Jian Changchun 蹇長春, who holds that there was a movement involving a significant group of poets.[4] When New Music Bureau poems are defined in the strictest sense, including only those of Li Shen, Yuan Zhen, and Bai Juyi, it becomes harder to argue for a movement, because the composition was confined to a small circle of friends, lasted for only a short period of time, and encompassed only a limited number of works.[5]

Definition, therefore, is key. But as Zhou Ming 周明 points out, agreeing on a unified definition is difficult. He also argues that the poems so identified bear no apparent differences from ancient-style poems; this alone challenges the legitimacy of "New Music Bureau Poetry" as a poetic genre, rendering the idea of a "movement" invalid.[6] As a remedy, Ge Xiaoyin proposed broad and narrow definitions of New Music Bureau poems. The former would include poems that use titles derived from the old ones, or those that use new titles but take after the form and content of earlier Music Bureau poetry. The latter recognizes only those within the broad definition that comment on contemporary affairs and adopt what Tang people considered to be new titles.[7] Chu Wo-Hsin, however, has pointed out the ineffectiveness of using either broad or narrow definitions to explain the discrepancies between the naming of New Music Bureau poetry and the poetry included under the category in Guo Maoqian's compilation.[8]

For literary activities to be treated as a movement, there should be a similar or even identical stylistic approach among the participants. B. Frank Sedwick described how such an identifiable, shared style emerges. An individual stylistic approach is imitated often enough to finally become recognizable and somewhat fixed; the resulting group stylistic approach becomes known as a school. In his opinion, style contains both "technique" (i.e., literary skills) and "attitude" (i.e., principles of writing); the choice of topic can also be a differentiating feature.[9]

With these defining features in mind, we find that the New Music Bureau poems of Yuan and Bai demonstrate similarities but also important differences. Although Yuan and Bai wrote on the same topics and shared the approach of realism, their techniques significantly differed. If even the original works fail to display a unified style, "movement" may not be a proper name for what the pair were attempting. Furthermore, although their general approach influenced later writers, the lack of followers in technique and topic precluded the formation of a school. Finally, "New Music Bureau Movement" itself is an anachronistic term.

Perhaps a more appropriate term to use would be "New Music Bureau Experiment." As mentioned in Chapter 1, the initiator was Li Shen, whose twenty New Music Bureau poems are no longer extant. Yuan and Bai's prefaces to their compositions show that they were trying to carry on the spirit of social criticism considered characteristic of Music Bureau poetry while breaking some conventions. In terms of their attitude toward writing, they shared the values of realism and social criticism. Realism concerns subject matter derived from contemporary affairs; social criticism involves comment on these affairs. A detailed examination of their prefaces and literary practices, however, reveals their different stylistic preferences and target readers. The nature of New Music Bureau poetry as an experiment is confirmed by their respective explanations of their writing principles and styles.

Yuan's preface is quite brief. In terms of subject matter, he chose to compose response poems to Li Shen for the most pressing contemporary affairs. In terms of language, he prioritized its political over its literary value and so adopted direct criticism. He held fast to this claim, and the affairs on which he commented all connect to state governance. They cover the inner court and the outer court, the literati and the military, and the local and the foreign. His sharp commentary is straight to the point, oftentimes being directed at previous emperors.

Bai's preface is more detailed and frequently quoted. He too declares that he wrote the poems not to showcase his literary skills but to provide a mirror for governance. He further notes that the content is factual, and the poems have the distinguishable features of clear intent, direct language, and irregular meter to encourage oral transmission. Two of his choices—the first line reveals the subject, and the last stanza reveals its aim—imitate the *Songs* to highlight the theme of each piece.[10]

This version of the preface, however, is subject to debate due to the fluidity of texts and the existence of other versions. Xie Siwei 謝思煒 proposes that the Kanda 神田 handwritten edition in Japan is closer to the primitive form of the series,[11] and that there was another line showing Bai had referenced "Gushi shijiu shou" in using the first line to highlight its subject. This line was edited out later, making it look like he followed only the *Songs*.[12]

Bai, like Yuan, was truthful in his claims about his approach. In terms of style, he uses unadorned and straightforward language with minimal historical and cultural allusions. Monologues and simple reported speech are common, making his use of oral language natural. His irregular meters and frequent changes of rhyme are reminiscent of folk songs. Each poem begins by repeating the title once or twice to highlight the subject. For titles with three characters, he tends to repeat it twice and follows it up with a seven-character line, creating

a 3-3-7 rhythm for a stanza. For titles with two characters, he tends to create a 2-2-3 rhythm within a line. The final stanzas articulate his social criticism. There are also titles that are summaries of the second to the fourth lines, but they are not included in the response poems discussed in this manuscript. In terms of subject matter, he comments on contemporary affairs that concern commoners, depicting their living conditions to reveal to higher authorities as well as to a broader audience the (in)effectiveness of rule.

While both Yuan and Bai choose the same word, *zhi* 直 (straightforward), to describe their use of language, each gives it a different meaning. Yuan describes his poems as "*ci zhi*" 詞直 (straightforward language). For him, straightforwardness refers to his direct criticism of former emperors; it was also intended to show later generations that Xianzong was sagacious and did not fear such directness.[13] Yuan's high-register language, heavily loaded with historical and literary allusions, posed no difficulty to understanding for his target readers, the emperor and his ministers; indeed, he might have wanted to impress them with his political insights and literary talent. Such complexity intensifies the meaning of the language and strengthens the criticism. It also creates a solemn tone, which is fitting for a high-level discussion of state politics.

Bai uses "*zhi er jing*" 質而徑 (plain and direct) to describe his rhetoric (*ci* 辭), noting that its purpose was to let his readers (見之者) understand his meanings right away. He then uses "*zhi er qie*" 直而切 (straightforward and sharp) to describe his usage of words (*yan* 言), noting that he wants his listeners (聞之者) to take his warnings to heart. He made sure that the affairs on which he commented could be confirmed as real phenomena, and so those who collected these works (采之者) would transmit his messages. He aimed for a wide circulation, hoping that his poems could be put to music and sung.[14] By picturing the lives of commoners, the poems act as a mirror of governance. They often present indirect criticism, especially when directed at the emperor. When Bai opts for direct criticism, he often aims it at officials. Unlike Yuan, however, he did not tailor his language to speak particularly to governing authorities.

Zuo Hanlin 左漢林 points out that Bai, in his position as Left Remonstrator and Hanlin Academician, might have intended to revive the early Tang system in which Officials of Customs collected songs circulating among the populace. This practice served as a means for rulers to learn how state policies were being received and how they should be shaped. As Bai's poems were meant to be sung, they might then be among the songs collected. But this wish did not come to fruition.[15]

Yuan and Bai's different goals and motivations were thus realized as two different styles within this new poetic genre. Shizunaga Takeshi has examined the major differences between poems composed by the two.

Taking "Faqu" as an example, he points out that their poems differ in rhyming patterns, in the use of allusions, and in their intent.[16]

This study has built off Shizunaga's insight, investigating all of Yuan's New Music Bureau poems and Bai's response poems and explicating in detail how each pair differs. It further proposes inner structure—both within a poem and between the poems—as a crucial element of Yuan's New Music Bureau poetry, as well as Yuan's employment of literary techniques to present these poems as memorials to the emperor and the chief ministers. Last, it examines the legacy of Yuan and Bai's New Music Bureau poems.

The Inner Structure of New Music Bureau Poems

Chen Yinke's comment that Yuan's poems display awkward incorporation of multiple themes into a single piece has long shaped their reception. Scholars often use "Shangyang baifaren" as an example. Chen disparaged this poem specifically for its lack of a centripetal theme, especially in comparison with Bai's more direct and focused poem.[17] Liao Meiyun also criticizes its abrupt shift of focus from the sad lot of palace women to the marriage of princesses.[18] Fan Shufen agrees that Yuan tends to incorporate various themes into one title, but she argues that this does not necessarily make his poems inferior.[19] This book has shown that there is a central theme that holds together these different themes, even if on the surface they appear unrelated. For the particular example of "Shangyang baifaren," we have argued that, far from being incoherent, Yuan's poem is actually a deliberate, two-pronged argument for the enfeoffment of princes.

Chen Yinke also commented that Yuan's series is diverse and lacks structure, in contrast to Bai's New Music Bureau poems. In his opinion, the fifty poems of Bai follow the order of the dynastic eras, and the themes also form a complete whole. Bai begins with the sagacious achievements of the founding emperors and the guiding spirit to be passed on, ending the series with his ambition to use New Music Bureau poems for the benefit of rule.[20]

Chen Chong 陳翀 further proposes that the fifty poems form an extended movement of a symphony that could be put to music and sung. He compares dozens of editions found in China and Japan to restore the original form of the text in 809, which, in Bai's own words, contained 9,252 characters. Chen suggests that the original form contained no titles, subtitles, or in-text annotations, and the poems were not individual pieces. Rather, they were published together, forming fifty full rounds of a tune. What is typically considered the first poem, "Qide wu," sets the foundation of the series, as it concerns the imperial dance, that is, the model of ceremonial dances performed to music. What is typically

considered the last poem, "Caishi guan" 採詩官 (Officials gathering poetry), concludes the movement with ceremonial music that contains social criticism.[21]

Scholars thus broadly agree that Bai's series has a clear structure, and they have devoted considerable energy to identifying its original form, internal logic, and political purpose. Yuan's New Music Bureau poems, however, have not received attention likewise following Chen Yinke's early dismissal of them. This study argues that Yuan's series also has a structure, and that music and ritual, both based in the virtue of benevolence, form its framework. It proposes that the poems can be divided into four sets, each with three poems.

The first set concerns musical instruments. Yuan first comments on the primitive pre-Han musical instrument of chime stones, then moves on to the larger instrument of the five-stringed lute that was imported from the north and was popular in his time. Then he ends with a foreign musical instrument presented as tribute from the south. This set thus covers musical instruments of the central plain, the north, and the south.

The second set deals with dances with accompaniments. He begins with the significance of dances to state music and the decline of this practice, then moves on to imported Tartar dances to music that replaced the ceremonial ones, ending with Tartar dances presented as tribute. Both sets of poems follow the same logical flow: The original music represents the ruling house, then foreign music is incorporated into the Tang imperial repertoire, and foreign music is presented as a form of tribute. Yuan thus aims to strengthen the position of Tang state music to be on par with that of the Western Zhou, the sagacious period that Confucius held in the highest regard. Doing so, the various subjects would be guided back to the right path.

The third set concerns the transgression of ritual. It begins with the imperial house failing to set a good example. It especially focuses on the enforced idleness of princes, who were not entrusted with power to safeguard the four quarters as the feudal lords of Western Zhou had been. He then moves on to criticize the border generals for failing to recover the territories lost to Tibetans; these generals only engaged in entertainment. He concludes with the various forms of transgression of duty and of proper relations he saw as rampant inside and outside of the palace. Yuan thus proposes that if the enfeoffment system was properly enacted, the emperor would have princes to safeguard his regions and not have to rely on military governors with foreign blood. Likewise, the feudal lords would do their best to protect the land they inherited without collecting excessive taxes. When the central government is strengthened and the ritual order is resumed, the court would also have the financial and military power to implement punishment on corrupt officials, thus restoring order and peace.

In the last set of poems, Yuan explores the true meaning of benevolence, which is the cornerstone of music and ritual. He uses the figure of a former frontier soldier to reinforce his idea that strengthening the state is the key to ensuring the well-being of commoners. He then moves on to discuss the importance of securing the well-being of the Tang people rather than seeking foreign tribute. He concludes with the crucial feature of a benevolent policy: to follow nature and let everyone assume their appropriate places.

This study suggests that Yuan's poems might follow an order different from that of the received editions. Unfortunately, we lack the many editions that exist for Bai's poems that might let us reconstruct the original text. The received editions of Yuan's compositions come from two sources. One source is referred to as the Shu 蜀 or the Jian 建 edition, printed in 1124 and titled *Yuan Weizhi wenji* 元微之文集 (Collected works of Yuan Weizhi). It was so named because the one who had it printed was Liu Lin 劉麟 (ca. 1124), a native of Jian'an 建安 county (in modern Fujian; "Min" was another name for the area). The other source is referred to as the Zhe or the Yue 越 edition, so named because the printing was done in Shaoxing 紹興 of Zhejiang 浙江 (Yue was another name for the area). Hong Gua 洪适 (1117–1184) had the Min edition reprinted and retitled as *Yuanshi Changqing ji* 元氏長慶集 (Collection of Yuan's compositions in the Changqing era) in 1168. The earliest editions extant are fragmented copies of the Shu and the Zhe editions from the Song dynasty. The earliest Shu edition extant is preserved in China and is now published under the title *Xinkan Yuan Weizhi wenji* 新刊元微之文集 (Newly printed collection of Yuan Weizhi's compositions). The New Music Bureau poems are included in this fragmented copy. The earliest Zhe edition extant was preserved in Japan, and the photographic images are provided in *Gen Shin kenkyū* 元稹研究 (A study of Yuan Zhen). The nine *juan* preserved are *juan* 40 to 48; all of them are imperial documents.[22] Fortunately, there are several editions from the Ming dynasty extant that were based on the Zhe edition.[23] The orders of the New Music Bureau poems are the same for these two sources. Below is a table showing the order of Yuan's New Music Bureau Poetry in the Shu and the Zhe editions and the proposed order in this manuscript:

	Order of Shu and Zhe editions	*Proposed order in this manuscript*
1.	"Shangyang baifaren"	"Huayuan qing"
2.	"Huayuan qing"	"Wuxian tan"
3.	"Wuxian tan"	"Piaoguo yue"
4.	"Xiliang ji"	"Faqu"
5.	"Faqu"	"Libu ji"
6.	"Xunxi"	"Huxuan nü"
7.	"Libu ji"	"Shangyang baifaren"

8.	"Piaoguo yue"	"Xiliang ji"
9.	"Huxuan nü"	"Yinshan dao"
10.	"Manzi chao"	"Fu Rongren"
11.	"Fu Rongren"	"Manzi chao"
12.	"Yinshan dao"	"Xunxi"

The current order of Yuan's poems does not match the response poems of Bai. Chen Yinke speculated that the order of Yuan might have been the order of Li Shen, but again, there is no means for us to verify this claim.[24] It is unclear whether the order of the received editions has been shuffled around, thus causing the poems to be jumbled together without clearly showing the connection in between. What is certain is that Yuan's compilation has suffered great loss in the process of circulation. Although Yuan personally compiled his own works up to eight times, none of these versions survived.[25] The comprehensive collection of his works, *Yuanshi Changqingji*, should contain a total of one hundred *juan*,[26] but only sixty *juan* remain. Since the Zhe edition was also based on the Shu edition of the Song dynasty, and the Shu edition only contained 60 *juan* rather than 100 *juan*, problems associated with textual transmission are expected. The problems of transmission were even more severe in the Tang era, when oral transmission and copied texts played a crucial role in manuscript production, and alterations to the original texts are highly likely.[27]

In 812, approximately three years after he composed the New Music Bureau poems, Yuan put together some eight hundred poems he had written since the age of sixteen to fulfill the wish of Li Jingjian 李景儉 (fl. 799–821),[28] a close friend who was also serving in Jiangling during Yuan's exile from the capital. In this edition, Yuan divided his poetry into *shiti* 十體 (ten poetic genres) and wrote an introduction to all ten in the preface. In it he says, "Those whose words follow the tradition of Music Bureau poetry, yet are confined to depicting and describing objects and scenery, are called New Music Bureau poetry" 詞實樂流, 而止於模象物色者, 為新題樂府.

As discussed in Chapter 2 and shown by the analysis presented throughout, this definition does not apply to the twelve New Music Bureau poems examined here. Something—perhaps his political fall—made Yuan change his mind about what should constitute New Music Bureau poetry. Moreover, since this 812 compilation is no longer extant, it is unclear whether the New Music Bureau poems collected by Yuan in it are the same as the ones in the extant edition. Nor do we know whether Yuan's poems could be put to music and sung like Bai's poems could, but the irregular tonal patterns and the mixing in of lines of different lengths may have made them somewhat easier to be sung. Nonetheless, so far there is no evidence to show that the works of either poet were ever actually put to music and sung. What we can

be sure of, however, is that Bai's poems had a much wider circulation, as sixteen of his New Music Bureau poems are found in the Dunhuang manuscripts.[29]

Yuan's New Music Bureau Poetry as Memorials

Yuan was about thirty years old by Chinese count when he composed his New Music Bureau poems. Thirty was a significant age for a traditional literatus, by which one should already have established oneself.[30] As a descendant of the Northern Wei 魏 (386–551) royal family, it would be natural for Yuan to have a strong desire to obtain a prominent position and exert political influence.

This study supports Shizunaga's argument that Yuan wrote his New Music Bureau poems to recommend himself to those in power, and it argues further that his poems served much like memorials to the throne. He was demonstrating his ability to be a court official, one who has the wisdom to identify the underlying causes of contemporary issues, the vision to create a stronger and more civilized state, and the courage to speak up for the general good. These qualities were what Chief Minister Pei Ji valued, and Pei is believed to be the one who promoted Yuan after he finished his mourning period.

Yuan's New Music Bureau poems present his advice on various aspects of state politics. Many of them are narrated from his perspective. He either refers to himself as *chen* 臣 (your subject) or *wo* 我 (I). The kind of direct criticism and advice given is like that found in a memorial, as is the format of writing.[31] Yuan's memorials often began with what he had heard ("*chen wen*" 臣聞, your subject heard) or seen ("*fujian*" 伏見, humbly see), after which he would introduce the proper way of governance and contrast it with the actual contemporary situation. He would then elaborate on that situation, argue for his points, and present advice to implement change. In the conclusion, when the issues concerned were particularly grave, he would declare that he "dared present his advice at the risk of death" (*maomei shusi* 冒昧殊死) simply to repay the emperor for deigning to read his poem. He would end by expressing his wish using *yuan* 願 (to hope/to implore) to urge the emperor to follow his advice.

His poems follow similar patterns, but with more variation to cater to aesthetic needs. Both "Faqu" and "Xiliang ji" begin with *wu wen* 吾聞 (I heard), while "Yinshan dao" uses *chen wen* when he presents his view directly to the emperor. To create variety, the other poems simply begin by describing the phenomena on which he was about to comment. Whereas "Huayuan qing" uses *yuan* at the end to offer Yuan's opinion, the other poems follow the tradition of Music Bureau poems, ending with questions or statements to bring out his advice or criticisms.

This resemblance to a memorial is most prominent in "Yinshan dao," most of which is a memorial in poetic form. He frequently refers to himself as *chen* 臣 (your subject), a humble type of self-address that by the Tang had become restricted solely to speaking to the emperor, as opposed to Han and pre-Han times when it was used more broadly.[32] Yuan also employs other forms of self-address, *wo* 我 and *wu* 吾, in places where he is not speaking directly to the emperor. In such cases, his target readers were both the emperor and his ministers. Had the target reader of these pieces solely been the chief minister Pei Ji, Yuan would not have called himself *chen* in the monologues. He would have used either his own name, Zhen 稹, or *mou* 某 (unspecified pronoun; so-and-so) as a humble self-reference. Examples of such uses can be found in "Shang Mengxia Pei Xianggong shu" 上門下裴相公書 (Letter to Chief Minister Pei of the Chancellery) that he wrote in 818 to seek Chief Minister Pei Du's patronage and in "Shang Linghu Xianggong shi qi" 上令狐相公詩啟 (Letter presenting poetry to Chief Minister Linghu) that he composed in 819 in hopes of obtaining Chief Minister Linghu Chu's recommendation to court.[33] Liao Meiyun considers Yuan's use of self-address in the pattern of "narration-argumentation" dull and flat in style,[34] but in fact it mimics the style of a memorial to present his advice directly to those higher up.

Another clear example is "Shangyang baifaren." Here Yuan incorporates into a single poem the three issues on which he had memorialized Xianzong in 806, when Yuan served as Left Remonstrator and presented "Xianshi biao" 獻事表 (Memorial on contemporary issues): releasing palace women to ease drought,[35] enfeoffing princes with hereditary posts to stabilize the empire, and marrying off princesses in obedience to Heaven's law.[36] In "Lun jiaoben shu," a letter to the emperor that he composed after he was appointed Left Remonstrator, he stresses the basic education of princes in music and rites, and proposes that they could then be enfeoffed to regions outside the capital to protect the central government.[37] In the poem, he uses *heru* 何如 (how about) to present his suggestion to let the ladies marry and the gentlemen assume duties. It is unclear whether Yuan's advice had any effect, but in 811, approximately two years after the composition of "Shangyang baifaren," Xianzong authorized the Chief Minister of the Court of the Imperial Clan to select candidates from prestigious clans as possible matches for princesses in the sixteen residences, who were then enfeoffed as District Princesses.[38] The fact that Yuan's concerns and advice primarily lie with state politics, as well as the high register of the language throughout the poems, all suggest that his intended audience were those with significant power at court: people who made a difference in state governance and who could promote him and give him a chance to realize his political goals.

When Bai composed his response poem "Shangyang baifaren" in 809, he was a Left Remonstrator and Hanlin Academician. At this time, he presented a memorial to Xianzong proposing that unwanted palace women should be released for reasons both of humanity and economy: Their lives were being wasted, and the expenditures on their behalf were exorbitant.[39] Xianzong released them that year, just as Bai had proposed.[40] Like Yuan, Bai made his appeal in both memorial and poetic form. Bai, however, continued the tradition of revealing the lives of commoners instead of voicing his advice directly. In line with this approach, he chose simple diction with few allusions to attract a wide audience. Paul R. Goldin notes that Bai composed New Music Bureau poems and circulated them among the populace when a problem arose that was too sensitive to be treated with a memorial to the emperor. They were informal satires or criticisms that Bai wrote in addition to his official memorials as Remonstrator.[41]

While Yuan's series concerns music, ritual, and benevolence, music is given the greatest weight. There are several possible reasons for this choice. On the one hand, Music Bureau poems were originally meant to be put to music, and it is thus normal to focus more on the discussion of music. On the other hand, the Han "Music Bureau poems" were played at ritual ceremonies; some of them celebrate the achievements of the emperor. Yuan might have wanted to create poems of equal value for his own era; he sang praises of the sages and of former wise emperors as a contrast to the more recent and problematic rulers, Xuanzong and Dezong.

Yuan's call for reviving the ethical and political order of the Western Zhou was part of the intellectual and artistic ferment of the mid- to late Tang, which many see as the beginning of the "Tang-Song transition." Soejima Ichiro 副島一郎 has argued that the mid-Tang saw a movement of the Confucian literati away from rites, which had once been considered as a governing principle of heaven and specified by the *Yi li* 儀禮 (Book of Etiquette and Ceremonial). Instead they stressed *renyi* 仁義 (benevolence and righteousness) as moral principles, and this again differed from the filial piety that was manifest in the strict observation of funeral rites during and before the Six Dynasties.[42] Yuan stands apart from this trend. He adheres to a pre-Qin Confucianism that emphasizes the transforming power of music and rites and acknowledges the role of benevolence underlying them. The composition of this series was an attempt to rekindle these ideals and restore that moral system and its expression in governance.

This belief of Yuan is manifest in "Caishi jianmao mingyu tiyong ce" 才識兼茂明於體用策 (Policy demonstrating excellence in talent and insight and perceptivity in its essence and application), his answer to a civil-examination question in 806. He proposes that the way to promote music and ritual was to cease military operations by increasing civil power. In his opinion, when the emperor governs with sincerity and trustworthiness,

his subjects will follow his example and become loyal and filial; when the emperor governs with humility and deference, rivalries will end and the foreign tribes will be brought into harmony.[43] Yuan's New Music Bureau poetry presents similar political advice to the emperor, fulfilling a function that was normally provided through the genre of memorials, and added to it aesthetic value by using a poetic form.

The Legacy of the New Music Bureau Experiment

The New Music Bureau poems are today acclaimed for both their cultural and historical value, as they provide a wealth of information on the music of the Tang and pre-Tang periods, including details of ceremonial music, popular music, and foreign music.[44] In Tang times, at least to Yuan and Bai, their political value was more important. In terms of literary accomplishment, Bai's poems illustrate what Chen Yinke considered to be the anticipation of the ancient-style prose promoted by Han Yu and Liu Zongyuan. He argues further that Bai successfully refined the popular folk ballads of his time.[45]

A detailed examination of the prosody of Yuan and Bai's poems shows that they indeed moved away from the rigid tonal patterns adopted by parallel prose and regulated verse, going so far as the extreme case where one line only contains level tones (see Table A.11, Bai's stanza 3, line 7; Table A.12, Bai's stanza 1, line 1). There are lines that consist mainly of level or oblique tones, or where the alternation of tones barely occurs even in cases when both types of tones were relatively even in their use. They also use near-rhyme, sometimes even of different tones (limited to rising and falling tones), although this case is rare in Yuan's and more common in Bai's poems (see Appendix for Yuan and Bai's prosody). Hanabusa Hideki 花房英樹 and Maegawa Yukio 前川幸雄 note that Yuan's "Huayuan qing," "Huxuan nü," and "Shangyang baifaren" cross the rhyme categories specified in the *Guangyun*, but do comply with the rules for ancient-style verse.[46] Bai Xue 柏雪 and Yang Huaiyuan 楊懷源 note that using words from the rising-tone and falling-tone categories to rhyme was an acceptable practice for ancient-style poetry in the Tang dynasty.[47] Lastly, both poets do not avoid the use of three level tones at the end of a line, a tonal pattern that is a taboo in a regulated verse for its monotonous rhythm.

Yuan and Bai's focus on contemporary affairs encouraged other Tang literati to continue this practice. All these poems were treated as "Music Bureau poems on current affairs" 即事類樂府 and inspired similar compositions all the way through the Yuan 元 dynasty (1260–1368), until it was more or less supplanted by the "ballad type" 歌行類.[48] The representative among the late Tang poets for "Music Bureau poems on current affairs"

was Pi Rixiu 皮日休 (ca. 834–883), but he did not follow Yuan and Bai in writing heptasyllabic verse. Rather, he used pentasyllabic verse for his Music Bureau poems, creating such series as the ten pieces of "Zheng Yuefu" 正樂府 (The orthodox Music Bureau poems).[49] The "Music Bureau poems on current affairs" composed from the Song through the Qing dynasties were all in a pentasyllabic verse that bore no difference from pentasyllabic ancient-style poems in form.[50]

Yuan and Bai's New Music Bureau poetry also brought changes to the literary world of late ninth-century Japan. Hasebe Tsuyoshi 長谷部剛 points out that the practice of creating new titles for Music Bureau poems rather than writing on the old titles can be demonstrated by the work of Sugawara no Michizane 菅原道真 (845–903). Sugawara created new titles either by following the format of the old ones, or by taking reference from the New Music Bureau poems. The most representative one is his "Luyu baitouweng" 路遇白頭翁 (Running into a white-haired oldster), which is clearly inspired by "Xinfeng zhebiweng" 新豐折臂翁 (The oldster of Xinfeng with a broken arm), one of Bai's fifty New Music Bureau poems that is not discussed in this manuscript.[51] Historically, Sugawara no Michizane was an esteemed poet, and he is now revered as the god of learning in Shinto.

Yuan's New Music Bureau poems also influenced the composition of heptasyllabic ancient-style poetry. According to Wang Li 王力, before the mid-Tang, heptasyllabic ancient-style poetry seldom used the same rhyme throughout. The exceptions are the Bailiang style 柏梁體, heptasyllabic linking verse that rhymes every line, and some poems of Du Fu. It was only after Han Yu that the use of the same rhyme became popular. These heptasyllabic, ancient-style poems fail to distinguish themselves from regulated verse if their prosody is also subject to the influence of the latter.[52] Yuan's New Music Bureau poems contributed to this change in which non-regulated heptasyllabic verse began to employ the same rhyme throughout. Moreover, his poems are distinct from ancient-style poems of Tang times that are subject to the influence of the prosody of regulated verse. The prosody of his poems greatly diverges from the alternation between level and oblique tones required for regulated verse.

In terms of content, Yuan's attention to realism and his strong sense of reasoning find their match in the heptasyllabic regulated verse of his Yuanhe-style poetry.[53] Yuan's direct criticism of the emperor, his presentation of advice, and his advocation of Confucian ways of governance also found followers in the composition of pentasyllabic ancient-style poetry in the late Tang. These poems of the late Tang also excel at argumentation and narration; such literary technique is said to have been inherited from Du Fu and Bai Juyi,[54] but Yuan's poems also demonstrate it. The poets subject to Yuan and Bai's influence include Cao Ye 曹鄴 (ca. 816–875), Liu Jia

劉駕 (b. 822), Nie Yizhong 聶夷中 (b. 827), Yu Fen 于濆 (fl. 861), Shao Ye 邵謁 (fl. 866), and Su Zheng 蘇拯 (fl. 898); they might also have imitated Meng Jiao 孟郊 (751–814), who specialized in pentasyllabic ancient-style poetry.[55]

While Yuan and Bai's collective effort to use new titles to comment on contemporary affairs impacted later literati in various ways, Bai's writing was undoubtedly more influential. Bai's New Music Bureau poems were particularly welcomed in Japan. According to Wen Yanrong 文豔蓉, they were recited, and their meanings explored and debated in the palace activities performed after offering sacrifices to Confucius. The topics Bai commented on were also used for *waka* 和歌, a type of Japanese poetry. *Monogatari* 物語, a Japanese epic narrative genre that includes such famous works as *Genji Monogatari* 源氏物語 (*The Tale of Genji*), also adapted many of his poetic lines. [56]

Since Yuan employs erudite language and argues for better state policies, reasoning at times compromises aesthetics. Hu Zhenheng 胡震亨 (1569–1645) points out that when Music Bureau poetry is composed for argumentation, it embarks on an "uncanny path" 鬼道.[57] Although Yuan's New Music Bureau poems are hardly straight argumentation, he was constantly trying to persuade the emperor or the ministers into adopting his advice by laying out evidence and presenting his view. His poetry carries a very specific goal, making it harder to strike a chord among readers less concerned with state politics or less thoroughly educated in classical language and literature. Indeed, both Yuan and Bai considered their poetry to be too incisive and argumentative, and felt that it came across as too sharp and wordy.[58]

Yuan's attempt to use Music Bureau poetry, a genre widely praised for incorporating "folk song" elements and for presenting indirect criticism of state politics, as a form of memorial also changes the very nature of the genre. Since Music Bureau songs were often put to music and performed with accompanying dances, dialogues or monologues speaking in the persona of commoners are common for plot development.[59] But in Yuan's poems, such elements are few. The only two that demonstrate such features are "Shangyang baifaren" and "Fu Rongren." Although "Yinshan dao" also contains a monologue, he uses it to present his memorial in a poetic form; there is no plot but simply argument and advice. The prosodic design of his poems, which is somewhere between heptasyllabic ancient-style verse and regulated verse, also makes its positioning difficult. As Xue Xue 薛雪 (1681–1770) commented, "Music Bureau poems should be put to music, and the rhymes should change every several lines or four lines; only then would one feel it is smooth and appealing" 樂府宜被管弦, 或數句或四句一轉, 始覺宛轉有致.[60] Yuan's poems, however, do not adopt this change of rhyme.

Perhaps it is for this reason that the heptasyllabic ballads of Music Bureau poetry, which are referred to as New Music Bureau poems by some who define the genre broadly, gave way to pentasyllabic ancient-style verse, as well as pentasyllabic and heptasyllabic regulated verse.[61] Even Yuan himself reverted to writing Music Bureau poems with what he called "ancient titles" 古題 in 817, in response to works by Liu Meng 劉猛 (fl. 817) and Li Yu 李餘 (fl. 817) that he considered innovative in meaning and language.[62]

Liu Xuezhong 劉學忠 proposes that one reason for the decline of the New Music Bureau poems is that they served mainly political purposes rather than literary ones; another reason is that there was no target genre that they aimed to challenge or replace. This was unlike the far more successful ancient-style prose that attended to both political and literary goals and challenged the popular genre of parallel prose. With the rise of lyric in the late Tang and its flourishing in the Song, literati turned from social criticism to more personal poetry. Moreover, the function of poetry to reveal the lives of commoners may have become less significant from the Song dynasty as information travelled much faster with better printing and transportation.[63] Although New Music Bureau poetry ceased to be a significant genre after the Tang, composition in this style remained active until the Qing dynasty. There were poets who wrote on the old titles or created their own titles to comment on social affairs. By Qing times, compositions on the title of "Zhuzhi ci" 竹枝詞 (The bamboo song) were particularly numerous, reaching over 23,000.[64]

The composition of New Music Bureau poems represented a serious attempt by mid-Tang poets to rework a poetic genre that had been literarily significant for centuries. It marked a new point in genre development. Moreover, the poems present valuable information on the social, political, and literary situations of the mid-Tang. Examining this conscious literary experiment allows us to better comprehend how mid-Tang writers rethought the role and value of literature and of literati themselves in creating a properly governed polity.

Notes

1 See Hu Shi, Chapter 16, "Yuan Zhen Bai Juyi," in *Baihua wenxueshi* 白話文學史 (1999; Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2009), 250–82; Jian Changchun 蹇長春, "Xin Yuefu shipai yu Xin Yuefu yundong—Guanyu Bai Juyi pingjia de yige wenti" 新樂府詩派與新樂府運動——關於白居易評價的一個問題, *Xibei shida xuebao* 西北師大學報, no. 4 (1986): 30–44; page 30.

2 On how Confucian ideas influenced Hu's reception of Pragmatism, see Zhang Yunyi 張允熠, "Hu Shi Shiyong zhuyi sixiang zhong de Ruxue qingjie" 胡適實用主義思想中的儒學情結, *Ershiyi shiji shuang yuekan* 二十一世紀雙月刊 45 (February 1998): 117–25.

3 For a brief review of the scholarly output on this topic, see Wong Yiu Kwan 黃耀堃, "Yinyue yu fengci: Xin Yuefu kao (qiyi)" 音樂與諷刺：新樂府考（其一), in *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu* 唐代文學研究, vol. 5, ed. Fu Xuancong 傅璇琮 and Zhou Zuzhuan 周祖譔 (Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 1994), 630–42.
4 See Jian, "Xin Yuefu shipai yu Xin Yuefu yundong," 30–44.
5 See Su Feng 宿豐, "Yetan 'Xinyuefu' yundong" 也談新樂府運動, *Dandong shizhuan xuebao* 丹東師專學報, no. 4 (1996): 50–51. Chen Caizhi 陳才智 argues that New Music Bureau poetry includes those named as such by Yuan and Bai, as well as some poems written under the ancient-style titles of Music Bureau poems that comment on contemporary affairs. See Chen Caizhi, "Xin Yuefu mingyi bianxi" 新樂府名義辨析, *Nanyang shifan xueyuan xuebao* 南陽師範學院學報 3, no. 7 (July 2004): 12–16.
6 Zhou Ming 周明, "Lun Tangdai wu Xin Yuefu yundong" 論唐代無新樂府運動, *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu* 唐代文学研究, vol. 2 (Guilin: Guangxi shida chubanshe, 1990), 35–40.
7 See Ge Xiaoyin, "Xin Yuefu de yuanqi he jieding" 新樂府的緣起和界定, *Zhongguo shehui kexue* 中國社會科學, no. 3 (1993): 161–73; Ge Xiaoyin, "Xin Yuefu de yuanqi he jieding," in *Shiguo gaochao yu sheng Tang wenhua*, 178–96.
8 See Chu, *Zhongguo shige fengyu chuantong*, 303.
9 See B. Frank Sedwick, "The Literary Movements Defined," *Hispania* 37, no. 4 (December 1954): 466–71; pages 466–67.
10 See "Xin Yuefu bingxu" 新樂府並序, in *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.136.
11 The Kanda edition was handwritten by Fujiwara no Mochiakira 藤原茂明 (born ca. 1093) in 1107. The poems, annotations, and comment notes all provide readers with a glimpse of the earlier version of Bai's texts. See Wen Yanrong 文豔蓉, "*Xin Yuefu* zai Riben de liuchuan yu shourong" 《新樂府》在日本的流傳與受容, in *Yuefuxue* 樂府學, vol. 17, ed. Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2017), 103–104.
12 Xie Siwei 謝思煒, "*Xin Yuefu* banben ji xuwen kaozheng" 《新樂府》版本及序文考證, *Beijing shifan daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 北京師範大學學報(社會科學版), no. 3 (1996): 67–74, 107.
13 See "He Li Jiaoshu xinti Yuefu shi'er shou bingxu" 和李校書新題樂府十二首並序, in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:24.717–18.
14 See "Xin Yuefu bingxu," in *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:3.136.
15 See Zuo Hanlin 左漢林, "Tangdai caishi zhidu ji qi yu Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu chuangzuo de guanxi" 唐代採詩制度及其與元白新樂府創作的關係, *Shandong daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 山東大學學報（哲學社會科學版), no. 6 (2006): 47–52.
16 See Shizunaga, *Haku Kyo'i "fūyushi" no kenkyū*, 115–45.
17 See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 126–31.
18 See Liao, *Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu yanjiu*, 194.
19 See Fan, *Yuan Zhen ji qi Yuefushi yanjiu*, 199–207.
20 Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 131.
21 Chen Chong, "Bai Juyi Yuanhe sinian zuo *Xin Yuefu* zhi geci xingtai ji qi suoyong yuequ kao" 白居易元和四年作《新樂府》之歌辭形態及其所用樂曲考, *Biaoxian jishu yanjiu* 表現技術研究 17 (March 2022): 45–58.
22 Hanabusa and Maegawa, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 81–120.
23 For a detailed study of these editions, see Zhou Xianglu 周相錄, "*Yuanshi Changqingji* banben yuanliukao" 《元氏長慶集》版本源流考, in *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu*

(di 12 ji) 唐代文學研究（第12輯）, compiled by Zhongguo Tangdai wenxue xuehui 中國唐代文學學會 (Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 2008), 649–57.

24 Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 131.

25 Wu Weibin 吳偉斌, "Lun Liuben *Yuanshi Changqingji* zhi gongxian yu quehan" 論劉本《元氏長慶集》之貢獻與缺憾, *Liaocheng daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 聊城大學學報（社會科學版), no. 2 (2014): 16–23.

26 "Yuan Zhen zhuan," in *JTS*, 166.4336.

27 For a study of manuscript production and the reliability of hand-copied texts of Tang poetry, covering the various means by which the text might be altered and living examples of this phenomena using firsthand information from Dunhuang manuscripts, see Christopher M. B. Nugent, *Manifest in Words, Written on Paper: Producing and Circulating Poetry in Tang Dynasty China* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2010).

28 Li passed the *jinshi* examination in 799. He first served as an assistant to Wei Xiaqing 韋夏卿 (743–806), the father-in-law of Yuan Zhen, who was the Official in Charge of Guarding the East Capital in the Absence of the Emperor. Later, he became a Supervising Censor through the recommendation of Dou Qun 竇羣 (760–814). Because of his connection with Dou, he was demoted to Service of Finances in Jiangling after Dou lost power; he was eventually appointed Prefect of Zhongzhou 忠州 (in modern Chongqing). See "Li Jingjian zhuan" 李景儉傳, in *JTS*, 171.4455.

29 See Huang, *Dunhuang de Tangshi*, 138–72.

30 Confucius notes that he had established himself as a cultured person when he reached thirty. See "Wei zheng" 為政, in *Lunyu zhushu*, 2.2a, in *SSJZS*, 16. It was common for literati to model themselves after Confucius.

31 For the genre characteristics of memorials, see notes #62 and #63 in James R. Hightower, "The Wen Hsüan and Genre Theory," *HJAS* 20, no. 3/4 (December 1957), 512–33; page 525.

32 See Zhang Hao 張淏 (fl. 1195), *Yungu zaji* 雲谷雜記 (Zhengzhou: Daxiang chubanshe, 2019), 2.236.

33 See Yuan, "Shang Mengxia Pei Xianggong shu," in *YZJJZ*, 2:31.874–77 and his "Shang Linghu Xianggong shi qi," in the addendum of *YZJJZ*, vol. 3:2.1450–51.

34 See Liao, *Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu yanjiu*, 190.

35 In pre-modern China, natural disasters were believed to be punishments sent by Heaven for improper governance on earth, and merit on the part of the ruler could relieve them. In late 805, soon after Xianzong ascended the throne and before he changed the reign year to Yuanhe, various areas began to suffer from drought. See "Shunzong, Xianzong ji" 順宗憲宗紀, in *JTS*, 14.413.

36 See *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:32.895.

37 Yuan, "Lun jiaoben shu," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:29.839–42.

38 See "Shunzong, Xianzong ji," in *JTS*, 14.438.

39 See "Zou qing jia deyin zhong jiemu erjian" 奏請加德音中節目二件, in *BJYJJJ*, vol.5:58.3340.

40 See *ZZTJ*, 237.7657; "Bai Juyi zhuan," in *XTS*, 119.4300.

41 See Goldin, "Reading Po Chü-i," 60–61.

42 See Soejima Ichiro 副島一郎, "Cong 'liyue' dao 'renyi'—Zhong Tang Ruxue de yanbian quxiang" 從「禮樂」到「仁義」——中唐儒學的演變趨向, *Xueshu yuekan* 學術月刊, no. 2 (1999): 66–73.

43 Yuan, "Caishi jianmao mingyu tiyong ce," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:28.818–26.

44 Shen Ling 沈聆, "*Xin Yuefu* shi zhong de yinyue shiliao"《新樂府》詩中的音樂史料, *Luoyang shifan xueyuan xuebao* 洛陽師範學院學報, no. 3 (2006): 170–72.
45 See Chen, *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao*, 125.
46 See Hanabusa and Maegawa, *Gen Shin kenkyū*, 277.
47 See Bai Xue and Yang Huaiyuan, "Shige yongyun zhong 'shangqu tongya' xianxiang yanjiu—Yi Tangdai Guanzhong shige yongyun wei li" 詩歌用韻中「上去通押」現象研究——以唐代關中詩歌用韻為例, *Chengdu shifan xueyuan xuebao* 32 (2016), no. 1: 60–64.
48 See Wang Huibin 王輝斌, "Xinti Yuefu de xingsheng yu xiaoxie—Dui you Tang er Qing qiannian Xin Yuefu de guanzhao" 新題樂府的興盛與消歇——對由唐而清千年新樂府的觀照, *Zhonghua wenhua luntan* 中華文化論壇, no. 3 (2019): 65–72, 156.
49 See Chu, *Zhongguo shige fengyu chuantong*, 402–405. For the social criticism in Pi Rixiu's 皮日休 (ca. 834–883) "Zheng Yuefu" series, see Matsuda Kiyohide, *Gafu no rekishiteki kenkyū* 樂府の歷史的研究 (Tokyo: Sōbunsha, 1975), 407–30. For a comprehensive study of Pi, covering his prose and poems and his contributions to Neo-Confucianism, see William H. Nienhauser, Jr., *P'i Jih-hsiu* (Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1979).
50 See Wang Huibin, *Tanghou Yuefu shishi* 唐後樂府詩史 (Hefei: Huangshan shushe, 2010), 35.
51 See Hasebe Tsuyoshi, "Gudai Riben Yuefushi guankui" 古代日本樂府詩管窺, in *Yuefuxue* 樂府學, vol. 17, ed. Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2018), 90–91.
52 See Wang Li, *Hanyu shilüxue* 漢語詩律學, 2nd ed. (2005; Shanghai: Shanghai shiji chuban jituan and Shanghai jiaoyu chubanshe, 2007), 353.
53 The New Music Bureau poems are not written in the form of regulated verse, but they carry the same feature of Yuanhe-style poetry in using poetry to present an argument. See Liu Ning 劉寧, *Tang Song zhi ji shige yanbian yanjiu* 唐宋之際詩歌演變研究 (Beijing: Beijing shifan daxue chubanshe, 2002), 3–18.
54 Song Erkang 宋爾康, "Wan Tang wuyan gushi dui zhong Tang Xin Yuefu yundong de jicheng he fazhan" 晚唐五言古詩對中唐新樂府運動的繼承和發展, *Henan shifan daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 河南師範大學學報(哲學社會科學版) 30, no. 4 (2003): 62–64.
55 See Hu Zhenheng, *Tangyin guiqian* 唐音癸籤 (Shanghai: Gudian wenxue chubanshe, 1957), 8.65.
56 See Wen, "*Xin Yuefushi* zai Riben de liuchuan yu shourong," 103–104.
57 Hu, *Tangyin guiqian*, 3.15.
58 See "He dashi shishou bingxu" 和答詩十首並序, in *BJYJJJ*, vol. 1:2.105.
59 For this feature concerning plot development with the inclusion of dialogues or monologues, see Wu, *Yuefuxue gailun*, 88.
60 See Xue Xue, *Yipiao shihua* 一瓢詩話, in *Qing shihua* 清詩話, ed. Wang Fuzhi 王夫之 (1619–1692) et al., 2 vols. (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1978), vol. 2:691.
61 See Chu, *Zhongguo shige fengyu chuantong*, 402–405.
62 Yuan, "Yuefu you xu," in *YZJJZ*, vol. 2:23.674. Xue Tianwei 薛天緯 treated eight of these poems as New Music Bureau poetry based on Guo Maoqian's classification. See Xue Tianwei, *Tangdai gexinglun* 唐代歌行論 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2006), 310–17. A detailed examination of this set

would reveal that they are significantly different from the twelve New Music Bureau poems discussed in this manuscript.

63 Liu Xuezhong 劉學忠, "'Xin Yuefu yundong' bian" 「新樂府運動」辨, *Hengyang shizhuan xuebao (shehui kexue)* 衡陽師專學報（社會科學）16 (April 1995): 18–22.

64 See Wang, *Tanghou Yuefu shishi*, 313–85. "Zhuzhi ci" was originally a folk song in the Sichuan area during the mid-Tang.

Appendix
Prosody of New Music Bureau Poetry

The symbols below follow David Branner, using the white circle ○ to signal a level tone and the black circle ● to signal the oblique tone.[1] For clarity, this appendix provides the original Chinese without giving the pinyin. Since the Tang pronunciation of these words was not the same as the modern language, only the rhyme categories in Chinese based on the *Guangyun* are provided.

Yuan often used words from the same rhyme category and its near rhymes within a poem. Bai, however, frequently changed rhymes within a poem. It is also common for him to use a near-rhyme within the same stanza or near-rhymes across different stanzas. In the case that near-rhymes are used across different stanzas, it is necessary to denote which rhyme word is a near-rhyme of which. Near-rhymes are rhyme categories adjacent to each other in the *Guangyun*. They belong to the same tone category. There are rare cases where near-rhymes are actually from different tone categories, but such cases only occur between rising and falling tones. When a poem that uses primarily words from the rising tone category has a near-rhyme from the falling tone category, the tone category of the near-rhyme would be specified in the table, and vice versa. (Tables A.1–A12).

Table A.1 Prosody of "Huayuan qing"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	泗濱浮石裁為磬	徑	華原磬	徑
	●○○●○○●		○○●	
	古樂疏音少人聽	徑	華原磬	徑
	●●○○●○●		○○●	
			古人不聽今人聽	徑
			●○●●○○●	
2	工師小賤牙曠稀		泗濱石	昔
	○○●●○●○	勁	●○●	
	不辨邪聲嫌雅正	(near-rhyme	泗濱石	昔
	●●○○○●●	of 徑)	●○●	
			今人不擊古人擊	錫
			○○●●●○●	(near-rhyme)
3	正聲不屈古調高		今人古人何不同	東
	●○●●●●○	映	○○●○○●○	
	鍾律參差管弦病	(near-rhyme	用之捨之由樂工	東
	○●○○●○●	of 徑)	●○●○○●○	
4	鏗金戛瑟徒相雜		樂工雖在耳如壁	
	○○●●○○●		●○○●●○●	
	投玉敲冰杳然零	徑	不分清濁即為聾	東
	○●○○●○●		●○○●●○○	
5	華原軟石易追琢		梨園弟子調律呂	語
	○○●●●○●		○○●●○●●	
	高下隨人無雅鄭	勁	知有新聲不如古	姥
	○●○○○●●		○●○○●○●	(near-rhyme)
6	棄舊美新由樂胥		古稱浮磬出泗濱	眞
	●●●○○●○		●○○●●●○	
	自此黃鍾不能競	映	立辯致死聲感人	眞
	●●○○●○●		●●●●○●○	
7	玄宗愛樂愛新樂		宮懸一聽華原石	
	○○●●●○●		○○●●○○●	
	梨園弟子承恩橫	映	君心遂忘封疆臣	眞
	○○●●○○●		○○●○○○○	
8	霓裳纔徹胡騎來		果然胡寇從燕起	止
	○○○●○●○		●○○●○○●	
	雲門未得蒙親定	徑	武臣少肯封疆死	旨
	○○●●○○●		●○●●○○●	(near-rhyme)
9	我藏古磬藏在心		始知樂與時政通	
	●○●●○●○		●○●●○●○	
	有時激作南風詠	映	豈聽鏗鏘而已矣	止
	●○●●○○●		●●○○○●●	
10	伯夔曾撫野獸馴		磬襄入海去不歸	
	●○○●●●○		●○●●●●○	
	仲尼暫和春雷盛	勁	長安市人為樂師	脂
	●○●●○○●		○○●○○●○	

(*Continued*)

Table A.1 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
11	何時得向筠簾懸 ○○●●●●○		華原磬與泗濱石 ○○●●●○●	
	為君一吼君心醒 ●○●●○○●	徑	清濁兩聲誰得知 ○●●○○●○	支 (near-rhyme of 脂)
12	願君每聽念封疆 ●○●●●○○			
	不遣豺狼剿人命 ●●○○●○●	映		

Table A.2 Prosody of "Wuxian tan"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	趙璧五弦彈徵調 ●●●○○●●	嘯	五絃彈 ●○○	
	徵聲嶠絕何清峭 ●○○●○○●	笑	五絃彈 ●○○	
		(near-rhyme of 嘯)	聽者傾耳心寥寥 ●●○●○○○	蕭
2	辭雄皓鶴警露啼 ○○●●○●○		趙璧知君入骨愛 ●●○○●●●	
	失子哀猿繞林嘯 ●●○○●○●	嘯	五絃一一為君調 ●○●●●○○	蕭
3	風入春松正凌亂 ○●○○●○●		第一第二絃索索 ●●●●○●●	鐸
	鶯含曉舌憐嬌妙 ○○●●○○●	笑	秋風拂松疏韻落 ○○●○○●●	鐸
4	嗚嗚暗溜咽冰泉 ○○●●●○○		第三第四絃泠泠 ●○●●○○○	青
	殺殺霜刀瀝寒鞘 ●●○○●○●	笑	夜鶴憶子籠中鳴 ●●●●○○○	庚 (near-rhyme)
5	促節頻催漸繁撥 ●●○○●○●		第五絃聲最掩抑 ●●○○●●●	職
	珠幢斗絕金鈴掉 ○○●●○○●	嘯	隴水凍咽流不得 ●●●●○●●	德 (near-rhyme)
6	千軹鳴鏑發胡弓 ○○○●●○○		五絃並奏君試聽 ●○●●○●○	青
	萬片清球擊虞廟 ●●○○●○●	笑	淒淒切切復錚錚 ○○●●●○○	耕 (near-rhyme)
7	眾樂雖同第一部 ●●○○●●●		鐵擊珊瑚一兩曲 ●●○○●●●	
	德宗皇帝常偏召 ●○○●○○●	笑	冰寫玉盤千萬聲 ○●●○○●○	清 (near-rhyme of the previous stanza)

(*Continued*)

Table A.2 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
8	旬休節假暫歸來 ○○●●●○○		鐵聲殺 ●○●	
	一聲狂殺長安少 ●○○●○○●	笑	冰聲寒 ○○○	寒
9	主第侯家最難見 ●●○○●○●		殺聲入耳膚血慘 ●○●●○●●	
	挼歌按曲皆承詔 ○○●●○○●	笑	寒氣中人肌骨酸 ○●●○○●○	桓 (near-rhyme of 寒)
10	水精簾外教貴嬪 ●○○●●●○		曲終聲盡欲半日 ●○○●●●●	
	琱瑁筵心伴中要 ●●○○●○●	笑	四座相對愁無言 ●●○●○○○	元 (near-rhyme of 寒)
11	臣有五賢非此弦 ○●●○○●○		座中有一遠方士 ●○●●●○●	止
	或在拘囚或屠釣 ●●○○●○●	嘯	唧唧咨咨聲不已 ●●○○○●●	止
12	一賢得進勝累百 ●○●●●●●		自歎今朝初得聞 ●●○○○●○	
	兩賢得進同周邵 ●○●●○○●	笑	始知孤負平生耳 ●○○●○○●	止
13	三賢事漢滅暴強 ○○●●●●○		唯憂趙璧白髮生 ○○●●●●○	庚
	四賢鎮岳寧邊徼 ●○●●○○●	嘯	老死人間無此聲 ●●○○○●○	清 (near-rhyme)
14	五賢並用調五常 ●○●●○●○		遠方士 ●○●	止
	五常既序三光曜 ●○●●○○●	笑	爾聽五絃信為美 ●○●○●○●	旨 (near-rhyme)
			吾聞正始之音不如是 ○○●●○○●○●	紙 (near-rhyme)
15	趙璧五弦非此賢 ●●●○○●○		正始之音其若何 ●●○○○●○	歌
	九九何勞設庭燎 ●●○○●○●	笑	朱絃疏越清廟歌 ○○○●○●○	歌
16			一彈一唱再三歎 ●○●●●○●	
			曲淡節稀聲不多 ●●●○○●○	歌
17			融融曳曳召元氣 ○○●●●○●	
			聽之不覺心平和 ○○●●○○○	戈 (near-rhyme of 歌)
18			人情重今多賤古 ○○●○○●●	姥
			古琴有絃人不撫 ●○●○○●●	麌 (near-rhyme)
19			更從趙璧藝成來 ●○●●●○○	
			二十五絃不如五 ●●●○●○●	姥

Table A.3 Prosody of "Piaoguo yue"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	驃之樂器頭象駝	歌	驃國樂	覺
	●○●●○●○		●●●	
	音聲不合十二和	戈	驃國樂	覺
	○○●●●●○	(near-rhyme of 歌)	●●●	
			出自大海西南角	覺
			●●●●○○●	
2	促舞跳趫筋節硬		雍羌之子舒難陀	
	●●●○○●●		○○○●○○○	
	繁詞變亂名字訛	戈	來獻南音奉正朔	覺
	○○●●○●○		○●○○●○●	
3	千彈萬唱皆咽咽		德宗立仗御紫庭	青
	○○●●○●●		●○●●●●○	
	左旋右轉空佹佹	歌	鼓纘不塞為爾聽	青
	●○●●○○○		●●●●●●○	
4	俯地呼天終不會		玉螺一吹椎髻聳	腫
	●●○○○●●		●○●○○●●	
	曲成調變當如何	歌	銅鼓千擊文身踊	腫
	●○●●○○○		○●○●○○●	
5	德宗深意在柔遠		珠纓炫轉星宿搖	
	●○○●●○●		○○○●○●○	
	笙鏞不御停嬪娥	歌	花鬘斗擻龍蛇動	董
	○○●●○○○		○○●●○○●	(near-rhyme of 腫)
6	史館書為朝貢傳		曲終王子啟聖人	真
	●●○○○●●		●○○●●●○	
	太常編入鞮鞻科	戈	臣父願為唐外臣	真
	●○○●○●○		○●●○○●○	
7	古時陶堯作天子		左右歡呼何翕習	緝
	●○○○●○●		●●○○○●●	
	遜遁親聽康衢歌	歌	至尊德廣之所及	緝
	●●○●○○○		●○●●○●●	
8	又遣遒人持木鐸		須臾百辟詣閤門	魂
	●●○○○●●		○○●●●●○	
	遍採謳謠天下過	戈	俯伏拜表賀至尊	魂
	●●○○○●○		●●●●●●○	
9	萬人有意皆洞達		伏見驃人獻新樂	
	●○●●○●●		●●●○●○●	
	四嶽不敢施煩苛	歌	請書國史傳子孫	魂
	●●●●○○○		●○●●○●○	
10	盡令區中擊壤塊		時有擊壤老農父	麌
	●●○○●●●		○●●●●○●	
	燕及海外覃恩波	戈	暗測君心閑獨語	語
	●●●●○○○		●●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
11	秦霸周衰古官廢		聞君政化甚聖明	庚
	○●○○●○●		○○●●●●○	
	下堙上塞王道頗	戈	欲感人心致太平	庚
	●○●●○●○		●●○○●●○	

(*Continued*)

Table A.3 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
12	共矜異俗同聲教 ●○●●○○●		感人在近不在遠 ●○●●●●●	
	不念齊民方薦瘥 ●●○○○●○	歌	太平由實非由聲 ●○○●○○○	清
13	傳稱魚鼈亦咸若 ●○○●●○●		觀身理國國可濟 ○○●●●●●	霽
	苟能效此誠足多 ●○●●○●○	歌	君如心兮民如體 ○○○○○○●	薺 (near-rhyme; rising tone)
14	借如牛馬未蒙澤 ●○○●●○●		體生疾苦心慘悽 ●○●●○●○	
	豈在抱甕滋竈鼂 ●●●●○○○	歌	民得和平君愷悌 ○●○○○●●	霽
15	教化從來有源委 ●●○○●○●		貞元之民若未安 ○○○○●●○	寒
	必將泳海先泳河 ●○●●○●○	歌	驃樂雖聞君不歡 ●●○○○●○	桓 (near-rhyme)
16	非是倒置自中古 ○●●●●○●		貞元之民苟無病 ○○○○●○●	映
	驃兮驃兮誰爾訶 ●○●○○●○	歌	驃樂不來君亦聖 ●●●○○●●	勁 (near-rhyme)
17			驃樂驃樂徒喧喧 ●●●●○○○	元
			不如聞此芻蕘言 ●○○●○○○	元

Table A.4 Prosody of "Faqu"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	吾聞黃帝鼓清角 ○○○●●○●		法曲法曲歌大定 ●●●●○●●	徑 (near-rhyme)
	弭伏熊羆舞玄鶴 ●●○○●○●	鐸	積德重熙有餘慶 ●●○○●○●	映
			永徽之人舞而詠 ●○○○●○●	映
2	舜持干羽苗革心 ●○○●○●○		法曲法曲舞霓裳 ●●●●●○○	陽
	堯用咸池鳳巢閣 ○●○○●○●	藥 (near-rhyme of 鐸)	政和世理音洋洋 ●○●●○○○	陽
			開元之人樂且康 ○○○○●●○	唐 (near-rhyme)

(*Continued*)

43 pt

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
3	大夏濩武皆象功		法曲法曲歌堂堂	唐
	●●●●○●○		●●●●○○○	
	功多已訝玄功薄	鐸	堂堂之慶垂無疆	陽
	○○●●○○●		○○○●○○○	
4	漢祖過沛亦有歌		中宗肅宗復鴻業	業
	●●●●●●○		○○●○●○●	
	秦王破陣非無作	鐸	唐祚中興萬萬葉	葉
	○○●●○○●		○●○○●●●	(near-rhyme)
5	作之宗廟見艱難		法曲法曲合夷歌	歌
	●○○●●○○		●●●●●○○	
	作之軍旅傳糟粕	鐸	夷聲邪亂華聲和	戈
	●○○●○○●		○○○●○○○	(near-rhyme)
6	明皇度曲多新態		以亂干和天寶末	末
	○○●●○○●		●●○○○●●	
	宛轉浸淫易沉著	藥	明年胡塵犯宮闕	月
	●●○○●○●		○○○○●○●	(near-rhyme)
7	赤白桃李取花名		乃知法曲本華風	東
	●●○●●○○		●○●●●○○	
	霓裳羽衣號天落	鐸	苟能審音與政通	東
	○○●○●○●		●○●○●●○	
8	雅弄雖云已變亂		一從胡曲相參錯	鐸
	●●○○●●●		●○○●○○●	
	夷音未得相參錯	鐸	不辨興衰與哀樂	覺
	○○●●○○●		●●○○●○●	(near-rhyme)
9	自從胡騎起烟塵		願求牙曠正華音	侵
	●○○●●○○		●○○●●○○	
	毛毳腥羶滿咸洛	鐸	不令夷夏相交侵	侵
	○●○○●○●		●●○●○○○	
10	女為胡婦學胡妝			
	●○○●●○○			
	伎進胡音務胡樂	鐸		
	●●○○●○●			
11	火鳳聲沉多咽絕			
	●●○○○●●			
	春鶯囀罷長蕭索	鐸		
	○○●●○○●			
12	胡音胡騎與胡妝			
	○○○●●○○			
	五十年來競紛泊	鐸		
	●●○○●○●			

Table A.5 Prosody of "Libu ji"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	胡部新聲錦筵坐	過	立部伎	
	○●○○●○●		●●●	
	中庭漢振高音播	過	鼓笛諠	元
	○○●●○○●		●●○	
2	太宗廟樂傳子孫		舞雙劍	
	●○●●○●○		●○●	
	取類群凶陣初破	過	跳七丸	桓 (near-rhyme of 元)
	●●○○●○●		●●○	
3	戛戛攢鎗霜雪耀		嫋巨索	
	●●○○○●●		●●●	
	騰騰擊鼓風雷磨	過	掉長竿	寒 (near-rhyme of 元)
	○○●●○○●		●○○	
4	初疑遇敵身啟行		太常部伎有等級	緝
	○○●●○●○		●○●●●●●	
	終象由文士憲左	箇 (near-rhyme of 過)	堂上者坐堂下立	緝
	○●○○●●●		○●●●○●●	
5	昔日高宗常立聽		堂上坐部笙歌清	清
	●●○○○●●		○●●●○○○	
	曲終然後臨玉座	過	堂下立部鼓笛鳴	庚 (near-rhyme)
	●○○●○●●		○●●●●●○	
6	如今節將一掉頭		笙歌一曲眾側耳	
	○○●●●●○		○○●●●●●	
	電捲風收盡摧挫	過	鼓笛萬曲無人聽	青 (near-rhyme of *geng* 庚)
	●●○○●○●		●●●●○○○	
7	宋晉鄭女歌聲發		立部賤	
	●●●●○○●		●●●	
	滿堂會客齊喧吸	箇	坐部貴	未 (near-rhyme of *zhi*寘)
	●○●●○○●		●●●	
8	珊瑚佩玉動腰身		坐部退為立部伎	寘
	○○●●●○○		●●●○●●●	
	一一貫珠隨咳唾	過	擊鼓吹笙和雜戲	寘
	●●●○○●●		●●○○●●●	
9	頃向圜丘見郊祀		立部又退何所任	侵
	●●○○●○●		●●●●○●○	
	亦曾正旦親朝賀	箇	始就樂懸操雅音	侵
	●○○●○○●		●●●○○●○	
10	太常雅樂備宮懸		雅音替壞一至此	紙
	●○●●●○○		●○●●●●●	
	九奏未終百寮惰	過	長令爾輩調宮徵	止 (near-rhyme)
	●●●○●○●		○●●●○○●	

(*Continued*)

Table A.5 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
11	悠懘難令季札辨		圓丘后土郊祀時	之
	○●○●●●●		○○●●○●○	
	遲迴但恐文侯臥	過	言將此樂感神祇	脂
	○○●●○○●		○○●●●○○	(near-rhyme)
12	工師盡取聾昧人		欲望鳳來百獸舞	麌
	○○●●○●○		●●●○●●●	
	豈是先王作之過	過	何異北轅將適楚	語
	●●○○●○●		○●●○○●●	(near-rhyme)
13	宋沆嘗傳天寶季		工師愚賤安足云	文
	●●○○○●●		○○○●○●○	
	法曲胡音忽相和	過	太常三卿爾何人	真
	●●○○●○●		●○○○●○○	(near-rhyme)
14	明年十月燕寇來			
	○○●●○●○			
	九廟千門虜塵涴	過		
	●●○○●○●			
15	我聞此語歎復泣			
	●○●●●●●			
	古來邪正將誰奈	箇		
	●○○●○○●			
16	姦聲入耳佞入心			
	○○●●●●○			
	侏儒飽飯夷齊餓	箇		
	○○●●●○●			

Table A.6 Prosody of "Huxuan nü"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	天寶欲末胡欲亂		胡旋女	語
	○●●●○●●		○○●	
	胡人獻女能胡旋	線	胡旋女	語
	○○●●○○●		○○●	
2	旋得明皇不覺迷		心應絃	
	○●○○●●○		○●○	
	妖胡奄到長生殿	霰	手應鼓	姥
	●○●●○○●	(near-rhyme of 線)	●●●	(near-rhyme of 語)
3	胡旋之義世莫知		絃鼓一聲雙袖舉	語
	○○○●●●○		○●●○○●●	
	胡旋之容我能傳	線	迴雪飄颻轉蓬舞	麌
	○○○○●○●		○●○○●○●	(near-rhyme of 語)

(*Continued*)

Table A.6 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
4	蓬斷霜根羊角疾		左旋右轉不知疲	支
	○●○○○●●		●○●●●○○	
	竿戴朱盤火輪炫	霰	千匝萬周無已時	之
	○●○○●○●		○●●○○●○	(near-rhyme)
5	驪珠迸珥逐龍星		人間物類無可比	脂
	○○●●●○○		○○●●○●○	
	虹暈輕巾掣流電	霰	奔車輪緩旋風遲	脂
	○●○○●○●		○○○●●○○	
6	潛鯨暗嗡笪海波		曲終再拜謝天子	止
	○○●●●●○		●○●●●○●	
	迴風亂舞當空霰	霰	天子為之微啓齒	止
	○○●●○○●		○●●○○●●	
7	萬過其誰辨終始		胡旋女	
	●●○○●○●		○○●	
	四座安能分背面	線	出康居	魚
	●●○○○●●		●○○	
			徒勞東來萬里餘	魚
			○○○○●●○	
8	才人觀者相為言		中原自有胡旋者	
	○○○●○○○		○○●●○○●	
	承奉君恩在圓變	線	鬪妙爭能爾不如	魚
	○●○○●○●		●●○○●●○	
9	是非好惡隨君口		天寶季年時欲變	線
	●○●●○○●		○●●○○●●	
	南北東西逐君盼	霰	臣妾人人學圓轉	線
	○●○○●○●		○●○○●○●	
10	柔軟依身看佩帶		中有太真外祿山	山
	○●○○○●●		○●●○●●○	
	徘徊繞指同環釧	線	二人最道能胡旋	仙
	○○●●○○●		●○●●○○○	(near-rhyme)
11	佞臣聞此心計迴		梨花園中冊作妃	微
	●○○●○●○		○○○○●●○	
	惑亂君心君眼眩	霰	金雞障下養為兒	支
	●●○○○●●		○○●●●○○	(near-rhyme)
12	君言似曲屈如鈎		祿山胡旋迷君眼	產
	○○●●●○○		●○○○○○●	
	君言好直舒為箭	線	兵過黃河疑未反	阮
	○○●●○○●		○●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
13	巧隨清影觸處行		貴妃胡旋惑君心	侵
	●○○●●●○		●○○○●○○	
	好學春鶯百般囀	線	死棄馬嵬念更深	侵
	●●○○●○●		●●●○●●○	
14	傾天側地用君力		從茲地軸天維轉	
	○○●●●○●		○○●●○○●	
	抑塞周遮恐君見	霰	五十年來制不禁	侵
	●●○○●○●		●●○○●●○	

(*Continued*)

Table A.6 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
15	翠華南幸萬里橋 ●○○●●●○		胡旋女 ○○●	語 (near-rhyme of 麌)
	玄宗始悟坤維轉 ○○●●○○●	線	莫空舞 ●○●	麌
			數唱此歌悟明主 ●●●○●○●	麌
16	寄言旋目與旋心 ●○○●●○○			
	有國有家當共譴 ●●●○○●●	線		

Table A.7 Prosody of "Shangyang baifaren"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	天寶年中花鳥使 ○●○○○●●	至	上陽人 ●○○	真
	撩花狎鳥含春思 ○○●●○○●	志 (near-rhyme of 至)	紅顏暗老白髮新 ○○●●●●○	真
2	滿懷墨詔求嬪御 ●○●●○○●		綠衣監使守宮門 ●○●●●○○	
	走上高樓半酣醉 ●●○○●○●	至	一閉上陽多少春 ●●●○○●○	諄 (near-rhyme of 真)
3	醉酣直入卿士家 ●○●●○●○		玄宗末歲初選入 ○○●●○●●	緝
	閨闈不得偷迴避 ○○●●○○●	寘 (near-rhyme of 至)	入時十六今六十 ●○●●○●●	緝
4	良人顧妾心死別 ○○●●○●●		同時采擇百餘人 ○○●●●○○	真
	小女呼爺血垂淚 ●●○○●○●	至	零落年深殘此身 ○●○○○●○	真
5	十中有一得更衣 ●○●●●○○		憶昔吞悲別親族 ●●○○●○●	屋
	永配深宮作宮婢 ●●○○●○●	紙 (near-rhyme of 至, rising-tone)	扶入車中不教哭 ○●○○●○●	屋
6	御馬南奔胡馬蹙 ●●○○○●●		皆云入內便承恩 ○○●●●○○	
	宮女三千合宮棄 ○●○○●○●	至	臉似芙蓉胸似玉 ●●○○○●●	燭 (near-rhyme of 屋)

(*Continued*)

Table A.7 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
7	宮門一閉不復開		未容君王得見面	
	○○●●●●○		●○○○●●●	
	上陽花草青苔地	至	已被楊妃遙側目	屋
	●○○●○○●		●●○○○●●	
8	月夜閑聞洛水聲		妬令潛配上陽宮	
	●●○○●●○		●●○●●○○	
	秋池暗度風荷氣	未 (near-rhyme of 至)	一生遂向空房宿	屋
	○○●●○○●		●○●●○○●	
9	日日長看提象門		秋夜長	
	●●○○○●○		○●○	
	終身不見門前事	志	夜長無寐天不明	庚
	○○●●○○●		●○○●○●○	
10	近年又送數人來		耿耿殘燈背壁影	
	●○●●●○○		●●○○●●●	
	自言興慶南宮至	至	瀟瀟暗雨打窗聲	清 (near-rhyme of 庚)
	●○●●○○●		○○●●●○○	
11	我悲此曲將徹骨		春日遲	
	●○●●○●●		○●○	
	更想深冤復酸鼻	至	日遲獨坐天難暮	暮
	●●○○●○●		●○●●○○●	
12	此輩賤嬪何足言		宮鶯百囀愁厭聞	
	●●●○○●○		○○●●○●○	
	帝子天孫古稱貴	未	梁燕雙栖老休妬	暮
	●●○○●○●		○●○○●○●	
13	諸王在閤四十年		鶯歸燕去長悄然	仙
	○○●●●●○		○○●●○●○	
	十宅六宮門戶閟	至	春往秋來不記年	先 (near-rhyme)
	●●●○○●●		○●○○●●○	
14	隋煬枝條襲封邑		唯向深宮望明月	
	○○○○●○●		○●○○●○●	
	肅宗血胤無官位	至	東西四五百迴圓	仙
	●○●●○○●		○○●●●○○	
15	王無妃媵主無壻		今日宮中年最老	晧
	○○○●●○●		○●○○○●●	
	陽亢陰淫結災累	寘	大家遙賜尚書號	號 (near-rhyme)
	○●○○●○●		●○○●●○●	
16	何如決壅順眾流		小頭鞋履窄衣裳	陽
	○○●○●●○		●○○●●○○	
	女遣從夫男作吏	志	青黛點眉眉細長	陽
	●●○○○●●		○●●○○●○	
17			外人不見見應笑	
			●○●●●○●	
			天寶末年時世妝	陽
			○●●○○●○	

(*Continued*)

Table A.7 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
18			上陽人 ●○○	
			苦最多 ●●○	歌
19			少亦苦 ●●●	
			老亦苦 ●●●	
			少苦老苦兩如何 ●●●●●○○	歌
20			君不見昔時呂向美人賦 ○●●●○●●●○●	
			又不見今日上陽白髮歌 ●●●○●●○●●○	歌

Table A.8 Prosody of "Xiliang ji"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	吾聞昔日西涼州 ○○●●○○○	尤	西涼伎 ○○●	
	人烟撲地桑柘稠 ○○●●○●○	尤	假面胡人假獅子 ●●○○●○●	寘 (near-rhyme of 止, falling-tone)
2	蒲萄酒熟恣行樂 ○○●●●○●		刻木為頭絲作尾 ●●○○○●●	止
	紅豔青旗朱粉樓 ○●○○○●○	侯 (near-rhyme of 尤)	金鍍眼睛銀帖齒 ○●●○○●●	止
3	樓下當壚稱卓女 ○●○○○●●		奮迅毛衣擺雙耳 ●●○○●○●	止
	樓頭伴客名莫愁 ○○●●○●○	尤	如從流沙來萬里 ○○○○○●●	止
4	鄉人不識離別苦 ○○●●○○●		紫髯深目兩胡兒 ●○○●●○○	支
	更卒多為沉滯游 ○●○○○●○	尤	鼓舞跳梁前致辭 ●●●○○●○	之 (near-rhyme)
5	哥舒開府設高宴 ○○○●●○●		應似涼州未陷日 ○●○○●●●	
	八珍九醞當前頭 ●○●●○○○	侯	安西都護進來時 ○○○●●○○	之
6	前頭百戲競撩亂 ○○●●●○●		須臾云得新消息 ○○○●○○●	職
	丸劍跳躑霜雪浮 ●●●●○●○	尤	安西路絕歸不得 ○○●●○●●	德 (near-rhyme)

(*Continued*)

Table A.8 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
7	師子搖光毛彩豎		泣向獅子涕雙垂	支
	○●○○○●●		●●○●●○○	
	胡姬醉舞筋骨柔	尤	涼州陷沒知不知	支
	○○●●○●○		○○●●○●○	
8	大宛來獻赤汗馬		獅子迴頭向西望	
	●○○●●●●		○●○○●○●	
	贊普亦奉翠茸裘	尤	哀吼一聲觀者悲	脂
	●●●●●○○		○●●○○●○	(near-rhyme of 支)
9	一朝燕賊亂中國		貞元邊將愛此曲	燭
	●○○●●○●		○○○●●●●	
	河湟忽盡空遺丘	尤	醉坐笑看看不足	燭
	○○●●○○○		●●●○○●●	
10	開遠門前萬里堠		享賓犒士宴三軍	
	○●○○●●●		●○●●●○○	
	今來蹙到行原州	尤	獅子胡兒長在目	屋
	○○●●○○○		○●○○○●●	(near-rhyme of 燭)
11	去京五百而近何其逼		有一征夫年七十	緝
	●○●●○●○○●		●●○○○●●	
	天子縣內半沒為荒陬	侯	見弄涼州低面泣	緝
	○●●●●●○○○		●●○○○●●	
12	西涼之道爾阻修	尤	泣罷斂手白將軍	文
	○○○●●●○		●●●●●○○	
	連城邊將但高會		主憂臣辱昔所聞	文
	○○○●●○●		●○○●●●○	
	每聽此曲能不羞	尤		
	●●●●○●○			
13			自從天寶兵戈起	止
			●○○●○○●	
			犬戎日夜吞西鄙	旨
			●○●●○○●	(near-rhyme)
14			涼州陷來四十年	
			○○●○●●○	
			河隴侵將七千里	止
			○●○○●○●	
15			平時安西萬里疆	陽
			○○○○●●○	
			今日邊防在鳳翔	陽
			○●○○●●○	
16			緣邊空屯十萬卒	術
			○○○○●●●	
			飽食温衣閑過日	質
			●●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
17			遺民腸斷在涼州	尤
			○○○●●○○	
			將卒相看無意收	尤
			●●○○○●○	

(*Continued*)

Table A.8 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
18			天子每思長痛惜 ○●●○○●●	
			將軍欲說合慚羞 ○○●●●○○	尤
19			奈何仍看西涼伎 ●○○○○○●	寘
			取笑資歡無所愧 ●●○○○●●	至 (near-rhyme)
20			縱無智力未能收 ●○●●●○○	
			忍取西涼弄為戲 ●●○○●○●	寘

Table A.9 Prosody of "Yinshan dao"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	年年買馬陰山道 ○○●●○○●	皓 (near-rhyme;	陰山道 ○○●	晧
	馬死陰山帛空耗 ●●○○●○●	rising-tone) 號	陰山道 ○○●	晧
			紇邏敦肥水泉好 ●○○○●○●	晧
2	元和天子念女工 ○○○●●●○		每至戎人送馬時 ●●○○●●○	
	內出金銀代酬犒 ●●○○●○●	號	道傍千里無纖草 ●○○●○○●	晧
3	臣有一言昧死進 ○●●○●●●		草盡泉枯馬病羸 ●●○○●●○	支
	死生甘分答恩燾 ●○○●●○●	號	飛龍但印骨與皮 ○○●●●●○	支
4	費財為馬不獨生 ●○●●●●○		五十疋縑易一匹 ●●●○●●●	質
	耗帛傷工有他盜 ●●○○●○●	號	縑去馬來無了日 ○●●○○●●	質
5	臣聞平時七十萬匹馬 ○○○○●●●●●		養無所用去非宜 ●○●●●○○	
	關中不省聞嘶噪 ○○●●○○●	號	每歲死傷十六七 ●●●○●●●	質
6	四十八監選龍媒 ●●●●●○○		縑絲不足女工苦 ○○●●●○●	暮
	時貢天庭付良造 ○●○○●○●	號	疏織短截充匹數 ○●●●○●●	遇 (near-rhyme of 暮)

(*Continued*)

Table A.9 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
7	如今坰野十無一 ○○●●●○●		藕絲蛛網三丈餘 ●○○●○●○	
	盡在飛龍相踐暴 ●●○○○●●	號	迴鶻訴稱無用處 ○●●○○●●	御 (near-rhyme of 暮)
8	萬束蒭茭供旦暮 ●●○○○●●		咸安公主號可敦 ○○○●●●○	魂
	千鍾菽粟長牽漕 ○○●●○○●	號	遠為可汗頻奏論 ●●●○○●○	魂
9	屯軍郡國百餘鎮 ○○●●●○●		元和二年下新勅 ○○●○●○●	職
	縑緗歲奉春冬勞 ○○●●○○●	號	內出金帛酬馬直 ●●○●○●●	職
10	稅户逋逃例攤配 ●●○○●○●		仍詔江淮馬價縑 ○●○○●●○	
	官司折納仍貪冒 ○○●●○○●	號	從此不令疏短織 ○●●●○●●	職
11	挑紋變繡力倍費 ○○●●●●●		合羅將軍呼萬歲 ●○○○○●●	
	棄舊從新人所好 ●●○○○●●	號	捧授金銀與縑綵 ●●○○●○●	海
12	越縠繚綾織一端 ●●○○●●○		誰知黠虜啟貪心 ○○●●●○○	
	十疋素縑功未到 ●●●○○●●	號	明年馬多來一倍 ○○●○○●●	海
13	豪家富賈踰常制 ○○●●○○●		縑漸好 ○●●	
	令族親班無雅操 ●●○○○●●	號	馬漸多 ●●○	歌
14	從騎愛奴絲布衫 ○●●○○●○		陰山虜 ○○●	
	臂鷹小兒雲錦韜 ●○●○○●●	號	奈爾何 ●●○	歌
15	群臣利己要差僭 ○○●●●○●			
	天子深衷空閔悼 ○●○○○●●	號		
16	綽立花塼鵁鶄行 ●●○○○●○			
	雨露恩波幾時報 ●●○○●○●	號		

Table A.10 Prosody of "Fu Rongren"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	邊頭大將差健卒	没	縛戎人	真
	○○●●○●●		●○○	
	入抄擒生快於鶻	没	縛戎人	真
	●○○○●○●		●○○	
			耳穿面破驅入秦	真
			●○●●○●○	
2	但逢頰面即捉來		天子矜憐不忍殺	黠
	●○○●●●○		○●○○●●●	
	半是邊人半戎羯	月	詔徙東南吳與越	末
	●●○○●○●	(near-rhyme of 没)	●●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
3	大將論功重多級		黃衣小使錄姓名	清
	●●●○●○●		○○●●●●○	
	捷書飛奏何超忽	没	領出長安乘遞行	庚
	●○○●○○●		●●○○○●○	(near-rhyme)
4	聖朝不殺諸至仁		身被金瘡面多瘠	昔
	●○●●○●○		○○○○●○●	
	遠送炎方示微罰	月	扶病徒行日一驛	昔
	●●○○●○●		○●○○●●●	
5	萬里虛勞肉食費		朝飡饑渴費盃盤	
	●●○○●●●		○○○●●○○	
	連頭盡被氈裘暍	月	夜臥腥臊污床席	昔
	○○●○○○●		●●○○○○●	
6	華茵重席卧腥臊		忽逢江水憶交河	歌
	○○○●●○○		●○○●●○○	
	病犬愁鴣聲咽嗢	没	垂手齊聲嗚咽歌	歌
	●●○○○●●		○●○○○●○	
7	中有一人能漢語		其中一虜語諸虜	
	○●●○○●●		○○●●●○●	
	自言家本長安窟	没	爾苦非多我苦多	歌
	●○○●○○●		●●○○●●○	
8	小年隨父戍安西		同伴行人因借問	問
	●○○●●○○		○●○○○●●	
	河渭瓜沙眼看没	没	欲說喉中氣憤憒	吻
	○●○○●○●		●●○○●●●	(near-rhyme; rising-tone)
9	天寶未亂前數載		自云鄉管本涼原	元
	○●●●○●●		●○○●●○○	
	狼星四角光蓬勃	没	大曆年中没落蕃	元
	○○●●○○●		●●○○●●○	
10	中原禍作邊防危		一落蕃中四十載	代
	○○●●○○○		●●○○●●●	
	果有豺狼四來伐	月	遣著皮裘繫毛帶	泰
	●●○○●○●		●●○○●○●	(near-rhyme)

(*Continued*)

Table A.10 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
11	蕃馬膽成正翹健		唯許正朝服漢儀	支
	○●○○●○●		○●○○●●○	
	蕃兵肉飽爭唐突	没	斂衣整巾潛淚垂	支
	○○●●○○●		●○●○○●○	
12	煙塵亂起無亭燧		誓心密定歸鄉計	
	○○●●○○●		●○●●○○●	
	主帥驚跳棄旄鉞	月	不使蕃中妻子知	支
	●●○●●○●		●●○○○●○	
13	半夜城摧鵝雁鳴		暗思幸有殘筋力	職
	●●○○○●○		●○●●○○●	
	妻啼子叫曾不歇	月	更恐年衰歸不得	德
	○○●●○●●		●●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
14	陰森神廟未敢依		蕃候嚴兵鳥不飛	微
	○○○●●●○		○●○○●●○	
	脆薄河冰安可越	月	脫身冒死奔逃歸	微
	●●○○○●●		●○●●○○○	
15	荊棘深處共潛身		晝伏宵行經大漠	鐸
	○●○●●○○		●●○○○●●	
	前困蒺藜後毚虓	没	雲陰月黑風沙惡	鐸
	○●●○●●●		○○●●○○●	
16	平明蕃騎四面走		驚藏青塚寒草疏	
	○○○●●●●		○○○●○●○	
	古木深林盡株楑	没	偷渡黃河夜冰薄	鐸
	●●○○●○●		○●○○●○●	
17	少壯為俘頭被髡		忽聞漢軍鼙鼓聲	清
	●●○○○●○		●○●○○●○	(near-rhyme of 庚)
	老翁留居足多肌	月	路傍走出再拜迎	庚
	●○○○●○●		●○●●●●○	
18	烏鳶滿野屍狼藉		游騎不聽能漢語	
	○○●●○○●		○●●○○●●	
	樓榭成灰牆突兀	没	將軍遂縛作蕃生	庚
	○●○○○●●		○○●●●○○	
19	暗水濺濺入舊池		配向東南卑濕地	至
	●●○○●●○		●●○○○●●	
	平沙漫漫鋪明月	月	定無存卹空防備	至
	○○●●○○●		●○○●○○●	
20	戎王遣將來安慰		念此吞聲仰訴天	先
	○○●●○○●		●●○○●●○	
	口不敢言心咄咄	没	若為辛苦度殘年	先
	●●●○○●●		●○○●●○○	
21	供進腋腋御叱般		涼原鄉井不得見	
	○●●●●●●		○○○●●●●	
	豈料穹廬揀肥腍	没	胡地妻兒虛棄捐	仙
	●●○○●○●		○●○○○●○	(near-rhyme of 先)

(*Continued*)

Table A.10 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
22	五六十年消息絕 ●●●○○●●		沒蕃被囚思漢土 ●○●○○●●	姥
	中間盟會又猖獗 ○○○●●○●	月	歸漢被劫為蕃虜 ○●●●○○●	姥
23	眼穿東日望堯雲 ●○○●●○○		早知如此悔歸來 ●○○●●○○	
	腸斷正朝梳漢髮 ○●●○○●●	月	兩地寧如一處苦 ●●○○●●●	姥
24	近年如此思漢者 ●○○●○●●		縛戎人 ●○○	真
	半為老病半埋骨 ●○●●●○●	没	戎人之中我苦辛 ○○○○●●○	真
25	尚教孫子學鄉音 ●●○○●○○		自古此冤應未有 ●●●○○●●	
	猶話平時好城闕 ○●○○●○●	月	漢心漢語吐蕃身 ●○●●●○○	真
26	老者儻盡少者壯 ●●●●●●●			
	生長蕃中似蕃悖 ○●○○●○●	没		
27	不知祖父皆漢民 ●○●●○●○			
	便恐為蕃心矻矻 ●●○○○●●	没		
28	緣邊飽餧十萬眾 ○○●●●●●			
	何不齊驅一時發 ○●○○●○●	月		
29	年年但捉兩三人 ○○●●●○○			
	精衛銜蘆塞溟渤 ○●○○●○●	没		

Table A.11 Prosody of "Manzi chao"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	西南六詔有遺種 ○○●●●○●	腫	蠻子朝 ○●○	宵
	僻在荒陬路尋壅 ●●○○●○●	腫	汎皮船兮渡繩橋 ●○○○●○○	宵
			來自褱州道路遙 ○●●○●●○	宵

(*Continued*)

Table A.11 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
2	部落支離君長賤		入界先經蜀川過	過
	●●○○○●●		●●○○●○●	
	比諸夷狄為幽冗	腫	蜀將收功先表賀	箇
	●○○●○○●		●●○○○●●	(near-rhyme)
3	犬戎強盛頻侵削		臣聞雲南六詔蠻	刪
	●○○●○○●		○○○○●●○	
	降有憤心戰無勇	腫	東連牂牁西連蕃	元
	○●●○●○●		○○○○○○○	(near-rhyme)
4	夜防鈔盜保深山		六詔星居初瑣碎	隊
	●○○●●○○		●●○○○●●	
	朝望烟塵上高冢	腫	合為一詔漸強大	泰
	○●○○●○●		●○●●●○●	(near-rhyme)
5	鳥道繩橋來款附		開元皇帝雖聖神	真
	●●○○○●●		○○○●○○○	
	非因慕化因為悚	腫	唯蠻倔強不來賓	真
	○○●●○○●		○○●●●○○	
6	清平官繫金呿嵯		鮮于仲通六萬卒	沒
	○○○●○○○		○○●○●●●	
	求天叩地持雙珙	腫	征蠻一陣全軍沒	沒
	○○●●○○●		○○●●○○●	
7	益州大將韋令公		至今西洱河岸邊	
	●○●●●●○		●○○●○●○	
	頃實遭時定汧隴	腫	箭孔刀痕滿枯骨	沒
	●●○○●○●		●●○○●○●	
8	自居劇鎮無他績		誰知今日慕華風	東
	●○●●○○●		○○○●●○○	
	幸得蠻來固恩寵	腫	不勞一人蠻自通	東
	●●○○●○●		●○●○○●○	
9	為蠻開道引蠻朝		誠由陛下休明德	
	●○○●●○○		○○●●○○●	
	接蠻送蠻常繼踵	腫	亦賴微臣誘諭功	東
	●○●○○●●		●●○○●●○	
10	天子臨軒四方賀		德宗省表知如此	紙
	○●○○●○●		●○●●○○●	
	朝廷無事唯端拱	腫	笑令中使迎蠻子	止
	○○○●○○●		●●○●○○●	(near-rhyme)
11	漏天走馬春雨寒		蠻子導從者誰何	歌
	●○●●○●○		○●●○●○○	
	瀘水飛蛇瘴烟重	腫	摩挲俗羽雙隈伽	戈
	○●○○●○●		○○●●○○○	(near-rhyme)
12	椎頭醜類除憂患		清平官持赤藤杖	
	○○●●○○●		○○○○●○●	
	瘴足役夫勞洶湧	腫	大軍將繫金呿嗟	麻
	●●●○○○●		●○●●○○○	(near-rhyme of 歌)

(*Continued*)

Table A.11 (Continued)

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
13	匈奴互市歲不供 ○○●●●●○		異牟尋男尋閣勸 ●○○○○●●	願
	雲蠻通好轡長駃 ○○○●●○●	腫	特勅召對延英殿 ●●●●○○●	霰 (near-rhyme)
14	戎王養馬漸多年 ○○●●●○○		上心貴在懷遠蠻 ●○●●○●○	刪
	南人耗額西人恐 ○○●●○○●	腫	引臨玉座近天顏 ●○●●●○○	刪
15			冕旒不垂親勞俾 ●○●○○●●	代
			賜衣賜食移時對 ●○●●○○●	隊 (near-rhyme)
16			移時對 ○○●	
			不可得 ●●●	德
			大臣相看有羨色 ●○○○●●●	職 (near-rhyme)
17			可憐宰相拖紫佩金章 ●○●●○●●○○	
			朝日唯聞對一刻 ○●○○●●●	德

Table A.12 Prosody of "Xunxi"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
1	建中之初放馴象 ●○○○●○●	養	馴犀馴犀通天犀 ○○○○○○○	齊
	遠歸林邑近交廣 ●○○●●○●	蕩 (near-rhyme)	軀貌駭人角駭雞 ○●●○●●○	齊
2	獸返深山鳥構巢 ●●○○●●○		海蠻聞有明天子 ●○○●○○●	止
	鷹雕鷁鶻無羈鞅 ○○●●○○●	養	驅犀乘傳來萬里 ○○○●○●●	止
3	貞元之歲貢馴犀 ○○○●●○○		一朝得謁大明宮 ●○●●●○○	東
	上林置圈官司養 ●○●●○○●	養	歡呼拜舞自論功 ○○●●●●○	東
4	玉盆金棧非不珍 ●○○●○●○		五年馴養始堪獻 ●○○●●○●	
	虎啖猙牢魚食網 ●●●○○●●	養	六譯語言方得通 ●●●○○●○	東
5	渡江之橘踰汶貉 ●○○●○●●		上嘉人獸俱來遠 ●○○●○○●	阮
	反時易性安能長 ●○●●○○●	養	蠻館四方犀入苑 ○●●○○●●	阮

(*Continued*)

Table A.12 Prosody of "Xunxi"

Stanza	*Yuan's*	*Rhyme*	*Bai's*	*Rhyme*
6	臘月北風霜雪深		餧以瑤觜鎖以金	侵
	●●●○○●○		●●○○●●○	
	踡跼鱗身遂長往	養	故鄉迢遞君門深	侵
	○●○○●○●		●○○●○○○	
7	行地無疆費傳驛		海鳥不知鍾鼓樂	
	○●○○●○●		●●●○○●●	
	通天異物罹幽枉	養	池魚空結江湖心	侵
	○○●●○○●		○○○●○○○	
8	乃知養獸如養人		馴犀生處南方熱	薛
	●○●●○●○		○○○●○○●	
	不必人人自敦獎	養	秋無白露冬無雪	薛
	●●○○●○●		○○●●○○●	
9	不擾則得之於理		一入上林三四年	
	●●●●○○●		●●●○○●○	
	不奪有以多於賞	養	又逢今歲苦寒月	月
	●●●●○○●		●○○●●○●	(near-rhyme of 薛)
10	脫衣推食衣食之		飲冰臥霰苦踡跼	燭
	●○○●●●○		●○●●●○●	
	不若男耕女令紡	養	角骨凍傷鱗甲縮	屋
	●●○○●●●		●●●○○●●	(near-rhyme)
11	堯民不自知有堯		馴犀死	
	○○●●○●○		○○●	
	但見安閑聊擊壤	養	蠻兒啼	齊
	●●○○○●●		○○○	
			向闕再拜顏色低	齊
			●●●●○●○	
12	前觀馴象後觀犀		奏乞生歸本國去	
	○○○●●○○		●●○○●●●	
	理國其如指諸掌	養	恐身凍死似馴犀	齊
	●●○○●○●		●○●●●○○	
13			君不見建中初	
			○●●●○○	
			馴象生還放林邑	緝
			○●○○●○●	
14			君不見貞元末	
			○●●○○●	
			馴犀凍死蠻兒泣	緝
			○○●●○○●	
15			所嗟建中異貞元	元
			●○●○●○○	
			象生犀死何足言	元
			●○○●○●○	

Note

1 David Prager Branner, "Tonal Prosody in Chinese Parallel Prose," *JAOS* 123, no. 1 (January–March 2003): 93–119.

Bibliography

Allen, Joseph R. *In the Voice of Others: Chinese Music Bureau Poetry*. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, University of Michigan, 1992.

Ames, Roger T. *Confucian Role Ethics: A Vocabulary*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 2011.

Ames, Roger T. *A Conceptual Lexicon for Classical Confucian Philosophy*. Albany: State University of New York, 2022.

Ames, Roger T. and David L. Hall. *Focusing the Familiar: A Translation and Philosophical Interpretation of the Zhongyong*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001.

Backus, Charles. *The Nan-chao Kingdom and T'ang China's Southwestern Frontier*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

Bai Xue 柏雪 and Yang Huaiyuan 楊懷源. "Shige yongyun zhong 'shangqu tongya' xianxiang yanjiu—Yi Tangdai Guanzhong shige yongyun wei li" 詩歌用韻中「上去通押」現象研究——以唐代關中詩歌用韻為例. *Chengdu shifan xueyuan xuebao* 32, no. 1 (2016): 60–64.

Ban Gu 班固 (32–92). *Han shu* 漢書, 12 vols. 1962; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002.

Beckwith, Christopher I. "The Impact of the Horse and Silk Trade on the Economies of T'ang China and the Uighur Empire: On the Importance of International Commerce in the Early Middle Ages." *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 34, no. 3 (1991): 183–98.

Beckwith, Christopher I. *The Tibetan Empire in Central Asia: A History of the Struggle for Great Power among Tibetans, Turks, Arabs, and Chinese during the Early Middle Ages*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993.

Bian Xiaoxuan 卞孝萱. *Tangdai wenshi luncong* 唐代文史論叢. Taiyuan: Renmin chubanshe, 1986.

Bian Xiaoxuan. *Yuan Zhen nianpu* 元稹年譜. Ji'nan: Qi-Lu shushe, 1980.

Birrell, Anne. "Mythmaking and Yüeh-Fu: Popular Songs and Ballads of Early Imperial China." *JAOS* 109, no. 2 (1989): 223–35.

Birrell, Anne. *Popular Songs and Ballads of Han China*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1993.

Birrell, Anne. *The Classic of Mountains and Seas*. New York: Penguin Books, 1999.

Bol, Peter K. *"This Culture of Ours": Intellectual Transitions in T'ang and Sung China*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1992.

Branner, David Prager. "Tonal Prosody in Chinese Parallel Prose." *JAOS* 123, no. 1 (January–March 2003): 93–119.

Brindley, Erica F. "Music, Cosmos, and the Development of Psychology in Early China." *T'oung Pao*. 2nd ser., vol. 92, fasc. 1/3 (2006): 1–49.
Brindley, Erica F. *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012.
Bryson, Megan. "The Great Kingdom of Eternal Peace: Buddhist Kingship in Tenth-Century Dali." *Asia Major* 32, no. 1, 3rd ser. (2019): 87–111.
Bryson, Megan. "Tsenpo Chung, Yunnan wang, Mahārāja: Royal Titles in Narratives of Nanzhao Kingship between Tibet and Tang China." *Cahiers d'Extrême-Asie* 24 (2015): 59–76.
Chan, Tim W. "In Search of Jade: Studies of Early Tang Poetry." PhD diss., University of Colorado, 1999.
Chan, Tim W. "The 'Ganyu' of Chen Zi'ang: Questions on the Formation of a Poetic Genre." *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., 87, fasc. 1/3 (2001), 14–42.
Chang, Xu. "Managing a Multicurrency System in Tang China: The View from the Centre," trans. Helen Wang. *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 223–44.
Chen Caizhi 陳才智. "Xin Yuefu mingyi bianxi" 新樂府名義辨析. *Nanyang shifan xueyuan xuebao* 南陽師範學院學報 3, no. 7 (July 2004): 12–16.
Chen Chong 陳翀. "Bai Juyi Yuanhe sinian zuo *Xin Yuefu* zhi geci xingtai ji qi suoyong yuequ kao" 白居易元和四年作《新樂府》之歌辭形態及其所用樂曲考. *Biaoxian jishu yanjiu* 表現技術研究 17 (March 2022): 45–58.
Chen Junqiang 陳俊強. "Cong Tangdai falü de jiaodu kan Li Bai changliu Yelang" 從唐代法律的角度看李白長流夜郎. *Taiwan shida lishi xuebao* 臺灣師大歷史學報 42 (2009): 21–50.
Chen Mingguang 陳明光. *Tangdai caizhengshi xinbian* 唐代財政史新編. Beijing: Zhongguo caizheng jingji chubanshe, 1991.
Chen Ruiquan 陳瑞泉. "Qin 'Yuefu' xiaokao" 秦「樂府」小考. *Tianjin yinyue xueyuan xuebao* 天津音樂學院學報, no. 4 (2005): 26–32.
Chen Sihai 陳四海. "Cong Qin Yuefuzhong Qin fengni de chutu tan Qinshihuang jianli Yuefu de yinyue sixiang" 從秦樂府鐘秦封泥的出土談秦始皇建立樂府的音樂思想. *Zhongguo yinyuexue* 中國音樂學, no. 1 (2004): 52–57.
Chen Yan 陳燕. "Yuan Zhen, Bai Juyi Xin Yuefu shi zhi chayi fenxi—Cong Chen Yinke *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao* shuoqi" 元稹、白居易新樂府詩之差異分析——從陳寅恪《元白詩箋證稿》說起. *Henan jidian gaodeng zhuanke xuexiao xuebao* 河南機電高等專科學校學報 26, no. 4 (July 2018): 57–61.
Chen Yang 陳暘 (fl. 1094). *Yueshu* 樂書. In *Yingyin Wenyuan ge Siku quanshu*. Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
Chen Yanmei 陳燕梅. "Chutan 'Wuli' de paixu ji qi yihan" 初探「五禮」的排序及其意涵. *Zhongguo wenxue yanjiu* 中國文學研究, no. 29 (January 2010): 39–70.
Chen Yicheng 陳義成. *Han Wei Liuchao Yuefu yanjiu* 漢魏六朝樂府研究. Taipei: Jiaxin shuini gongsi wenhua jijinhui, 1976.
Chen Yinke 陳寅恪 (1890–1969). *Yuan Bai shi jianzhenggao* 元白詩箋證稿. Beijing: Sanlian shudian, 2001.
Chen Yinke. *Tangdai zhengzhishi shulungao* 唐代政治史述論稿.1997; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2001.
Cheng Guofu 程國賦. "Tangdai shizu zhi jia buyuan qu gongzhu zhi yuanyin kaoshu" 唐代士族之家不願娶公主之原因考述. *Wenxue yichan* 文學遺產, no. 6 (2000): 112–14.
Cheng Guofu. *Tangdai xiaoshuo yu zhonggu wenhua* 唐代小說與中古文化. Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 2000.
Cheng Qianfan 程千帆. *Tangdai jinshi xingjuan yu wenxue* 唐代進士行卷與文學. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1980.

Chiu-Duke, Josephine. *To Rebuild the Empire: Lu Chih's Confucian Pragmatist Approach to the Mid-T'ang Predicament*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2000.

Chu Wo-Hsin 朱我芯. "Tangdai Xin Yuefu zhi fazhan guanjian—Li Bai kaichuang zhi gong yu Du Fu, Yuan Jie zhi shuangxian kaizhan" 唐代新樂府之發展關鍵——李白開創之功與杜甫、元結之雙線開展. *Zhengda zhongwen xuebao* 政大中文學報, no. 7 (June 2007): 25–52.

Chu Wo-Hsin. *Zhongguo shige fengyu chuantong: Jianlun Tangdai Xin Yuefu* 中國詩歌諷諭傳統：兼論唐代新樂府. Taipei: Taiwan shifan daxue chuban zhongxin, 2015.

Cook, Scott. "'Yue Ji' 樂記—Record of Music: Introduction, Translation, Notes, and Commentary." *Asian Music* 26, no. 2, *Musical Narrative Traditions of Asia* (Spring–Summer, 1995): 1–96.

Cook, Scott. "Unity and Diversity in the Musical Thought of Warring States China." PhD diss., University of Michigan, 1995.

Creel, H. G. "The Role of the Horse in Chinese History." *The American Historical Review* 70, no. 3 (April 1965): 647–72.

Czaplicka, M. A. *The Turks of Central Asia in History and at the Present Day: An Ethnological Inquiry into the Pan-Turanian Problem, and Bibliographical Material Relating to the Early Turks and the Present Turks of Central Asia*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1918.

Dalby, Michael T. "Court Politics in Late T'ang Times." In *The Cambridge History of China: Sui and T'ang China, 589–906*, *Part I*, ed. Denis Twitchett, 561–681. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.

Daniels, Christian. "Nanzhao as a Southeast Asian Kingdom, c. 738–902." *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 52, no. 2 (June 2021): 188–213.

DeBlasi, Anthony. *Reform in the Balance: The Defense of Literary Culture in Mid-Tang China*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002.

DeWoskin, Kenneth J. "Philosophers on Music in Early China." *The World of Music* 27, no. 1, China (1985): 33–47.

Dong, Lorraine. "The Creation and Life of Cui Yingying (c. 803–1969)." PhD diss., University of Washington, 1978.

Doran, Rebecca. *Transgressive Typologies: Constructions of Gender and Power in Early Tang China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2016.

Drège, Jean-Pierre and Olivier Venture, eds. *Études de Dunhuang et Turfan*. Paris: Droz, 2007.

Drompp, Michael R. *Tang China and the Collapse of the Uighur Empire: A Documentary History*. Leiden: Brill, 2005.

Du Xiaoqin 杜曉勤. "'Qinzhongyin' fei 'Xin Yuefu' kaolun—Jianlun Bai Juyi Xin Yuefushi de tishi tezheng ji houren zhi wujie" 〈秦中吟〉非「新樂府」考論——兼論白居易新樂府詩的體式特徵及後人之誤解. *Wenxue yichan* 文學遺產, no. 1 (2015): 55–69.

Du You 杜佑 (735–812). *Tongdian* 通典, 5 vols. 1988; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003.

Duan Tianshu 段天姝. "Bai Juyi 'Manzi chao' 'mosuo suyu shuang weiqie' xinjie" 白居易〈蠻子朝〉「摩挲俗羽雙隈伽」新解. *Chūgoku bungaku ronshū* 中国文学論集 51 (December 2022): 59–75.

Egan, Charles H. "Were Yüeh-fu Ever Folk Songs? Reconsidering the Relevance of Oral Theory and Balladry Analogies." *Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews* 22 (December 2000): 31–66.

Egan, Ronald. "The Controversy over Music and 'Sadness' and Changing Conceptions of the *Qin* in Middle Period China." *HJAS* 57, no. 1 (June 1997): 5–66.
Eisenberg, Andrew. "Kingship, Power and the Hsüan-wu Men Incident of the T'ang." *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., 80 (1994): 223–59.
Fan Shufen 范淑芬. *Yuan Zhen ji qi Yuefushi yanjiu* 元稹及其樂府詩研究. Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1984.
Frankel, Hans H. "Yueh-fu Poetry." In *Studies in Chinese Literary Genres*, ed. Cyril Birch, 69–107. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974.
Frankel, Hans. "The Formulaic Language of the Chinese Ballad 'Southeast Fly the Peacocks'." *The Bulletin of the Institute of History and Philology* 39, no. 2 (1969): 219–41.
Ge Xiaoyin 葛曉音. "Xin Yuefu de yuanqi he jieding" 新樂府的緣起和界定. *Zhongguo shehui kexue* 中國社會科學, no. 3 (1993): 161–73.
Ge Xiaoyin. *Shiguo gaochao yu sheng Tang wenhua* 詩國高潮與盛唐文化. Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 1998.
Goldin, Paul R. "Reading Po Chü-I." *Tang Studies* 12 (1994): 57–96.
Goldin, Paul R. ed. *Dao Companion to the Philosophy of Han Fei*. New York and London: Springer, 2013.
Guo Guangwei 郭廣偉, coll. *Quan Deyu shiwen ji* 權德輿詩文集. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2008.
Guo Maoqian 郭茂倩 (fl. 1084). *Yuefu shiji* 樂府詩集, 4 vols. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1998.
Guo Qiyong, Cui Tao, Liu Junping, and Xiong Ying. "The Values of Confucian Benevolence and the Universality of the Confucian Way of Extending Love." *Frontiers of Philosophy in China* 7, no. 1 (March 2012): 20–54.
Guo Songnian 郭松年, Wang Shuwu 王叔武, coll. and ed.; Li Jing 李京, Wang Shuwu, coll. and ed. *Dali xingji jiaozhu, Yunnan zhilue jijiao* 大理行記校注 雲南志略輯校. Kunming: Yunnan minzu chubanshe, 1986.
Han Guopan 韓國磐. *Sui-Tang Wudai shigang* 隋唐五代史綱. 1961; rpt., Beijing: Sanlian shudian, 1962.
Han Ying 韓嬰 (fl. 156 BCE). *Hanshi waizhuan jishi* 韓詩外傳集釋, ed. Xu Weiyu 許維遹. 1980; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2005.
Hanabusa Hideki 花房英樹 and Maegawa Yukio 前川幸雄. *Gen Shin kenkyū* 元稹研究. Kyoto: Ibundō shoten, 1977.
Hartman, Charles. *Han Yü and the T'ang Search for Unity*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986.
Hasebe Tsuyoshi 長谷部剛 and Yamadera Michi 山寺三知, comp. and trans. *Hayashi Kenzo "Zui Tō engakuchō kenkyu" to sono shūhen*『隋唐燕楽調研究』とその周辺. Osaka: Kansai daigaku shuppanbu, 2017.
Hasebe Tsuyoshi. "Gudai Riben Yuefushi guankui" 古代日本樂府詩管窺. In *Yuefuxue* 樂府學, vol. 17, ed. Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲, 90–91. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2018.
Hayashi Kenzo 林謙三. *Sui-Tang yanyuediao yanjiu* 隋唐燕樂調研究, trans. Guo Moruo 郭沫若. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1936.
He Wenhui 何文滙. *Chen Zi'ang "Ganyu" shi jian* 陳子昂感遇詩箋. Hong Kong: Xuejin chubanshe, 1978.
Heller, Natasha. "Why Has the Rhinoceros Come from the West?" *JAOS* 131, no. 3 (July–September 2011): 353–70.
Hightower, James R. *Han shih waichuan: Han Ying's Illustrations of the Didactic Application of the Classic of Songs*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1952.

Hightower, James R. "The Wen Hsüan and Genre Theory." *HJAS* 20, no. 3/4 (December 1957), 512–33.
Hino Kaizaburo 日野開三郎. "Hanchin-jidai no shūzei sanbunsei ni tsuite" 藩鎮時代の州税三分制に就いて. *Shigaku zasshi* 史学雑誌 65, no. 7 (July 1956): 21–41.
Hino Kaizaburo. *Tōyō shigaku ronshū* 東洋史学論集, vol. 3–4. Tokyo: San'ichi shobō, 1980–1984.
Hisayuki Miyakawa 宮川尚志. "An Outline of the Naitō Hypothesis and Its Effects on Japanese Studies of China." *The Far Eastern Quarterly* 14, no. 4, Special Number on Chinese History and Society (August 1955): 533–52.
Hou Linbo 侯林伯. *Tangdai yidi bianhuan shilue* 唐代夷狄邊患史略. Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1972.
Hu Shi 胡適 (1891–1962). *Baihua wenxueshi* 白話文學史. 1999; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2009.
Hu Zhenheng 胡震亨 (1569–1645). *Tangyin guiqian* 唐音癸籤. Shanghai: Gudian wenxue chubanshe, 1957.
Huang Yongnian 黃永年. *Tangdai shishi kaoshi* 唐代史事考釋. Taipei: Lianjing chuban, 1998.
Huang Yongnian. *Tangshi shi'er jiang* 唐史十二講. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2007.
Huang Yongwu 黃永武. *Dunhuang de Tangshi* 敦煌的唐詩. 1987; rpt. Taipei: Hongfan shudian, 1998.
Huang Zhencheng 黃鎮成 (1288–1362). *Shangshu tongkao* 尚書通考. In *Yingyin Wenyuange Siku quanshu* 影印文淵閣四庫全書. Taipei: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
Hucker, Charles O. *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985.
Hwa, Lily. "Yuan Chen (A.D. 779–831): The Poet-Statesman, His Political and Literary Career." PhD diss., University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1984.
Ing, Michael David Kaulana. *The Dysfunction of Ritual in Early Confucianism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.
Jagchid, Sechin. "The 'Uighur Horses' of the T'ang Dynasty." In *Gedanke und Wirkung: Festschrift zum 90. Geburtstag von Nikolaus Poppe*, ed. Walther Heissig and Klaus Sagaster. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1989.
Jennings, Theodore W. "On Ritual Knowledge." *The Journal of Religion* 62, no. 2 (April 1982): 111–27.
Ji Qin 冀勤, ed. *Yuan Zhen ji* 元稹集. 1982; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2000.
Jian Changchun 蹇長春. "Xin Yuefu shipai yu Xin Yuefu yundong—Guanyu Bai Juyi pingjia de yige wenti" 新樂府詩派與新樂府運動——關於白居易評價的一個問題. *Xibei shida xuebao* 西北師大學報, no. 4 (1986): 30–44.
Jin Shangli 金尚理. *Li yi yue he de wenhua lixiang* 禮宜樂和的文化理想. Chengdu: Ba-Shu shushe, 2002.
Jingmenshi bowuguan 荊門市博物館, ed. *Guodian Chumu zhujian* 郭店楚墓竹簡. Hebei: Wenwu chubanshe, 1998.
Jo-shui Chen. *Liu Tsung-yüan and Intellectual Change in T'ang China, 773–819*. 1992; rpt. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
Kern, Martin. "A Note on the Authenticity and Ideology of *Shih-chi* 24, 'The Book on Music'." *JAOS* 119, no. 4 (October–December 1999): 673–77.
Knechtges, David R. "A Journey to Morality: Chang Heng's 'The Rhapsody on Pondering the Mystery'." In *Essays in Commemoration of the Golden Jubilee of the Fung Ping Shan Library (1932–1982)*, ed. Chan Ping-leung et al. Hong Kong: Fung Ping Shan Library, Hong Kong University, 1982.

Knechtges, David R. *Wen xuan, Volume Three: Rhapsodies on Natural Phenomena, Birds and Animals, Aspirations and Feelings, Sorrowful Laments, Literature, Music, and Passions*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996.
Knoblock, John. *Xunzi: A Translation and Study of the Complete Works*, 3 vols. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994.
Kolbas, Judith G. "Khukh Ordung, A Uighur Palace Complex of the Seventh Century." *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 15, no. 3 (November 2005): 303–27.
Kou Xiaoxin 寇效信. "Qin Han Yuefu kaolue—You Qin Shihuangling chutu de Qin Yuefu bianzhong tanqi" 秦漢樂府考略——由秦始皇陵出土的秦樂府編鐘談起. *Shaanxi shifan daxue xuebao* 陝西師範大學學報, no. 1 (1978): 35–37.
Kroll, Paul W. "The Flight from the Capital and the Death of Precious Consort Yang." *Tang Studies* 3 (1985): 25–53.
Kroll, Paul W. "Four Vignettes from the Court of Tang Xuanzong." *Tang Studies* 25 (2007): 1–27.
Kuttner, Fritz A. "The Development of the Concept of Music in China's Early History." *Asian Music* 1, no. 2 (Autumn 1969): 12–21.
Lao Sze-Kwang 勞思光. *Zhongguo zhexueshi* 中國哲學史, 4 vols. Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 2005.
Lau, D. C., trans. *The Analects*, 2nd ed. 1992; rpt. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 2002.
Legge, James (1815–1897), trans. *Li Chi: Book of Rites*, 2 vols. New York: University Books, 1967.
Legge, James, trans. *I Ching: Book of Changes*. New York: Gramercy Books, 1996.
Legge, James, trans. *The Chinese Classics: The Ch'un Ts'ew with the Tso Chuen*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960.
Legge, James. *The Chinese Classics: The She King or the Book of Poetry*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960.
Legge, James. *The Chinese Classics: The Shoo King or the Book of Historical Documents*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1960.
Lei Qiaoling 雷巧玲. "Tangren weishang gongzhu xisu tanxi" 唐人畏尚公主習俗探析. *Renwen zazhi* 人文雜誌, no. 6 (1992): 92–94.
Li Ao 李翱 (772–841). *Li Wengong ji* 李文公集. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1993.
Li Fang 李昉 (925–996). et al., comp. *Wenyuan yinghua* 文苑英華. 1966; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982.
Li Jinxiu 李錦繡. *Tangdai caizheng shigao* 唐代財政史稿. Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2001.
Li Jinxiu. "Tang houqi de xuqian, shiqian wenti" 唐後期的虛錢、實錢問題. *Beijing daxue xuebao* 北京大學學報, no. 2 (1989): 13–25.
Li Linfu 李林甫 (d. 752). *Tang liudian* 唐六典, punc. & coll. Chen Zhongfu 陳仲夫. 1992; rpt., Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2008.
Li Shutong 李樹桐. *Tangshi yanjiu* 唐史研究. Taipei: Taiwan Zhonghua shuju, 1979.
Li Sui 理綏. "Shilun Tangdai shangren shehui diwei de bianhua ji qi xiandu" 試論唐代商人社會地位的變化及其限度. *Zhongguo shehui jingjishi yanjiu* 中國社會經濟史研究, no. 4 (1988): 32–36.
Liu Xu 劉昫 (887–946) et al., comp. *Jiu Tang shu* 舊唐書. 1975; rpt., Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002.
Li Zhao 李肇 (*fl.* 818). *Tang guoshi bu* 唐國史補. 1957; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1979.
Li Zongwei 李宗為. *Tangren chuanqi* 唐人傳奇. 1985; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003.

Liao Deguang 廖德廣. *Nanzhao "Dehua bei" tanjiu* 南詔德化碑探究. Kunming: Yunnan minzu chubanshe, 2006.
Liao Meiyun 廖美雲. *Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu yanjiu* 元白新樂府研究. Taipei: Taiwan xuesheng shuju, 1989.
Liji jishuo 禮記集說. In *Wenyuange Siku quanshu*. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1987.
Liu Jiaying 劉佳瑩. "Tangshi zhong de sichou wenhua yu Tangdai shehui shenghuo" 唐詩中的絲綢文化與唐代社會生活. *Wenhua xuekan* 文化學刊, no. 1 (2010): 84–87.
Liu Junwen 劉俊文. *Tanglü shuyi jianjie* 唐律疏議箋解. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1996.
Liu Ning 劉寧. *Tang Song zhi ji shige yanbian yanjiu* 唐宋之際詩歌演變研究. Beijing: Beijing shifan daxue chubanshe, 2002.
Liu Su 劉餗 (fl. 742). *Sui-Tang jiahua* 隋唐嘉話, coll. Cheng Yizhong 程毅中. 1979; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1997.
Liu Xie 劉勰 (ca. 466–538/ca. 465–532). *Wenxin diaolong zhu* 文心雕龍註, annot. Fan Wenlan 范文瀾 (1893–1969), 2 vols. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1962.
Liu Xin 劉歆 (d. 23). *Xijing zaji jiaozhu* 西京雜記校注, comp. Ge Hong 葛洪 (284–364), coll. and annot. Xiang Xinyang 向新陽 and Liu Keren 劉克任. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1991.
Liu Xu 劉昫 (887–946) et al., comp. *Jiu Tang shu* 舊唐書. 1975; rpt., Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002.
Liu Xuezhong 劉學忠. "'Xin Yuefu yundong' bian" 「新樂府運動」辨. *Hengyang shizhuan xuebao (shehui kexue)* 衡陽師專學報(社會科學)16 (April 1995): 18–22.
Liu Yuanyuan 劉媛媛. "Lun Tang Pozhen yue" 論唐破陣樂. *Huangzhong (Zhongguo Wuhan yinyue xueyuan xuebao)* 黃鍾(中國．武漢音樂學院學報), no. S1 (2006): 45–49.
Liu Yuanzhi 劉遠智. *Chen Zi'ang ji qi "Ganyu" shi yanjiu* 陳子昂及其感遇詩研究. Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1987.
Loewe, Michael, ed. *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide*. Berkeley: The Society for the Study of Early China and The Institute of East Asian Studies, 1993.
Lü Chia Hui 呂家慧. "Cong xing liyue dao guan shengmin: Lun Zhong Tang Yuefu de fuxing yu xinbian" 從興禮樂到觀生民：論中唐樂府的復興與新變. PhD diss., Chinese University of Hong Kong, 2014.
Lu Huayu 盧華語. "Lun sichou zai Tangdai jingji shenghuo zhong de zuoyong" 論絲綢在唐代經濟生活中的作用. *Jiangsu shehui kexue* 江蘇社會科學, no. 6 (1995): 96–99, 95.
Lü Simian 呂思勉 (1884–1957). *Sui-Tang wudai shi* 隋唐五代史, 2 vols. 2005; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2009.
Luo Bi 羅泌 (13th cent.). *Lu shi* 路史. In *Wenyuange Siku quanshu*. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1987.
Luo Zhufeng 羅竹風, ed. *Hanyu da cidian* 漢語大詞典, 12 vols. Shanghai: Hanyu dacidian chubanshe, 1994.
Ma Duanlin 馬端臨 (1254–1323). *Wenxian tongkao* 文獻通考. In *Wenyuange Siku quanshu*. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1987.
Ma Qichang 馬其昶 (1855–1930) and Ma Maoyuan 馬茂元 (1918–1989), eds. *Han Changli wenji jiaozhu* 韓昌黎文集校注. 1986; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1998.
Mackerras, Colin, ed. and trans. *The Uighur Empire According to the T'ang Dynastic Histories: A Study in Sino-Uighur Relations, 744–840*, 2nd ed.,

Asian publications series, no. 2 Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1973.
Mair, Victor H. "Scroll Presentation in the T'ang Dynasty." *HJAS* 38, no. 1 (1978): 35–60.
Mair, Victor H, ed. *The Columbia History of Chinese Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2001.
Mao Lei 毛蕾. *Tangdai Hanlin xueshi* 唐代翰林學士. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2000.
Matsuda Kiyohide 增田清秀. *Gafu no rekishiteki kenkyū* 樂府の歷史的研究. Tokyo: Sōbunsha, 1975.
McMullen, David L. "Historical and Literary Theory in the Mid-Eighth Century." In *Perspectives on the T'ang*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett, 307–42. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1973.
McMullen, David L. "Views of the State in Du You and Liu Zongyuan." In *Foundations and Limits of State Power in China*, ed. Stuart R. Schram, 77–85. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1987.
McMullen, David L. "Devolution in Chinese History: The *Fengjian* Debate Revisited." *International Journal of China Studies* 2.2 (2011): 135–54.
McMullen, David L. "The Emperor, the Princes, and the Prefectures: A Political Analysis of the Pu'an Decree of 756 and the *Fengjian* Issue." *Tang Studies* 32 (2014): 47–97.
Millward, James A. *Eurasian Crossroads: A History of Xinjiang*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2007.
Naitō Konan 内藤湖南 (1866–1934). *Shina ron* 支那論. Tokyo: Bunkaidō shoten, 1914.
Naitō Konan. "Tō Sō jidai no kenkyū: Gaikatsu teki Tō Sō jidaikan" 唐宋時代の研究: 概括的唐宋時代觀. *Rekishi go chiri* 歷史ご地理9, no. 5 (1922): 1–12.
Neville, Robert C. *Ritual and Deference: Extending Chinese Philosophy in a Comparative Context*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2008.
Nienhauser, William H., Jr., ed. *Critical Essays on Chinese Literature*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press, 1976.
Nienhauser, William H., Jr. *P'i Jih-hsiu*. Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1979.
Nienhauser, William H., Jr., ed. *The Grand Scribe's Records*. Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994.
Nienhauser, William H., Jr., ed. *The Grand Scribe's Records*. Vol. 2. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002.
Nienhauser, William H., Jr., ed. *The Grand Scribe's Records: The Hereditary Houses of Pre-Han China, Part I*, vol. 5.1. Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006.
Nugent, Christopher M. B. *Manifest in Words, Written on Paper: Producing and Circulating Poetry in Tang Dynasty China*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2010.
Owen, Stephen, ed. & trans. *An Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911*. New York & London: W. W. Norton & Company, 1996.
Owen, Stephen. *The End of the Chinese "Middle Ages": Essays in Mid-Tang Literary Culture*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
Owen, Stephen. *The Making of Early Chinese Classical Poetry*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2006.
Ouyang Xiu 歐陽修 (1007–1072) and Song Qi 宋祁 (998–1061), comp. *Xin Tang shu* 新唐書. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1975.

Palandri, Angela J. *Yuan Chen*. Boston: Twayne Publishers, 1977.
Peterson, Charles A. "The Restoration Completed: Emperor Hsien-tsung and the Provinces." In *Perspectives on the T'ang*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett, 151–91. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1973.
Peterson, Charles A. "Court and Province in Mid- and Late T'ang." In *The Cambridge History of China: Sui and T'ang China, 589–906*, *Part I*, ed. Denis Twitchett, 464–560. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
Pulleyblank, Edwin G. *The Background of the Rebellion of An Lu-shan*. London: Oxford University Press, 1955.
Pulleyblank, Edwin G. "Neo-Confucianism and Neo-legalism in T'ang Intellectual Life, 755–805." In *The Confucian Persuasion*, ed. Arthur F. Wright, 77–114. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1960.
Pulleyblank, E. G. "Registration of Population in China in the Sui and T'ang Periods." *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 4, no. 3 (December 1961): 289–301.
Qianlong 乾隆 (1711–1799, r. 1736–1795). *Yupi lidai tongjian jilan* 御批歷代通鑑輯覽. Taipei: Xinxing shuju, 1959.
Qiu Zhao'ao 仇兆鰲 (1638–c. 1713). *Dushi xiangzhu* 杜詩詳注, 5 vols. 1979; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2004.
Quan Hansheng 全漢昇. "Tangdai wujia de biandong" 唐代物價的變動. *Guoli Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Lishi yuyan yanjiusuo jikan* 國立中央研究院歷史語言研究所集刊 11, 101–48. 1944; rpt., Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1947.
Ren Shiying 任士英. *Tangdai Xuanzong Suzong zhi ji de zhongshu zhengju* 唐代玄宗肅宗之際的中樞政局. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2003.
Rothschild, Harry N. *Wu Zhao: China's Only Woman Emperor*. New York: Pearson Education, 2008.
Rothschild, Harry N. *Emperor Wu Zhao and Her Pantheon of Devis, Divinities, and Dynastic Mothers*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2015.
Ruan Yuan 阮元 (1764–1849), coll. *Shisanjing zhushu* 十三經注疏, 8 vols. Taipei: Yiwen yinshuguan, 2007.
Saussy, Haun. "'Ritual Separates, Music Unites': Why Musical Hermeneutics Matters." In *Recarving the Dragon: Understanding Chinese Poetics*, ed. Olga Lomová, 9–25. Prague: Karolinum Press, 2003.
Sedwick, B. Frank. "The Literary Movements Defined." *Hispania* 37, no. 4 (December 1954): 466–71.
Sha Wutian 沙武田. "Yifu zhengui de Tang Chang'an yejian yuewutu—Yi Mogaoku di 220 ku Yaoshi jingbian yuewutu zhong deng wei zhongxin de jiedu" 一幅珍貴的唐長安夜間樂舞圖——以莫高窟第220窟藥師經變樂舞圖中燈為中心的解讀. *Dunhuang yanjiu* 敦煌研究, no. 5 (2015): 34–44.
Shen Ling 沈聆. "*Xin Yuefu* shi zhong de yinyue shiliao"《新樂府》詩中的音樂史料. *Luoyang shifan xueyuan xuebao* 洛陽師範學院學報, no. 3 (2006): 170–72.
Shen Yue 沈約 (441–513), comp. *Song shu* 宋書. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1974.
Sheng, Angela. "Determining the Value of Textiles in the Tang Dynasty in Memory of Professor Denis Twitchett (1925–2006)." *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 175–95.
Shields, Anna M. *One Who Knows Me: Friendship and Literary Culture in Mid-Tang China* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2015.
Shizunaga Takeshi 静永健. *Haku Kyo'i "fūyushi" no kenkyū* 白居易「諷諭詩」の研究. Tokyo: Bensei shuppan, 2000.

Sichuansheng Shehongxian Chen Zi'ang yanjiu lianluozu 四川省射洪縣陳子昂研究聯絡組, comp. *Chen Zi'ang yanjiu lunji* 陳子昂研究論集. Beijing: Zhongguo wenlian chuban gongsi, 1989.
Sigurðsson, Geir. *Confucian Propriety and Ritual Learning: A Philosophical Interpretation*. 2015; rpt. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2016.
Sima Guang 司馬光 (1019–1086). *Zizhi tongjian* 資治通鑑, annot. Hu Sanxing 胡三省 (1230–1302). 1956; rpt., Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2005.
Sima Qian 司馬遷(c. 145 BCE–c. 86 BCE). *Shiji* 史記, 10 vols., rev. ed. 1982; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2003.
Skaff, Jonathan K. *Sui-Tang China and Its Turko-Mongol Neighbors: Culture, Power, and Connections, 580–800*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.
So, Jenny F. *Music in the Age of Confucius*. Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 2000.
Soejima Ichiro 副島一郎. "Cong 'liyue' dao 'renyi'—Zhong Tang Ruxue de yanbian quxiang" 從「禮樂」到「仁義」——中唐儒學的演變趨向. *Xueshu yuekan* 學術月刊, no. 2 (1999): 66–73.
Solomon, Bernard S. trans. *The Veritable Record of the T'ang Emperor Shun-tsung, February 28, 805–August 31, 805: Han Yu's Shun-tsung shih-lu*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1955.
Song Erkang 宋爾康. "Wan Tang wuyan gushi dui zhong Tang Xin Yuefu yundong de jicheng he fazhan" 晚唐五言古詩對中唐新樂府運動的繼承和發展. *Henan shifan daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 河南師範大學學報(哲學社會科學版)30, no. 4 (2003): 62–64.
Song Lian 宋濂 (1310–1381) et al. *Yuan shi* 元史. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1976.
Song Minqiu 宋敏求 (1019–1079), comp. *Tang da zhaoling ji* 唐大詔令集. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2008.
Spring, Madeline K. "A Stylistic Study of Tang 'Guwen': The Rhetoric of Han Yu and Liu Zongyuan." PhD diss., University of Washington, 1983.
Sterckx, Roel. "Transforming the Beasts: Animals and Music in Early China." *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., vol. 86, fasc. 1/3 (2000): 1–46.
Stott, Wilfrid. "The Expansion of the Nan-chao Kingdom: Between the Years A.D. 750–860 and the Causes That Lay behind It as Shewn in the T'ai-ho Inscription and the *Man Shu*." *T'oung Pao*, 2nd ser., vol. 50, Livr. 1/3 (1963): 190–220.
Su Feng 宿豐. "Yetan 'Xinyuefu' yundong" 也談新樂府運動. *Dandong shizhuan xuebao* 丹東師專學報, no. 4 (1996): 50–51.
Su Ya 蘇婭. "Tang yuewu zai Riben de yinjin yu gaizao" 唐樂舞在日本的引進與改造. *Yunnan yishu xueyuan xuebao* 雲南藝術學院學報, no. 1 (2015): 77–80.
Su Zhongxiang 蘇仲翔, annot. *Yuan Bai shixuan* 元白詩選. Shanghai: Gudian wenxue chubanshe, 1957.
Sun Shangyong 孫尚勇. *Yuefu wenxue wenxian yanjiu* 樂府文學文獻研究. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2007.
Sun Yirang 孫詒讓 (1848–1908). *Mozi jiangu* 墨子閒詁, punc. and coll. Sun Qizhi 孫啟治, ed. Xu Jialu 許嘉璐, 2 vols. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2009.
Tai Jingnong 臺靜農. *Zhongguo wenxueshi* 中國文學史. Zhengzhou: Haiyan chubanshe, 2015.
Tan Qixiang 譚其驤, ed. *Zhongguo lishi dituji* 中國歷史地圖集, 8 vols. 1982; rpt., Beijing: Zhongguo ditu chubanshe, 1996.
Tan, Mei Ah. "A Study of Yuan Zhen's Life and Verse 809–810: Two Years that Shaped His Politics and Prosody." PhD diss., University of Wisconsin–Madison, 2008.

Tan, Mei Ah. "Exonerating the Horse Trade for the Shortage of Silk: Yuan Zhen's 'Yin Mountain Route'." *Journal of Chinese Studies* 57 (July 2013): 49–96.
Tan, Mei Ah. "New Music Bureau Poetry as Memorial: The True Significance of Yuan Zhen's 'Shangyang baifa ren'." *Tang Studies* 35, no. 1 (December 2017): 87–108.
Tao Zongyi 陶宗儀 (b. 1316). *Nancun Chuogeng lu* 南村輟耕錄. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1959.
Trombert, Éric. "The Demise of Silk on the Silk Road: Textiles as Money at Dunhuang from the Late Eighth Century to the Thirteenth Century." *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 327–47.
Tuo Tuo 脫脫 (1314–1355). *Jin shi* 金史. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1975.
Twitchett, Denis C. *Financial Administration under the T'ang Dynasty*, 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.
Twitchett, Denis C. "Lu Chih (754–805): Imperial Advisor and Court Official." In *Confucian Personalities*, ed. Arthur F. Wright and Denis Twitchett, 84–122. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1962.
Twitchett, Denis C. "Provincial Autonomy and Central Finance in Late T'ang." *Asia Major*, n.s., 11 (1965), 211–32.
Twitchett, Denis., ed. *The Cambridge History of China*, Vol. 3: *Sui and T'ang China*, *589–906*, Part 1. 1979; rpt. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
Villagran, Ignacio. "In Search of the Ethical Empire: Medieval Chinese Debates on Fengjian and Junxian." PhD diss., University of Michigan, 2015.
Von Falkenhausen, Lothar. *Suspended Music: Chime-Bells in the Culture of Bronze Age China*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press, 1993.
Walter, Michael. *Buddhism and Empire: The Political and Religious Culture of Early Tibet*. Leiden: Brill, 2009.
Wang Bi 王弼 (226–249), annot., Kong Yingda, comm. *Zhouyi zhengyi* 周易正義. Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe, 1999.
Wang Huibin 王輝斌. "Lun Du Fu 'sanli' 'sanbie' de shiti shuxing—Jianji Tangdai Xinyuefu de youguan wenti" 論杜甫「三吏」「三別」的詩體屬性——兼及唐代新樂府的有關問題. *Du Fu yanjiu xuekan* 杜甫研究學刊, no. 3 (2005): 40–46, 77.
Wang Huibin. *Tanghou Yuefu shishi* 唐後樂府詩史. Hefei: Huangshan shushe, 2010.
Wang Huibin. "Xinti Yuefu de xingsheng yu xiaoxie—Dui you Tang er Qing qiannian Xin Yuefu de guanzhao" 新題樂府的興盛與消歇——對由唐而清千年新樂府的觀照. *Zhonghua wenhua luntan* 中華文化論壇, no. 3 (2019): 65–72, 156.
Wang Li. *Hanyu shilüxue* 漢語詩律學, 2nd ed. 2005; Shanghai: Shanghai shiji chuban jituan and Shanghai jiaoyu chubanshe, 2007.
Wang Pu 王溥 (922–982). *Tang huiyao* 唐會要. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1955.
Wang Rubi 王汝弼. *Yuefu sanlun* 樂府散論. Xi'an: Shaanxi renmin chubanshe, 1984.
Wang Shounan 王壽南. *Tangdai renwu yu zhengzhi* 唐代人物與政治. Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1999.
Wang Xianqian 王先謙 (1842–1918), Shen Xiaohuan 沈嘯寰, and Wang Xingxian 王星賢, punc. and coll. *Xunzi jijie* 荀子集解, 2 vols. 1988; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1997.
Wang Yunxi 王運熙. *Yuefushi shulun* 樂府詩述論. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2006.

Wang, Helen. "Textiles as Money on the Silk Road?" *JRAS*, 3rd ser., 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 165–74.
Watson, Burton. *Hsün Tzu: Basic Writings*. 1963; rpt. New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.
Wechsler, Howard J. *Mirror to the Son of Heaven: Wei Cheng at the Court of T'ang T'ai-tsung*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1974.
Wei Zheng 魏徵 (580–643) and Linghu Defen 令狐德棻 (583–666), comp. *Sui shu* 隋書. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1973.
Wen Yanrong 文豔蓉. "*Xin Yuefu* zai Riben de liuchuan yu shourong" 《新樂府》在日本的流傳與受容. In *Yuefuxue* 樂府學, vol. 17, ed. Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲, 103–104. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2017.
Williams, Nicholas M. *Elegies of Chu: An Anthology of Early Chinese Poetry*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022.
Wang Shiyi 王拾遺. *Bai Juyi shenghuo xinian* 白居易生活繫年. Yinchuan: Ningxia renmin chubanshe, 1981.
Wong Yiu Kwan 黃耀堃. "Yinyue yu fengci: Xin Yuefu kao (qiyi)" 音樂與諷刺: 新樂府考(其一). In *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu* 唐代文學研究, vol. 5, ed. Fu Xuancong 傅璇琮 and Zhou Zuzhuan 周祖譔, 630–42. Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 1994.
Wu Weibin 吳偉斌. "Lun Liuben *Yuanshi Changqingji* zhi gongxian yu quehan" 論劉本《元氏長慶集》之貢獻與缺憾. *Liaocheng daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 聊城大學學報(社會科學版), no. 2 (2014): 16–23.
Wu Weibin. *Xinbian Yuan Zhen ji* 新編元稹集. Xi'an: San Qin chubanshe, 2015.
Wu Weibin. *Xinbian Yuan Zhen nianpu* 新編元稹年譜. Xi'an: San Qin chubanshe, 2022.
Wu Weibin. *Yuan Zhen kaolun* 元稹考論. Zhengzhou: Henan renmin chubanshe, 2008.
Wu Weibin. *Yuan Zhen pingzhuan* 元稹評傳. Zhengzhou: Henan renmin chubanshe, 2008.
Wu Weibin. "Yuan Zhen shige yishu tese qianxi" 元稹詩歌藝術特色淺析. *Yangzhou shiyuan xuebao* 揚州師院學報, no. 3 (1985): 54–59.
Wu Xiangzhou 吳相洲. *Yuefuxue gailun* 樂府學概論. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2015.
Wu Zhao 吳釗 and Liu Dongsheng 劉東升. *Zhongguo yinyue shilue* 中國音樂史略. 1993; Beijing: Renmin yinyue chubanshe, 2005.
Xiang Hongwei 向紅偉. "Luelun Tangdai Longyou diqu mazheng dui jinglue Xibei de yingxiang" 略論唐代隴右地區馬政對經略西北的影響. *Hebei keji daxue xuebao* 河北科技大學學報, no. 2 (2007): 68–71.
Xiao Difei 蕭滌非. *Han Wei Liuchao Yuefu wenxueshi* 漢魏六朝樂府文學史. 1984; rpt. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1998.
Xie Siwei 謝思煒. "*Xin Yuefu* banben ji xuwen kaozheng" 《新樂府》版本及序文考證. *Beijing shifan daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 北京師範大學學報(社會科學版), no. 3 (1996): 67–74, 107.
Xie Yuanlu 謝元魯. "Sui-Tang de taizi qinwang yu huangwei jicheng zhidu" 隋唐的太子親王與皇位繼承制度. *Tianfu xinlun* 天府新論, no. 2 (1996): 70–75.
Xin Xuefeng 辛雪峰. "Cong 'Beigong Yuefu' shiqing jiqi xiangguan wenwu kan Qin Yuefu yinyue" 從「北宮樂府」石磬及其相關文物看秦樂府音樂. *Yinyue yanjiu* 音樂研究, no. 1 (2021): 39–46.
Xu Dongsheng 徐東升. "Lun Tangdai wujia de jige wenti" 論唐代物價的幾個問題. *Wen shi zhe* 文史哲, no. 5 (2002): 134–38.
Xu Haoren 許浩然. "Lü Xiang 'Meiren fu' fawei" 呂向〈美人賦〉發微. *Zhongguo yunwen xuekan* 中國韻文學刊 23, no. 3 (2009): 6–8.

Xu Peng 徐鵬, coll. and punc. *Chen Zi'ang ji* 陳子昂集, rev. ed.; Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2013.
Xue Tianwei 薛天緯. *Tangdai gexinglun* 唐代歌行論. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2006.
Xue Xue 薛雪 (1681–1770). *Yipiao shihua* 一瓢詩話. In *Qing shihua* 清詩話, ed. Wang Fuzhi 王夫之 (1619–1692) et al., 2 vols. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1978.
Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, annot. *Chunqiu Zuozhuan zhu* 春秋左傳注, rev. ed. 1990; rpt. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2006.
Yang Bojun, ed. *Liezi jishi* 列子集釋. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1979.
Yang Lun 楊倫 (1747–1803). *Du shi jingquan* 杜詩鏡銓, 2 vols. 1981; Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2007.
Yang Ming 楊名. "Lun chu Tang diwang yuewuguan de bianqian jiqi wenhua yiyi" 論初唐帝王樂舞觀的變遷及其文化意義. *Jiaoxiang—Xi'an yinyue xueyuan xuebao* 交響—西安音樂學院學報 32, no. 2 (June 2013): 21–26.
Yang Shengkuan 楊勝寬. "Yuan, Bai dui Du Fu xinti Yuefu de renshi yu pingjia—Jianlun erren changdao Xin Yuefu yundong de zuoyong yu gongxian" 元、白對杜甫新題樂府的認識與評價——兼論二人倡導新樂府運動的作用與貢獻. *Jiangsu keji daxue xuebao (shehui kexue ban)* 江蘇科技大學學報(社會科學版), no. 4 (2013): 12–18.
Yao Peijian 姚培建. "Qiannian sichou jian Tangfeng: Tangdai sichou pingshu" 千年絲綢見唐風——唐代絲綢評述. *Sichou* 絲綢, no. 4 (1997): 40–43.
Yao Shangyi 姚上怡. "Shilun Tangdai shangren de falü diwei" 試論唐代商人的法律地位. Master's thesis, Xiangtan University, 2009.
Yao Silian 姚思廉 (557–637), comp. *Chen shu* 陳書. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1972.
Yu Liangqin 禹良琴. "Yuan Zhen Xin Yuefu yanjiu" 元稹新樂府研究. MA thesis, Yangzhou daxue, 2010.
Yuan Ke 袁珂, ed. *Shanhaijing jiaozhu* 山海經校注. 1980; rpt. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1986.
Yuan Zhen. *Xinkan Yuan Weizhi wenji* 新刊元微之文集. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1994.
Zhang Guangda 張廣達. *Neiteng Hunan de Tang Song biange shuo ji qi yingxiang* 內藤湖南的唐宋變革說及其影響. *Tang yanjiu* 唐研究 11 (2005): 5–71.
Zhang Hao 張淏 (fl. 1195). *Yungu zaji* 雲谷雜記. Zhengzhou: Daxiang chubanshe, 2019.
Zhang Qiuyang 張秋陽. "Zuozhuan 'zheng' 'bao' hun yanjiu" 左傳「烝」「報｜婚研究. *Jiuzhou wentan* 九州文談 (December 2009): 40–58.
Zhang Qun 章群. *Tangdai fanjiang yanjiu* 唐代蕃將研究. Taipei: Lianjing chuban, 1986.
Zhang Xiurong 張修蓉. *Zhong Tang Yuefushi yanjiu* 中唐樂府詩研究. Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1985.
Zhang Yongxin 張永鑫. *Han Yuefu yanjiu* 漢樂府研究. 1992; Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 2000.
Zhang Yu 張煜. "Zhang Wang Yuefu yu Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu chuangzuo guanxi zai kaocha" 張王樂府與元白新樂府創作關係再考察. *Wenxue pinglun* 文學評論, no. 4 (2007): 89–92.
Zhang Yue 張說 (667–731). *Zhang Yuezhi wenji* 張說之文集. In *Sibu congkan* 四部叢刊. Taipei: Taiwan Shangwu yinshuguan, 1967.
Zhang Yunyi 張允熠. "Hu Shi Shiyong zhuyi sixiang zhong de Ruxue qingjie" 胡適實用主義思想中的儒學情結. *Ershiyi shiji shuang yuekan* 二十一世紀雙月刊 45 (February 1998): 117–25.

Zhao Erxun 趙爾巽 (1844–1927), comp. *Qingshi gao* 清史稿. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1976–1977.
Zhao Feng 趙豐 and Wang Le 王樂. "Glossary of Textile Terminology (Based on the Documents from Dunhuang and Turfan)." *JRAS* 23, no. 2 (April 2013): 349–87.
Zhao Lan 趙瀾. "*Da Tang kaiyuanli* chutan—Lun Tangdai lizhi de yanhua licheng" 《大唐開元禮》初探——論唐代禮制的演化歷程. *Fudan xuebao* 復旦學報, no. 5 (1994): 87–92.
Zhou Ming 周明. "Lun Tangdai wu Xin Yuefu yundong" 論唐代無新樂府運動. *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu* 唐代文学研究, vol. 2:35–40. Guilin: Guangxi shida chubanshe, 1990.
Zhou Shaoliang 周紹良, ed. *Quan Tang wen xinbian* 全唐文新編. Chengdu: Jilin wenshi chubanshe, 2000.
Zhou Shaoliang. *Tang chuanqi jianzheng* 唐傳奇箋証. Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 2000.
Zhou Xianglu 周相錄. "*Yuanshi Changqingji* banben yuanliukao" 《元氏長慶集》版本源流考. In *Tangdai wenxue yanjiu (di 12 ji)* 唐代文學研究(第12輯), compiled by Zhongguo Tangdai wenxue xuehui 中國唐代文學學會. Guilin: Guangxi shifan daxue chubanshe, 2008, 649–57.
Zhou Xianglu 周相錄, coll. and annot. *Yuan Zhen ji jiaozhu* 元稹集校注, 3 vols. Shanghai: Shanghai shiji chuban and Shanghai guji, 2011.
Zhu Jincheng 朱金城, annot. *Bai Juyi ji jianjiao* 白居易集箋校. 1988; rpt., Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 2003.
Zhu Xi 朱熹 (1130–1200). *Zhuzi yulei* 朱子語類. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1986.
Zhu Zaiyu 朱載堉 (1536–1611). *Yuelü quanshu* 樂律全書. In *Wenyuange Siku quanshu* 文淵閣四庫全書. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1987.
Zou Changlin 鄒昌林. *Zhongguo li wenhua* 中國禮文化. Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2000.
Zuo Hanlin 左漢林. "Tangdai caishi zhidu jiqi yu Yuan Bai Xin Yuefu chuangzuo de guanxi" 唐代採詩制度及其與元白新樂府創作的關係. *Shandong daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 山東大學學報(哲學社會科學版), no. 6 (2006): 47–52.

Index